

**To: Members of the Bureau of the Committee on Sustainable Energy**

**From: Juergen Keinhorst, Denise Mulholland, Dario Liguti**

**Call of the Bureau of the Committee on Sustainable Energy**

Via Teams – 14:00 CEST, 29 November 2022

**MINUTES**

**I. ATTENDANCE:**

- **Bureau Members in attendance:** Juergen Keinhorst (Chair), Emir Farhadzada (Azerbaijan), Admir Softić (Bosnia and Herzegovina), Jean-Christophe Fueeg (Switzerland), Farhod Bilolzoda (Tajikistan), Yaroslav Demchenkov (Ukraine), Emily Grubert (United States), David G. MacDonald (Expert Group of Resource Management – EGRM), Ray Pilcher (Group of Experts on Coal Mine Methane and Just Transition – GECMMJT), Jim Robb (Group of Experts on Cleaner Electricity Systems – GECES), Stefan Buettner (Group of Experts on Energy Efficiency – GEEE),
- **Other supporting staff in attendance:** Carlos Moreno Carrero (Group of Experts on Gas – GEG), Janna Janssen (Chair), Inna Slobodian (Ukraine), Oksana Tkachuk (Ukraine)
- **UNECE Secretariat staff in attendance:** Iva Brkic, Michal Jacek Drabik, Oleg Dzioubinski, Charlotte Griffiths, Steven Silaga Lagare, Dario Liguti (Division Director), Igor Litvinyuk, Branko Milicevic, Denise Marie Mulholland (Secretary), Gianluca Sambucini, Anthony Toscano, Harikrishnan Tulsidas, Siuzanna Sarkissova, Slavko Vekoslav Solar
- **Unable to attend:** Mr. Francisco de la Flor Garcia (Group of Experts on Gas – GEG), Mr. Kostiantyn Gura (Group of Experts on Renewable Energy – GERE), Mr. Romeo Mikautadze (Georgia), Dr. Chokan Laumulin (Kazakhstan), and Mr. Pawel Pikus (Poland)

**II. PROPOSED AGENDA:**

1. Opening and agenda approval
2. Meet the new Sustainable Energy Division (SED) Division Director – Dario Liguti
3. Meet the new Bureau - Introductions
  - What do you hope to help the Committee achieve in the next two years?
4. Bureau activities and expectations
5. Priorities coming out of CSE-31, Bureau Roles
6. Discussion of the Platform on Resilient Energy Systems
  - What activities provide the greatest potential to support increased resiliency of energy systems in ECE region and should be prioritized by the Committee?
  - What role can Bureau members play to support them?
  - Are there any comments on the communications piece circulated on 18 November?
  - Next Steps regarding a work plan development
7. Operations Feedback and Discussion
  - What lessons can we take from CSE-31 to improve CSE-32?
  - What can the Bureau/Secretariat do to enhance the success of the Committee?
  - Are there any ideas for the theme for the 32nd session?
8. EXCOM Chair report 30 November 2022
9. Recent and upcoming activities
10. AOB

### III. DOCUMENTATION:

1. Committee member list with contact information– for Agenda Item 1
2. [Final Report](#) of the 31<sup>st</sup> session of the Committee on Sustainable Energy (CSE31) ECE-ENERGY-143.pdf – for Agenda items 4 and 5
3. Draft Resiliency publication for Policymakers (for your review); Based on the “Building Resilient Energy Systems” background document from the CSE31- *3a. Building Resilient Energy Systems in the ECE Region - Post CSE31 Communications Paper for Policymakers DRAFT for CSE Bureau Review.docx*
4. Link to the [Report By the Chair](#) of the Committee on Sustainable Energy at the 125<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Executive Committee (EXCOM) of the Economic Commission for Europe on 30 November 2022 – for agenda item 7

### IV. SUMMARY OF DISCUSSIONS AND DECISIONS

#### Agenda Item 1. Opening and agenda approval

Documentation: Committee member list with contact information

The Chair, Juergen Keinhorst, welcomed all the bureau members and the agenda was approved as drafted

#### Agenda Item 2. Meet the new SED Division Director

Mr Dario Liguti introduced himself to the Bureau members.

#### Agenda Item 3. Meet the new Bureau – Introductions

Mr Liguti invited each bureau member to introduce themselves and identify what they hope to help the committee achieve in the next two years.

