# ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

135th meeting Geneva, 9 September 2024

Item 6

Informal Document No. 2024/30

Annual report on evaluation 2023

#### Note by the Secretariat

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

1. The present report is submitted to the Executive Committee (EXCOM) for information. EXCOM requested the Secretariat to prepare an annual report on evaluation at the ninety-first meeting on 24 March 2017<sup>1</sup>, beginning with an annual report for 2017. The purpose of the report is to inform the UNECE member States on evaluation efforts conducted during the past year, future evaluation plans, the status and information on completed and ongoing evaluations, and changes generated by the implementation of relevant recommendations. This year, the liquidity restrictions affecting the United Nations Secretariat have an impact on the format and the content of the 2023 Annual report, as detailed in paras. 9 and 29.

2. As per the UNECE Evaluation Policy, the Secretariat undertakes evaluations to promote organizational learning, contribute to improvement of programme or project performance, and ensure accountability to member States and other stakeholders. The present report consolidates and analyses the outcome of all evaluations conducted in 2023 to support this objective. The Executive Secretary, through the Programme Management and Support Services Division (PMSSD) and its Programme Management Unit (PMU), ensures the consistent application of evaluation norms and standards across UNECE, and ensures the application of the key outcomes of evaluations into the future planning of the UNECE programme of work.

3. The analysis is based on the results of all evaluations conducted by UNECE, relevant external and/or system-wide evaluations, and the UN System-Wide Action Plan (UN-SWAP) to implement the Chief Executives Board for Coordination (CEB) Policy on gender equality and the empowerment of women.<sup>2</sup>

#### 2. BACKGROUND ON EVALUATION IN THE UN SECRETARIAT AND IN UNECE

4. The Secretary-General's Bulletin ST/SGB/2018/3<sup>3</sup> outlines inter alia the requirements for evaluation for all UN Secretariat entities. The purpose of evaluation is to determine as systematically and objectively as possible the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and impact of the Organization's activities in relation to their objectives, and to enable the Secretariat and Member States to engage in systematic reflection, and, if necessary, reviewing their objectives.<sup>4</sup>

5. To this end, all programmes shall be evaluated over a fixed time period, which shall include periodic internal evaluation of activities and the ad hoc in-depth evaluation of selected programme areas or topics.<sup>5</sup> Evaluations may be conducted by external entities, such as the Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS), the Joint Inspection Unit (JIU) and at the request of Member States, or by respective departments (called "internal evaluation"). Internal evaluation shall be independent and assess the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of subprogrammes and activities. Heads of departments are responsible for ensuring high quality results, rigorous evaluation methodology, transfer of evaluation information, and conduct of ad hoc studies.

6. To complement Secretary-General's Bulletin ST/SGB/2018/3, in August 2021, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Chair's conclusions of 91st EXCOM meeting

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> https://undocs.org/CEB/2006/2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> <u>ST/SGB/2018/3</u> Secretary-General's bulletin Regulations and Rules Governing Programme Planning, the Programme Aspects of the Budget, the Monitoring of Implementation and the Methods of Evaluation, 1 June 2018

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>ST/SGB/2018/3</u> Reg 7.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> <u>ST/SGB/2018/3</u> Reg 7.2 and Rule 107.2

Under-Secretary-General for Management Strategy, Policy and Compliance (DMSPC) issued Administrative Instruction ST/AI/2021/3 'Evaluation in the UN Secretariat' and related 'Guidelines'<sup>6</sup>. The Administrative Instruction requires all Secretariat entities to have an evaluation policy, calls for every entity to have an evaluation plan and to evaluate every subprogramme at least once every six years.

7. To fully align and comply with the new evaluation framework of the Secretariat, ECE subsequently updated its own Evaluation Policy, which was approved by ECE Executive Committee at its 119<sup>th</sup> meeting on 16 December 2021<sup>7</sup>. In response to an OIOS recommendation and to operational requirements, ECE will submit a revised Evaluation Policy to the EXCOM in 2024, as detailed in paras. 12 and 24.

#### **3. EVALUATION RESOURCES**

8. Until 31 August 2023, evaluations were managed by the P-4 Management and Programme Analyst in the PMU. After this date, the position became vacant, but recruitments were restricted, because of the liquidity situation. The PMU is still unable to recruit as of July 2024. This long vacancy has had an enduring impact, with only the core evaluation requirements covered by the Chief, a.i. of the PMU.

9. In the 2022 Annual report, the secretariat highlighted its concern regarding the lack of adequate resources from the regular budget available to evaluate regular budget activities, as prescribed in ST/AI/2021/3. The situation is even more stretched in 2024 with a reduced allotment received under Section 20. In 2024, the secretariat will only be able to conduct one subprogramme-level evaluation, instead of three, as mandated in the 2024 Evaluation Plan approved by EXCOM at the 131<sup>st</sup> Meeting<sup>8</sup>.

10. Independence and the quality of evaluations are inextricably linked to dedicated resources for engaging external evaluators. In addition to recruitment challenges arising from the liquidity situation referred to in para. 8, the secretariat faces two main challenges to produce qualitative evaluations. On one hand, the continuing trend of decreasing resources under the regular budget puts evaluation of regular budget activities at risk. This is particularly challenging at ECE given the high number of subprogrammes (eight) and the requirement to evaluate every subprogramme at least once every six years. On the other hand, the resources earmarked for the evaluation of extrabudgetary projects just at the threshold level (2% of \$250,000, i.e. \$5,000) are not sufficient to fund qualitative evaluations meeting all OIOS criteria<sup>9</sup>.

11. Presently, resources to conduct evaluations of programmes and activities funded through the regular budget are much lower than those to evaluate projects and activities funded through the UN Development Account or extrabudgetary resources, for which approximately 4% and 2% of project activities are dedicated to evaluation, respectively.

12. To overcome these challenges within existing resources, the secretariat will propose to revise the Evaluation Policy and shift towards more strategic and less standalone evaluation reports. The 2% earmarked for the evaluation of each extrabudgetary project above \$250,000 would be kept but directed towards a newly established Evaluation Trust Fund. Each

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> <u>ST/AI/2021/3</u> and related <u>Guidelines</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> <u>UNECE Evaluation Policy</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See Annex I and <u>Chair's conclusions of 131st EXCOM meeting, para. 45</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Criteria are detailed in Section III, B of the OIOS biennial report *Strengthening the role of evaluation and the application of evaluation findings on programme design, delivery and policy directives* (2020-2021); <u>A/78/70</u>, p.16

extrabudgetary project above \$250,000 would no longer be individually evaluated, but instead evaluation resources would be pooled to supplement the limited regular budget resources available to evaluate ECE annual Evaluation Plan, looking at all funding sources together in more comprehensive and qualitative reports. Finally, the Evaluation Trust Fund could also be used to strengthen the evaluation culture, build capacities on results-based management and support evaluation processes in the organization. The use of the Trust Fund would be annually reported to EXCOM through the Annual report on evaluation.

#### 4. EVALUATIONS COMPLETED IN 2023

#### **4.1 Internal evaluations**

13. The Evaluation Plan for 2023<sup>10</sup> was approved by EXCOM in December 2021<sup>11</sup>. The plan was developed based on an assessment of risks, as well as ensuring the widest possible coverage of the ECE programme of work over successive years.

14. As reflected in Table 1 below, a total of six evaluations were completed in 2023: one programme-level evaluation and five evaluations of extrabudgetary projects at the end of their cycles.

	Category of Evaluation	Evaluation report	Subprogramme(s)
1	Programme-level	Review of the UNECE's role to support the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, in the context of the UN development system reform	All
2	XB Project E355	Moving to carbon neutrality in the UNECE region	Sustainable energy
3	XB Project E317	Promoting innovation policy capacities in Eastern Europe and the Caucasus	Economic cooperation & integration
4	XB Project E340	Improved Sustainable Urban Development in 17 Norwegian Cities	Housing, land management & population
5	XB Project E345	Improved Capacities of UNECE member States in developing evidence-based policy measures to meet their commitments under MIPAA/RIS and 2017 Lisbon Ministerial Declaration: Ageing (Phase III)	Housing, land management & population
6	XB Project E264	Enhancing Coherence and Integration of Economic and Social Statistics in Support of the Implementation of 2008 SNA	Statistics

Table 1: Evaluations Completed in 2023

15. The following section contains highlights of the findings and recommendations made in the framework of the programme-level evaluation included in the 2023 Evaluation plan approved by EXCOM. For information on projects evaluations, please consult the evaluation reports at the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> 2023 Evaluation Workplan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Chair's conclusions of 119<sup>th</sup> EXCOM meeting, para. 53

links provided above.

# Programme-level evaluation of the UNECE's role to support the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, in the context of the UN development system reform <sup>12</sup>

16. This evaluation, conducted during Q2 and Q3 of 2023, looked at the period 2017-2023 and assessed the relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of UNECE in supporting the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, in the context of the UN development system reform (2017-2023).

17. The evaluation found that there has been a tangible and valuable increase in the visibility and understanding of the ECE offer within the UN system, particularly in the programme countries. However, this has not yet translated into significantly more joint initiatives, including joint programmes at country or regional level, with opportunities for resource mobilization.

18. Five priority concrete and actionable recommendations have been formulated to strengthen ECE's engagement through the development of a forward-looking vision.

19. ECE's management response was signed by the Executive Secretary on 20 November 2023<sup>13</sup> and presented to the EXCOM for information at the 132<sup>nd</sup> Meeting<sup>14</sup>; the five recommendations were accepted. The secretariat has committed to close all of them by 31 December 2025 and will report on their implementation through the biannual progress reports and to EXCOM in future Annual reports on evaluations.

20. A *Tentative Schedule of UNDA and XB Project Evaluations for 2023<sup>15</sup>* was included in Annex II of the Annual report on evaluation 2022. As detailed in Table 2 below, five projects were extended, and evaluations postponed accordingly into 2024. One project was ultimately not evaluated, and the evaluation of the UNDA project could only start in 2024.

	Project ID	Project Title	Comment
1	E267	International Centre of Excellence on PPPs: development and implementation of PPP standards and recommendations	Project extended until 31.12.2023, evaluation completed in March 2024
2	E331	Modernising Statistical Production Phase 3	Project extended until 31.12.2023, evaluation completed in March 2024
3	E293	Strengthening the capacity of Central Asian countries to implement trade facilitation measures and better integrate into the international rules-based trading system	Project extended until 31.12.2023, evaluation completed in June 2024
4	2023N	Strengthened innovation policies of landlocked Central Asian countries in support of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development	Project completed on 31.12.2023. Evaluation ongoing
5	E280	Working Group on Environmental Monitoring and Assessment (WGEM &A)	The project mobilized less than \$250,000 during the period and was therefore not selected for evaluation
6	E374	Strengthening cooperation and national capacities in selected UNECE countries for sustainable forest management	Project extended until 31.05.2024, evaluation ongoing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Evaluation of UNECE's role to support the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, in the context of the UN development system reform

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Management Response

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See <u>Chair's conclusions of 132<sup>thd</sup>EXCOM meeting, Item 7</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See p.14 of the <u>Annual report on evaluation 2022</u>

Γ		Project ID	Project Title	Comme	nt		
	7	E365, E371, E385, E413	Road Safety Phases V, VI and VII & Project Increasing Awareness for Road Safety	Phase 31.12.20 ongoing		extend Joint	until luation

Table 2: Projects extended in 2023

#### 4.2 External evaluations

21. In 2023, OIOS conducted an evaluation of Regular Programme of Technical Cooperation (RPTC)<sup>16</sup>, upon request from the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions (ACABQ)<sup>17</sup>. As one of the 11 RPTC implementing entities, ECE contributed actively to the evaluation.

22. RPTC is a core funding source for ECE to deliver technical cooperation in response to the demands from Member States, in close cooperation with UN Country Teams (UNCT) and Resident Coordinator system. The OIOS report made 3 recommendations applicable to ECE<sup>18</sup>: (1) share good practices and lessons learnt among RPTC implementing entities; (2) review RPTC guidelines pertaining to posts and non-post uses; and (4) better assess or evaluate outcomes of RPTC support.

23. In ECE's management response  $^{19}$ , the Executive Secretary accepted the 3 recommendations but also noted with regards to recommendation (2) that many Regional Advisers positions across implementing entities funded from RPTC have fixed terms or continuing contracts, and that a clear guidance from DMSPC would be required before devising any policy relating to the potential discontinuation of such contracts after 5 years as foreseen in RPTC modalities<sup>20</sup>.

24. To implement recommendation (4), ECE will revise its Evaluation Policy to include RPTC funded activities in the scope of future programme-level and subprogramme-level evaluations.

25. The secretariat has committed to close the three recommendations by 31 December 2025 and will report on their implementation through the biannual progress reports and to EXCOM in future Annual reports on evaluations.

26. This OIOS evaluation has been presented to the ACABQ in the second quarter of 2024, in the context of the review of the 2025 Proposed programme budget. ACABQ recommendations will be considered by the Fifth Committee of the General Assembly at its 79<sup>th</sup> session in October 2024.

## **5. IMPLEMENTATION OF OUTSTANDING RECOMMENDATIONS IN 2023**

#### 5.1 Implementation of outstanding recommendations from external evaluations

27. ECE reports progress on closing outstanding evaluations recommendations to OIOS every

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Evaluation of the Regular Programme of Technical Cooperation; IED-23-007

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See para. V.112 of <u>A/77/7</u>, endorsed in General Assembly <u>resolution 77/262</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Recommendation (3) was issued to DMSPC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> <u>Management response</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See for example, para. 23.16 of <u>A/78/6(Sect.23)</u>

six-months, and through the annual Compact of the Executive Secretary with the Secretary-General. All Progress Reports pertaining to ECE evaluations are available on the Open UNECE website. As reflected in Annex VII, in December 2023, ECE closed as implemented one recommendation from the *OIOS Thematic evaluation of secretariat support to the Sustainable Development Goals*<sup>21</sup>, two years ahead of the due date of 31 December 2025.

