Economic and Social Council

Economic Commission for Europe

Inland Transport Committee

World Forum for Harmonization of Vehicle Regulations

187th session
Geneva, 21-24 June 2022
Item 2.3 of the provisional agenda
**Intelligent Transport Systems and coordination
of automated vehicles related activities**

Proposal for Recommendations on uniform provisions concerning cyber security and software updates

Submitted by the Working Party on Automated/Autonomous and Connected Vehicles[*]

The text reproduced below was adopted by the Working Party on Automated/Autonomous and Connected Vehicles (GRVA) at its twelfth session (see ECE/TRANS/WP.29/GRVA/12, para. 47). It is based on ECE/TRANS/WP.29/GRVA/2022/5. It is submitted to the World Forum for Harmonization of Vehicle Regulations (WP.29) for consideration at its June 2022 session.

---

[*] In accordance with the programme of work of the Inland Transport Committee for 2022 as outlined in proposed programme budget for 2022 (A/76/6 (part V sect. 20) para 20.76), the World Forum will develop, harmonize and update UN Regulations in order to enhance the performance of vehicles. The present document is submitted in conformity with that mandate.

Please recycle

I. Proposal for Recommendations for Automotive Cyber Security and Software Updates

A. Part I - Introduction

1.   Individuals and organizations involved in the design, manufacturing, or assembly of a motor vehicle have a role to play with respect to vehicle cybersecurity.

2.   This document is provided as guidance for Contracting Parties to the 1998 Agreement when formulating regulation or legislation on cyber security for automotive vehicles and/or regulation or legislation on software updates and the processes for updating a vehicle's software. The aim of the guidance is to enable a harmonized approach to the adoption of such regulation or legislation. As such, the technical requirements herein are aligned to the furthest extent possible with the requirements from UN Regulations Nos. 155 and 156 that pertain to the 1958 Agreement's Contracting Parties regarding cyber security and software updates, respectively. Parenthetical references have been added pointing to corresponding section(s) in the corresponding regulation.

The document lists technical requirements for the vehicle and technical requirements for management systems. The technical requirements for the management systems list requirements that are external to the vehicle but need to be in place to effectively manage the cyber security of a vehicle over its lifetime and to ensure software updates will be sufficiently appraised and protected before they are sent to a vehicle.

It is recommended that, as a minimum, the technical requirements relating to the vehicle are adopted *en masse* when formulating regulation or legislation. Where possible the requirements for the management system should also be adopted. Where it is not possible to adopt the management system requirements within regulation or legislation, it is suggested they are adopted as national guidance for manufacturers of automobiles to follow.

The document does not define acceptance criteria nor test criteria for these requirements.

The vehicle phases mentioned in this document are not defined herein and are left to regulation or legislation. Industry guidance on all vehicle phases can be found in international standards e.g. ISO/SAE 21434 and ISO 24089. However, it should be noted that the "post-production phase" encompasses all aspects after a vehicle has been produced, where the two most important aspects to be considered are end of life of a vehicle (also known as "decommissioning") and end of cybersecurity support of a vehicle. Due to the fact that the 1998 Agreement is intended to be applicable to diverse regulatory and enforcement systems, the Informal Working Group on cyber security and over the air updates has not defined a minimum length of time for vehicle cyber security support in this document.

This document provides a method by which information about the software and hardware configurations, particularly those relating to systems of a vehicle specified in regulation or legislation, can be managed and understood with respect to the vehicle's certification. Through the use of a dedicated identifier (e.g. R_xSWIN as defined in UN Regulation No. 156), representing the configuration of a given system's software and hardware, it can be understood when a software update affects the certification of that system as the dedicated identifier should change when this happens. For this method to work, a vehicle manufacturer needs to be able to provide information about the hardware and software represented by a given dedicated identifier. For a given vehicle it must be possible to determine what software is present on the vehicle in order to verify that the software conforms to that represented by the dedicated identifier.

B. Part II

1.   Management systems

1.1.   Management System for Cyber security

1.1.1.   The vehicle manufacturer shall have a system that manages cyber security throughout the following phases: *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.2.2.1.)*

(a)   Development phase;

(b)   Production phase; and

(c)   Post-production phase.

1.1.2.   The management system for cyber security shall include processes to: *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.2.2.2.)*

(a)   Manage cyber security at an organisational level;

(b)   Identify risks to vehicles, which shall include consideration of the threats in Annex 1, Part A, and other relevant threats;

(c)   Assess, categorise and treat identified risks;

(d)   Verify that risks identified are appropriately managed;

(e)   Test the cyber security of a vehicle;

(f)   Ensure that risk assessments are kept current;

(g)   Monitor for, detect and respond to cyber-attacks, cyber-threats and vulnerabilities on the vehicle;

(h)   Assess whether the cyber security measures implemented remain effective when new cyber threats or vulnerabilities are identified; and

(i)   Provide data to enable analysis of attempted or successful cyber-attacks.