Bureau members expressed interest in working with the Committee on a number of different areas, including to help member States decrease CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, ensure access to safe, secure, sustainable and resilient energy systems – especially against external shocks- and create a just transition by:

- engaging with member States, identifying needs and sharing experiences
- working on the practical constraints of transitioning to more sustainable energy
- focusing where UNECE has unique value-added to avoid duplication of efforts (e.g. sustainable resource management - UN Framework Classification for Resources (UNFC), UN Resource Management System (UNRMS); coal mine methane (CMM))
- helping to identify and foster replication of innovative and effective policies and practices (e.g. renewables, just transition, especially for mine closures but also other fossil fuels, measurement, reporting and verification (MRV))
- potentially developing universal systems, standards and/or requirements (e.g. related to the design and construction of energy facilities, collective responses during challenges, consequences of attacks, etc)
- exploring decentralization of the energy sector
- reducing energy costs
- increasing energy efficiency and renewable energy
- promoting and providing training and education (e.g. via seminars and workshops) on the tools and resources we’ve already developed (e.g. UNFC, resiliency, CMM best practice guidance)

- increasing collaboration across expert groups, increasing understanding on and leveraging the interlinkages between the expert groups (e.g. between critical raw materials and renewable energy; between hydrogen and existing fuels and technologies) and the ability to advance understanding collectively
- promoting digitalization
- extending our work on technology interplay to focus on energy demand

Some bureau members said the expert groups would benefit from more top-down guidance on priorities from the Committee but should also be recognized as a source of unique expertise – with the latest knowledge about changes in technologies and approaches - that can guide the Committee.

In response to an idea to explore creation an international expert assistance platform for emergency assistance on technologies, equipment and repairs, Mr Liguti noted that it's a valuable suggestion but that the Committee work on energy resilience is on more on the medium to long term perspective (ie. not equipped to address emergency response). He acknowledged that the subprogramme is working at the UNECE level on how to organize and react, and is making proposals inside the UN to support the reconstruction of Ukraine that will hopefully be supported by the Member States and by the donors.

The Chair thanked the bureau members for their service, ideas, and interests.

#### **Agenda Item 4. Bureau activities and expectations**

Documentation: [Final Report](#) of the 31<sup>st</sup> session of the Committee on Sustainable Energy (CSE31) ECE-ENERGY-143.pdf

The Chair acknowledged that the Committee works on the demands and agenda of the UNECE member States and that it will continue the work of the last few years. He also stated that the Committee appreciates expert group input, including recommendations based on their experience, the situation, and new technologies, and that he expects this to intensify as the expert groups contribute to the overarching goals of the committee. He stated that main priorities from the Committee meeting include: hydrogen, energy efficiency, critical raw materials and resource management and taking a regional approach, especially in Central Asia but potentially others.

The Chair stated that the Committee should avoid duplicating work of other organizations and really see where the committee, as expert groups, can provide added value but also acknowledged that it does not exclude some overlapping. He stated that it is better to take advantage of some synergies of our work with respective organizations.

He also noted that financing is a cross cutting issue where the Committee has already started to intensify exchange with international financing institutions, not to enter into financing issues in detail, but at least to address it and intensify cooperation to help get the framework conditions in place for technologies.

#### **Agenda Item 5. Priorities coming out of CSE-31, Bureau Roles**

Documentation: [Final Report](#) of the CSE31 ECE-ENERGY-143.pdf

Mr Liguti and members of the secretariat described the **four main priorities** coming out of CSE31 as:

## 1. Enable a hydrogen ecosystem

The secretariat described the range of Committee actions that would help enable the hydrogen ecosystem, including to:

- Centralize hydrogen work under the Committee with GEG coordinating it, in collaboration with other GoEs; operationalize Task Force on Hydrogen
- Promote a hydrogen ecosystem as part of building resilient energy systems, finding ways to use the current gas infrastructure to scale-up a nascent industry
- Investigate existing classifications and specifications and develop specifications for the application of UNFC and the UNRMS to hydrogen projects and production technologies, as appropriate
- Develop pilot hydrogen resource management projects and case studies applying UNRMS principles
- Explore opportunities to develop a Guarantee of Origin for Hydrogen (GOH) that decouples physical from commercial flows
- Agree to a threshold for hydrogen purity (of importance for a broader adoption of hydrogen as an energy carrier)
- Immediate steps:
  - *Draft Hydrogen Task Force ToR* and discuss them at GEG-10, then at EGRM, then at CSE-32
  - *Develop recommendations for a coherent international system of standardization of hydrogen*
  - *Develop recommendations for pilot projects in international cooperation in sustainable hydrogen technologies*

Mr Liguti noted that a number of initiatives and priorities will require extrabudgetary support but the work will proceed on the immediate actions.

