Economic Commission for Europe
Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and Public-Private Partnerships
Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships
Seventh session
Geneva, 30 November-1 December 2023
Item 3 of the provisional agenda
Review of the work since the sixth session of the Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships on 1-2 December 2022

Annual summary report of Bureau decisions since the sixth session of the Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships on 1-2 December 2022

Note by the secretariat

Background
This document contains the consolidated list of decisions (verbatim and in date order) taken by the Bureau of the ECE Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships since the sixth session of the Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships on 1-2 December 2022. During the period in question, the Bureau took 38 decisions during 11 meetings. The document is submitted by the secretariat to the Working Party for information in line with Rule 16 of the Rules of Procedure (ECE/CECI/(WP/PPP/2021/5/Rev.1).

List of decisions

Bureau meeting – Tuesday, 13 December 2022

Decision 2022-44. Standard on PPP/Concession legal framework in support of the SDGs
Considering that the document received by the Bureau from EBRD on 8 December 2022 for the Bureau discussion is potentially different from what the EBRD actually intends to publish, the Bureau:

1. Noted the wish from EBRD to publish the document/standard approved by the UNECE Working Party on PPPs on 2 December 2022 (ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2022/5), with possible minor edits.

2. Requested EBRD to send to the Bureau as soon as possible the draft final version which it intends to publish, including the title and detailed introductory institutional aspects, and annexes, in track changes from the Working Party on PPPs December version, for final discussion and decision by the Bureau.
3. Requested the Chair, in advance of receiving the draft final version, to also offer the following considerations to EBRD:

   (i) With respect to the title an appropriate balanced formulation and presentation be found, considering the following key aspects:

      (a) Full inclusion of the respective institutional authorship, based on the way this document was initiated in 2016 by UNECE, and based on the key institutional contributions from: UNECE, including by the International Specialist Centre of Excellence on PPP Policies, Laws and Institutions, and EBRD; and

      (b) Explicit mention of the dual focus of the document on both “PPPs” and “concessions”.

   (ii) Suggests to EBRD to use the following reference as part of the title with respect to the collaboration on the document: “developed by the UNECE in collaboration with EBRD”.

   (iii) Request that on the first page of EBRD published document, a footnote is added to underline, as a cross-reference and for the purpose of transparency to the readership the following points:

      (a) This document is being published independently by the two institutions, UNECE and EBRD;

      (b) The UNECE document has been endorsed by the UNECE Working Party on PPPs on 2 December 2022 as document number ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2022/5 and the Working Party agreed to rename it as “Standard on Public-Private Partnerships/Concession legal framework in support of the SDGs”;

      (c) The internet link to this UNECE document should be added, in the respective UNECE languages (English, Russian, and French); and

      (d) That this document is one of several that have been designed for the implementation of the SDGs through PPPs and concessions. Please visit https://unece.org/ppp/products to access the full package of documents.

Bureau meeting - Tuesday, 24 January 2023

Decision 2023 – 01. Follow up to the 6th session of the Working Party on PPPs

The Bureau:

1. Took note of the Working Party’s decision on 2 December 2022 requesting the Bureau to finalise the commentary/accompanying guide to accompany the Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals under its auspices in 2023;

2. Acknowledged the need to give priority to this document;

3. Agreed that existing available material could be used;

4. Reiterated that its preparation and finalisation has to be on a pro bono basis;

5. Decided to set up a Bureau sub-group composed of Mr. Steven van Garsse, Mr. Art Smith, Mr. Frederic Bobay, and Ms. Doris Chevalier to supervise and oversee the process of finalising the guide; and

6. Decided that the Bureau sub-group will provide a detailed plan to the Bureau at its next meeting.
Decision 2023 – 02. Future Work

The Bureau:
1. Took note with appreciation of the launching by the secretariat of the work on five new best practice guides as agreed by the Working Party on 2 December 2022; and
2. Requested the secretariat to manage the drafting process and to provide regular updates to the Bureau.

Decision 2023 – 03. Cooperation with SIF-SOURCE

The Bureau:
1. Noted with appreciation the progress made in the cooperation with SIF/SOURCE platform;
2. Agreed with the proposal from SIF to develop a hybrid solution using an application programming interface (API) to establish communication between SOURCE and PIERS;1 and
3. Urged the secretariat to give priority to the development of a more user-friendly web version of PIERS to complement the Excel file.2

Decision 2023 – 04. Preparations for the 7th edition of the UNECE International PPP Forum and the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP)

The Bureau:
1. Took note of the update by the secretariat on the preparations for the Forum and the proposed daily schedule;3 and
2. Took note of the update by the Chair on the preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP).

