Economic Commission for Europe
Steering Committee on Trade Capacity and Standards
Working Party on Agricultural Quality Standards
Specialized Section on Standardization of Fresh Fruit and Vegetables
Seventy-second session
Geneva, 6–8 May 2024

Report of the seventy-second session of the Specialized Section on Standardization of Fresh Fruit and Vegetables

I. Introduction

1. The seventy-second session of the Specialized Section on Standardization of Fresh Fruit and Vegetables was chaired by Mr. Cyril Julius (South Africa).

2. The Chair welcomed the delegates highlighting the importance of standardization and value of the work performed by the Specialized Section. He noted that standards are not only used in ECE member States but also throughout Africa, to ensure that growers get a fair price for their exports as well as a point of reference when settling claims between exporters and importers.

3. The Chief ad interim of the Market Access Section of the Economic Cooperation and Trade Division of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (ECE), Mr. Ariel Ivanier, noted that the sustainability of food systems is critical for health, environment, climate, and livelihoods, and thus the achievement of many of the Sustainable Development Goals. He emphasized the central role of fresh fruit and vegetables for sustainable and healthy diets and noted that the standards developed by the Specialized Section play an important role in facilitating the trade in fresh fruit and vegetables. He expressed appreciation for the useful guidance on food loss and waste reduction in fresh fruit and vegetable value chains.

II. Attendance

4. Representatives of the following countries attended the meeting: Austria, Belgium, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Italy, Morocco, Netherlands (Kingdom of the), Poland, Russian Federation, Slovakia, South Africa, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Türkiye, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America.

5. The following specialized programme participated in the session: Joint Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO)/World Health Organization (WHO) Food Standards Programme (Codex Secretariat).

6. Representatives of the following intergovernmental organizations participated in the session: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO); International Trade Centre (ITC).
Representatives of the following non-governmental organizations, business associations, academia, and private sector entities also attended: Committee Linking Entrepreneurship-Agriculture-Development (COLEAD); International Organization for Standardization (ISO); Union Fleurs - International Flower Trade Association.

### III. Adoption of the agenda (agenda item 1)

8. The Specialized Section adopted the revised annotated provisional agenda as contained in document ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/1/Rev.1, with the addition under agenda item 6 to present the kiwifruit study prepared by Italy.

### IV. Matters arising since the last session (agenda item 2)

(a) **Recent developments in the United Nations, the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe and its subsidiary bodies**

9. The Chief *ad interim* of the Market Access Section informed of developments since the last session of the Specialized Section in May 2023, notably the eighth session of the Steering Committee on Trade Capacity and Standards which was held on 26 and 27 June 2023, and the seventy-eighth session of the Working Party on Agricultural Quality Standards, held on 13–15 November 2023. He informed that the upcoming meeting of the Steering Committee on Trade Capacity and Standards would be held on 26–28 June 2024, and the Working Party on Agricultural Quality Standards on 11–13 November 2024.

10. He further informed of the results of the programmatic evaluation of the work of the Economic Cooperation and Trade Division (ECTD), conducted by the Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) of the United Nations in 2022 and for which the report was published in March 2023 (E/AC.51/2023/5). The evaluators found that the work of ECTD was considered aligned with its mandate, that the Division largely responded to specific member States’ requests, and that it “found its niche in a crowded space of trade and economic cooperation”. On effectiveness, the evaluators concluded that the Division’s work on facilitating norms and standards setting was largely effective, noting that there were numerous instances of norms and standards being adopted into national policies and legislation, such as in the case of fresh fruit and vegetables standards in the European Union. The evaluators recommended that ECTD should: establish a technical cooperation request tracking mechanism; develop divisional action plans to operationalize ECE strategies on resource mobilization, partnerships, and technical cooperation; and ensure integration of gender, environment, disability inclusion, and human rights considerations in its various workstreams.