**5.2 Implementation of outstanding recommendations from internal evaluations** 

28. Since December 2018, progress reports from internal evaluations are prepared twice a year in June and December to inform on the actions taken to close the outstanding recommendations. In 2023: (a) 44 recommendations (59%) were closed as implemented; (b) 3 recommendations (4%) were partially implemented; (c) 6 recommendations (8%) were closed without implementation; and (d) 21 recommendations (28%) were outstanding as of 31 December 2023. Summary tables as of 30 June and 31 December 2023 are presented in Annexes III and V and the details of the actions taken can be found in progress reports as of 31 December 2023, available on Open UNECE<sup>22</sup> for each evaluation.

#### 6. LESSONS LEARNT FROM 2023 EVALUATIONS

29. As a result of the liquidity situation detailed in Chapter 2 of this report, the PMU could not organize an *Annual Exchange of Experience on Evaluations* in early 2024, as in previous years. As reflected in the ECE Evaluation Policy, the purpose of this exercise is to: (i) promote organizational learning; (ii) contribute to the improvement of programme performance; and (iii) ensure the accountability of the Secretariat.

#### **7. EVALUATION PARTNERSHIPS**

30. ECE leverages partnerships with other relevant organizations to enhance its evaluative function and activities, and coordinates with the other Regional Commissions through the Chiefs of Programme Planning, and the Evaluation Focal Point Network. ECE collaborates actively with the Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) on evaluation of UN Development Account (UNDA) projects. As reflected in Annex II, ECE will participate in 2024 to 3 evaluations of COVID-19 response joint UNDA projects, managed by lead entities.

31. ECE is an active member of the UN Evaluation Group (UNEG), which establishes the norms and standards for evaluation for all UN agencies, funds and programmes. UNEG is an interagency professional network that brings together the evaluation units of the UN system, including UN departments, specialized agencies, funds and programmes, and affiliated organizations. ECE also engages with the JIU, OIOS and DMSPC on a regular basis.

#### 8. UN-SWAP EVALUATION SCORECARD (GENDER) 2023

32. In 2018, UN-Women rolled out the UN-SWAP 2.0, which represents an update of the previous framework, building into its lessons learnt from the first five years of implementation.

33. As part of the annual reporting requirements, each department conducts an annual metaevaluation of all evaluations completed in the prior year. The UN-SWAP Evaluation Scorecard is a reporting tool organized around four criteria that capture the overall elements related to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> <u>E/AC.51/2023/3;</u> see also para. 30 of the <u>Annual report on evaluation 2022</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> <u>https://unece.org/evaluation-reports</u>

mainstreaming gender equality and the empowerment of women as reflected in the evaluation reports conducted by the entities in a given year.

34. ECE achieved a rating of Exceeds Requirements in UN SWAP 2.0 indicator 4 (evaluation) for the inclusion of gender in evaluations in 2023, based on a review of the eight evaluation reports, maintaining the 2019, 2020, 2021 and 2022 levels. The key drivers for this rating are (a) meeting the UNEG gender equality related norms and standards; (b) systematically applying UNEG Guidance on Integrating Human Rights and Gender Equality in Evaluations during all phases of the evaluation in ECE; and (c) conducting at least one evaluation to assess corporate performance on gender mainstreaming or equivalent every 5-8 years<sup>23</sup>.

#### 9. FUTURE EVALUATIONS

35. The 2024 Evaluation Work Plan as approved by EXCOM at its 126<sup>th</sup> meeting on 13 January 2023<sup>24</sup> is contained in Annex I. The projects scheduled to close in 2024 and that will undergo an evaluation are attached in Annex II.

36. EXCOM approved the 2025 Evaluation Work Plan<sup>25</sup> at its 131<sup>st</sup> meeting of 4 December 2023<sup>26</sup>; it is referred in the 2024 Proposed programme budget for Section 20, Economic development in Europe<sup>27</sup>, to be approved by the General Assembly in its 79<sup>th</sup> session.

37. The 2026 Evaluation plan will be submitted to EXCOM for approval, alongside with the review of the 2026 Proposed programme budget, in December 2024. As indicated in para. 9 of this report, only 1 subprogramme-level evaluation out of 3 will be conducted in 2024. To address the situation, the secretariat plans to seek EXCOM concurrence: (a) to postpone the 2 subprogramme-level evaluation approved for 2024 into 2025; and (b) to postpone the programme-level evaluation approved for 2025 into 2026.

#### List of Annexes:

Annex I: Approved ECE Evaluation Plan for 2024

Annex II: Tentative Schedule of UNDA and XB Project Evaluations for 2024

Annex III: Summary of Evaluation Recommendations as of 30 June 2023

Annex IV: List of recommendations from internal evaluations closed as of 30 June 2023

Annex V: Summary of Evaluation Recommendations as of 31 December 2023

Annex VI: List of recommendations from internal evaluations closed as of 31 December 2023

Annex VII: List of recommendations from external evaluations closed as of 31 December 2023

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> ECE conducted its last programme-level evaluation of Gender Mainstreaming in 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup>Chair's Conclusions from the 126th Meeting, para 73

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Informal document No. 2023/50

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Chair's Conclusions from 131st meeting, para 45

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> <u>A/79/6(Sect.20)</u>, para. 20.15

Evaluation Title	Subprogramm	e (Fin:	Resources ancial & Human)
Implementation of the Inland Transport Committee Strategy until 2030	Subprogramme 2 Transport	<b>P-4</b> : 1	al consultant)
Supporting member States in statistics for the Sustainable Development Goals	Subprogramme 3 Statistics	<b>P-4</b> : 1	al consultant)
Sustainable resource management: regular budget activities on the United Nations Framework Classification for Resources and the United Nations Resource Management System	Subprogramme 5 Sustainable Energy	<b>P-4:</b> 1	al consultant)
	Consultancy P-4, 3 months GS-OL, 1.5 month	<u>Unit Monthly Cost<sup>28</sup></u> \$17,125 \$12,308	Total           \$30,000           \$51,375           \$18,463           \$99,838

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Based on 2022 Salary Costs, at full rate, including common staff costs and without staff assessment

### Annex II: Tentative Schedule of UNDA and XB Project Evaluations for 2024

	<b>Evaluation Title</b>	Project ID	Funding Source/ Project Budget	Evaluation Budget <sup>29</sup> USD	ECE Responsible Staff / Subprogramme	Schedule (Q) <sup>30</sup>
1.	International Centre of Excellence on PPPs: development and implementation of PPP standards and recommendations	E267	XB/\$870,000	15,700	Tony Bonnici, Economic Cooperation and Integration	Q1
2.	Modernising Statistical Production Phase 3	E331	XB/\$600,000	10,400	Taeke Gjaltema, Statistics	Q1
3.	Strengthening Social Protection for Pandemic Response: Identifying the Vulnerable, Aiding Recovery and Building Resilience <sup>31</sup>	2023Y	UNDA/\$2,422,823	96,913	Andres Vikat, Statistics; Hilary Murphy, Office of the Executive Secretary	Q1
4.	Supporting UNECE member States in the development and implementation of the United Nations Framework Classification for Resources (UNFC) and the United Nations Resource Management System (UNRMS	E357	XB/\$2,272,727	37,000	Charlotte Griffiths, Sustainable Energy Division	Q2
5.	Strengthened innovation policies of landlocked Central Asian countries in support of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development	2023N	UNDA/\$483,300	15,000	Christopher Athey, Economic Cooperation and Integration	Q2
6.	Strengthening the capacity of Central Asian countries to implement trade facilitation measures and better integrate into the international rules-based trading system	E293	XB/\$350,000	8,000	Mario Apostolov, Trade	Q2
7.	Global Initiative towards post-Covid-19 resurgence of the Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) sector <sup>32</sup>	2023W	UNDA/\$4,572,300	182,000	Hana Daoudi, Trade	Q2
8.	Transport and Trade Connectivity in the age of pandemics <sup>33</sup>	2023X	UNDA/\$5,363,780	214,550	Konstantinos Alexopoulos, Sustainable transport; Mario Apostolov, Trade	Q2

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> In line with UNECE Evaluation policy, internal evaluations are conducted by consultants, final budget to be confirmed
 <sup>30</sup> Evaluations starting in Q4 will be finalized in Q1 2023
 <sup>31</sup> ECE portion for this project was \$195,500; the evaluation was led by ECA
 <sup>32</sup> ECE portion for this project was \$448,500; the evaluation was led by UNCTAD
 <sup>33</sup> ECE portion for this project was \$1,323,480; the evaluation was led by UNCTAD

	<b>Evaluation Title</b>	Project ID	Funding Source/ Project Budget	Evaluation Budget <sup>29</sup> USD	ECE Responsible Staff / Subprogramme	Schedule (Q) <sup>30</sup>
9.	Strengthening cooperation and national capacities in selected UNECE countries for sustainable forest management	E374	XB/\$257,800	5,200	Roman Michalak, Forest and the forest industry	Q3
10.	Inter-regional cooperation for the implementation of the New Urban Agenda <sup>34</sup>	2023P	UNDA/\$1,526,260	61,000	Tea Aulavuo, Housing land management	Q3
11.	Enhancing transparency and traceability for more sustainable value chains in the garment and footwear		XB/€2,932,080	30,000	Maria-Teresa Pisani, Trade	Q3
11.	sector	E414	AD/02,992,000	50,000		Q3
		E371		30,000	Nneka Henry, Road Safety Fund	
12.	Evaluation of the activities and projects conducted by the Secretariat of the Special Envoy on Road Safety (October	E365	XB/\$4,535,000			Q3
12.	2020 – June 2024)	E385		50,000	Thomas From y, Road Safety Fand	<b>X</b> 2
13.	Enhancing urban planning in the cities of Kharkiv and Mykolaiv in Ukraine by supporting to the implementation of the new master plans and facilitating investments in sustainable urban infrastructure	E423	XB/\$5,102,000	60,000	Thamara Monteiro De Arruda Fortes	Q4

 $<sup>^{34}</sup>$  ECE portion for this project was \$107,412; the evaluation will be led by UN-Habitat

Div.	Unit / Sections responsible	Project	Outstanding Recs as at 31.12.22	New Recs since 01.01.23	Recs closed (impl.) 30.06.23	Recs closed (not impl.) 30.06.2 3	Outstanding Recs as at 30.06.23
		Capacity Building for Cooperation on Dam Safety in Central Asia	3	-	-	1	2
ED	Office of the	Evidence-based environmental governance and sustainable environmental policies in support of the 2030 Agenda in South-East Europe	8	-	1	-	7
	Director	Activities serviced by UNECE under the Aarhus Convention and its Protocol on PRTRs	-	7	-	-	7
TD	WP.5	Sustainable transport connectivity and implementation of transport-related SDGs in selected landlocked and transit/bridging countries	5	-	-	-	5
SED	Office of the Director	Integrated energy and water resource management in support of sustainable development in South-East Europe and Central Asia	3	-	1	-	2
ECTD	WP.6	Enhancing usage and uptake of standards for sustainable development, gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls	5	-	-	-	5
Leib	Office of the Director	OIOS Evaluation of ECE Subprogrammes 4 and 6	-	4	-	-	4
		Forum of Mayors	12	-	6	-	6
FLHD	Office of the Director	Building urban economic resilience during and after COVID-19	5	-	2	-	3
	Director	Relevance of the Forest Products Annual Market Review to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector	5	-	-	-	5
OES	DES Office of DES Programme level evaluation: UNECE engagement with the Private Sector		8	-	-	-	8
<u> </u>			54	11	10	1	54
			83%	17%	15,5%	1,5%	83%

# Annex III: Summary of Evaluation Recommendations as of 30 June 2023

# Annex IV: List of recommendations from internal evaluations closed as of 30 June 2023

#	<b>Report Recommendation</b>	Management Response	Final Progress Report
Envir	ronment, Capacity-building for	cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 3, Jul	y 2021
1	UNECE to continue supporting national and regional capacities on hydraulic and hydro-electric structures and cooperation on dam safety, in close cooperation with relevant global and regional organizations, and donors.	<b>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</b> Depending on available funding UNECE will continue to support cooperation on dam safety if a proper regional institution willing to address the dam safety challenges is allocated. However, supporting capacities on hydro- electric structures has never been the focus of UNECE initiative. UNECE will explore cooperation opportunities with the International Fund for Saving the Aral Sea (IFAS) which is mandated to address the dam safety challenges in the region.	Closed without implementation in June 2023 During the reporting period efforts were made to identify a regional institution mandated to address the dam safety challenges in Central Asia. On 27 July 2021, a letter was sent to the Chair of the Executive Committee of the International Fund for Saving the Aral Sea (IFAS) with the proposal to lead and coordinate the work on dams' challenges in the region. A reminder was sent on 3 December 2021. As of June 2023, no response has been received regarding the letter addressed to the IFAS. In addition, the project manager raised this issue during a meeting with the Executive Director of IFAS. Despite the expressed importance of this area for the region, the Executive Director did not welcome the inclusion of this matter in IFAS' activities.
1	Project design: UNECE may consider developing a Theory of Change for projects in the future to describe the processes through which change comes about for individuals, stakeholder groups, ministries, industry, or communities. The Theory of Change should provide an assumption (or series of assumptions) about how change will happen in a country, regardless of what a donor or project does or does not do.	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation. A request that project managers develop a Theory of Change for project proposals is included in the ECE Concept Note and Project Document template, namely under sections 1. Context (development challenges), 10. Country level situation analysis and 11. Stakeholder analysis and capacity assessment. UNECE Programme Management Unit (PMU) will continue to monitor that such elements are adequately addressed in projects Concept Notes and Documents. PMU will also share with ECE project managers existing UN guidance on how to develop a theory of change when designing projects. Furthermore, PMU will bring this recommendation to the attention of DESA-Programme Management Team,	Inclusion       Implemented as of 30 June 2023         PMU updated the ECE Concept Note and Project Document template and included a section recommending the development of a project-wide theory of change for projects at or above USD 250,000 and requiring it for projects at or above USD 1 million.         PMU shared with ECE directors and project managers existing UN guidance on how to develop a theory of change when designing projects on 30 January 2023, together with the updated ECE Concept Note and Project Document template.         PMU shared with DESA-Programme Management Team, the UNDA project Manager, the revised ECE Concept Note and Projects on 15 February 2023, after distribution to ECE directors and project managers.
Sucto	inable Energy Integrated Ener	the UNDA project Manager.	Istainable Development in South-Eastern Europe and Central Asia, May-22
2	Continue country-level capacity building: This project	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 30 June 2023         Ukraine has received support under the Regular Programme of Technical Cooperation