Decision 2023 – 05. AOB

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on 1 March 2023 at 12 noon CET.

---

1 SIF proposed as their first solution to map PIERS against SOURCE existing similar questions to avoid data duplication entries, using the same approach as for FAST-Infra label, or GRIS or national methodologies. The missing questions in SOURCE will be added to the project assessment. It is important to highlight here that SOURCE will not represent PIERS as is, i.e., the matching process does not necessarily mean that categories, indicators, weight, etc. are exactly the same and they would not generate the same results as those generated by PIERS. The hybrid solution using API would enable SOURCE users to do a “pre-assess” of their project documentation against PIERS and add hyperlinks in SOURCE assessment module to PIERS website version for guidance. SIF could also make available the published project assessment data in SOURCE to the UNECE online scoring platform or website, using an Application Programming Interface to obtain an official scoring by UNECE.

2 This need was already acknowledged by the Bureau at its meeting in February 2022 (see Decision 2022 – 4.4: “The Bureau acknowledged the need by the secretariat to develop a more user-friendly web version of the self-assessment tool to complement the Excel file once the CICPPP approves the methodology.”)

3 The secretariat is working on a preliminary Forum schedule, which it will share with the Bureau before the Bureau meeting. There will be enough time for Bureau members to make comments before the preliminary schedule is published on the UNECE website on 1 February (the programme of the Forum will be developed by the secretariat in February and it will be published in early March).
Bureau meeting - Wednesday, 1 March 2023

Decision 2023 – 06. Standard on PPP/Concession legal framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals: finalise the commentary/accompanying guide in 2023

The Bureau:

1. Took note with appreciation of the plan to finalise the commentary/accompanying guide to accompany the Standard on PPP/Concession Model Law (renamed by the Working Party as “Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals in 2023”) presented by Bureau sub-group;
2. Agreed with the plan as proposed by the sub-group; and
3. Requested the Bureau sub-group to implement the plan in a timely manner and to keep the Bureau informed accordingly.

Decision 2023 – 07. Preparations for the 7th edition of the UNECE International PPP Forum (CICPPP) (3-5 May)

The Bureau:

1. Took note with appreciation of the provisional programme for the Forum;
2. Agreed with the secretariat’s plans to publish the provisional programme by 3 March 2023 to encourage participation; and
3. Requested the secretariat to keep the Bureau regularly informed on the progress.

Decision 2023 – 08. Preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP) (31 May-2 June)

The Bureau:

1. Took note of the update by the Chair and the secretariat on the preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP); and
2. Took note of the revised document containing the Evaluation Methodology to be reissued and submitted to CICPPP in line with two decisions by the member States at the

---

4 The Bureau sub-group made an initial analysis of which articles in the commentary need special or modified clarification, and have gone through all the chapters. The Bureau sub-group proposes:

- to distribute the chapters among its members with the exception of a few articles where the sub-group would seek input from experts. For most articles, the current assessment is that a technical revision is sufficient. For a few articles it is different; and
- to ask input from WAPPP because the articles that need clarification and new comments have been created based on expertise from Mr. Ziad Hayek and Mr. Marc Frilet. These are mainly articles related to the institutional organization of PPP units, etc.) and the set-up of projects. In a second phase, it is proposed that targeted input would also be sought on additions to other articles (articles that were modified or re-engineered), but this will be very limited and very focused.

Based on that input, the Bureau sub-group will work to include in the commentary the input received. As to the timing: if the Bureau agrees, the Bureau sub-group can discuss with WAPPP what is feasible as their input and timing will determine the way forward.

5 The provisional programme was sent to the Bureau on 27 February 2023.
CICPPP in May 2022 (decision 2022 – 4b.2) and at the Working Party in December 2022 (Decision 2022 – 4.4).

**Decision 2023 – 09. AOB**

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on 4 April 2023 at 12 noon CET.

**Bureau meeting - Tuesday, 4 April 2023**

**Decision 2023 – 10. Standard on PPP/Concession legal framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals: finalise the commentary/accompanying guide in 2023**

The Bureau:

1. Took note with appreciation of the update presented by the Bureau sub-group on the work to finalise the commentary/accompanying guide to accompany the Standard on PPP/Concession Model Law (renamed by the Working Party in 2023 as “Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals”); and

2. Requested the Bureau sub-group to continue working on the guide, with a view to finalizing it at the soonest in view of its programmed publication, and keep the Bureau posted as necessary pursuant to the Working Party decision 2022 – 4.2 in December 2022.