## 2. Provide targeted support to build resilient energy systems in Central Asia

The secretariat informed the Committee that UNECE had recently launched strategic partnership with UNDP and ESCAP to accelerate energy transition in Central Asia at the successful 2<sup>nd</sup> Almaty Forum. Key areas of work include:

- Low- and zero-carbon technology interplay in Central Asia (UNECE SED leads)
- Access to critical raw materials in Central Asia (UNECE SED leads)
- Water and energy nexus in Central Asia (UNECE ENV leads)
- Energy connectivity in Central Asia (ESCAP leads)
- Fostering next generation of energy experts to deliver on energy transition in Central Asia (KBTU leads & coordinates network of regional universities; SED will work with them)

## 3. Accelerate Sustainable Resource Management

The secretariat described the XB Project "Development and implementation of UNFC and UNRMS." The current focus includes countries of European Union and on critical raw materials (CRMs).

The secretariat also noted other priorities, including:

- *UNFC Guidance Europe*
  - The secretariat noted that the European Commission is in the process of developing a Critical Raw Materials Act, and that some comments

proposed that the UNFC should be included as part of it; This would be a gamechanger for UNFC.

- *UNRMS Principles and Requirements*
  - It was approved at the EGRM session 25 October; public comment period closes 30 November on the twelve principles and requirements so plan to publish very soon.
- *Focus on Critical Raw Materials*
  - The secretariat noted that demand for the CRMs and metals needed for the energy and green transitions is expected to grow exponentially over the next two decades. UNECE is engaging to support the development of an UNRMS CRMs Dashboard with credible, harmonized and up-to-date information as part of an UN UNRMS toolkit and to support a greener, circular, low-carbon trajectory via Resources as a Service.
- *Focus on Financing the Value Chain*
  - Financing CRMs is hugely important to meet the goals of the 2030 Agenda and the Paris Agreement and there has been an increasing level of interest in the last year, including leading up to and at COP27. The secretariat reported that UNECE hosted a pre COP27 regional forum focused on climate financing, but with a drill down on CRMs; It led to development of a compendium of climate projects in 17 programme countries (e.g. Central Asia, the Caucasus, etc) that was issued and published at COP 27 and is available [online](#).
  - The secretariat reported that mobilising finance for CRMs will be key and that transparency and responsible production will be essential; Since much of the critical raw material supply is in the global south (e.g. South and Central America, Africa, Asia) there is an opportunity to help those countries get financing so that they can develop these CRMs responsibly while benefiting from them economically.
- *Capacity-Building / Network of Practitioners Europe*
  - Each country in Europe has been nominating a focal point for the network which enables more experienced experts that have been implementing UNFC to help less experienced colleagues in Europe, proving extremely valuable support that can be replicated elsewhere
- *Support for Ukraine*
  - The secretariat informed the Bureau that Ukraine was the first country to legislate the UNFC and that **UNECE** is offering support for Ukraine, including on helping them to map their CRMs and helping establish an Atlas and a resource management strategy
  - The secretariat shared that EBRD has entered into cooperation project with Ukraine to help them digitize their resource records (e.g. maps, etc) that are still in paper format but need to urgently be digitized before the information is lost forever. The **EGRM** is hopefully going to engage and involve UNFC as information is digitized and put into GIS format.
- *Support for African Union*
  - The secretariat noted the need to continue to offer support for the African Union on UNFC which was approved by the Heads of State earlier this year to be deployed Africa wide and all the 55 countries; Capacity building education and outreach is urgently needed.