1.1.3.   The management system for cyber security shall ensure that cyber threats and vulnerabilities that are identified as requiring a response from the manufacturer shall be mitigated within a reasonable timeframe. *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.2.2.3.).*

1.1.4.   The processes used in the management system for cyber security shall ensure that the monitoring specified in section 1.1.2. (g) is continual and includes: *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.2.2.4.).*

(a)   Vehicles in the field; and

(b)   The capability to analyse and detect cyber threats, vulnerabilities and cyber-attacks from vehicle data and vehicle logs. This capability shall respect the privacy rights of vehicle owners and drivers, particularly with respect to consent.

1.1.5.   The management system for cyber security shall manage cyber security related dependencies that may exist with contracted suppliers, service providers or manufacturer's sub-organizations *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.2.2.5.).*

1.2.   Management System for Software Updates

1.2.1.   The management system for software updates shall include processes to:

(a)   Document information relating to software updates *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.1.).*

(b)   Securely maintain the information documented in 1.2.1. part (a) *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.1.).*

(c)   Make the information documented in paragraph 1.2.1. part (a) available to appropriate authorities upon request *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.1.).*

(d)   Uniquely identify all initial and updated versions of software on systems of the vehicle specified in regulation or legislation including integrity validation data, and relevant hardware components *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.2.).*

(e) Access and update information regarding any dedicated identifiers used to represent information about software on a vehicle, before and after an update, which includes the ability to update information regarding the software versions and their integrity validation data of all software relevant to each dedicated identifier used *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.3.)*.

(f) Verify that, where dedicated identifiers are used to represent information about software on a vehicle, the version(s) of the software present on a relevant component of the vehicle are consistent with those defined by the relevant dedicated identifier *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.4.)*.

(g) Identify interdependencies of the updated system with other system(s) *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.5.)*.

(h) Identify target vehicles for a software update *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.6.)*.

(i) Confirm the compatibility of a software update with the target vehicle(s)'s configuration before the software update is issued, including an assessment of compatibility between the last known software/hardware configuration of the target vehicle(s) and the software update to be issued *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.7.)*.

(j) Determine whether a software update will affect any system that is subject to regulation or legislation, including whether the update will impact or alter any of the parameters used to define the systems the update affects, or whether it changes any parameters that are subject to regulation or legislation *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.8.)*.

(k) Determine whether a software update will add, alter or enable any function(s) that were not present, or enabled, when the vehicle was certified according to regulation or legislation, or whether an update will alter or disable any other parameters or functions that are subject to regulation or legislation, including consideration of whether:

(i) Regulated information (according to regulation or legislation) regarding the vehicle will need to be modified;

(ii) Results of previous tests conducted according to regulation or legislation will no longer cover the vehicle after modification;

(iii) Any modifications to functions on the vehicle will affect the vehicle's certification according to regulation or legislation *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.9.)*.

(l) Determine whether a software update will affect any other system required for the safe and continued operation of the vehicle, or if the update will add or alter functionality of the vehicle compared to when it was certified *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.10.)*.

(m) Enable the vehicle user to be informed about a software update *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.11.)*.

1.2.2. The vehicle manufacturer shall record and store the following information for each update: *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.2.)*.

(a) Documentation describing the processes used by the vehicle manufacturer for software updates and any relevant standards followed *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.2.1.)*.

(b) Documentation describing the configuration of any systems that are regulated by regulation or legislation, before and after an update. This shall include unique identification for the system's hardware and

software (including software versions) and any relevant vehicle or system parameters *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.2.2.)*.

(c)   If dedicated identifiers are used to represent information about software of Electronic Control Systems contributing to systems or functions on a vehicle that are specified in regulation or legislation, an auditable register describing information about all the software relevant to each dedicated identifier before and after an update. This shall include information of the software versions and their integrity validation data for all relevant software *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.2.3.)*.

(d)   Documentation listing target vehicles for the update and confirmation of the compatibility of the last known configuration of those vehicles with the update *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.2.4.)*.

(e)   Documentation for all software updates describing: *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.2.5.)*

(i)   The purpose of the update;

(ii)   What systems or functions of the vehicle the update may affect;

(iii)   Which (if any) of the systems or functions listed in part b) are required by regulation or legislation (if any);

(iv)   If applicable, whether the software update affects the fulfilment of the requirements of any relevant regulation or legislation identified in part 3);

(v)   Whether the software update affects any parameter specified in regulation or legislation for a vehicle or vehicle system;

(vi)   If applicable, whether an approval for the update was requested from the relevant national authority;

(vii)   How the software update may be executed and under what conditions;

(viii)   Confirmation that the software update will be conducted safely and securely;

(ix)   Confirmation that the software update has undergone and successfully passed verification and validation procedures.

1.2.3.   The information specified in 1.2.2.3. and 1.2.2.4. shall be available from the vehicle manufacturer to relevant national authorities *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.1.12.)*.

1.2.4.   With regards to security for software updates, the vehicle manufacturer shall implement and maintain processes to: *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.3.)*

(a)   Ensure software updates are protected to reasonably prevent manipulation before the update process is initiated *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.3.1.)*;

(b)   Ensure software update processes used are protected to reasonably prevent their compromise, including the development of the software update delivery system and *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.3.2.)*;

(c)   Verify and validate software functionality and code for the software used in the vehicle are appropriate *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.3.3.)*.