11. The Specialized Section noted with appreciation the outcome of the OIOS evaluation.

(b) **Recent developments in other organizations**

12. The representative of the Codex Secretariat of the Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme informed of recent developments in the Codex Alimentarius Commission, including that the 23rd session of the Codex Committee on Fresh Fruits and Vegetables (CCFFV) is tentatively scheduled to take place in February 2025 and will consider among others the draft standards for fresh dates and fresh curry leaves, and work on the review/update to the existing Codex standards. Further, the Codex Coordinating Committee for Latin America and the Caribbean (CCLAC), which is scheduled to be held virtually in July 2024, will consider the development of a draft regional standard for castilla lulo.

13. The Vice-Chair of the Fruit and Vegetables Scheme of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) provided an update on recent activities of the scheme, which included the publication of explanatory brochures for papayas, root vegetables, green bananas, and passion fruit, the ongoing development of a brochure for cauliflower, and the forthcoming development of a brochure for courgettes. Over the past
years, two joint webinars had been held with COLEAD. Upcoming training workshops included the capacity building workshop by the Quality Control Bureau (KCB) in the Netherlands, in collaboration with OECD and collaboration with ECE, UNDP, and Hilfswerk International in the organization of a training workshop in Uzbekistan, both to be held on 4-6 June 2024, as well as a regional training for countries in Africa and a peer review of Italy’s inspection system to be held in September/October 2024.

14. The representative of the International Trade Center (ITC) secretariat shared information on its capacity-building work on fresh fruit and vegetables. ITCs works on export promotion, with interventions at the ministerial, organizational, and company level, focused on supporting small businesses as they engage in international trade. ITC supports countries with market access for products, the development of roadmaps for exports, and capacity building, including training on European market requirements, on trade fair preparations and participation, on GlobalGap and ISO/Hazard Analysis and Critical Control System (HACCP) Certification.

15. The representative of COLEAD provided an overview of the work of the organization, which is geared at strengthening the expertise of people working in developing countries in African and Caribbean regions. Activities are focused on three pillars: ensuring market access (providing market insights), strengthening value chains (training and technical assistance) and leveraging impact (networks and alliances). During the past year, COLEAD received ISO 21001 certification for its management system for training and skills development and worked with OECD on the development of e-learning and on designing joint webinars. COLEAD is also part of the Fairmiles alliance¹, which seeks to promote a fair approach to “net zero” without stopping vital market access for developing world producers.

16. The representative of ISO presented on the work of the ISO committee on food products. ISO has more than 20000 standards. In the food sector, the ISO technical committee on Food Products (ISO/TC34) works on developing standards for food safety, quality (product specifications, nutritional value of food), fair practices in trade, and for sustainable development. Under ISO/TC34, subcommittee 3 (SC3) on Fruit and Vegetable Products has published 115 standards on methods of analysis/sampling, on product specifications, terminology, and packaging storage, transportation. ISO/TC34 had also recently set up a committee working on food loss and waste, which currently worked on two projects: Project ISO 20001 – development and utilization of management system standards for the minimization of food loss and waste across the food value chain, and Project ISO 20008 – measuring methods for determining food loss and waste.

V. Harmonized System codes for fresh fruits and vegetables

(agenda item 3)

17. At its 2023 session, the Specialized Section discussed the inconsistency and lack of granularity for some Harmonized System (HS) codes for fresh and dried fruit and the impact this has on the ability to analyse trade at individual product level. Following the meeting, the secretariat was informed that FAO had submitted a proposal to the World Customs Organization (WCO) for changes to HS codes for tropical fruit.

18. The representative of FAO gave a presentation on the background and content of its proposal to revise HS codes for tropical fresh fruit, which had been submitted by FAO to the Harmonized System Review Sub-Committee (RSC) of the WCO in October 2022. The FAO proposal consists of two parts: firstly, to separate the produce that is currently clustered under HS code 0804.50, which currently comprises guavas, mangoes and mangoosteen, into separate HS codes for the three products. Secondly, it proposed to create separate HS codes for five other tropical fruits currently reported under HS code 0810.90, i.e. lychees, longans, dragon fruit, pomegranate, and passion fruit.