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	discussing key areas of potential focus. While there was general appreciation of the work done on this project, there was some expectation from stakeholders interviewed that there should have been a greater element of 'hands on' capacity building. However, for this project it was not possible due to the Covid-19 crisis, where the majority of project activities were implemented online. For future projects, UNECE should launch a project with a presentation for all UN Country Teams (UNCT) of the project beneficiary countries and follow up with UNCTs in the process of project implementation. If further technical assistance is needed after the completion of the project, UNECE should work with UNCTs in the countries on providing such technical assistance and/or consider using other resources available internally for this purpose.	country-level capacity building on energy and water resources management in the beneficiary countries, including hands-on training and the development of case studies, through Regular Programme of Technical Cooperation (RPTC) and United Nations Development Account (UNDA) funds as well as through in-kind contributions. In 2022, SED plans to utilize RPTC funds to support Ukraine in producing a report on critical raw materials and holding a national workshop. As part of UNDA Global Initiative towards post-COVID-19 resurgence of the MSME sector, in 2022 SED will support national workshops in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Serbia, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. In 2023, RPTC and UNDA funds availability will be explored to support all the six countries. ii. In all its upcoming projects, SED will keep UN RCOs in the beneficiary countries abreast and will ensure thorough communication and coordination with relevant UNCT members, including by making presentations on the projects to the UNCTs	<ul> <li>(RPTC) in 2022 and will continue to receive further assistance under RPTC in 2023. This support has helped Ukraine to strengthen its institutional and regulatory capacities, improve its data collection and analysis, and align its policies and standards with the UNECE norms and conventions. Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan are also receiving support through the United Nations Development Account (UNDA) 14th Tranche Project for post-COVID-19 recovery in Eastern Europe, Western Balkans, Central Asia, the Middle East, and Africa (2022-2025). This project aims to enhance the resilience and sustainability of the countries' socio-economic systems by promoting green and circular economy approaches, fostering innovation and digitalization, and facilitating regional cooperation and integration.</li> <li>SED organized national workshops in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Serbia, Kazakhstan, and Kyrgyzstan in 2022 as part of UNDA's Global Initiative towards the post-COVID-19 resurgence of the MSME sector. These workshops provided a platform for dialogue and knowledge exchange among policymakers, private sector representatives, academia, civil society, and international organizations on the challenges and opportunities for MSMEs in the post-pandemic context. The workshops also identified policy recommendations and best practices to support MSMEs' recovery and growth, such as enhancing access to finance, markets, and technology, fostering innovation and entrepreneurship, and improving the business environment.</li> <li>As a part of the triple crisis project, the UNDA 16th Tranche Project on Enhancing Capacities in the sustainable production of critical raw materials required for low-carbon transitions. The project will have a strong capacity-building focus, including training workshops, technical assistance, policy advice, and knowledge products. Kazakhstan and Kryrgzzstan are beneficiaries of the project, which is expected to span four years and start in 2023. The project will have a strong capacity-building focus, including trai</li></ul>

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
Hous	ing, Land Management & Population, Building urban economic resi	lience during and after COVID-19, Dec-22	
2	ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA, UN-Habitat and UNCDF should consider mobilizing resources (UNDA or other) for a follow-up project to support the implementation and monitoring of ERBPs in the pilot cities. A draft concept note for a DA 16th tranche project was developed to support urban economic resilience building for inclusive responses and recovery regarding natural, man- made disasters, internal and external shocks. If implemented in some of the pilot cities, this proposed project could help them update the city diagnostics, track progress in the ERBPs, and continue building their capacities in relation with resilience planning, monitoring (including data collection and management), and implementation in the context of the multiple economic crises that cities are facing in the current international juncture.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> The DA 16th tranche concept note was submitted by the consortium and is currently being reviewed by UN DESA.	Implemented as of 30 June 2023 The concept note for a DA 16th tranche project was accepted by UN DESA for funding; the follow up project is to start in January 2024, and it will support urban economic resilience building for inclusive responses and recovery regarding natural, man-made disasters, internal and external shocks in five pilot projects globally.
5	ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA, UN-Habitat and UNCDF should continue implementing joint, global projects to fully harness potential synergies and multiply outcomes. Future joint projects should replicate the project's governance arrangements, including the appointment of a leading agency supported by a project manager, weekly Steering Committee meetings, knowledge management systems, and a unified implementation strategy with clear but adaptable deliverables and milestones.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. The project governance structure will be replicated in the 16th Tranche project application which was submitted to UN DESA. Considering the efficiency of the "Building Urban Economic Resilience during and after COVID-19" in terms of the project governance arrangements, the consortium agreed to continue in the same manner.	<b>Implemented as of 30 June 2023</b> The approved by UNDA 16th tranche project that was accepted by UN DESA for funding, replicates the governance arrangements of the previous project and the knowledge database through <u>https://urbaneconomics.org/</u> and a SharePoint based internal database.
Hous	ing, Land Management & Population, Evaluation of UNECE Forum	of Mayors, Jul-22	
7	Strengthen the connection with the work of other UNECE subprogrammes and divisions. The above-mentioned JPO position, together with the recently established fully dedicated Regional Advisor position, should contribute to improve cross-collaboration with other divisions and the quality of UNECE services.	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.accepts the recommendation.At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM made no recommendation or decision in this regard. The JPO and the Regional Adviser will in any case continue to promote cross-divisional cooperation on matters related to cities.	<b>Implemented as of 13 January 2023</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM made no recommendation or decision in this regard. The JPO and the Regional Adviser will in any case continue to promote cross- divisional cooperation on matters related to cities.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
9	Strengthen the current city selection system that fully corresponds with the intergovernmental nature of UNECE. Further develop objective selection criteria to ensure alignment with the work of CUDHLM and maximize impact. The limit of one city per country is a pragmatic approach. In the future, an increased number could be considered if sufficient resources are available. In any case, the selection should allow to mix new with previous participants.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM established specific selection criteria and selection process. The selection is expected to be completed by May 2023.	Implemented as of 30 June 2023At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM establishedspecific selection criteria and selection process.As of 1 May 2023, with reference to the Note to member Statesof 14 February 2023 requesting nominations for cities toparticipate in the Forum of Mayors 2023 and in line withDecision ECE/EX/2023/L.4, the secretariat and the Bureau ofthe Forum of Mayors 2023 and in line withDecision ECE/EX/2023/L.4, the secretariat and the Bureau ofthe Forum of Mayors:a. Received nominations from a number of countries;b. For those countries which did not send a nomination, selectedcities to participate.
10	Organize the Forum on an annual basis, at least until it becomes a well- known event and frequency could be then reconsidered. The Forum is a work in progress with immense opportunities to build up a record of action beyond sharing experiences. A yearly event would allow the Forum to "keep the momentum" and provide a response to a quickly evolving context by offering a neutral platform to bring stakeholders together.	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation. In line with ECE/EX/2/Rev.1 ("Guidelines for the establishment and functioning of teams of specialists within UNECE"), at its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided to hold the FoM in 2023 and 2024. It also decided that a review will be undertaken before recommending extension.	<b>Implemented as of 13 January 2023</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided to hold the FoM in 2023 and 2024. It also decided that a review will be undertaken before recommending extension.
11	Organize the Forum two or three times in Geneva and then consider alternating every other year. This would minimize any selection problems, facilitate participation, ensure economies of scale, strengthen the Forum's character and connection with United Nations processes and stress mayors as another layer of diplomacy.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided the first two sessions will be organized in Geneva, as per draft decision contained in ECE/EX/2023/L.4.	<b>Implemented as of 13 January 2023</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided the first two sessions will be organized in Geneva, as per draft decision contained in ECE/EX/2023/L.4.
13	Consider including a "global segment" in the Forum's future sessions so as to contribute to the global vision of the future of cities. The selection of participants should be based on clear criteria to ensure that their engagement benefits all parties, including the other Regional Commissions of the United Nations.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM invited Regional Commissions to organize an "interregional segment" back-to- back with the Forum to include mayors from all the regions, to exchange good practices among	Implemented as of 30 June 2023 At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM invited Regional Commissions to organize an "interregional segment" back-to-back with the Forum to include mayors from all the regions, to exchange good practices among peers and with other interested stakeholders. Details of the interregional segment are

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
		peers and with other interested stakeholders. Details of the interregional segment should be discussed with all interested stakeholders and should be shared well ahead of the Forum with all UNECE member States.	being discussed with all interested stakeholders and will be shared well ahead of the Forum with all UNECE member States. Participants have been selected and a draft programme of "Interregional Segment", organized back-to-back with the Forum of Mayors, has been prepared in close collaboration with other Regional Commissions.
14	Consider formalizing the position of "Patron" of the Forum to increase its visibility and the participation of urban stakeholders beyond the usual UNECE constituency.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> With a view to promoting awareness and harnessing support for the Forum of Mayors, at its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided that the Chairperson and the two Vice-Chairpersons, in consultation with the secretariat, should designate an "Advocate of the Forum" for each Forum. Such person shall not be a mayor and shall have a distinguished record of exemplary support for the objectives of the Forum of Mayors and the CUDHLM. Gender and geographic diversity in the designation of the "Advocate of the Forum" should be invited to give a statement during the Forum. Architect Norman Foster was appointed "Advocate of the Forum" for 2023, as per draft decision contained in ECE/EX/2023/L.4.	Implemented as of 13 January 2023 With a view to promoting awareness and harnessing support for the Forum of Mayors, at its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided that the Chairperson and the two Vice- Chairpersons, in consultation with the secretariat, should designate an "Advocate of the Forum" for each Forum. Such person shall not be a mayor and shall have a distinguished record of exemplary support for the objectives of the Forum of Mayors and the CUDHLM. Gender and geographic diversity in the designation of the "Advocate of the Forum" should be ensured. The "Advocate of the Forum" should be invited to give a statement during the Forum. Architect Norman Foster was appointed "Advocate of the Forum" for 2023, as per draft decision contained in ECE/EX/2023/L.4.

Annex V: Summary of Evaluation Recommendations as of 31 December 2023
-----------------------------------------------------------------------

Div.	Unit / Sections responsible	Project	Outstanding Recs as at 30.06.2023	New Recs since 01.07.2023	Recs closed (impl.) 31.12.2023	Recs closed (part. impl.) as at 31.12.2023	Recs closed without impl. as at 31.12.2023	Outstanding Recs as at 31.12.2023
ED	Office of the Director	Capacity Building for Cooperation on Dam Safety in Central Asia	2	-	1	1	-	-
ED	Office of the Director	Evidence-based environmental governance and sustainable environmental policies in support of the 2030 Agenda in South-East Europe	7	-	7	-	-	-
ED	Aarhus Convention	Activities serviced by UNECE under the Aarhus Convention and its Protocol on PRTRs	7	-	4	-	-	3
STD	WP.5	Sustainable transport connectivity and implementation of transport-related SDGs in selected landlocked and transit/bridging countries	5	-	1	-	-	4
SED	Office of the Director	Integrated energy and water resource management in support of sustainable development in South-East Europe and Central Asia	2	-	2	-	-	-
SED	Sust. Energy section	Moving to carbon neutrality in the UNECE region	-	3	-	-	-	3
ECTD	WP.6	Enhancing usage and uptake of standards for sustainable development, gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls	5	-	4	-	-	1
ECTD	Office of the Director	OIOS Evaluation of ECE Subprogrammes 4 and 6	4	-	-	-	_	4
FLHD	HLMU	Evaluation of the Forum of Mayors	6	-	6	-	-	-
FLHD	HLMU	Building urban economic resilience during and after COVID- 19	3	-	3	-	-	-
FLHD	HLMU	Improved Sustainable Urban Development in 17 Norwegian Cities	-	6	2	-	-	4
FLHD	Forestry	Relevance of the Forest Products Annual Market Review to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector	5	-	3	-	-	2
OES	DES	Review of UNECE engagement with the Private Sector	8	-	1	2	5	-
			54	9	34	3	5	21
			86%	14%	54%	5%	8%	33%

Annex VI: List of recommendations	from internal evaluations	closed as of 31 December 2023
Thinks vit List of recommendations	II om meethal evaluations	

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report			
Offic	office of the Executive Secretary, Review of United Nations Economic Commission for Europe engagement with the private sector, September 2021					
1	Strengthen buy-in from membership, senior management and other relevant stakeholders within the Organization through better sharing the benefits of engaging with the private sector. This would allow to forge a consensus on what is expected from the private sector (desirable scenario).	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> UNECE, with inputs of all subprogrammes, will prepare a Partnership Strategy, which will clarify inter alia, the benefits of engaging with the private sector.	Closed without implementation on 31 December 2023 A <u>Partnerships Report</u> was presented to EXCOM on 30 September 2022. A <u>Note on partnerships</u> was presented to EXCOM at the 131st Meeting. The Chair's Conclusions indicate that EXCOM took note (Para. 53).			
2	Review the Framework in the spirit of SDG 17 (living document) and complement it with an overarching UNECE partnership strategy. This would include providing operational guidance that is responsive to current issues in the specific context of UNECE's mandate and activities.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> The Partnership Strategy will provide operational guidance for engagement with the private sector at the subprogramme level, in the context of UNECE's mandate and activities.	<b>Closed as implemented on 31 December 2023</b> While the secretariat concluded that the Note on partnerships presented to EXCOM in December 2023 was sufficient to outline his vision, an internal operational guidance is now available in ECE Intranet.			
3	In the business sector partnership strategy, clarify the type of partnerships and determine their role in advancing UNECE's mandate. This would allow to strategize on its vision and areas of engagement, ensuring that competing interests are sufficiently represented and possibly exploring innovative types of collaboration (ensuring consistency with other rules such as those related to the right to vote, non-reimbursable loans of personnel services from external sources, etc.)	UNECE accepts the recommendation. The Partnership Strategy, to be developed in consultation with all the subprogrammes will clarify the type of partnerships with the private sector and determine their role in advancing UNECE's mandate, ensuring that competing interests are sufficiently represented, including with regard to the UN rules, policies and procedures.	<b>Closed without implementation on 31 December 2023</b> While the Partnerships Report presented to EXCOM on 30 September 2022 spells out the types of partnerships in place, the Secretariat decided to opt for a flexible approach reflected in the Note on partnerships, without spelling out fixed categories.			