1.2.5.   For vehicles that support over the air updates, the vehicle manufacturer shall implement and maintain processes to: *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.4.)*

(a)   Assess over the air updates to ensure they will not impact safety, if conducted during driving and *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.4.1.);*

(b)   Ensure over the air updates that require a specific skilled or complex action (for example recalibration of a sensor post-programming in order to complete an update process) can only proceed when a person skilled to do that action is present or is in control of the process *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.1.4.2.).*

2.   Vehicle requirements

2.1.   Requirements for Cyber Security

2.1.1. The manufacturer shall identify the critical elements of the vehicle and perform an exhaustive risk assessment for the vehicle and shall treat/manage the identified risks appropriately *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.3.).*

2.1.1.1.   The risk assessment shall consider the individual elements of the vehicle and their interactions.

2.1.1.2.   The risk assessment shall consider interactions with external systems.

2.1.1.3.   While assessing the risks, the vehicle manufacturer shall consider the risks related to all the threats referred to in Annex 1, part A, as well as any other relevant risk.

2.1.1.4.   The risk assessment shall consider all supplier-related risks *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.2.).*

2.1.2. The manufacturer shall protect the vehicle against risks identified in the risk assessment *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.4.).*

2.1.2.1.   Relevant and proportionate mitigations shall be implemented to protect the vehicle.

2.1.2.2.   The mitigations implemented shall include all mitigations referred to in Annex 1, Part B and C which are relevant for the risks identified. However, if a mitigation referred to in Annex 1, Part B or C, is not relevant or not sufficient for the risk identified, the vehicle manufacturer shall ensure that another appropriate mitigation is implemented.

2.1.2.3.   The vehicle manufacturer shall perform appropriate and sufficient testing to verify the effectiveness of the security measures implemented. *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.6.)*

2.1.3. The vehicle manufacturer shall put in place appropriate and proportionate measures to secure dedicated environments on the vehicle (if provided) for the storage and execution of aftermarket software, services, applications or data *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.5.).*

2.1.4. The vehicle manufacturer shall implement measures for the vehicle to: *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.7.)*

(a)   Detect and prevent cyber-attacks against the vehicle;

(b)   Support the monitoring capability of the vehicle manufacturer with regards to detecting threats, vulnerabilities and cyber-attacks relevant to the vehicle;

(c)   Provide data forensic capability to enable analysis of attempted or successful cyber-attacks.

2.1.5. Cryptographic modules shall be in line with consensus standards. If the cryptographic modules used are not in line with consensus standards, then the vehicle manufacturer shall justify their use *(UN Regulation No. 155, paragraph 7.3.8.).*

2.2.   Requirements for Software Updates

2.2.1.   The authenticity and integrity of software updates shall be protected to reasonably prevent their compromise and reasonably prevent invalid updates. *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.2.1.1.)*

2.2.2.   If dedicated identifiers are used to represent information about software of Electronic Control Systems contributing to systems or functions on a vehicle that are specified in regulation or legislation, each dedicated identifier shall be uniquely identifiable. When relevant software is modified by the vehicle manufacturer, the dedicated identifier shall be updated if it affects the certification of the vehicle or its systems *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.2.1.2.1.)*

2.2.3.   The versions of the software on Electronic Control Systems contributing to systems or functions on a vehicle that are specified in regulation or legislation, or dedicated identifiers used to represent information about that software, shall be easily readable in a standardized way via the use of an electronic communication interface on the vehicle *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.2.1.2.2.).*

2.2.4.   Information regarding the configuration of the software on a vehicle shall be protected against unauthorized modification *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.2.1.2.3.).*

2.2.5.   Additional Requirements for Over-the-Air (OTA) Updates *(UN Regulation No. 156, paragraph 7.2.2.)*

2.2.5.1.   The vehicle shall restore systems to their previous version in case of a failed or interrupted update or that the vehicle shall be placed into a safe state after a failed or interrupted update.

2.2.5.2.   Software updates shall only be executed when the vehicle has enough power to complete the update process (including that needed for a possible recovery to the previous version or for the vehicle to be placed into a safe state).

2.2.5.3.   When the execution of an update may affect the safety of the vehicle, the vehicle shall be in a state where it can be executed safely.

2.2.5.4.   The vehicle user shall be able to be informed about an update before the update is executed. The information made available shall contain:

(a)   The purpose of the update. This could include the criticality of the update and if the update is for recall, safety and/or security purposes;

(b)   Any changes implemented by the update on vehicle functions;

(c)   The expected time to complete execution of the update;

(d)   Any vehicle functionalities which may not be available during the execution of the update;

(e)   Any instructions that may help the vehicle user safely execute the update.

In case of groups of updates with a similar content one information may cover a group.

2.2.5.5.   In the situation where the execution of an update while driving may not be safe, the vehicle shall either:

(a)   Be incapable of being driven during the execution of the update; or,

(b)   Be in a state ensuring that the driver is not able to use any functionality of the vehicle that would affect the safety of the vehicle or the successful execution of the update.

2.2.5.6.   After the execution of an update:

(a)   The vehicle user shall be able to be informed of the success (or failure) of the update;

(b) The vehicle user shall be able to be informed about the changes implemented and any related updates to the user manual (if applicable).