19. The proposal received a positive response from several delegations and the RSC of the WCO provisionally adopted it. The proposal is expected to be formally adopted by the

¹ https://fairmiles.org/
Harmonized System Committee in 2025, with the resulting revised nomenclature entering into force on 1 January 2028.

20. FAO further informed that suggesting changes to HS codes requires providing empirical evidence showing the importance of products in international trade, as products that are traded below 50 million USD would generally remain clustered under the same HS code.

21. The Specialized Section thanked the representative of FAO for the useful presentation. Several delegations highlighted the issue of the currently joint HS codes for fresh and dried fruit. Delegations further took note that proposing any changes to the HS code structure would require empirical evidence showing the importance of products in international trade, and that working with FAO would be a potential channel.

VI. Sustainable Development Goal 12 and sustainable practices: food loss and waste prevention related to standards (agenda item 4)

22. The delegation of Sweden provided an update on the progress of the working group established in 2022 to conduct a review of selected ECE standards for fresh fruit and vegetables from a food loss and waste prevention perspective. Over the past year, the working group had met twice and submitted a proposal for revisions to the standard for carrots (see agenda item 6).

VII. Development of new standards: sweet potatoes (agenda item 5)

23. At its 2023 session, the Specialized Section finalized a draft standard for sweet potatoes and submitted it to the Working Party. The Working Party at its seventy-eighth session in November 2023 decided to adopt the draft text as a recommendation (i.e. draft standard) for a one-year trial period.

24. The Specialized Section reviewed the recommendation on sweet potatoes (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/2023/7) and found that it was ambiguous with regard to whether sizing is mandatory or not.

25. The Specialized Section agreed that sizing should be mandatory for Class I and optional for Class II, that minimum size should apply to both classes, and that uniformity requirements should apply to Class I but not to Class II. It agreed to submit the draft standard with those revisions to the Working Party for adoption as a new ECE standard for sweet potatoes.

VIII. Review of existing standards (agenda item 6)

(a) Discussion of proposals resulting from the last session

26. Following discussions at its 2023 session, the Specialized Section considered proposals for amendments to the standards for carrots and pears, as well as to the informal reference list of citrus fruit varieties.

(i) Carrots

27. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposal by the food loss and waste working group to amend the standard for carrots (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/2024/3). The group is composed of Brazil, France, Spain, South Africa, Sweden and the United States. The proposals included making sizing optional for Class II, moving the requirement of “not forked” from minimum requirements into classes, and stipulating that broken tips with a diameter of 4 mm and less would not be counted as broken. The proposal also included some
suggestions to improve the readability of the standard and to refer to the symptoms rather than the causes of defects.

28. The Specialized Section discussed the proposal at length. There was general support for making sizing optional in Class II. As regards minimum size requirements the views of delegations differed, with some suggesting removing them while others found them useful. Issues pointed out, among others, included that green was also to be considered discoloured, that traces of soil were not usually found on washed carrots, and that requirements related to soft rot and traces of soil should not be listed in the class requirements as they will be taken care of by the tolerances.

29. The Specialized Section agreed that the food loss and waste working group would continue its work and undertake a full review of the standard. Delegations that are not part of the food loss and waste working group were invited to join.

(ii) Pears

30. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposed revisions to the standard for pears (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/4) which had been developed by a working group composed of Belgium (rapporteur), France, Germany, Spain and United States, which was set up to review the non-exhaustive list annexed to the standard. It also reviewed a proposal by the delegation of Iran (Islamic Republic of) (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/5), which had suggested to add two varieties to the list and to include requirements for red hue.

31. The Specialized Section held an extensive discussion on the proposals. While delegations agreed with the proposal to remove the term summer pear from the standard, opinions differed as regards whether to only include large-fruited varieties in the list, to keep the full non-exhaustive list, or to make two lists (i.e. one with large-fruited as an annex to the standard and a full informal list to be kept on the website).

32. After some discussion, several delegations expressed support for a change on re-labelling what was earlier referred to as summer pear varieties into E for “exempt from minimum size requirements”. However, opinions still differed on whether there was a need to keep the requirements for minimum size for “other varieties” in the sizing provisions of the standard.