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
4	Strengthen the organizational capacity to develop and manage partnerships, including clarification of internal processes and specific awareness raising activities (even training) for staff. This would allow a strengthened implementation of a partnership strategy and learning from successes and failures.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. Partnerships have been centralized in the Office of the Deputy-Executive Secretary since 1 September 2021. While internal processes have already been simplified in practice, they will be outlined in the Partnership Strategy. The training of staff will need to be supported within existing resources. Subsequent Partnerships reports to EXCOM will inform member States about the implementation of the strategy.	<b>Partially implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> Many discussions have taken place in ECE, towards the finalization of the Note on partnerships, presented to EXCOM in December 2023. These discussions have contributed to strengthen the organizational capacity on partnership. An internal operational guidance clarifying processes is available in ECE Intranet. However, no training of staff was organized, and Partnership reports will only be produced upon request from EXCOM.
5	Strengthen capacities that support collaboration with the business sector, including improved due diligence and risk management. This would allow to further develop the due diligence and associated processes as a function that is meant to serve the Organization to identify the most strategic opportunities, while at the same time properly assessing potential risks (including simplified mechanisms tailored to low-risk types of engagement or small financial contributions).	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation. ECE support functions are funded from the regular budget and opportunities to strengthen capacities are limited, with reference to the zero-growth instructions included in the guidance from the Secretary-General in the last 10 years. However, UNECE is always looking for efficiencies through the improvement of existing internal processes. The due diligence and associated processes will be aligned with the Partnership Strategy to identify the most strategic opportunities, while at the same time properly assessing potential risks.	Closed without implementation on 31 December 2023 The due diligence and associated processes remain as approved by EXCOM in 2017.
6	Implement a monitoring system of the engagement with the private sector at Subprogramme/Division level and establish a consolidated knowledge management database at the Organization level. This would allow to promote clear results and replicating good practices.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. A first Partnerships report will be presented to EXCOM in 2022; it will provide information on partnerships at Subprogramme/Division level, including with the private sector, and capture best practices. An internal knowledge management system will also be released by the end of 2022 and will, among other areas, enable a more streamlined information and knowledge sharing as regards the partnerships with the private sector.	<b>Partially implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> The development of a knowledge management system requires resources. As of 31 December 2023, most of the components are still being developed with the support of existing resources.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
7	Consider putting in place a "one-stop shop" to receive and appropriately channel private sector partnership initiatives which could facilitate engagement and reduce the associated bureaucracy.	<b>UNECE</b> accepts the recommendation. Partnerships have been centralized in the Office of the Deputy-Executive Secretary since 1 September 2021. While internal processes have already been simplified in practice, they will be outlined in the Partnership Strategy.	<b>Closed without implementation on 31 December 2023</b> The development of private sector partnerships remains decentralized at the division-level. An internal operational guidance clarifying processes is available in ECE Intranet.
8	Partnerships should explore the possibility of engaging various Subprogrammes exploiting more fully the potential of new relationships (such as cross-sectorial cooperation around the UNECE nexus areas) to achieve a greater impact on the SDGs, including SDG 5 on gender equality. This could be done both in the partnership strategy itself or during its implementation (specific agreements).	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> The Partnerships reports will reflect at the subprogramme level the engagement with the private sector to achieve a greater impact on the SDGs, including SDG 5 on gender equality.	Closed without implementation on 31 December 2023 Per the Note on partnerships, Partnership reports will only be produced upon request from EXCOM.
Envi	ronment, Evaluation of project "Capacity-building	g for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase	3", July 2021
3	During the future similar project designs UNECE should include explicit provisions to address gender equality, vulnerable people and disabled in project activities, outcomes, as well as reporting. One of the directions could be to make a study/assessment of how gender roles, as well as situation of vulnerable/disabled people could be influenced by displacement and environmental migration as a consequence of a major dam accident. National crisis management agencies should be actively integrated in these efforts.	<ul> <li>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation</li> <li>1. Gender assessment is part of the standard template of the concept note and it was addressed at the design stage of the project. As to the vulnerable and disable people this aspect was not part of the project template and can be added subject to amendment of the concept template.</li> <li>2. Follow-up projects on dam safety will assess in the inception phase the potential impact of the project on gender equality and the situation of the vulnerable groups, as reflected in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development</li> </ul>	<ul><li>addresses gender equality, human rights, Leaving no one behind and disability inclusion.</li><li>2. As of 31 December 2023 there was no follow up project on dam safety.</li></ul>

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
6	For the purposes of sustainability in development of legal, regulatory and technical frameworks on dam safety in Central Asia, UNECE should maintain frequent engagement with Governments and other partners through, but not limited to advisory missions.	<b>UNECE accepts this recommendation.</b> The challenges and the need to strengthen cooperation in the area of dam safety in the region as well as the results of the UNECE initiative will be presented at the various events (SPECA Working Group on Water, Energy and Environment, relevant regional platforms; Water MoP) conducted in the region. UNECE will also provide advisory, intermediary, mediation services to other donor and development organizations (e.g. IWAC, GIZ, AFD) interested in addressing the Central Asian countries' dam safety challenges. In addition, it will be implemented through various relevant missions including conducted by the Regional Advisor on Environment.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> The project results, lessons learnt as well as the dam safety challenges in the region are regularly presented at the regional and national events that are conducted in Central Asia. The final results of the project were presented at the SPECA Working Group on Water, Energy and Environment, 10-11 November 2021. The project manager is regularly contacted and consulted by governments and regional organizations that are engaged or plan to engage in the dam safety activities in the region. For example, inputs were provided to the work plan of the International Water Assessment Center (IWAC). UNECE has continued to raise awareness about the project results in subsequent years. A presentation was delivered at the 25th meeting of the SPECA WG on Water, Energy and Environment. UNECE staff attended the 2nd International Training Workshop on the Safety of Hydraulic Structures organized by the International Water Assessment Center in cooperation with Government of Slovakia. Cooperation on water resources and dam safety was a topic for discussion of a meeting between the UNECE ES and a staff member with the Slovak organizations dealing with these issues (23 November 2022). UNECE received a letter from the Ministry of Water Resources of Uzbekistan with a request to support addressing dam safety in the country. On 20 April 2023, the need to strengthen dam safety cooperation was discussed at the regional meeting organized by the UN Regional Centre for Preventive Diplomacy in Central Asia (UNRCCA). Initiating new activities on dam safety was also discussed with the OSCE Office in Dushanbe on 5 May 2023.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
		t Evidence-based environmental governa	ance and sustainable environmental policies in support of the 2030 Agenda in South-East Europe,
_	pr-22		
2	<b>Regional information sharing</b> :	UNECE accepts the	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
	2.1: Acknowledging that sharing	recommendation.	The EPR unit organized three workshops on waste management, climate change, and disaster risk
	information is already ongoing,	The Environmental Performance	reduction based on Policies and practices on the basis of UNECE Environmental Performance Reviews.
	continued sharing clean industry	Reviews (EPR) unit will address	About 20 countries participated in the workshops. In order to prepare the workshop, EPR related
	practices or step by step approaches	environmental risks/hazards and waste	recommendations were assessed including the participation of CSOs.
	for overcoming negative	in reviews of countries at their request	
	consequences of environmental	and to share information on reviews and	The workshops were carried out in September and October 2023. The main objectives were:
	hazards and waste across countries	recommendations with all countries in	• Provide a platform for countries of Eastern and South-eastern Europe, Central Asia and the Caucasus
	in the region.	the region (2.1).	to share their experiences in addressing respective topics and to support cooperation between the relevant experts.
	2.2: Depending on funding	Subject to the availability of resources,	• Discuss opportunities and challenges considering the implementation of the Sustainable Development
	available, organise a workshop for	the EPR unit will organize a regional	Goals
	all project countries inviting		• Improve the understanding of available tools and instruments.
	representatives of governments,	environmental risks/hazards and/or	• Brainstorm, discuss and identify solutions to overcome challenges and remove bottlenecks.
	CSOs/ UN system and EU active in	waste (2.2).	
	those countries, to share experiences, network, and develop		
	partnerships for future needs.		
	Alternatively organise workshops		
	at national level.		
3	Climate Change:	UNECE accepts the	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
		recommendation.	
	Consider how to best mainstream		The Environment Division has arranged discussions with PMU, the ECE Climate Action Task Force and
	climate change considerations into	The Environment Division, in consultation with PMU, the ECE	ECE Regional Advisors on how to best mainstream climate change considerations into future projects. Following a review of the climate change mainstreaming strategies by the UN and other international
	all projects, linking with the UNECE Climate Task Force/	Climate Action Task Force and ECE	organizations, UNECE has updated its project Concept Note template in 2023, with one section on
	Regional Advisors, whilst also	Regional Advisors, will discuss how to	Contribution to climate change mitigation and adaptation. The Evaluation Policy was also revised in
	ensuring linkages to relevant results	best mainstream climate change	December 2021, highlighting the Paris Climate Agreement of 2015 as one relevant internationally agreed
	groups of UN Country Teams.	considerations into future projects,	principle to be promoted and uphold in evaluation practice. The UNECE secretariat to the Industrial
		subject to member States concurrence,	Accidents Convention has supported mainstreaming climate change and industrial safety considerations,
		to ensure that they contribute to member	by developing its work on Natech (natural hazard triggered technological accidents). A joint
		States' attainment of their UN global commitments, namely those contained	UNECE/OECD Seminar on Natech risk management was organized on 29 November 2022 as part of the twelfth meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP-12).
		in the Paris agreement. The consultation	the function income of the function (Cor -12).
		with PMU and ECE Regional Advisors	The development of OECD/UN/EU JRC Guidance on Natech risk management was initiated in 2022 and
		will among others aim at ensuring	will be pursued actively in 2023, aiming to finalize it by end-2023, to publish in 2024. Natech risks are also
		linkages to relevant results groups of	being considered in the majority of the assistance activities in EECCA and SEE countries. More
		UN Country Teams.	specifically, UNECE supported Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan in addressing industrial accident including

#	<b>Report Recommendation</b>	Management Response	Final Progress Report
			Natech risk in national DRR documents under a joint UNECE-UNDRR project during the period 15 August 2022 - 15 Jan 2023.
			The Environmental Monitoring and Assessment Programme has supported countries in the past to enhance their environmental monitoring and statistics including in the area of climate change. In 2023 a regional training on the revised UNECE indicators on air and related to climate change was conducted under the programme with funding from the EU.
			UNECE is a leading member of the UN inter-agency Issue-based Coalition (IBC) on Environment and Climate Change. UNECE worked with UNEP and UNESCO to issue Guidance on integrating the Environment and Climate Change in Processes for UNSDCFs in July 2021, and follow-up training in December 2021-January 2022. UNECE led the preparation of an IBC policy brief on the importance of a continued focus on climate action in support of UNCT engagement with Governments in Europe and Central Asia, issued in October 2022. The Water Convention has supported mainstreaming of climate change and water among its work programme 2022-2024 and this issue will be discussed at the Water Convention 14th meeting of the Task Force on water and climate that will be held in February 2024 in Geneva. https://unece.org/info/Environmental-Policy/WaterConvention/events/386480 Under the Air Convention, UNECE will start a new project on aligning air pollutant and GHG emission inventories development in Central Asian countries in 2024. Regional Adviser on Environment is co-chairing Results Groups in Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. While co-leading the discussion on joint workplans and joint resource mobilization, she ensures the integration of climate change aspects, in particular in the Vision 2030 Fund in Uzbekistan she continuously advocating climate actions to be prioritized for the second
4	Capacity building:	UNECE accepts the recommendation	resource allocation strategy. Implemented as of 31 December 2023
	4.1 Continue to develop projects where UNECE provides support in prioritizing recommendations arising from EPRs. Continue to work with staff in ministries who understand the SDGs and have energy and enthusiasm to move the agenda forward.	develop project proposals to provide support to UNECE member States in prioritizing recommendations arising	4.1 Under the Air Convention, a recent project proposal for consideration by the EU Delegation in Uzbekistan takes the recent EPR recommendations for the country into account. In the EPR unit, project proposals were elaborated that successfully mobilized resources for the holding of three workshops to support reviewed countries in their implementation of EPR recommendations. The three workshops, held in September and October 2023, looked at policies and practices regarding waste management, climate change and disaster risk reduction. In each case, the workshop programme included introductions to national policies, strategies and regulatory frameworks, with an emphasis on identifying replicable initiatives appropriate to the reviewed countries.
	4.2: Encourage countries to develop their own environmental training programmes including systems where training of trainer capacity building becomes systematic and reaches inspection authorities	own environmental training programmes including systems where training of trainer capacity building becomes systematic and reaches inspection authorities responsible for	4.2 Under the Environmental Monitoring and Assessment Programme support is provided to UNECE member States in transition to enhance their environmental monitoring and assessment systems and to follow-up on EPR recommendations. In 2022 the programme has for example, initiated support for the development of a National State of the Environment report in Uzbekistan which was finalized in December 2023. Moreover, the Air Convention recently developed a project proposal on air quality monitoring and