3. Definitions

3.1. "*Cyber security*" means the condition in which road vehicles and their functions are protected from cyber threats to electrical or electronic components.

3.2. "*Execution*", in the context of software updates, means the process of installing and activating an update that has been downloaded.

3.3. "*Configuration information*" is data that provides an understanding of the software versions present on the vehicle. Such data may be detailed or provided by a dedicated identifier for a set configuration (i.e., R_XSWIN).

3.4. "*Integrity Validation Data*" means a representation of digital data, against which comparisons can be made to detect errors or changes in the data. This may include checksums and hash values.

3.5. "*Mitigation*" means a measure that is reducing risk.

3.6. "*Over-the-Air (OTA)*" means any method of making data transfers wirelessly instead of using a cable or other local connection.

3.7. "*Risk*" means the potential that a given threat will exploit vulnerabilities of a vehicle and thereby cause harm to the organization or to an individual.

3.8. "*Risk Assessment*" means the overall process of finding, recognizing and describing risks (risk identification), to comprehend the nature of risk and to determine the level of risk (risk analysis), and of comparing the results of risk analysis with risk criteria to determine whether the risk and/or its magnitude is acceptable or tolerable (risk evaluation).

3.9. "*Safe state*" means an operating mode in case of a failure of an item without an unreasonable level of risk.

3.10. "*Software*" means the part of an Electronic Control System that consists of digital data and instruction.

3.11. "*Software update*" means a package used to upgrade software to a new version including a change of the configuration parameters.

3.12. "*System*" means a set of components and/or sub-systems that implement a function of functions.

3.13. "*Threat*" means a potential cause of an unwanted incident, which may result in harm to a system, organization or individual.

3.14. "*Vehicle user*" means a person operating or driving the vehicle, a vehicle owner, an authorised representative or employee of a fleet manager, an authorised representative or employee of the vehicle manufacturer, or an authorized technician.

3.15. "*Vulnerability*" means a weakness of an asset or mitigation that can be exploited by one or more threats.

Annex 1

List of threats and corresponding mitigations

1.   This annex consists of three parts. Part A of this annex describes the baseline for threats, vulnerabilities and attack methods. Part B of this annex describes mitigations to the threats which are intended for vehicle types. Part C describes mitigations to the threats which are intended for areas outside of vehicles, e.g. on IT backends.

2.   Part A, Part B, and Part C shall be considered for risk assessment and mitigations to be implemented by vehicle manufacturers.

3.   The high-level vulnerability and its corresponding examples have been indexed in Part A. The same indexing has been referenced in the tables in Parts B and C to link each of the attack/vulnerability with a list of corresponding mitigation measures.

4.   The threat analysis shall also consider possible attack impacts. These may help ascertain the severity of a risk and identify additional risks. Possible attack impacts may include:

>   (a)   Safe operation of vehicle affected;
>
>   (b)   Vehicle functions stop working;
>
>   (c)   Software modified, performance altered;
>
>   (d)   Software altered but no operational effects;
>
>   (e)   Data integrity breach;
>
>   (f)   Data confidentiality breach;
>
>   (g)   Loss of data availability;
>
>   (h)   Other, including criminality.

Part A. Vulnerability or attack method related to the threats

1.   High level descriptions of threats and relating vulnerability or attack method are listed in Table A1.

Table A1
List of vulnerability or attack method related to the threats

High level and sub-level descriptions of vulnerability/ threat			Example of vulnerability or attack method	
4.3.1 Threats regarding back-end servers related to vehicles in the field	1	Back-end servers used as a means to attack a vehicle or extract data	1.1	Abuse of privileges by staff (**insider attack**)
			1.2	**Unauthorized internet access** to the server (enabled for example by backdoors, unpatched system software vulnerabilities, SQL attacks or other means)
			1.3	**Unauthorized physical access** to the server (conducted by for example USB sticks or other media connecting to the server)
	2	Services from back-end server being disrupted, affecting the operation of a vehicle	2.1	**Attack on back-end server stops it functioning**, for example it prevents it from interacting with vehicles and providing services they rely on
	3	Vehicle related data held on back-end servers being lost or compromised ("data breach")	3.1	Abuse of privileges by staff (**insider attack**)
			3.2	**Loss of information in the cloud**. Sensitive data may be lost due to attacks or accidents when data is stored by third-party cloud service providers
			3.3	**Unauthorized internet access to the server** (enabled for example by backdoors, unpatched system software vulnerabilities, SQL attacks or other means)
			3.4	**Unauthorized physical access to the server** (conducted for example by USB sticks or other media connecting to the server)
			3.5	**Information breach** by unintended sharing of data (e.g. admin errors)
4.3.2 Threats to vehicles regarding their communication channels	4	Spoofing of messages or data received by the vehicle	4.1	**Spoofing of messages** by impersonation (e.g. 802.11p V2X during platooning, GNSS messages, etc.)
			4.2	**Sybil attack** (in order to spoof other vehicles as if there are many vehicles on the road)
	5	Communication channels used to conduct unauthorized manipulation, deletion or other amendments to vehicle held code/data	5.1	Communications channels permit **code injection**, for example tampered software binary might be injected into the communication stream
			5.2	Communications channels permit **manipulate** of vehicle held data/code
			5.3	Communications channels permit **overwrite** of vehicle held data/code
			5.4	Communications channels permit **erasure** of vehicle held data/code
			5.5	Communications channels permit introduction of data/code to the vehicle (write data code)