33. With regard to the proposals by Iran (Islamic Republic of), the Specialized Section it was noted that varieties can be added to the list if they are internationally traded. For red hue, several delegations objected to including requirements for red hue in the standard. One delegation recalled that when the Specialized Section earlier decided to split the apple and pears standards, it had removed the colour requirement for pears. As regards the proposal to include photos of pear shapes, the Specialized Section referred to the OECD brochure for pears.

34. Due to many divergent views by delegates, the Specialized Section requested the working group reconvene to discuss the different proposals and table a revised proposal at the next session.

(iii) Citrus fruit varieties

35. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposed revisions to the informal reference list of citrus fruit varieties (contained in document ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/6 and ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/INF.1) that had been developed by a working group consisting of Brazil, Germany, South Africa (rapporteur) and Spain.

36. The Specialized Section commended the work. While noting that the list is informal and non-exhaustive, it discussed whether or not to include it as an annex to the standard.

37. The Specialized Section agreed to the proposed revisions to the informal reference list of citrus fruit varieties. It further agreed to keep the list as informal (i.e. to not include it as an annex to the standard, which would allow for more frequent updates).
(b) New proposals

38. The Specialized Section considered revised proposals for amendments to the standards for headed cabbages, courgettes, garlic, leafy vegetables, and citrus fruit.

(i) Headed cabbages

39. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposal by the delegation of Sweden to amend the standard for headed cabbages (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/7), which suggests deleting the minimum size requirements for headed cabbages, alternatively reducing the requirements for minimum weight.

40. The Specialized Section agreed to remove the minimum weight requirement in the standard for headed cabbages, and to submit the revised standard to the Working Party for adoption.

(ii) Courgettes

41. The delegation of Germany introduced its proposal for revisions to the standard for courgettes (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/8). The delegation proposed to revise the sizing requirements to allow for more flexible grading of size by length and requested its adoption by the Specialized Section forwarding to Working Party for approval.

42. While there was general support for the proposal, several delegations suggested to also look at revising the requirements for sizing.

43. The Specialized Section requested Germany, in consultation with other delegations, to draft a new proposal for sizing by weight. Due to the requirements for Standards to not be reviewed more than once every three years, the Specialized Section agreed to finalize the revision through an intersessional process, and then submit it to the Working Party for adoption at its 2024 session.

(iii) Garlic

44. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposal by the delegation of Germany to amend the standard for garlic (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/9) by including an allowance for dry bruises and injuries.

45. Several delegations expressed concern with the proposal, including as regards the percentage constituted by two cloves in the case of garlic with few cloves. It was also proposed to revise the text to refer to non-progressive defects and slight dry superficial bruises and healed injuries. It was also mentioned that it is important to preserve the quality levels of Class “Extra” and Class I.

46. The Specialized Section requested the delegation of Germany to revise the proposal, taking into consideration the points raised, and to submit it for discussion at the next session of the Specialized Section.

(iv) Leafy vegetables

47. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposal by the delegation of Germany to amend the standard for leafy vegetables (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2023/10) by including pak choi under nature of produce.

48. The Specialized Section agreed to the proposal and also agreed to list the names of produce in the same order as under section I, definition of produce. It agreed to submit the standard text with those changes to the Working Party for adoption at its 2024 session.

(v) Citrus fruit

49. The Specialized Section reviewed the proposal by the delegation of South Africa to amend the standard for citrus fruit (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/11) by changing the text in footnote number 7 on nature of produce to refer to the non-exhaustive list of varieties as “informal”, as in its name, rather than “informative” as currently referred to in the standard.
50. The Specialized Section agreed to the proposal. It further agreed that the change could be considered editorial, and that it could be implemented by the secretariat without going through Working Party approval.

(c) Review of the standards for cut flowers

51. At its 2023 Session, the Specialized Section agreed to explore the possible revision of the ECE standards for cut flowers. The Specialized Section then decided to invite the International Flower Trade Association, Union Fleurs, at the suggestion of COLEAD, to make a presentation at its next meeting.