#	<b>Report Recommendation</b>	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	responsible for environmental		management, including training, in Uzbekistan, which took the recommendations on air protection in the
	enforcement.	The Environment Division will unpack	3rd Cycle EPR of Uzbekistan (2020) as a basis.
	<ul> <li>4.3 Apart from technical environmental issues, UNECE should also unpack related aspects of governance where member States require support– e.g. transparency, accountability aspects; how to develop an accountability chain; or how to be inclusive and unlock citizens participation.</li> <li>4.4 The UNECE nexus approach must continue to be shared with member states. During UNECE missions hold workshops on the nexus approach in a concrete way. Continue to encourage ministries to engage on the SDGs across sector</li> </ul>	The Environment Division will unpack related aspects of governance where member States require support (4.3). The Environment Division will continue to share with member States the UNECE nexus approach and to encourage ministries to engage on the SDGs across sector silos, including through workshops and projects, subject to the availability of resources (4.4).	<ul> <li>4.3 Following requests from countries undergoing the EPR process, the EPR unit organized three workshops in Skopje, which helped unpacking aspects of governance related to waste management, climate change and disaster risk reduction. The EU4Environment (Green Economy in Eastern Partnership Countries) project implemented by the Espoo Convention secretariat includes multiple events on strategic environmental assessment (SEA), with each including a component on public participation.</li> <li>For example, within an SEA pilot project in Azerbaijan, a public hearing on the SEA for the draft master plan of the city of Ganja was held in September 2023.</li> <li>4.4 UNECE has, among others, pursued a nexus approach, by supporting the establishment of interinstitutional working groups on mine tailing's safety and the prevention of accidental water pollution in Kazakhstan and Tajikistan and continuing to pursue the engagement of relevant institutions and their cross sectoral considerations in 2023. A National Policy Dialogue (NDP) on Industrial Safety in Serbia, initiated since 2021 under the leadership of the Ministry of Environmental Protection, in close cooperation with the Ministry of Interior and the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Management, with support by the UNECE, under the auspices of its Industrial Accidents Convention, also engages various institutions and serves as a platform to address respective cross-sectoral concerns and gaps.</li> <li>A Launch meeting, two NPD Steering Committee Meetings and a Stakeholder Consultation meeting have</li> </ul>
	silos, using projects such as these as		been held in the period 2021-2023. A National Programme on Industrial Safety, a document outlining the
	a means.		national strategy in terms of industrial accidents prevention, preparedness, and response, is being developed under the NPD. The work under the NPD on Industrial Safety in Serbia will continue in 2024.
5	EU Accession focus	UNECE partially accepts the	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
5	Le recession locus	recommendation, while recalling that	Implemented as 01 51 December 2025
	Any new projects that support Western Balkans countries to implement the SDGs should also try to align (somewhat) with the EU Green Agenda. Highlight how the EPR methodology also facilitates EU law and how EU law is built on and references major UNECE Conventions.	UNECE does not promote the instruments of regional economic integration organizations. The Environment Division will, in any new projects that support Western Balkans countries to implement the SDGs, take into consideration the EU Green Agenda. The EPR Unit will continue to recognize links with EU law in its reviews of countries that are EU members, candidates or partners	The Environment Division has not initiated any new projects dedicated to supporting Western Balkans countries to implement the SDGs. However, the Environment Division co-chairs the regional UN Inter- agency Issue-based Coalition on Environment and Climate Change and the Environment Division organized, for example, a webinar on 29 November 2022 on "Enabling policies and strategic frameworks: towards a more strategic approach to supporting the green transition". The accompanying guidance note refers repeatedly to the EU Green Deal. The webinar was the last in a series of five events supporting UN Country Teams in their assistance to member States in the green transition. The dialogue with UN Country Teams on this topic continued in a regional workshop organized by the Coalition in November 2023, in which a case study was presented from the West Balkans of "Growth through Green and Just Recovery from COVID-19" in the context of the EU agenda. The Coalition has been invited to continue fostering coordinated UN support on environment and climate change in the West Balkans, inevitably in line with the EU Green Agenda. The next EPRs will be of Montenegro and Republic of Moldova, both EU candidate countries, and the same practice as employed recently for Romania (a recent EU member State) and Armenia (which has a Comprehensive and Enhanced Partnership Agreement with the EU), in terms of linking the review of the legal and policy framework to EU law and policy, will be applied as per the EPR

#	<b>Report Recommendation</b>	Management Response	Final Progress Report
			methodology. Meanwhile, workshops held in North Macedonia in September and October 2023 to support
			countries in implementing waste- and climate change-related EPR recommendations (see recommendation 4.1 above) referred to the relevant EU laws.
			4.1 above) referred to the relevant EO laws.
6	Politics and advocacy	UNECE accepts the	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
_		recommendation.	r · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	6.1: At policy level, UNECE must		6.1 As co-chair of the Result Groups in Tajikistan and Uzbekistan, the Regional Adviser on Environment
	continue to work with high level	The Environment Division will work	conveys messages of commitments made to SDGs and climate change agreements at various platforms such
	representatives from member State ministries of environment to convey	with member State ministries of environment to convey messages of	as at the joint UNSDCF Steering Committee and SDG Forums.
	messages of commitments made to	commitments made to SDGs, climate	6.2 The Environment Division generally relies upon the UNECE Information Unit for social media posts,
	SDGs, climate change agreements	change agreements and environmental	while providing source materials. However, the Water Convention has its own social media posts. Together,
	and human rights.	human rights (6.1).	they make several social media posts every week.
	6.2: Linking to UN information	The Environment Division will	6.3 Projects in the Environment Division routinely include work with CSOs. Each EPR mission includes
	campaigns (twitter cards or other	continue to push the 2030 Agenda and	on its first or second day a plenary meeting between the international team of experts and national civil
	social media methods) may be	environmental governance issues,	society organizations. Moreover, in the course of an EPR mission, international experts could have
	useful to push the 2030 Agenda and environmental governance issues.	through social media (6.2).	individual meetings with representatives of national CSOs. In the period since the evaluation, this has occurred in all EPR missions: Kyrgyzstan (May 2022), Mauritania (December 2022) and Tajikistan
	environmental governance issues.	The Environment Division will	(November 2023). A typical example from outside the EPR unit is from the EU4Environment (Green
	6.3: CSOs should be considered a	continue to encourage member States to	Economy in Eastern Partnership Countries) project implemented by the Espoo Convention secretariat. Two
	stronger part of the environment	consult and work closely with CSOs in	training workshops on strategic environmental assessment were held in Armenia in October and November
	advocacy coalitions. More	projects that deal with environmental	2023 under the project with representatives of CSOs participating.
	encouragement could be placed on member States to consult and work	governance and ensure that country missions engage early with many	
	closely with CSOs in projects that	stakeholders including CSOs (6.3).	
	deal with environmental		
	governance. This means		
	government provides adequate time for others to comment and agree		
	action plans and roadmaps.		
	Preparations for UNECE country		
	missions should ensure that they		
	leave time to engage early with		
	many stakeholders including CSOs and encourage national		
	coordinators to ensure their voice to		
	be brought to the table.		
7	Implementing Legislation	UNECE accepts the	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
		recommendation.	7.1 See recommendations 2.1 and 2.2.

7.1: Follow up on what was The EPR Unit will continue to monitor 7.2 Under the Air Convention, a project pro	conosal for two workshops on emission inventory development
	itted for consideration by the Nordic Council of Ministers. The
	n. Under the Water Convention a project for cross sectoral
out which EPR recommendations for updates sent to member States, and cooperation in transboundary basins in the are not yet being implemented and encourage civil society organisations to Italian Ministry of Environment and Energy	Western Balkans has recently been funded (Dec. 2023) by the
encourage civil society continue to play a watchdog role when	y security for the period 2024-2020.
organisations to continue to play a meeting them during EPR country	
'watchdog' role. missions (7.1).	
7.2: Continue efforts to locate The Environment Division will	
sources of finance to demonstrate continue to raise funds to demonstrate	
and pilot what can be achieved to and pilot what can be achieved to	
improve the environment. Funding improve the environment and will	
for conveying meetings that help consider whether resources can be	
build environmental advocacy obtained from the Western Balkans	
coalitions is also suggested, so Investment Framework (7.2).	
results/innovations are shared more	
widely. Consider whether resources can be obtained from the Western	
Balkans Investment Framework	
8     Learn and draw lessons from the     UNECE     accepts     the     Implemented as of 31 December 2023	
collaborative gender mainstreaming recommendation.	
	nized in Serbia in 2021 and at the request form countries in the
	haring workshop on the integration of gender aspects into
	Ikan region was held on 9 February 2022, bringing together
	rzegovina, Montenegro and Serbia. The main objective of the
	s and discuss challenges and opportunities on gender equality es to gender mainstreaming in environmental policy amongst
share experience may be useful. gender mainstreaming in environment national institutions.	es to gender mainstreaming in environmental poncy amongst
	v guidance document "Updated Strategies for Monitoring and
	es and Groundwaters" prepared in the framework of the Water
Convention in 2022.	
	nformation on activities related to gender mainstreaming into
	and policy programmes, <u>https://unece.org/environment-</u>
policy/environment-and-gender.	
	ent Pan-European Programme (THE PEP) a representative from nted, in a seminar on gender mainstreaming, the experience from
	NDA project. Further work on gender issues is to be undertaken
under THE PEP.	TOT Project. I drulet work on gender issues is to be undertaken

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report	
			Information, Public Participation in Decision-making, and Access to Justice	
in	in Environmental Matters (Aarhus Convention) and its Protocol on Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers (Protocol on PRTRs) (2018-2021), Jan-23			
2	Liaise with OSCE to explore its possible interest in	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023	
	designing a regional program to support Aarhus Centres that have been left behind in fulfilling their responsibilities. Communicate this issue to Parties, other interested Members States, relevant UN organisations, and their regional and development partners with similar agendas and interests.	The secretariat of the Aarhus Convention and its Protocol on PRTRs will: (a) liaise with OSCE to explore its possible interest in designing a regional program to support Aarhus Centres; (b) communicate this issue to Parties, other interested Members States, relevant UN organisations, and their regional and development partners with similar agendas and interests, through addressing it in formal reports on implementation of the treaties' work programmes (which will be translated in ECE official languages) and submitting them for the attention of the Working	The secretariat liaised with OSCE to explore its possible interest in designing a program to support Aarhus Centres and the issue was communicated to Parties, other interested Members States, relevant UN organisations and their partners. This have been evidenced by the proceedings of the 27th meeting of the Working Group of the Parties, the Convention's decision-making body which meets annually during the intersessional period, see: (a) statement by the representative of OSCE, and the meeting's report para 54; (b) statement by the Deputy-Director of the ECE Environment Division (para 6 of the meeting's report); (c) practical example of the role of the Aarhus Centres to support civil society to exercise their rights under the Convention, whose representatives was invited to speak as a panelist at the meeting and to make a statement from the floor (paras 17 and 55 of the meeting's report); (d) appreciation to and recognition of the important role of	
		Group of the Parties to the Aarhus Convention and the Working Group of the Parties to the Protocol on PRTRs in 2023.	the Aarhus Centres by the Working Group of the Parties and welcoming efforts by OSCE and encouraging Convention's national focal points to support capacity building in that regard (para 57 (b), (c), (d) of the meeting's report).	
4	Subject to resources, plan and budget for impact	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023	
5	evaluation to assess the implementation of the three pillars of the Aarhus Convention in the region. ECE may also consider the possibility of assessing the effectiveness and impact of the Compliance Committees and Special Rapporteur on Environmental Defenders.	The secretariat of the Aarhus Convention will assess feasibility of conducting an impact evaluation on the implementation of the three pillars of the Aarhus Convention and will bring the issue for attention of the Bureau of the Meeting of the Parties to the Aarhus Convention for its consideration.	The secretariat assessed feasibility of conducting an impact evaluation on the implementation of the three pillars of the Aarhus Convention and concluded that the current XB funding and the expected pledges is consistently experiencing systemic challenges and lacking sufficient resources for implementing the adopted work programme, even without additional activities. The secretariat brought the issue to the attention of the Convention's Bureau and the Working Group of the Parties. No Party indicated any interest in increasing its contributions or to allocate additional contributions for this purpose. Instead, Parties decided that the work area "Compliance mechanism" shall receive priority for funding, namely, advisory support and capacity-building for the Parties concerned with regard to compliance matter and rapid response mechanism for protection of environmental defenders, see paras 86 and 87 (a, f, g, h), https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-11/ECE.MP_PP_WG_1.2023.2.E.pdf.	
5	Continue enhancing synergies among relevant international instruments, organisations, and	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023	
	processes, including those related to the issue of environmental defenders.	The secretariat of the Aarhus Convention and its Protocol on PRTRs will continue enhancing synergies among relevant international instruments, organisations, and processes,	The secretariat continued enhancing synergies among relevant international instruments, organisations, and processes, including those related to the issue of environmental defenders by: (a) exchanging relevant information with them; (b) promoting the treaties obligations and activities in other relevant processes; and	

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
		including those related to the issue of environmental defenders by: (a) exchanging relevant information with them; (b) promoting the	(c) inviting representatives of other relevant international instruments, organisations, and processes to participate in the treaties' meetings and other activities. This have been evidenced, but not limited to, by the following. For (a)
		treaties obligations and activities in other relevant	and (b), see: Sections II B and C and section III:
		processes; and (c) inviting representatives of other relevant international instruments, organisations, and processes to participate in the treaties'	https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023- 06/ECE.MPPPWG1.2023.5.E.pdf Section, II E: https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-
		meetings and other activities.	<u>10/ECE.MPPRTRWG1.2023.3.E.pdf</u>
			For (c), see: 1. Convention's Task Force on Access to Justice and the Judicial Colloquium
			(Geneva, 3-5 April 2023), the latter was organized in cooperation with the United
			NationsEnvironmentProgramme,United Nations Development Programme, Organization for Co-operation and
			Security in Europe, IUCN World Commission on Environmental Law, Global
			Judicial Institute on Environmental Law, European Union Forum of Judges for the Environment, and other partner organizations.
			Representatives of many other relevant international instruments, organisations,
			and processes participated and made presentations at the events, see for example: <u>https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-</u>
			10/ECE.MPPPWG1.2023.4.E_0.pdf
			2. 27th meeting of the Working Group of the Parties to the Aarhus Convention
			(Geneva, 26-28 June 2023). Representatives of many other relevant international instruments, organisations, and processes participated and spoke at the event,
			including with regard to protection of environmental defenders. See for example,
			https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023- 11/ECE.MP .PP .WG .1.2023.2.E.pdf and Tabs "Statements", "Thematic
			session on PPDM" and "Thematic session on PPIF", on the meeting's webpage.
			3. Convention's Task Force on Access to Information at its 8th meeting featured
			an international workshop entitled "Advancing public access to environment- related product information:
			Challenges and opportunities". The latter was organized in cooperation with the
			United Nations Centre for Trade Facilitation and Electronic Business (UN/CEFACT), UNEP, ONE Planet Network and European Environment
			Agency. Representatives of many other relevant
			international instruments, organisations, and processes participated and made presentations at the events, see for example:
			https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-
			<u>11/8TFAI_KeyOutcomes_inf.3_fnl.pdf</u> and Tabs "Task Force Statements and Presentations", and "International workshop "Advancing public access to