High level and sub-level descriptions of vulnerability/ threat			*Example of vulnerability or attack method*	
	6	Communication channels permit untrusted/unreliable messages to be accepted or are vulnerable to session hijacking/replay attacks	6.1	Accepting information from an **unreliable or untrusted source**
			6.2	**Man in the middle** attack/ session hijacking
			6.3	**Replay attack**, for example an attack against a communication gateway allows the attacker to downgrade software of an ECU or firmware of the gateway
	7	Information can be readily disclosed. For example, through eavesdropping on communications or through allowing unauthorized access to sensitive files or folders	7.1	**Interception of information** / interfering radiations / monitoring communications
			7.2	Gaining **unauthorized access** to files or data
	8	Denial of service attacks via communication channels to disrupt vehicle functions	8.1	**Sending** a large number of garbage **data** to vehicle information system, **so that it is unable to provide services** in the normal manner
			8.2	**Black hole attack**, in order to disrupt communication between vehicles the attacker is able to block messages between the vehicles
	9	An unprivileged user is able to gain privileged access to vehicle systems	9.1	An unprivileged user is able to **gain privileged access**, for example root access
	10	Viruses embedded in communication media are able to infect vehicle systems	10.1	**Virus** embedded in communication media infects vehicle systems
	11	Messages received by the vehicle (for example X2V or diagnostic messages), or transmitted within it, contain malicious content	11.1	Malicious **internal** (e.g. CAN) **messages**
			11.2	Malicious **V2X messages,** e.g. infrastructure to vehicle or vehicle-vehicle messages (e.g. CAM, DENM)
			11.3	Malicious diagnostic messages
			11.4	Malicious **proprietary messages** (e.g. those normally sent from OEM or component/system/function supplier)
4.3.3 Threats to vehicles regarding their update procedures	12	Misuse or compromise of update procedures	12.1	Compromise of **over the air software update procedures**. This includes fabricating the system update program or firmware
			12.2	Compromise of **local/physical software update procedures**. This includes fabricating the system update program or firmware
			12.3	The **software** is **manipulated before the update process** (and is therefore corrupted), although the update process is intact
			12.4	**Compromise** of cryptographic keys of the software provider **to allow invalid update**
	13	It is possible to deny legitimate updates	13.1	Denial of Service attack against update server or network to **prevent rollout of critical software updates** and/or unlock of customer specific features

High level and sub-level descriptions of vulnerability/ threat			*Example of vulnerability or attack method*	
4.3.4 Threats to vehicles regarding unintended human actions facilitating a cyber attack	15	Legitimate actors are able to take actions that would unwittingly facilitate a cyber-attack	15.1	Innocent victim (e.g. owner, operator or maintenance engineer) being **tricked into taking an action** to unintentionally load malware or enable an attack
			15.2	**Defined security procedures** are not followed
4.3.5 Threats to vehicles regarding their external connectivity and connections	16	Manipulation of the connectivity of vehicle functions enables a cyber-attack, this can include telematics; systems that permit remote operations; and systems using short range wireless communications	16.1	Manipulation of **functions designed to remotely operate systems**, such as remote key, immobilizer, and charging pile
			16.2	**Manipulation of vehicle telematics** (e.g. manipulate temperature measurement of sensitive goods, remotely unlock cargo doors)
			16.3	Interference with **short range wireless systems** or sensors
	17	Hosted 3rd party software, e.g. entertainment applications, used as a means to attack vehicle systems	17.1	**Corrupted applications**, or those with poor software security, used as a method to attack vehicle systems
	18	Devices connected to external interfaces e.g. USB ports, OBD port, used as a means to attack vehicle systems	18.1	**External interfaces** such as USB or other ports used as a point of attack, for example through code injection
			18.2	Media infected with a **virus** connected to a vehicle system
			18.3	**Diagnostic access (e.g. dongles in OBD port)** used to facilitate an attack, e.g. manipulate vehicle parameters (directly or indirectly)
4.3.6 Threats to vehicle data/code	19	Extraction of vehicle data/code	19.1	Extraction of copyright or proprietary software from vehicle systems (product **piracy**)
			19.2	Unauthorized access to the **owner's privacy information** such as personal identity, payment account information, address book information, location information, vehicle's electronic ID, etc.
			19.3	Extraction of cryptographic keys
	20	Manipulation of vehicle data/code	20.1	Illegal/unauthorized changes to **vehicle's electronic ID**
			20.2	**Identity fraud.** For example, if a user wants to display another identity when communicating with toll systems, manufacturer backend
			20.3	Action to **circumvent monitoring systems** (e.g. hacking/ tampering/ blocking of messages such as ODR Tracker data, or number of runs)
			20.4	Data manipulation to **falsify vehicle's driving data** (e.g. mileage, driving speed, driving directions, etc.)
			20.5	Unauthorized changes to **system diagnostic data**
	21	Erasure of data/code	21.1	Unauthorized deletion/manipulation of **system event logs**