#### 4. Build Resilient Energy Systems: ECE Platform

Mr Liguti noted that member States had requested during the CSE31 that the Committee design and deploy the ECE Platform on Resilient Energy Systems, helping member States build resilient energy systems while achieving 2030 Agenda and Paris Agreement goals. The Committee requested that the expert groups integrate resiliency considerations into their work planning and develop relevant resources for member States; This call for collaboration across expert groups as well is targeted support by each expert group area. He noted that this item would be discussed in greater detail under Agenda item 6.

#### Agenda Item 6. Discussion of the Platform on Resilient Energy Systems

Documentation: Post CSE31 Communications Paper for Policymakers DRAFT for CSE Bureau Review.docx

The secretariat gave background on the request to create the Platform, and shared the definition of resilient energy systems with proposed edits to inclusion of the concept of “ensuring agility from external shocks, such as war or climate change impacts,” based on the discussion at CSE31. The secretariat noted that, increasingly, adaptation is becoming an important aspect of resiliency, as highlighted at COP27, and that there is a need to start looking at adaptation in addition to mitigation.

The secretariat presented a schematic that organized the Committee work on the platform as categorized predominantly into four elements and also proposed *potential activities* that could be prioritized for 2023:

1. Sustainable resource management & access to critical raw materials
  - Develop an **international hydrogen taxonomy** and specifications under UNFC and UNRMS. (would involve: GEG, EGRM, GERE, CES) **\$/€**
  - Develop early warning system for critical and other resources with UNFC and UNRMS (EGRM, CES, GERE) **\$\$\$/€€€**
2. Low and zero-carbon technology interplay
  - Enhance the low- and zero-carbon technology interplay and strengthen the grid capacity in Central Asia to allow deep electrification of the energy system (CES, GEG, GERE, GEEE, CMMJT) **\$/€**
3. Scaling systemic efficiencies & digitalization of energy system networks
  - Develop support resources related to energy storage (GEEE, CES, GERE, GEG)
  - Cybersecurity in the energy sector (GEEE, GERE, CES, GEG, EGRM, CMMJT)
4. Just Transition, as a cross-cutting element
  - Enhance the low- and zero-carbon technology interplay and strengthen the grid capacity in Central Asia to allow deep electrification of the energy system (CES, GEG, GERE, GEEE, CMMJT) **\$/€**

**Note:** **\$/€** indicates that additional funding is needed and if it is a low-cost (**\$/€**) or higher cost (**\$\$\$/€€€**) activity

The Chair thanked the secretariat, opened up the discussion for Bureau feedback.

One bureau member noted that while deep electrification is very important, there still lots of energy consuming processes that cannot be as easily electrified. For example, it was

noted that 60% to 70% of industry is not electrified yet it could become net zero quicker if other forms of energy were on the table, such as hydrogen and so hydrogen should not be ruled out under the 2<sup>nd</sup> category, Low- and zero-carbon technology interplay. Another Bureau member seconded the notion that not all sectors can be easily electrified, flagging transportation (e.g. aviation, maritime, long haul, heavy duty, etc) and the chemical industry, and noted that every technology should be ready or given the opportunity to jump in and contribute to carbon neutral system. They also noted that they do not believe the current draft of the resiliency communications paper is fully technology neutral.

The secretariat clarified that the low- and zero-carbon technology interplay is not only about deep electrification but about assessing technology and policy options, including clean hydrogen and renewable energy, energy efficiency and electrification, to get us to net zero. They noted that UNECE is the only platform under the UN flag that allows really neutral, technology-agnostic dialogue and will continue to be true to that approach.

Another bureau member suggested the bureau consider calling it deep decarbonization instead of deep electrification. A bureau member suggested that the bureau could form a mini team of bureau members to work on issues that arise and need resolution, such as the wording of deep electrification vs deep decarbonization.

The secretariat invited Bureau members to share additional thoughts and other opinions by email after the call. **The secretariat will create a smaller group to develop a draft work plan for bureau review and inform representatives from the Member States on progress at an upcoming EXCOM meeting.** One bureau member noted that the chairs of the expert groups will need to consult with their respective bureaus so any update to EXCOM will need to be after the January EXCOM meeting.