52. The secretary general of Union Fleurs gave a presentation of global production and trade in cut flowers. She noted that while more than 40 per cent of global flower trade transits via the Netherlands, the four largest exporting countries from the south (Colombia, Ecuador, Ethiopia, and Kenya) in 2015 together constituted approximately 45 per cent of global exports, around as much as the Netherlands.

53. After consulting with the industry, Union Fleurs had found that operators have limited awareness of the existence of the ECE standards on cut flowers, that some varieties for which ECE standards were developed are not as important in trade as they were earlier, and that the flower industry have built on the standards developed at ECE and integrated them into industry standards which cover a greater number of products and more detailed product specifications. She also reported that in direct trade between producers (for big volumes), they had found examples of reference to the ECE standards in the specific contracts between the buyers and sellers.

54. Union Fleurs further informed that the VBN (Dutch Flower Auctions Association) has developed product specifications covering 52 products, which include quality elements, including for maturity, grading, packaging, etc. They are followed across the European market as the reference for quality standards and are regularly updated and reviewed in consultation with growers.

55. In conclusion, from initial consultation with the industry, Union Fleurs indicated there does not seem to be a strong need for a review of the standards as the markets have functioned well since the 1990s, and the industry has developed its own specifications. That said, she noted that there might be a need to update the standards to match better with the actual market developments (e.g. develop a standard for orchids or lilies). She further noted that if work to revise or develop new standards was to be undertaken, it would be important to consult with the industry and Union Fleurs would be ready to support.

56. The Specialized Section thanked Union Fleurs for a very informative presentation. It agreed to keep the standards for cut flowers on the website but not revise them at the current time. It further suggested that the secretariat include a reference to the VBN standards on the ECE webpage for the cut flower standards.

(d) Provisions for industrial processing

57. The Specialized Section discussed if it would be desirable to include provisions for industrial processing in the standards for fresh fruit, or if there is a need for standards for fruit and vegetables intended for industrial processing. The Chair noted that the Specialized Section from time to time gets requests to include "kitchen-ready products", or other slightly processed produce.

58. Several delegations expressed that there is no need to develop ECE standards for products for industrial processing, as there are existing industry standards for these types of products produced elsewhere.
(e) Alignment of standards with the revised standard layout

59. The secretariat provided an update on the progress made regarding the alignment of existing standards with the revised standard layout. After the adoption of the revised standard layout in November 2023, the secretariat worked to align all existing fresh fruit and vegetable standards with the revised standard layout. The work had been reviewed by the Bureau and had been completed for the English language versions. The secretariat informed that it would initiate work on aligning the Russian and French language versions.

(f) Presentation by Italy on the study on kiwifruit

60. The delegation of Italy presented the findings of its study on the implications of modifying the flesh colour uniformity provisions in the standard for kiwifruit (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/INF.2). The delegation expressed concern about the modification done to allow mixed kiwifruit of different colours in the same package. It noted that in the past years, the kiwifruit sector had been hit with a lot of diseases. In addition, it reported a change in consumer behaviour, with demand increasing for sweeter kiwifruit. The concern of Italy is that mixed packaging can confuse the consumer and create unfair competition, as prices can vary influences mainly by the different flesh colours (i.e. lower prices for packages with less expensive kiwi varieties).

61. The Specialized Section thanked the delegation of Italy for the study.

IX. Capacity-building and promotional activities (agenda item 7)

62. The secretariat informed about the upcoming capacity building on standards and inspection of fresh and dried fruit and vegetables to be organized on 4-6 June 2024 in Tashkent, Uzbekistan.

63. The delegation of Slovakia informed that its next international training course on harmonization of fruit and vegetable quality assessment would be held on 17-19 September 2024 in Mojmírovce, Slovakia, with a focus on citrus fruit and walnuts.

64. The delegation of Germany informed of its next international meeting on quality control of fresh fruit and vegetables, to be held in Bonn on 25-27 March 2025.