High level and sub-level descriptions of vulnerability/ threat			*Example of vulnerability or attack method*	
	22	Introduction of malware	22.2	Introduce **malicious software** or malicious software activity
	23	Introduction of new software or overwrite existing software	23.1	**Fabrication of software** of the vehicle control system or information system
	24	Disruption of systems or operations	24.1	**Denial of service**, for example this may be triggered on the internal network by flooding a CAN bus, or by provoking faults on an ECU via a high rate of messaging
	25	Manipulation of vehicle parameters	25.1	Unauthorized access of **falsify the configuration parameters** of vehicle's key functions, such as brake data, airbag deployed threshold, etc.
			25.2	Unauthorized access of **falsify the charging parameters**, such as charging voltage, charging power, battery temperature, etc.
4.3.7 Potential vulnerabilities that could be exploited if not sufficiently protected or hardened	26	Cryptographic technologies can be compromised or are insufficiently applied	26.1	Combination of short **encryption keys** and long period of validity enables attacker to break encryption
			26.2	Insufficient use of cryptographic algorithms to protect sensitive systems
			26.3	Using already or soon to be deprecated **cryptographic algorithms**
	27	Parts or supplies could be compromised to permit vehicles to be attacked	27.1	**Hardware or software, engineered to enable an attack** or fails to meet design criteria to stop an attack
	28	Software or hardware development permits vulnerabilities	28.1	**Software bugs**. The presence of software bugs can be a basis for potential exploitable vulnerabilities. This is particularly true if software has not been tested to verify that known bad code/bugs is not present and reduce the risk of unknown bad code/bugs being present
			28.2	**Using remainders** from development (e.g. debug ports, JTAG ports, microprocessors, development certificates, developer passwords, …) can permit access to ECUs or permit attackers to gain higher privileges
	29	Network design introduces vulnerabilities	29.1	**Superfluous internet ports left open**, providing access to network systems
			29.2	Circumvent **network separation** to gain control. Specific example is the use of unprotected gateways, or access points (such as truck-trailer gateways), to circumvent protections and gain access to other network segments to perform malicious acts, such as sending arbitrary CAN bus messages
	31	Unintended transfer of data can occur	31.1	Information breach. Personal data may be leaked when the **car changes user** (e.g. is sold or is used as hire vehicle with new hirers)

High level and sub-level descriptions of vulnerability/ threat			*Example of vulnerability or attack method*	
	32	Physical manipulation of systems can enable an attack	32.1	**Manipulation of electronic hardware**, e.g. unauthorized electronic hardware added to a vehicle to enable "man-in-the-middle" attack
				Replacement of authorized electronic hardware (e.g., sensors) with unauthorized electronic hardware
				Manipulation of the information collected by a sensor (for example, using a magnet to tamper with the Hall effect sensor connected to the gearbox)

Part B. Mitigations to the threats intended for vehicles

1. Mitigations for "Vehicle communication channels"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Vehicle communication channels" are listed in Table B1.

Table B1
Mitigation to the threats which are related to "Vehicle communication channels"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Vehicle communication channels"	Ref	Mitigation
4.1	Spoofing of messages (e.g. 802.11p V2X during platooning, GNSS messages, etc.) by impersonation	M10	The vehicle shall verify the authenticity and integrity of messages it receives
4.2	Sybil attack (in order to spoof other vehicles as if there are many vehicles on the road)	M11	Security controls shall be implemented for storing cryptographic keys (e.g., use of Hardware Security Modules)
5.1	Communication channels permit code injection into vehicle held data/code, for example tampered software binary might be injected into the communication stream	M10 M6	The vehicle shall verify the authenticity and integrity of messages it receives Systems shall implement security by design to minimize risks
5.2	Communication channels permit manipulation of vehicle held data/code	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code
5.3	Communication channels permit overwrite of vehicle held data/code		
5.4 21.1	Communication channels permit erasure of vehicle held data/code		
5.5	Communication channels permit introduction of data/code to vehicle systems (write data code)		
6.1	Accepting information from an unreliable or untrusted source	M10	The vehicle shall verify the authenticity and integrity of messages it receives
6.2	Man in the middle attack / session hijacking	M10	The vehicle shall verify the authenticity and integrity of messages it receives
6.3	Replay attack, for example an attack against a communication gateway allows the attacker to downgrade software of an ECU or firmware of the gateway		
7.1	Interception of information / interfering radiations / monitoring communications	M12	Confidential data transmitted to or from the vehicle shall be protected
7.2	Gaining unauthorized access to files or data	M8	Through system design and access control it should not be possible for unauthorized personnel to access personal or system critical data. Example of Security Controls can be found in OWASP
8.1	Sending a large number of garbage data to vehicle information system, so that it is unable to provide services in the normal manner	M13	Measures to detect and recover from a denial of service attack shall be employed

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Vehicle communication channels"	Ref	Mitigation
8.2	Black hole attack, disruption of communication between vehicles by blocking the transfer of messages to other vehicles	M13	Measures to detect and recover from a denial of service attack shall be employed
9.1	An unprivileged user is able to gain privileged access, for example root access	M9	Measures to prevent and detect unauthorized access shall be employed
10.1	Virus embedded in communication media infects vehicle systems	M14	Measures to protect systems against embedded viruses/malware should be considered
11.1	Malicious internal (e.g. CAN) messages	M15	Measures to detect malicious internal messages or activity should be considered
11.2	Malicious V2X messages, e.g. infrastructure to vehicle or vehicle-vehicle messages (e.g. CAM, DENM)	M10	The vehicle shall verify the authenticity and integrity of messages it receives
11.3	Malicious diagnostic messages		
11.4	Malicious proprietary messages (e.g. those normally sent from OEM or component/system/function supplier)		

2. Mitigations for "Update process"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Update process" are listed in Table B2.