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
			<ul> <li>environment-related product information: Challenges and opportunities", on the meeting's webpage.</li> <li>4. Tenth meeting of the Working Group of the Parties to the Protocol on PRTRs (Geneva, 27–28 November 2023). Representatives of many other relevant</li> </ul>
			international instruments, organisations, and processes participated and made presentations at the event. Fourth Joint Roundtable on Public Awareness, Education, Access to Information, Public Participation and Access to Justice regarding Living Modified Organisms/Genetically Modified Organisms (Geneva, 11-
			12 December 2023). To promote synergy, the event was organised jointly with the secretariat of the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety to the Convention on Biological Diversity, and the representatives of these treaties promoted their relevant obligations at the meeting, see programme for the event: <u>https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-</u> 12/Provisional Programme GMO LMO Roundtable2023 v11Dec.pdf
6	Continue encouraging gender considerations and a	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
	human rights-based approach in the activities under the two treaties and monitor the participation of women and people with disability in the Parties' and stakeholders' delegations and in senior management positions in governing and subsidiary bodies.	The secretariat of the Aarhus Convention and its Protocol on PRTRs will continue: (a) encouraging gender considerations and a human rights-based approach in the activities under the two treaties, including at dedicated thematic sessions of the treaties' bodies and through conducting a survey regarding groups in vulnerable situations and (b) monitor the participation of women and people with disability in the Parties' and stakeholders' delegations and in senior management positions in governing and subsidiary bodies.	It shall be noted that the Aarhus Convention and its Protocol on PRTRs aim to empower the public with the right to access information, participate in decision- making in environmental matters and seek justice. Thereby, all activities under the treaties promote human rights without any discrimination of people in vulnerable situations in terms of gender, disability or other aspects. For (a): The secretariat continued encouraging gender considerations and a human rights-based approach in the activities under the two treaties, including at the following dedicated thematic sessions of the treaties' bodies and through conducting a survey regarding groups in vulnerable situations. This has been evidenced by the following: 1. Thematic session with panel discussion on balanced and equitable participation and different modalities for engaging stakeholders in international decision- making at the 27th meeting of the Working Group of the Parties and the related survey, see programme of the session: <u>https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023- 06/WGP27 Programme PPIF session.pdf</u>
			2. Thematic session with panel discussion on public access to environmental information, considering needs of the groups in vulnerable situations, at the 8th meeting of the Task Force on Access to Information. See meeting's outcomes, section III: <u>https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-11/8TFAI_KeyOutcomes_inf.3_fnl.pdf</u> and the Updated recommendations on the more effective use of electronic information tools, (ECE/MP.PP/2021/2/Add.2)

# Report Recomm	endation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
			which specifically address the needs of groups in vulnerable situations and were promoted at the meeting.
			3. Thematic session with panel discussion on access to justice in cases related to climate change and biodiversity protection, considering needs of the groups in
			vulnerable situations at the 15th meeting of the Task Force on Access to Justice.Seemeeting'soutcomes,sectionII:https://unece.org/sites/default/files/2023-
			04/15TF.AJ_Inf.4_KeyOutcomes_as_circulated.pdf
			For (b): It shall be noted that nomination of participants, panelists and treaties' officers is
			the responsibility of Member States and the organizations concerned and the secretariat has no influence on their decisions. However, the secretariat made efforts to ensure that each panel at every meeting organised by the secretariat
			included female speakers, and vast majority of delegations were comprised of female participants as well. This have been evidenced by the lists of participants,
			documents and statements available on the meetings' webpages, provided through the reporting on Recommendation 1 above. No participant with disability has been
			registered for the meetings in the reporting period.
			For what concerns senior management positions in governing and subsidiary bodies, it shall be noted that: out of seven members of the Convention's Bureau,
			six are females; out of seven members of the Protocol's Bureau, five are females; and three females are holding Chairs positions for the two Convention's Task Forces and the Compliance Committee.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report	
Sı	Sustainable transport, evaluation of the project Sustainable transport connectivity and implementation of transport-related SDGs in selected landlocked and transit/bridging			
co	ountries, August 2022			
2	Acknowledging that the current informal	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023	
	mechanism for sharing good practices and			
	experiences in the field of promoting inland	a) SITCIN to be added as a standing/ recurrent	(a) SITCIN has been added as a standing agenda item to the agenda for the	
	transport needs improvement, and in light of the	agenda item to future sessions of the Working	forthcoming thirty-sixth session of the Working Party on Transport Trends and	
	findings of the evaluation report and lessons	Party on Transport Trends and Economics	Economics (WP.5) in September 2023.	
	learned from the National Connectivity Reports,	(WP.5), inviting countries that have used the		
	which contribute toward wider institutional	SITCIN self-assessment process to share their	(b) SITCIN was used as the basis for a technical assistance project with the Customs	
	knowledge and articulate possible pathways for	experience with the Working Party.	Committee of Uzbekistan in 2022.	
	future similar projects:			
		b) Findings of National Connectivity Reports of		

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
		countries conducting the SITCIN self-	
	a) UNECE could propose to its Member States a	assessment will be considered when designing	
	more structured innovative approach or	and implementing technical assistance and	
	mechanism to manage and facilitate the sharing of	capacity building activities designed and	
	lessons learned and good practices among national	implemented by the Division (i.e. in the	
	stakeholders, transport and other related specialists	framework of the SPECA programme, of	
	at the national, regional and global levels.	extrabudgetary (XB) projects etc.)	
	Moreover, the mechanism should be inclusive		
	enough to attract a broader civil society audience.		
	Along with the specialists in the transport		
	connectivity sector, members would include, for		
	instance: more business representatives,		
	environmental specialists, urban planners, gender		
	specialists, etc. The UNECE's Working Party on		
	Transport Trends and Economics (WP.5), which		
	has a mandate to promote experience sharing,		
	could be well-placed to take up this role.		
	b) Furthermore, UNECE should identify and		
	consolidate areas of commonality in both the		
	current external evaluation report and the National		
	Connectivity Reports to generate a plan of action		
	for future SITCIN related or similar type projects.		
		ated Energy and Water Resources Management	in Support of Sustainable Development in South-Eastern Europe and Central
As	ia, May-22		
3	Enhance focus on gender, vulnerable groups	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023
	and human rights issues:	In its fature anti-ities will the sector second	The Wenner in December Management Wenking Comment the English Comment
	ECE should in its future estivities related to water	In its future activities related to water-energy-	The Women in Resource Management Working Group of the Expert Group on
	ECE should in its future activities related to water- energy-climate change-natural disasters nexus	climate change-natural disasters nexus, UNECE will try to address more explicitly gender	Resource Management has achieved remarkable results in advancing gender equality and empowerment in the field of resource management. The group has
	address more explicitly gender inequalities and the	inequalities and the challenges faced by	developed and implemented various activities, such as providing inputs for the
	challenges faced by vulnerable populations,	vulnerable groups, including by strengthening	UNFC and UNRMS, conducting policy dialogues and case studies, organizing
	including by strengthening capacity building on	capacity building on gender mainstreaming and	workshops and webinars, creating an online network, and collaborating with key
	gender mainstreaming and leaving no one behind,	leaving no one behind, involving key UN	partners. The group has also contributed to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable
	involving key UN partners such as UN-Women	partners such as UN-Women and OHCHR, as	Development, especially the goals related to gender, energy, and climate. The group
	and OHCHR, as appropriate.	appropriate. The Women in Resource	will continue its work in 2024 and 2025 as part of the Expert Group Work plan. The
	and strettic, as appropriate.	Management Working Group, part of the Expert	RPTC and UNDA projects have made significant strides in addressing gender issues
		Group on Resource Management, will do the	in resource management. The Women in Resource Management Working Group, a
		following work in 2022 and 2023: (a) Update	network of women engaged in resource management projects was established. This
		specifications and guidelines for women and	group has played a crucial role in providing inputs for the development of UNRMS
		diversity in UNFC and UNRMS; (b) Hold policy	principles and requirements, which were published in 2022. Policy dialogues aimed

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
#	Report Recommendation         Image: Commendation	Management Response dialogue(s) on promoting gender participation in resource management; (c) Set-up a network of women engaged in resource management projects; (d) Provide inputs for the development of UNRMS requirements; (e) Conduct case studies and recommendations on mainstreaming gender in resource management in various positions from young professionals to senior leadership, including in the post-COVID-19 recovery.	<ul> <li>at promoting gender participation in resource management and case studies and recommendations on mainstreaming gender in resource management were done and more are being developed. The group is focused on women in various positions, from young professionals to senior leadership.</li> <li>As part of these efforts, the group organized a workshop in March 2023 on "Critical Raw Materials in Vulnerable Geographies: Impact on Women", and a keynote was delivered at the "International Day of Women in Mining". The group contributed to the 14th Annual Session of the Expert Group on Resource Management and provided input on promoting gender equality and inclusivity in the energy and resource management sectors. The group organized a "Women in extractive and geo-environmental activities" session at the VII Symposium on Mineral Exploration in the Mediterranean basin, Iglesias, Sardinia (Italy), October 2023 highlighting the role and achievements of women in resource management. Additionally, an online LinkedIn page has been created to facilitate interactions within the network. The group collaborated with various women-centric professional associations, such as the UN-Women, Society of Petroleum Engineers (SPE), the Women in Earth and Environmental Sciences in Australasia (WoMEESA), the Society of Exploration Geophysicists (SEG), the American Geophysical Union (AGU), and the Society of Women Engineers (SWE). The group will also conduct reviews, case studies, and policy dialogues on enhancing gender participation and mainstreaming in resource management, covering women in various positions, from young professionals to senior leadership.</li> </ul>
			The group will work under the guidance of the Technical Advisory Group, consult and cooperate with other Working Groups and the UNRMS Sub-group and report
4	Mitigate the Project's sustainability risks:	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	regularly to the Expert Group. Implemented as of 31 December 2023
	UNECE should guide the Governments of the beneficiary countries on how the activities related to UNFC application should be mainstreamed into the operations and programmes of the relevant Ministries. Specifically, the following actions are recommended: a. Maintain momentum to ensure continuity in the	i. UNECE will include integrated and sustainable resource management elements at strategic and programmatic levels, in the programme of work of the Committee on Sustainable Energy as well as in the programme of work contained in proposed programme budgets under subprogramme 5: Sustainable Energy, to keep stakeholders motivated and	The integrated and sustainable resource management elements are being included in the Expert Group on Resource Management programme of work. UNECE supported enhanced participation of national experts in the development and implementation of UNFC and UNRMS. Future activities will include clear strategies for integrated resource management linkages and will provide practical examples and consultancy support on the institutional, legal, and technical measures needed to fully implement the UNFC and UNRMS.
	recipient countries by identifying ways to keep stakeholders motivated and engaged in the process and by keeping the issue of the integrated energy and water resource management high on the	engaged. ii. UNECE will support enhanced participation of national experts of the beneficiary countries	i. UNECE has included integrated and sustainable resource management elements, with a special focus on critical raw materials at strategic and programmatic levels, in the programme of work of the Committee on Sustainable Energy as well as in the programme of work contained in 2024 programme

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report	
	UNECE strategic and programmatic levels.	in the activities of the Expert Group on Resource Management	budgets under subprogramme 5: Sustainable Energy.	
	<ul> <li>UNECE strategic and programmatic levels.</li> <li>b. UNECE should enhance dialogue and bilateral cooperation with the beneficiary countries aiming at a formal decision by the Governments of these countries to apply the UNFC system. As an initial step, consider supporting enhanced participation of national experts in the activities of the Expert Group on Resource Management.</li> <li>c. Water, geology, energy, economy, and ecology interconnectedness needs to be addressed and awareness-raising enhanced through future UNECE projects. To enhance the coherence of such future UNECE projects, efforts should be made to integrate into the Project Document a clear strategy for linkages with other similar initiatives by defining the nature of these linkages per each relevant activity in the work plan.</li> <li>d. Future UNECE efforts to strengthen the integrated energy and water resource management should focus on providing the beneficiary countries with practical examples and consultancy support on the institutional, legal and technical measures needed for the full implementation of the UNFC.</li> </ul>	in the activities of the Expert Group on Resource Management. iii. Future projects will include a clear strategy for integrated resource management linkages in their Project Documents. iv. Future projects will provide practical examples and consultancy support on the institutional, legal, and technical measures needed to fully implement the UNFC and UNRMS.	<ul> <li>budgets under subprogramme 5: Sustainable Energy.</li> <li>ii. UNECE organized a special session with the participation of national experts of the beneficiary countries in the 14th Annual Session of the Expert Group on Resource Management, 25-28 April, 2023. (https://unece.org/info/Sustainable-Energy/UNFCand-Resource-Management/events/374260) Press Release: Central Asia's Resource Management Expertise Can Be Transformed to Support Critical Raw Materials Internationally, say UN experts</li> <li>iii. Critical Raw Materials projects from all beneficiary countries were showcased in the Towards COP27: UNECE Regional Forum on Climate Initiatives to Finance Climate Action and the SDGs, October 2022. Selected projects were also showcased in the European Regional Forum on "Climate Initiatives to Finance Climate Action and the SDGs", July 2023.</li> <li>iv. UNDA 14th Tranche Project Food-Water-Energy nexus support to post-COVID-19 recovery in Eastern Europe, Western Balkans, Central Asia, the Middle East and Africa (2022-2025) provided practical examples and consultancy support on the institutional, legal, and technical measures needed to implement the UNFC and UNRMS fully. The project prepared a report on "Natural Resource Nexuses" and two-page graphic key messages. Case studies on sustainable resource management have been developed. The project supported implementation of the United Nations Environment Assembly resolution 5/12 on environmental aspects of minerals and metals management. The project collaborated with stakeholders on developing a report on knowledge gaps in relation to the environmental aspects of tailings management. Workshops on raw material waste (tailings management) were held in 2023 to identify and compile best practices and knowledge gaps. The report's findings, knowledge,</li> </ul>	
			and recommended guidelines on environmental knowledge gaps in tailings management was launched at the Global Intergovernmental Meeting on Minerals and Metals in September 2023.	
			v. Launched a series of dialogues on access to critical raw materials in Central Asia – including at the ECE Sustainable Energy Week in April 2023, 31st session of the Committee on Sustainable Energy in September 2023, and the 3rd Almaty Energy Forum in November 2023. Noted that access to critical raw materials (CRMs) is vital for the ECE region to achieve its climate and sustainable development goals and to support the transition to a carbon neutral and a digital society. Policy alternatives that could enhance the resiliency and sustainability of the CRMs value chain include diversifying primary sources, promoting a	

# Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
		circular economy, fostering innovation and cooperation, strengthening governance and transparency, and increasing investments (ECE/ENERGY/2023/13). Developed a policy brief on aligning critical raw materials development with sustainable development" that was presented at the UN High level Political Forum in New York in July 2023.
		vi. Organized in partnership with the UN Working Group on Transforming Extractive Industries for Sustainable Development side events at the COP 27 Sharm-Al-Sheik, December 2022 on "A global sustainability framework for critical raw materials required for low-carbon transitions" and COP 28 in Dubai, December 2023 on "Responsible and inclusive management of critical energy transition minerals". A working paper on "Strengthening critical mineral value chains for the energy transitions" was also developed.
		vii. The Expert Group on Resource Management accelerated implementation of the United Nations Framework Classification for Resources (UNFC) globally, in particular in countries of the European Union, thanks to the ongoing extrabudgetary project on "Supporting UNECE member States in the development and implementation of UNFC and the United Nations Resource Management System (UNRMS)". At its 130th session the EXCOM has approved the Phase II of the project and the secretariat will continue to build capacities in ECE member States for sustainable management of resources through the application of UNFC and UNRMS.
		viii. At the request of the Government of Albania, UNECE conducted Assessment of Geothermal Energy Resources in Albania. The study supports the efforts of Albania to develop low carbon energy sources to address the ongoing climate crisis. A national workshop on Just Transition in Mining Communities and Potential for Development of Geothermal Energy was held in Tirana in June 2023.
		ix. Published the United Nations Resource Management System (UNRMS): Principles and requirements (UNECE Energy Series 74), a new global standard for sustainable and integrated management of natural resources, such as minerals, petroleum, renewable energy, nuclear resources, anthropogenic resources, geological storage and groundwater. UNRMS was endorsed by the United Nations Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) in July 2023 (E/RES/2023/19). UNRMS aims to help countries and companies balance economic development, environmental sustainability, and social responsibility in line with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Paris Agreement. At the 9th Asia-Pacific Energy Ministers' Meeting (APEMM) held in Bangkok,

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
			Thailand, on 28-29 October 2023, the Energy Ministers of the region expressed their support for UNRMS in their Ministerial Declaration and invited its application to enhance the sustainability and efficiency of resource management in the Asia-Pacific. The Committee recognized the potential of UNRMS to facilitate the management of a complex hybrid system of renewable and nonrenewable resources, considering their unique features and differences and integrating it with the water-food-energy nexus.
			UNDA 16th Tranche Project on Enhancing Capacities in the Sustainable Production of the Critical Raw Materials Required for Low-Carbon Transitions is planned for during 2024-2027. The project's objective is to enhance selected countries' capacity to produce critical raw materials sustainably to achieve sustainable and circular low- carbon transitions. Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan are beneficiary countries of the project.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
Tr	ade, evaluation of the project Enhancing usage and uptake of standards for sus	tainable development, gender equality and the empowe	rment of women and girls, January 2023
2	Any future project should ensure equal integration of cross-cutting issues into	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023.
	its outputs and activities, by establishing respective mechanisms and tools		
	derived from relevant UN mainstreaming strategies (gender, human rights,	The secretariat recognizes the importance of these cross-	WP.6 Secretary has successfully completed
	disability) which should include the strengthening of partnerships with relevant	cutting issues and their integration into all aspects of its	the United Nations System Staff College
	UN agencies, national partners, and think-tanks with subject-matter expertise.	work. It further notes that several of these issues were	five-week course on "Improving People's
		addressed by the current project, albeit not explicitly	Lives Through UN Country Programming:
	a. Consider explicitly applying a disability inclusion approach in the design and	cited.	Integrating the UNSDCG Guiding
	implementation of the next phase of the Standards for the SDGs project, expanding the portal to map standards relevant for disability inclusion and	These issues shall be fully integrated into the conception	Principles Human Rights Based Approach, Gender Equality and Women's
	prevention of accidents, injuries and illness, and embed disability indicators and	of future projects within Working Party 6 (WP.6) and	Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment, and Leave No One Behind."
	targets in project and activity results frameworks. Gender should also be	used as performance indicators.	These principles will be integrated into
	mainstreamed in these areas.	used as performance indicators.	future projects within WP.6. A new extra-
			budgetary project on gender mainstreaming
	b. Apply a rights-based approach in the design, implementation and results of the		in quality infrastructure has been prepared
	activities for the next phase of the project, including by making explicit reference		and will be presented at the March 2024
	to relevant international human rights law standards, particularly the Convention		EXCOM (2024/13). The project takes into
	on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women. Consider developing the		account cross-cutting elements; as integral
	next project document jointly with UN Women to leverage its comparative		parts of the project.
	advantage and technical expertise in gender equality and gender mainstreaming.		
	Increase participation of women including by seeking to engage with national		
	gender equality machineries, women-led MSMEs, and women's civil society		
	organisations, and integrating use of gender advocates and experts. Consider		
	embedding the appropriate gender equality, human rights, disability inclusion, and		

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	other LNOB indicators and targets for inclusion in project and activity results framework as relevant. Links should be made where possible and appropriate to relevant SDG indicators and targets.		
	c. Leave No One Behind: guide standards development bodies to employ a human rights-based approach to data disaggregation, i.e. one that calls for disaggregation in accordance with grounds of discrimination prohibited by international human rights law – including gender, age, geographic location, income, and other characteristics relevant in the national context. Standards development bodies could be guided by OHCHR (2012), Human Rights Indicators: A Guide to Measurement and Implementation.		
	Use this for evidence-based policy making relevant for inclusive standards		
3	development, including standards for the SDGs and gender-responsive standards. Consider European Union and Council of Europe accession as entry points to encourage UNECE member States to build consensus and buy-in to integrate gender responsive standards.	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation. The secretariat acknowledges the importance of regional economic and political bodies as a vector to promote its work. Efforts are currently made to engage these bodies which may not have been apparent in the deliverables of the current extra-budgetary (XB) project. The regional standards development bodies are one of the key actors in this domain, especially in the European Union context and the European Committee for Standardization (CEN) & the European Committee for Electrotechnical Standardization (CENELEC) is not only a signatory to the Declaration on Gender-Responsive Standards and Standards Development but has been an active participant in the formulation of the guidance provided under this initiative. The secretariat would emphasize that the UNECE has 34 member States covering countries of Europe, but also countries in North America (Canada and United States), Central Asia (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan) and Western Asia (Israel). The recommendations and guidance that it produces are applicable globally and experts from all UN Member States are welcome to join in developing these deliverables. Efforts have already been made to engage relevant regional bodies.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023. WP.6 has continued to engage with regional bodies in order to encourage the uptake of gender-responsive standards. During the first annual meeting of the Team of Specialists on Gender-Responsive Standards, several regional bodies were used to leverage buy-in on the topic and report on progress in their respective bodies: CEN/CENELEC, the Standards and Metrology Institute for Islamic Countries (SMIIC), the Pan American Standards Commission (COPANT) as well as specific countries. The World Trade Organization also made a presentation supporting the work of GRS and linking this into more global initiatives on gender and trade. Furthermore, Kazakhstan has become the 82nd signatory of the Declaration on Gender Responsive Standards and Standards Development. Moving forward, WP.6 will continue to engage with these regional bodies and seek further buy-in of gender-responsive standards in its programme countries.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
		The secretariat would further underline that it brings particular efforts to its 17 programme countries within its own region. The translation into Russian of all relevant material is a major part of this effort, in order to ensure that it is accessible to the largest possible audience in this region. The workshop with Russian translation in April 2022 was particularly successful in reaching a large audience in these programme countries. Moving forward, the secretariat will continue to engage the pertinent regional bodies, the major international bodies and continue to bring particular focus to the 17 programme countries in the UNECE region, subject to the availability of XB funds.	
4	<ul> <li>Any follow up project should include a focus on capacity building and awareness raising relevant for Gender Action Plans and gender responsive standards, which may include the following:</li> <li>a. Assistance to specific beneficiary country signatories of the Declaration to draft and implement gender action plans for gender-responsive standards and gender inclusive standards development. This would include building consensus and buyin.</li> <li>b. Support relevant institutions to engage more people with the topic of gender-responsive standards and to design and implement effective Gender Action Plans, including through raising internal awareness and building capacity. For example, by running campaigns with high visibility, making the topic a regular item in newsletters and on social media, building an online repository with useful resources and learning tools, including examples of Gender Action Plans of standard setting bodies.</li> <li>c. In line with the recommendation of Working Party 6: (i) encourage member States to engage in dialogue with standards bodies in their jurisdiction to become signatories of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (ECE) Declaration for Gender-Responsive Standards and Standards Development; (ii) Encourage member States to consider financing for follow-up work particularly capacity-building for gender action plans; and (iii) Continue awareness-raising efforts</li> </ul>	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> The need for capacity building and further awareness raising efforts is a clear takeaway of this project. The experts in the Team of Specialists on Gender-Responsive Standards (GRS) and the initiative that preceded it have put together a guidance document to assist with this, which accompanies the guidance material developed under this project. The GRS is continuing to develop further guidance, however specific actions will be required in countries to provide capacity building. With this perspective, the secretariat has developed a follow-up project proposal and has approached UN-WOMEN to work together on the topic, with a specific focus on programme countries within the UNECE region. The proposal has been ready since April 2022 and the secretariat has been approaching potential donors. In the meantime, the secretariat is supporting the experts in the GRS to further the development of guidance while waiting for extra-budgetary funds.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023. As reflected in response to Rec #2, PTB Germany has offered funds for a follow up project which is planned to focus on capacity building and awareness raising and planned to target three beneficiary countries who are signatories to the Declaration (Albania, Benin and Georgia). While this project would not explicitly "partner" with UNWOMEN, it is planned to engage UN- WOMEN and ISO in the roll out of the project

Informal document No. 2023/30

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
5	Consider increasing translation of project materials and capacity building activities into multiple UN languages, e.g. Russian, Arabic, Spanish to increase	UNECE accepts the recommendation.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023.
	engagement and accessibility throughout the UNECE region and beyond	The secretariat recognizes the importance of making material available in multiple languages in order to raise awareness on the topic and assist experts to access the material. As part of the project, certain materials were translated to the six official languages of the UN and this has been well received.	The new project (see response to Rec#2) 1 includes translation into ECE languages; the secretariat is also working with partner organizations to propose other languages that could be useful to the user community.
		The secretariat will ensure that such translations are an integral part of future extra-budgetary (XB) projects and plan to deliver accordingly, subject to the availability of XB funds.	

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report		
	Forest and forest industries subprogramme, Self-evaluation on the relevance of the Forest Products Annual Market Review to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector, December 2022				
1	The evaluation recommends the Forest Products Annual Market Review to include information, data and statistics on Sustainable Development Goals relevant to the various forest products market sectors.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> One of the core objectives of the publication is to inform the audience about the situation of production and consumption of forest products markets and their contribution to accelerate progress towards the achievements of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The first chapter of the publication on Economic Overview and Policies lends itself to be a good place to include information, data and statistics on the SDGs relevant to the various forest products market sectors. The Joint UNECE/FAO Forestry and Timber Section (the Joint Section) will focus mainly on highlighting the information for SDGs 7 and 12.	Implemented as of 31 December 2023. The Forest Products Annual Market Review was published in November 2023 and includes information, data and statistics on Sustainable Development Goals relevant to the various forest products market sectors. The link to the SDG's is clearly stated in the introduction (page 2): "The analysis of the various wood commodity markets now also contains additional information on how these market trends contribute to the achievement of the various United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), namely SDG 7 ("Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all"), 11 ("Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable"), 12 ("Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns"), 13 ("Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts") and 15 ("Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss")." Specific references are made a various part of the specific chapters (e.g. forest certification or sawn hardwood and SDG 15.2).		

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
2	The evaluation recommends the subprogramme to consider – to the extent possible and without creating additional workload – redirecting existing regular budget resources for layout and printing to be primarily used to produce an electronic publication. A machine-readable electronic publication makes the content accessible to visually impaired users and users not able to read one of the three official languages of the UNECE via machine translation.	<b>UNECE</b> accepts the recommendation. The Joint Section and PMU will discuss with UNOG which digital type formats of publications suitable for machine reading and translation algorithms they offer or could offer in the near future -without creating additional workload to the subprogramme- to make ECE publications more accessible (noting that the current pdf digital option is not machine-readable).	Implemented as of 31 December 2023. The FLHD and PMU successfully discussed with the Division of Conference Management (DCM) in December 2023 and agreed on the way forward to implement this recommendation. DCM confirmed that the discussion about machine readable electronic publications was timely and fully in line with the UN's "Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities" and the UN Disability Inclusion Strategy to increase inclusiveness. The publishing section would be able to offer the choice between two main types of electronic publications. (i) Reflowable document, which automatically adjusts the layout of the text to the electronic device (static html) and (ii) e-publications for e-readers. UNECE and DCM aim to use the FPAMR and a selected number of other UNECE publications to test new presentation formats in addition to the PDF versions.
4	The evaluation recommends the subprogramme to urge member States to consider a long-term planning for sustainable funding of the independent market expert input to the Review through a multi-donor, multi-year project.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> The Joint Section will present the outcomes of the evaluation of the FPAMR to member States during the 44th session of the Joint UNECE/FAO Working Party on Forest Statistics, Economics and Management (31. May – 2. June 2023) and the 81st session of the Committee on Forests and the Forest Industry (21-24 November 2023). The Joint Section will use these opportunities to particularly raise the issue with member States and urge them to consider providing a long-term funding for the FPAMR.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> . The secretariat informed member States during the 44th session of the Joint Working Party on Forest Products Statistics, Economics and Management (31 May – 2 June 2023) about the Self-evaluation on the relevance of the Forest Products Annual Market Review to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector. The secretariat highlighted recommendation 4 and member States took note of the funding needs. The Committee on Forests and the Forest Industry took note of the report from the Joint Working Party. The secretariat did not manage to obtain any firm pledges for long term funding of the publication.
		of the project Building urban economic resilience duri	
1	ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP and ESCWA, with support from UN-Habitat and UNCDF as relevant, should continue efforts to engage pilot cities and help them further develop their capacities to access funding for their plans. The evaluation identified some risks to the sustainability of project results, including limited access to funding, decreased	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> The full implementation of this recommendation is subject to the mobilization of substantial extrabudgetary funds. The project partners have submitted a proposal to the UNDA for a follow up project to continue supporting the pilot cities. On the	Implemented as of 31 December 2023 Support has been provided by UNECE to Bishkek in cooperation with Cities Development Initiative for Asia for urban development of informal settlements. Additional cooperation has been established with the Asian Development Bank, UNEP, UNDP and UNEP on local development projects. Within the comprehensive framework of the Country Profile on

