Qualification for welding – Interpretation of EN 14025

Transmitted by the International Union of Wagon Keepers (UIP) *, **, ***

1. This document on the qualification for welding is submitted by UIP on behalf of the European Committee for Standardization (CEN), in particular its technical committee TC 296 WG 3. During the revision of standard EN 14025 “Design and Construction of Tanks”, which is referenced in RID/ADR, it was explained that:

When EN ISO 15614 dealing with “Qualification for Welding” was developed as an ISO standard, two levels were created. The introduction to this standard says that:

Level 1 is based on ASME and
Level 2 is based on earlier European standards.

2. It should be noted that within Europe, there is no harmonized approach:

Some countries and their authorities are of the opinion that EN 14025 is based on European Standard EN 13445 – the European Pressure Vessel Code, and this means that manufacturers of tanks need to be certified according to level 2.

An additional argument put forward by these countries is the specific requirement for this standard in annex ZA of the European Pressure Equipment Directive (PED).

Other countries are of the opinion that RID/ADR is not based specifically on European standards. In addition, the calculation based on test pressure is taken from ASME, so level 1 should be sufficient for certification of the manufacturer.

3. As the requirements to comply with level 2 are more stringent (more tests are required as the scope of the tests is more restrictive), TC 296 WG 3’s specific question is:

---

* A/76/6 (Sect.20), para. 20.76.
** Circulated by the Intergovernmental Organisation for International Carriage by Rail (OTIF) under the symbol OTIF/RID/RC/2022/10.
*** This document was scheduled for publication after the standard publication date owing to circumstances beyond the submitter's control.
Is a tank manufacturer free to choose which level he selects and is he allowed to supply RID/ADR tanks according to EN 14025 with a welding certificate of level 1 or 2 based on his decision?

or

Is it a requirement of RID/ADR to meet level 2 and should this then be stated in EN 14025 so that there is a harmonised approach to this issue?

4. As neither TC 296 WG 3 nor the Joint Meeting’s working group on standards were in the position to reach a consensus, UIP asked the Joint Meeting for its view in September 2021 (informal document INF.11), but due to the lack of time, the discussion was postponed. Meanwhile, the December 2021 meeting of the so-called “London Working Group” dealing with the harmonisation of approval and inspection of tanks discussed the issue but did not come to a consensus.

5. Even more questions on existing approvals were discussed at that informal session. France declared that “old welding approvals on the basis of ASME” were still valid and if the requirements of EN 12972 were added to level 1, it would be on the same level as level 2. However, Germany and the United Kingdom pointed out that the historic requirement had always been based on European standards and never on ASME.

6. The shared view was that: repairs and new builds can continue in accordance with the existing, older ASME approvals.

7. The basic question was kept open, and it was agreed to put it to the Joint Meeting in an official document to obtain a decision on the questions set out in paragraph 3 above.