Table B2
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Update process"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Update process"	Ref	Mitigation
12.1	Compromise of over the air software update procedures. This includes fabricating the system update program or firmware	M16	Secure software update procedures shall be employed
12.2	Compromise of local/physical software update procedures. This includes fabricating the system update program or firmware		
12.3	The software is manipulated before the update process (and is therefore corrupted), although the update process is intact		
12.4	Compromise of cryptographic keys of the software provider to allow invalid update	M11	Security controls shall be implemented for storing cryptographic keys
13.1	Denial of Service attack against update server or network to prevent rollout of critical software updates and/or unlock of customer specific features	M3	Security Controls shall be applied to back-end systems. Where back-end servers are critical to the provision of services there are recovery measures in case of system outage. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP

3. Mitigations for "Unintended human actions facilitating a cyber attack"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Unintended human actions facilitating a cyber attack" are listed in Table B3.

Table B3
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Unintended human actions facilitating a cyber attack"

Table A1 reference	Threats relating to "Unintended human actions"	Ref	Mitigation
15.1	Innocent victim (e.g. owner, operator or maintenance engineer) is tricked into taking an action to unintentionally load malware or enable an attack	M18	Measures shall be implemented for defining and controlling user roles and access privileges, based on the principle of least access privilege
15.2	Defined security procedures are not followed	M19	Organizations shall ensure security procedures are defined and followed including logging of actions and access related to the management of the security functions

4. Mitigations for "External connectivity and connections"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "external connectivity and connections" are listed in Table B4.

Table B4
Mitigation to the threats which are related to "external connectivity and connections"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "External connectivity and connections"	Ref	Mitigation
16.1	Manipulation of functions designed to remotely operate vehicle systems, such as remote key, immobiliser, and charging pile	M20	Security controls shall be applied to systems that have remote access
16.2	Manipulation of vehicle telematics (e.g. manipulate temperature measurement of sensitive goods, remotely unlock cargo doors)		
16.3	Interference with short range wireless systems or sensors		
17.1	Corrupted applications, or those with poor software security, used as a method to attack vehicle systems	M21	Software shall be security assessed, authenticated and integrity protected. Security controls shall be applied to minimise the risk from third party software that is intended or foreseeable to be hosted on the vehicle
18.1	External interfaces such as USB or other ports used as a point of attack, for example through code injection	M22	Security controls shall be applied to external interfaces
18.2	Media infected with viruses connected to the vehicle		
18.3	Diagnostic access (e.g. dongles in OBD port) used to facilitate an attack, e.g. manipulate vehicle parameters (directly or indirectly)	M22	Security controls shall be applied to external interfaces

5.	Mitigations for "Potential targets of, or motivations for, an attack"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Potential targets of, or motivations for, an attack" are listed in Table B5.

Table B5
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Potential targets of, or motivations for, an attack"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Potential targets of, or motivations for, an attack"	Ref	Mitigation
19.1	Extraction of copyright or proprietary software from vehicle systems (product piracy / stolen software)	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP
19.2	Unauthorized access to the owner's privacy information such as personal identity, payment account information, address book information, location information, vehicle's electronic ID, etc.	M8	Through system design and access control it should not be possible for unauthorized personnel to access personal or system critical data. Examples of Security Controls can be found in OWASP
19.3	Extraction of cryptographic keys	M11	Security controls shall be implemented for storing cryptographic keys e.g. Security Modules
20.1	Illegal/unauthorised changes to vehicle's electronic ID	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP
20.2	Identity fraud. For example, if a user wants to display another identity when communicating with toll systems, manufacturer backend		
20.3	Action to circumvent monitoring systems (e.g. hacking/ tampering/ blocking of messages such as ODR Tracker data, or number of runs)	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP. Data manipulation attacks on sensors or transmitted data could be mitigated by correlating the data from different sources of information
20.4	Data manipulation to falsify vehicle's driving data (e.g. mileage, driving speed, driving directions, etc.)		
20.5	Unauthorised changes to system diagnostic data		
21.1	Unauthorized deletion/manipulation of system event logs	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP.
22.2	Introduce malicious software or malicious software activity	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP.
23.1	Fabrication of software of the vehicle control system or information system		
24.1	Denial of service, for example this may be triggered on the internal network by flooding a CAN bus, or by provoking faults on an ECU via a high rate of messaging	M13	Measures to detect and recover from a denial of service attack shall be employed
25.1	Unauthorized access to falsify configuration parameters of vehicle's key functions, such as brake data, airbag deployed threshold, etc.	M7	Access control techniques and designs shall be applied to protect system data/code. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Potential targets of, or motivations for, an attack"	Ref	Mitigation
25.2	Unauthorized access to falsify charging parameters, such as charging voltage, charging power, battery temperature, etc.		