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	<ul> <li>political ownership following possible government changes in the future, low social ownership and, to a lesser extent, limited technical capacities within local governments and institutional arrangements that hinder the adoption of the Economic Resilience Building Plans (ERBPs). To address these risks, the following actions should be considered:</li> <li>Continue engaging local governments from the pilot cities in ongoing or upcoming projects and activities to provide them with continued support to access funding and to improve their technical capacities for the implementation and monitoring of the ERBPs. Cities would particularly benefit from continued and practical advice on how to tap on existing opportunities for increasing public revenue, and on how to access international and private-sector funding for the most cost-intensive actions included in the ERBPs (e.g., those related with basic infrastructure). Advice is particularly needed to develop a pipeline of projects and match them with adequate types of funding from different sources.</li> <li>Continue providing spaces for experience exchange among pilot cities, both at the regional and global level, including joint events in different fora and the integration of local governments into ongoing initiatives, such as the Making Cities</li> </ul>	second point of the first recommendation, UNECE: • Continues to be engaged in the Making Cities Resilient 2030 network; • Is engaging with the UN DESA Financing for Sustainable Development Office, which provides a global platform for building capacities of local governments on municipal infrastructure asset management; • Established the UN Forum of Mayors as a team of specialists under the UNECE Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management. The Forum of Mayors is a UN platform for mayors and vice-mayors to exchange experiences and best practices and learn from each other.	Urban Development of Albania, dedicated efforts have been made to assess and enhance the urban landscape, with a particular focus on the city of Tirana. This initiative is strategically aligned with the imperative to bolster economic resilience, especially in the aftermath of the global challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic. The development of the country profile incorporates the valuable recommendations coming from the 'Building Economic Resilience during and after COVID-19' project. By integrating these recommendations into the urban economic action plan, the aim is not only to fortify Tirana's economic foundations but also to pave the way for sustainable urban development. In shaping the recovery plan for Kharkiv postCOVID-19, a key influence has been the insights gained from the "Building Urban Economic Resilience during and after COVID-19" project. This project's recommendations have played a crucial role, offering solid guidance for the city's long-term recovery efforts. As part of the UN4UkrainianCities project funded by the German Government, UNECE is actively supporting Kharkiv, particularly in developing strategies for economic redevelopment.
	Resilient 2030 network, the Asia – Pacific Mayors Academy (launched by ESCAP, UN-Habitat and other organizations), and the Malaga Global		building, crucial for implementing Economic Resilience and Recovery Plans (ERBPs). This commitment extends to initiatives like the Asia- Pacific Mayors Academy and the Malaga Global Coalition for Municipal
	Coalition for Municipal Finance led by UNCDF. This would provide local governments with opportunities to access expert advice and capacity building to implement their ERBPs, while at the same time fostering long-term engagement in		Finance, demonstrating a comprehensive approach to resilience that includes financial strategies. The emphasis on involving not just mayors but also local focal points and city officials ensures a diverse range of expertise contributes to ERBP development. Through these collaborative networks, cities not only enhance their resilience but also contribute to collective
	resilience building. Ideally, experience exchange		knowledge and strategies for urban recovery.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	should go beyond mayors to involve local focal points and other city officials.		
3	ECA and ECE, with support from ECLAC, ESCAP, ESCWA, UN-Habitat and UNCDF as relevant, should systematize the lessons learned from this project. The project produced a large number of knowledge products and deliverables, most of which are available on the project website. It would be useful to distil this vast knowledge into policy guidelines for economic resilience building that would provide practical and concise guidance to national and subnational governments regarding how to strengthen urban economic resilience in the face of external shocks.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. The project already started systematizing the collected knowledge in the Compendium of practices "Global Compendium of Practices on Local Economic and Financial Recovery" available at https://urbaneconomicresilience.org/deliverablesresou rces/global-compendium-of-practices-on- localeconomicand-financial-recovery/, as well as in the five Regional Policy Briefs on building urban economic resilience during and after COVID-19, all five available at https://urbaneconomicresilience.org/deliverablesresou rces/regional-policy-briefs-on-urban- <u>economicrecoveryand-resilience/</u> . Subject to funding of the new UNDA follow-up project, a global survey to systematize the collected knowledge as well as global policy guidelines will be produced.	<b>Implemented as of 1 November 2023</b> The 16th tranche project, in collaboration with ECA, ECE, and support from key partners, will distil project insights into concise policy guidelines for enhancing urban economic resilience. The project is expected to start in January 2024.
6	<b>UNDA projects should support capacity</b> <b>building throughout implementation.</b> While supporting diagnostic and planning processes is key to advance urban economic resilience, and more broadly the 2030 Agenda, so is developing implementation capacities, especially at the local level. As already mentioned above, efforts should focus, in particular, on helping local governments strengthen their capacities to increase public revenues and develop a pipeline of projects matched with adequate types of funding from different sources. The proposed DA 16 <sup>th</sup> tranche project mentioned above is a promising step in this direction.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. Capacity building was already provided during the whole project period through regular meetings with the local governments and close communication among the partner organizations, international and local consultants on one hand and the cities' governments on the other. Subject to the approval of the follow-up UNDA project, capacity building activities are planned to be conducted starting from the very beginning of the project as the new project will be building on outcomes of the diagnostic assessment, which was already conducted. Capacity building activities in the new project will be focusing on efforts to help local governments strengthen their capacities to increase public revenues and develop a pipeline of projects	<b>Implemented as of 1 November 2023</b> The capacity building activities were designed to be implemented within the new UNDA project which has already been approved. In addition, the partners already now regularly organize training events at different global forums for higher impact, including at UN Habitat Assembly, HLPF, COP and World Urban Forum planned for 2024.

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report	
		matched with adequate types of funding from different sources		
Hous	sing, Land Management & Population, evaluation	of the project Improved sustainable urban developmen	nt in 17 Norwegian cities, March 2023	
4	The UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit should pay more attention to project planning including needs and risk assessments, defining success indicators and the intended outcomes, which is key in ensuring value for money and that projects are owned by the beneficiaries. Defining the intended outcomes and impact at activity / work package level is also a way to ensure that the planned activities serve for long-term strategic purposes, that the project responds to the needs of the intended recipients and that no strategic diversions are needed during the implementation. Defining the theory of change allows monitoring of the project successes and the verification of results during and after the project.	UNECE accepts the recommendation. UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit is strengthening project planning and monitoring through the deployment and use of a new ERP (Umoja) solution 'Integrated Planning, Management and Reporting', which will allow better monitoring of project implementation and to take corrective measures in case of diversions from the project plan.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit strengthened project planning through the deployment and use of a new ERP (Umoja) solution Integrated Planning, Management and Reporting, which allows better monitoring of project implementation.	
5	While synergy benefits should be sought to avoid duplication of efforts, it is important that project activities and their successes are traceable and verifiable against project plans and budgets. Future UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit plans and reports should link the project activities, the related expenditure, outputs and outcomes more clearly and they should differentiate core project activities, synergy benefits, and complementarities of the related action.	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit is strengthening project planning and monitoring through the deployment and use of a new ERP (Umoja) solution 'Integrated Planning, Management and Reporting', which will allow better monitoring of project implementation and to take corrective measures in case of diversions from the project plan.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> UNECE Housing and Land Management Unit strengthened project planning and monitoring through the deployment and use of a new ERP (Umoja) solution 'Integrated Planning, Management and Reporting', which allows better monitoring of project implementation and to take corrective measures in case of diversions from the project plan.	
Hous	Housing, Land Management & Population, Evaluation of UNECE Forum of Mayors			
1	Formally establish the Forum of Mayors. It represents an innovative initiative that (i) responds to the role of mayors and cities as a positive and	<b>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM established the Forum of Mayors (FoM) as a Team of	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided to establish the Forum of Mayors as a subsidiary body of the Committee on Urban	

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	growing force on the global stage; and (ii) ensures the relevance and effectiveness of UNECE.	Specialists under the Committee on Urban Development, Housing and Land Management (CUDHLM). The next FoM is expected to be held in Geneva in October 2023.	Development, Housing and Land Management. It also decided that a review will be undertaken before recommending extension. The 2023 Forum of Mayors will be held In Geneva on 2-3 October.
2	Further strengthen the connection of the Forum with the work of CUDHLM by attaching it to the annual sessions of the Committee and finding a complementary narrative but keeping the Forum's own programme and agenda.	At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM The 2023 Forum of Mayors will be held in Geneva on 2-3 (	
4	Have informal meetings with the representatives of municipalities to define the theme of the Forum's meetings. Consider organizing the presentations specifically around progress towards the SDGs.	<b>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided to establish a bureau of the FoM to guide the work of the Forum, including deciding on the theme. Consultations with a group of experts will be organized in any case by the secretariat to explore options, if the chairpersons agree.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM decided to establish a bureau of the FoM to guide the work of the Forum, including deciding on the theme. In line with the Forum of Mayors Terms of Reference, the Bureau of the 2023 Forum of Mayors discussed about the theme and agreed that the overall topic of the Forum of Mayors will be "Urban regeneration towards 2030". The Bureau of the 2024 Forum of Mayors decided that the theme for 2024 will be "Cities Summit of the Future"
5	Provide more information at the Forum on impact measurement to strengthen the role of the Forum as a crucial instrument to keep mayors and cities focused on the 2030 Agenda by, for example, presenting existing UNECE tools for sustainable urban development, measuring progress toward smart sustainable cities, developing urban SDG strategies, trade-offs, implementation, monitoring, participation, etc.	<b>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM approved the objectives and scope of the FoM as described in the draft decision contained in ECE/EX/2023/L.4. The FoM agenda/programme will be agreed by July 2023 and will reflect the decision taken by EXCOM as described above.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023 and ongoing</b> At its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 EXCOM approved the objectives and scope of the FoM as described in the draft decision contained in ECE/EX/2023/L.4 In the program a specific panel on SDGs localization has been included. The same will happen for the 2024 Forum of Mayors.
6	Consider hiring one dedicated staff to strengthen the secretariat. In this respect, the Government of Italy has recently provided support through a JPO at the P2 level to help with the Forum. If the experience proves successful, it should be	<b>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</b> A staff at the P2 level was recruited in October 2022 as part of the Junior Professional Officer (JPO) Programme with funding from Italy. If the experience	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023</b> The JPO has been recruited. If the experience proves successful, the division will try to keep this position irrespective of the funding source. However, the organization of the Forum cannot count only on XB staff, and

#	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
	considered to make this position a regular budget one.	proves successful, the division will try to keep this position irrespective of the funding source.	the secretariat will seek to establish a position if the Forum of Mayors continues beyond 2024.
12	Allow space to discuss political matters that could happen on the sides of the Forum (e.g., non-official declarations or discussions, side events, etc.), but with consideration to include more political discussions and outcome in the formal session (together with the presentations with images). It is necessary to keep the relevance of the initiative by providing a venue for mayors' deliberations and initiatives. This will also strengthen ownership and visibility.	<b>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</b> No decision was made by EXCOM at its 126th meeting on 13 January 2023 in this regard. Political matters will continue to be addressed during side events to the Forum, as in the past edition.	<b>Implemented as of 31 December 2023 and ongoing</b> Political matters will continue to be addressed during side events to the Forum. Moreover, the Forum of Mayors 2024 will focus on the Pact for the Future and discuss its implementation at the local level

# Annex VII: List of recommendations from external evaluations closed as of 31 December 2023

Report	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Final Progress Report
Report of the Office of Internal Oversight Services on the Thematic evaluation of the United Nations Secretariat support to the Sustainable Development Goals (E/AC.51/2023/3)	<ul> <li>(2) Each Secretariat entity should clearly, distinctly and specifically articulate in their internal strategic plans and workplans how they will support host governments in achieving the SDGs. This should align with the overarching UN development system framework and integrate existing system-wide processes on data and reporting. This would include:</li> <li>a. Specific linkages between its programmatic budget, workplan, activities and outputs, including consideration of tools and processes identified as missing in this evaluation and how these will support the 2030 development agenda;</li> <li>b. Reporting on results achieved with SDG support activities in its annual results; and</li> <li>c. Identification of possible synergies and coordination with other Secretariat entities</li> </ul>	ECE accepts recommendation 2 addressed to all Secretariat entities but would recall that the format of the proposed programme budget shall comply with General Assembly resolution 77/267 and is therefore beyond the strict purview of ECE. At the Commission level, the secretariat will continue to present annually its report on technical cooperation activities structured by SDG and covering all funding sources.	On the basis of the two actions described below, <b>OIOS marked this recommendation</b> <b>as closed and implemented on 22 December</b> <b>2023.</b> ECE presented its Annual report on Technical Cooperation for 2022 to ECE Executive Committee at the 129 <sup>th</sup> Meeting of 6 July 2023 (Item 3). In keeping with the recommendation and the Management response, the Annual report describes results achieved with SDG support activities under all funding sources; it also reflects the synergies and coordination with other Secretariat entities. The Executive Committee took note of the report with appreciation. ECE has also revised the format of the 2025 Proposed programme plan for Programme 17, to make cleared references to the SDGs. In the version presented to the Executive Committee on 4 December 2023, under each subprogramme a paragraph specifies in which SDGs the work of the subprogramme will contribute to help ECE member States. Finally, para. 20.7 also describes: (a) the cross-cutting areas with multiplier effects across the SDGs; (b) the cooperation with other entities at the global, regional, national and local levels; (c) inter-agency coordination and liaison.