**Decision 2023 – 11. Preparations for the 7th edition of the UNECE International PPP Forum (3-5 May)**

The Bureau took note with appreciation of the progress in the preparations of the Forum.

---

6 Decision 2022 – 4b.2 (ECE/CECI/2022/2): Regarding the continued use of the name “People-first PPPs for the SDGs”, the Committee took note of the results of the information consultations conducted with interested delegations on the matter since the fifth session of the Working Party on PPPs in November 2021, and decided to:

i. Change the name to “PPPs for the SDGs”; and

ii. Progressively reissue the documents endorsed and adopted by the Committee and the Working Party on PPPs to reflect i. above within the document quota allocated to the ECI subprogramme and without incurring additional costs.  

The Committee requested the secretariat to reissue three core documents within twelve months, and the rest of the documents within three years. The Committee requested the Bureau of the Working Party on PPPs to decide on which non-core documents should be prioritised during this period.

Note: the three core documents are: Guiding Principles on People-first PPP in support of the UN SDGs (ECE/CECI/2019/5); Introduction to People-first PPPs in support of the UN SDGs (ECE/CECI/2019/6); and the People-first PPP Evaluation Methodology for the SDGs (ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2021/3).

7 Decision 2022 – 4.4 (ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2022/1): The Working Party:

1. Recognising the need for a more marketable name for the UNECE PPP Evaluation Methodology for the SDGs, agreed with the Bureau recommendation to rename the Evaluation Methodology as “UNECE PPP and Infrastructure Evaluation and Rating System (PIERS): An Evaluation Methodology for the SDGs”; and

2. Noted that the Evaluation Methodology will be reissued in early 2023 to reflect 1 above and the Committee’s decision 2022 – 4b.2 (ECE/CECI/2022/2).

8 The secretariat briefed the Bureau on the progress to form the drafting teams to develop the practical guides approved by the Working Party. After a call for participation, 297 experts have indicated their interest to be in the drafting/peer review groups. The secretariat is currently identifying potential drafting group leaders for 4 of the 5 teams (Mr Steven van Garsse is the team leader of the green PPP procurement group) and will subsequently form the groups so that the work can start in due course.
Decision 2023 – 12. Preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP) (31 May-2 June)

The Bureau took note of:

1. The update by the Chair and the secretariat on the preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP); and
2. The draft PPP decisions that will be shared by the secretariat with the member States in due course.

Decision 2023 – 13. AOB

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on 16 May 2023 at 12 noon CET.

Bureau meeting - Tuesday, 16 May 2023

Decision 2023 – 14. 7th edition of the UNECE International PPP Forum (3-5 May)

The Bureau:

1. Congratulated the Municipality of Athens, the Government of Greece and the secretariat for organising a most successful 7th edition UNECE International PPP Forum in Athens, Greece from 3 to 5 May 2023; and
2. Thanked the Chairperson for taking the initiative to bring the Forum to Athens.


The Bureau:

1. Took note with appreciation of the update presented by the Bureau sub-group on the work to finalise the commentary/accompanying guide to accompany the Standard on PPP/Concession Model Law (renamed by the Working Party in 2023 as “Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals”); and
2. Requested the Bureau sub-group to continue working on the guide, liaise with the experts involved to proceed with their input to the guide as proposed, taking into account the Bureau discussion on the matter, with a view to finalizing it by July 2023, and keep the Bureau posted as necessary pursuant to the Working Party decision 2022 – 4.2 in December 2022.

Decision 2023 – 16. Preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP) (31 May-2 June)

The Bureau took note of the update by the Chair and the secretariat on the preparations for the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP), including the outcomes of the CICPPP Bureau meeting held on 15 May 2023.

9 The secretariat briefed the Bureau on the following two issues:

1. 5 new workstreams launched in 2023: all the drafting group leaders have been identified, and the secretariat plans to form the drafting groups in the coming days, with a view of them holding meetings before the Forum.
2. Documents to be re issued in 2023: the secretariat proposed to have a discussion at the next Bureau meeting on the documents to be re issued for the next WP session. 8 to 10 documents could be submitted in 2023, with the rest to be issued in 2024. The secretariat recalled that the Bureau has already started to prioritise the list of documents, and suggested that the list would be agreed at the next Bureau meeting. The secretariat will re circulate the list with a brief summary of the Bureau discussions in 2022.
Decision 2023 – 17. Parliamentary documents to be re-issued

The Bureau took note of:

1. The information provided by the secretariat that 7 to 8 documents could be re-issued already in 2023 as pre-session documents for the 7th session of the Working Party on PPPs on 30 November-1 December 2023; and


Decision 2023 – 18. AOB

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on Monday, 12 June 2023 at 12 noon CEST.