## **Agenda Item 7. Operations Feedback and Discussion**

The secretariat asked the bureau to consider a number of questions so that the Committee could improve its effectiveness in the coming year, including: What lessons can we take from CSE-31 to improve the 32<sup>nd</sup> session (CSE32)? What can the Bureau/secretariat do to enhance the success of the Committee? Are there any ideas for the theme for CSE32? For example, the secretariat noted, perhaps it would be better to have fewer speakers per session so that there is more time for discussion in the future; or perhaps there are better ways to increase communication and outreach on our products and events, by using speakers, validators and the Bureau to promote them via social media or through other means.

The Chair thanked the secretariat for doing an excellent job for the last committee meeting in the preparation and in the running of it. He noted that it was a challenging committee meeting but that he was extremely happy about how it worked and acknowledged that we would like to make it even better. He suggested that there might be some cross cutting issues. Like resiliency in CSE31, where all the expert groups can feed in without necessitating six different sessions, one for each expert group.

Bureau members noted that there were several topic areas that could benefit from the collaboration of many of the expert groups (e.g. energy storage, decarbonizing heating and cooling efficiency) and enable the Committee to deliver not only the big picture really in resilience, but also the tiny little pieces that enable policymakers and end users to actually become resilient.

Because time was running short, the **secretariat promised to send the questions by email and solicit responses from the bureau members via email.**

The Chair thanked the chairs of the subsidiary bodies for their contributions and invited the Member States, as well, to communicate their perspective and their priorities to the secretariat as how they would like the Committee to continue working on the concept of energy resilience.

### **Agenda Item 8. EXCOM Chair report 30 November 2022**

Documentation: [Report By the Chair of the Committee on Sustainable Energy at the 125<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Executive Committee \(EXCOM\) of the Economic Commission for Europe on 30 November 2022](#)

The Chair informed the Bureau that he would be presenting a report on the CSE31 at the 30 November 2022 EXCOM meeting. He promised to report back at the next meeting and **asked the Secretariat to share with the Bureau the slide show prepared for the EXCOM presentation.**

### **Agenda Item 9. Recent and upcoming activities**

Mr Liguti reported that September, October, and November were very busy with intense activity from the groups of experts. He highlighted participation at COP 27 with three flagship events, the regional forum on climate financing and the EU raw materials week as very notable with respect to positioning our work and informing others about what the Committee does. He flagged several upcoming events and publications for December through March and promised that **the Secretariat will share the slides from the Bureau call and list of events for Bureau members' reference.**

Finally, he encouraged Bureau members to help the secretariat get the word out about Committee products and events via the *UNECE Sustainable Energy* LinkedIn account, twitter, Instagram, and/or other social media.

### **Agenda Item 10. AOB**

Mr Liguti announced that Ms Denise Mulholland would be leaving UNECE to return to the US. Environmental Protection Agency in early January 2023 and that Iva Brkic would assume the role of Secretary for the Committee. Mr Liguti and the Chair thanked Ms Mulholland for her work as Secretary and wished her luck in her new position. They congratulated Ms Brkic on her new role helping to ensure a successful CSE32 next September.

**The Secretariat noted that the next meeting of the Bureau would be in early 2023 and that they will send out a doodle poll for dates as it gets closer.**

## **V. SUMMARY OF FOLLOW UP ACTION ITEMS**

### **Secretariat:**

- Invite bureau members to a smaller group to develop the draft work plan for the Platform on Building Resilient Energy Systems to be shared with the bureau for review prior to the Chair informing representatives from the Member States on progress at an upcoming EXCOM meeting
- Send the questions by email to the bureau as to how the Committee can improve its effectiveness in the coming year by email
- Share with the Bureau the slide show prepared for the EXCOM presentation.
- Share the slides from the Bureau call and list of events for Bureau members' reference
- Send out a doodle poll for possible dates for next bureau call (early 2023) as it gets closer



**Bureau:**

- Volunteer to help develop the draft workplan for the Platform on Building Resilient Energy Systems
- (Chairs of Expert Groups) Consult with your expert groups on potential activities related to building resilient energy systems
- Provide feedback to the secretariat on the following questions related to improving Committee effectiveness in 2023:
  - What lessons can we take from CSE-31 to improve the 32nd session (CSE32)?
  - What can the Bureau/secretariat do to enhance the success of the Committee?
  - Do you have any ideas for the theme for CSE32?
- Respond to the doodle poll regarding your availability for next Bureau call (early 2023)