6. Mitigations for "Potential vulnerabilities that could be exploited if not sufficiently protected or hardened"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Potential vulnerabilities that could be exploited if not sufficiently protected or hardened" are listed in Table B6.

Table B6
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Potential vulnerabilities that could be exploited if not sufficiently protected or hardened"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Potential vulnerabilities that could be exploited if not sufficiently protected or hardened"	Ref	Mitigation
26.1	Combination of short encryption keys and long period of validity enables attacker to break encryption	M23	Cybersecurity best practices for software and hardware development shall be followed
26.2	Insufficient use of cryptographic algorithms to protect sensitive systems		
26.3	Using deprecated cryptographic algorithms		
27.1	Hardware or software, engineered to enable an attack or fail to meet design criteria to stop an attack	M23	Cybersecurity best practices for software and hardware development shall be followed
28.1	The presence of software bugs can be a basis for potential exploitable vulnerabilities. This is particularly true if software has not been tested to verify that known bad code/bugs is not present and reduce the risk of unknown bad code/bugs being present	M23	Cybersecurity best practices for software and hardware development shall be followed. Cybersecurity testing with adequate coverage
28.2	Using remainders from development (e.g. debug ports, JTAG ports, microprocessors, development certificates, developer passwords, …) can permit an attacker to access ECUs or gain higher privileges		
29.1	Superfluous internet ports left open, providing access to network systems		
29.2	Circumvent network separation to gain control. Specific example is the use of unprotected gateways, or access points (such as truck-trailer gateways), to circumvent protections and gain access to other network segments to perform malicious acts, such as sending arbitrary CAN bus messages	M23	Cybersecurity best practices for software and hardware development shall be followed. Cybersecurity best practices for system design and system integration shall be followed

7.   Mitigations for "Data loss / data breach from vehicle"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Data loss / data breach from vehicle" are listed in Table B7.

Table B7
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Data loss / data breach from vehicle"

Table A1 reference	Threats of "Data loss / data breach from vehicle"	Ref	Mitigation
31.1	Information breach. Personal data may be breached when the car changes user (e.g. is sold or is used as hire vehicle with new hirers)	M24	Best practices for the protection of data integrity and confidentiality shall be followed for storing personal data.

8.   Mitigations for "Physical manipulation of systems to enable an attack"

Mitigation to the threats which are related to "Physical manipulation of systems to enable an attack" are listed in Table B8.

Table B8
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Physical manipulation of systems to enable an attack"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Physical manipulation of systems to enable an attack"	Ref	Mitigation
32.1	Manipulation of OEM hardware, e.g. unauthorised hardware added to a vehicle to enable "man-in-the-middle" attack	M9	Measures to prevent and detect unauthorized access shall be employed

Part C. Mitigations to the threats outside of vehicles

1.   Mitigations for "Back-end servers"

Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Back-end servers" are listed in Table C1.

Table C1
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Back-end servers"

Table A1 reference	Threats to "Back-end servers"	Ref	Mitigation
1.1 & 3.1	Abuse of privileges by staff (insider attack)	M1	Security Controls are applied to back-end systems to minimise the risk of insider attack
1.2 & 3.3	Unauthorised internet access to the server (enabled for example by backdoors, unpatched system software vulnerabilities, SQL attacks or other means)	M2	Security Controls are applied to back-end systems to minimise unauthorised access. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP
1.3 & 3.4	Unauthorised physical access to the server (conducted by for example USB sticks or other media connecting to the server)	M8	Through system design and access control it should not be possible for unauthorised personnel to access personal or system critical data
2.1	Attack on back-end server stops it functioning, for example it prevents it from interacting with vehicles and providing services they rely on	M3	Security Controls are applied to back-end systems. Where back-end servers are critical to the provision of services there are recovery measures in case of system outage. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP
3.2	Loss of information in the cloud. Sensitive data may be lost due to attacks or accidents when data is stored by third-party cloud service providers	M4	Security Controls are applied to minimise risks associated with cloud computing. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP and NCSC cloud computing guidance
3.5	Information breach by unintended sharing of data (e.g. admin errors, storing data in servers in garages)	M5	Security Controls are applied to back-end systems to prevent data breaches. Example Security Controls can be found in OWASP

2.   Mitigations for "Unintended human actions"
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Unintended human actions" are listed in Table C2.

Table C2
Mitigations to the threats which are related to "Unintended human actions"

Table A1 reference	Threats relating to "Unintended human actions"	Ref	Mitigation
15.1	Innocent victim (e.g. owner, operator or maintenance engineer) is tricked into taking an action to unintentionally load malware or enable an attack	M18	Measures shall be implemented for defining and controlling user roles and access privileges, based on the principle of least access privilege
15.2	Defined security procedures are not followed	M19	Organizations shall ensure security procedures are defined and followed including logging of actions and access related to the management of the security functions