65. COLEAD informed of the e-learning tool on conformity checks developed with OECD with the purpose of training inspectors. The e-learning tool has eight modules and aims to help national inspection bodies to train their staff. The tool is now ready, and the next step is to implement it through the training of trainers. COLEAD would be happy to discuss this individually with delegations. COLEAD also showed the analytics function available on its website, which contains a lot of trade data on individual product level, as well as its AGRINFO online platform, which compiles information on recent and upcoming EU regulatory changes. These are accessible by competent authorities, business membership and national farmer organizations from low, lower-middle and upper-middle-income economies linked to the EU markets.

66. The Specialized Section welcomed the e-learning tool developed by COLEAD and OECD and encouraged it to be made available to as wide an audience as possible.

X. Working Procedures of the Working Party on Agricultural Quality Standards and its Specialized Sections (agenda item 8)

67. The secretariat provided an update on the progress of work to review the Working Procedures of the Working Party on Agricultural Quality Standards and its Specialized Sections and invited views on the proposed revisions (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/2023/4, and ECE/CTCS/WP.7/2023/INF.2). The open working group consists of Brazil, Poland, Spain and the United States of America, and Germany had also commented.
68. The Specialized Section reviewed the initial proposals for revisions to the Working Procedures and provided several suggestions for rewording, which were recorded in track-change in session. The secretariat will convey the suggestions to the open working group.

XI. Electronic quality certificates and digitalization (agenda item 9)

69. The Specialized Section discussed the role of digitalization in ensuring efficient agricultural trade, focusing on the needs and current solutions for national inspection bodies.

70. Several delegations suggested that the discussions should continue, with more focused discussions, and that that this may involve a presentation by a delegation at each session. It was recalled that digitization had come further in the phytosanitary space, as documentation is compulsory, but that in many cases electronic conformity certificates are not compulsory and thus the appetite for digitization had been lower.

71. The Codex Secretariat informed that in 2021 the Codex Commission had adopted revised guidance on paperless use of electronic certificates, focusing on food quality and food safety.

72. The secretariat conveyed information received from the European Commission, informing that the European Commission intends to further digitize the trading processes by establishing an electronic system for DG AGRI non-customs formalities (ELAN) based on TRACES NT and linked to the EU Single Window Environment for customs as established by Regulation (EU) 2022/2399. A feasibility study is currently underway. The scope of the project includes conformity certificates for fruit and vegetables electronically issued by inspection bodies of EU Member States and third countries. It aims to connect ELAN to national systems of Member States and third countries. ELAN will be developed in two phases, with certificates of conformity for fruits and vegetables part of the second phase (ELAN2-C). ELAN2-C is intended to be used at both import and export and is expected to be available to stakeholders to issue relevant supporting documents in 2026.

73. The Specialized Section agreed to keep digitalization on the agenda for its next session, and to invite the EU Commission to present on ELAN 2-C, and to also invite the secretariat to present on relevant ECE tools and standards in this regard.

XII. Future work (agenda item 10)

74. The Specialized Section decided to include the following items on the agenda for its next session:

- continuation of the work in the working group to review standards from a food loss and waste perspective, including the continued review of the standard for carrots
- review of the pears standard by the working group consisting of Belgium (rapporteur), France, Germany, Spain and United States
- review of the standards for courgettes (intersessional) and garlic, by Germany
- discussion on if extra class is needed for roots, tubers and bulb crops, by the United States
- review of the tolerance section of the standard layout, proposed by the United States
- continued discussion on digitalization, including inviting presentations by individual member States, the European Commission and the ECE secretariat
- update by the Netherlands on its pilot to assess the possibility of making markings digital, assigning a unique number to each producer/grower box similar to containers in shipping trade, legible through a QR code.
XIII. Other business (agenda item 11)

75. No issue was raised under other business.

XIV. Election of officers (agenda item 12)

76. The Specialized Section re-elected Mr. Cyril Julius (South Africa) as its Chairperson and Ms. Karen Spruijt-de Gelder (Kingdom of the Netherlands) as its Vice-Chairperson for a one-year period.

XV. Adoption of the report (agenda item 13)

77. The Specialized Section adopted the report of its seventy-second session (ECE/CTCS/WP.7/GE.1/2024/2) in session.