Bureau meeting - Monday, 12 June 2023


The Bureau:

1. Noted with appreciation the update presented by the Bureau sub-group on the work to finalise the commentary/accompanying guide to accompany the Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals; and

2. Reiterated the need to finalize the guide in July 2023; and

3. Requested the Bureau sub-group to share a draft of the guide for the Bureau’s consideration in due course.

Decision 2023 – 20. 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP) (31 May-2 June)

The Bureau:

1. Noted with appreciation the successful conclusion of the 16th session of the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and PPPs (CICPPP), and the adoption of the Intersessional Implementation Plan for 2023-2024, including the PPP work; and in particular

2. Took note of the dates of the next Working Party session (30 November to 1 December) and the 8th International PPP Forum (8-10 May 2024).

Decision 2023 – 21. Preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs (30 November to 1 December 2023)

The Bureau:

1. Requested the secretariat to prepare a draft annotated agenda for the Working Party and to share it with the Bureau for its consideration by mid-July 2023 (for clearance by the end of July);

2. Noted that with effect from 16 May 2023, all special procedures during the COVID-19 period adopted by the Executive Committee were no longer in place (this included the possibility of having official meetings in hybrid formats);

3. Further noted that as a result of 2 above, the decisions at the next Working Party session will be agreed by delegations participating in person; and

4. Agreed, subject to funding, to allow online (via Zoom) participation to Working Party delegates, speakers and experts on the first day only (30 November) to contribute to the policy
dialogue, on the understanding that all decisions will be taken by Working Party delegations present in person.

**Decision 2023 – 22. Fundraising activities**

The Bureau:

1. Noted with appreciation the secretariat’s efforts to raise funding for the UNECE PPP work; and
2. In line with the OIOS recommendations, encouraged donors to provide funding towards the UNECE PPP normative work and technical assistance.

**Decision 2023 – 23. AOB**

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on Tuesday, 27 June 2023 at 13:30hrs CEST.

---

**Bureau meeting - Tuesday, 27th June 2023**


The Bureau:

1. Noted with appreciation the update presented by the Bureau sub-group on the work to finalise the commentary/accompanying guide to accompany the Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals; and
2. Requested the Chair to contact the experts involved in the process so that they submit their comments by 10 July 2023; and
3. Looked forward to receiving the draft of the guide by 25 July 2023 with a view to finalise the document by 31 July 2023.

**Decision 2023 – 25. Fundraising activities**

The Bureau:

1. Noted and discussed the proposals of Bureau members on fundraising options;
2. Encouraged other Bureau members to share their proposals on fundraising;
3. Requested the secretariat to prepare a brief note on this topic and share it with the Bureau; and
4. Agreed to revert to this matter at a future Bureau meeting.

**Decision 2023 – 26. AOB**

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on 31 July 2023 at 12:00 CEST.

---

**Bureau meeting - Monday, 31 July 2023**

**Decision 2023 – 27. UN publication with the Standard on PPP/Concession legal framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals and its commentary/accompanying guide**

The Bureau:

1. Endorsed the accompanying guide to the Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the SDGs ;
2. Requested Mr. Steven van Garsse (Belgium) to carry out a technical and linguistic review/proofreading of the accompanying guide in August 2023 without the need to revert back to the Bureau;

3. Agreed on the text to be used in the UN publication to acknowledge the contribution by the various experts and Bureau members;


5. Expressed its appreciation to the Bureau subgroup Mr. Steven van Garsse (Belgium), Mr. Frédéric Bobay (France), Mr. Art Smith (United States) and Ms. Doris Chevalier (Bureau observer) and the experts for their valuable contribution to the finalization of the accompanying guide; and

6. Requested the secretariat to prepare and submit the UN publication with the Standard and its Accompanying Guide (the secretariat has a final editorial say on the publication).

Decision 2023 – 28. Preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs (30 November – 1 December 2023)

The Bureau:

1. Noted with appreciation the progress presented by the secretariat on the preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs, including the status of the pre-session and INF documents;

2. Endorsed the draft Annotated Provisional Agenda in document ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2023/1; and

3. Requested the secretariat to submit the agenda and the pre-session documents therein to the Working Party.

Decision 2023 – 29. Future PPP work

The Bureau:

1. Noted with appreciation the progress presented by the secretariat on the ongoing PPP work;

2. Agreed to assign Bureau liaisons to the various drafting teams developing practical guides;

3. Assigned Ms. Doris Chevalier (Bureau observer), working in close collaboration with Mr. Sam Tabuchi (Japan) and Ms. Melissa Peneycad (Bureau observer), as the Bureau liaison for the practical guide under preparation on the pros and cons of simplifying and accelerating the delivery of PPP projects for the SDGs for sustainable economic recovery and reconstruction.

4. Requested Bureau members and observers to volunteer to become Bureau liaisons for the other guides under preparation by 31 August 2023;

5. Requested the secretariat to update and share with the Bureau for consideration document ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2022/INF.2 with new topics for future PPP work and/or to launch from 2024; and

6. Agreed to revert to this matter at its next Bureau meeting.

Decision 2023 – 30. AOB

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on Thursday, 14 September at 12:00 CEST.
Decision 2023 – 31. Preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs
(30 November – 1 December 2023)

The Bureau:
1. Noted with appreciation the progress presented by the secretariat on the preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs;
2. Took note with appreciation of a briefing by Ms. Doris Chevalier (Bureau observer) on the work on the recovery and reconstruction guide;
3. Discussed the future PPP work in document ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2023/INF.2;
4. Agreed with the revised list of topics with the addition of two topics (off-grid renewable energy and climate resilient PPP and infrastructure projects) and the proposal for work on new PPP documents (stakeholder engagement, women’s empowerment, off-grid renewable energy and climate resilient PPP and infrastructure projects) to start in 2024; and
5. Requested the secretariat to finalise the proposal on the proposed off-grid standard and resubmit document ECE/CECI/WP/PPP/2023/INF.2 to the Bureau for approval.

Decision 2023 – 32. UN publication of the Standard on Public-Private Partnerships/Concession Legal Framework in support of the Sustainable Development Goals and its Accompanying Guide

The Bureau:
1. Took note of the final version of the Accompanying Guide to the Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the SDGs;
2. Expressed its appreciation to Mr. Steven van Garsse (Belgium) for conducting the final proofreading; and
3. Requested the Chair to share the Accompanying Guide with the experts for information only with a ‘thank you’ note on behalf of the Bureau.

Decision 2023 – 33. Fundraising activities

The Bureau:
1. Noted with appreciation the secretariat’s efforts to raise funding for the UNECE PPP work; and
2. Agreed to revert to this matter at a future Bureau meeting.

Decision 2023 – 34. AOB

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on Thursday, 12 October at 12 noon CEST.
3. Referring to the offer by Türkiye to, in principle and subject to confirmation before the Working Party session, host the 8th edition of the UNECE International PPP Forum in Istanbul in May 2024, endorsed the offer and agreed to recommend to the Working Party to accept it.

Decision 2023 – 36. AOB

The Bureau decided to hold its next meeting on Friday, 10 November at 12 noon CET.

Bureau meeting – Friday, 10 November 2023

Decision 2023 – 37. Preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs (30 November – 1 December 2023)

The Bureau:

1. Noted the progress on the preparations for the seventh session of the Working Party on PPPs; and

2. Expressed its deep appreciation to the secretariat – Mr. Tony Bonnici, Mr. Claudio Meza and Mr. Antonin Menegaux – for the always efficient and transparent way that the Working Party sessions are being prepared.

Decision 2023 – 38. AOB

The Bureau:

1. Requested the Chair to reply on its behalf to the letter from the Executive Director of WAPPP, by thanking WAPPP for its support to the development of the Accompanying Guide to the Standard on PPP/Concession Legal Framework in support of the SDGs, and inviting them to the launch of the UNECE publication;

2. Decided to hold its next meeting on Friday, 15 December at 2pm CET; and

3. Thanked the outgoing Chair, Mr. George Katapodis (Greece), the Vice-Chair, Ms. Sedef Yavuz-Noyan (Türkiye), and members – Mr. Steven Van Garsse (Belgium), Mr. Frederic Bobay (France), Mr. Sam Tabuchi (Japan), Ms. Svetlana Maslova (Russian Federation) and Mr. Art Smith (United States) – for their substantive contribution, leadership, and dedication towards the Working Party and the UNECE PPP programme.

---

10 Discussions with the Government of Türkiye started in January 2023.
11 The secretariat will reconfirm this date with the incoming Chairperson after the Working Party session.