**Economic Commission for Europe**

Meeting of the Parties to the Convention on   
Access to Information, Public Participation   
in Decision-making and Access to Justice   
in Environmental Matters

**Twenty-fifth meeting**

Geneva, 3 May and 7 and 8 June 2021

Item 9 (h) of the provisional agenda

**Preparations for the seventh session of the Meeting of the Parties:   
strategic plan for 2022-2030**

Draft decision VII/... on the Strategic Plan  
for 2022–2030[[1]](#footnote-2)\*

approved, as amended at the meeting

|  |
| --- |
| *Summary* |
| The present document was prepared pursuant to decision VI/5 on the work programme for 2018–2021 (ECE/MP.PP/2017/2/Add.1), adopted by the Meeting of the Parties to the Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (Aarhus Convention) at its sixth session (Budva, Montenegro, 11–14 September 2017), through which the Meeting of the Parties requested the Bureau, with the assistance of the secretariat, to develop a Strategic Plan for 2022–2030.  The document is based on the current Strategic Plan for 2015–2020 (ECE/MP.PP/2014/2/Add.1). The approach to the drafting of the new Strategic Plan and an indicative timeline for its preparation are outlined in the proposal on the future Strategic Plan for 2022–2030 (ECE/MP.PP/WG.1/2019/7) that was agreed by the Working Group at its twenty-third meeting (Geneva, 26–28 June 2019). An overview of the implementation of the international dimension of the Strategic Plan for 2015–2020 is provided in document AC/WGP-23/Inf.1a and a self-assessment of Parties regarding its implementation is provided in document AC/WGP-24/Inf.8b.  The first draft of the present document was considered by the Working Group at its twenty-third meeting. The Working Group took note of the comments provided by delegations and requested the Bureau, with the support of the secretariat, to proceed with the preparation of the Strategic Plan in accordance with the proposal on the future Strategic Plan for 2022–2030 (ECE/MP.PP/WG.1/2019/7), taking into consideration the comments provided at and after the meeting. The Working Group further requested Parties and stakeholders to provide the secretariat with their comments in writing well in advance prior to their consideration and requested the secretariat to make comments available online (ECE/MP.PP/WG.1/2019/2, para. 99). The Bureau considered the comments received at and after the twenty-third meeting of the Working Group and prepared the revised draft.  There was again an opportunity for an open-ended consultation among national focal points and stakeholders prior to and after the twenty-fourth meeting of the Working Group (Geneva (online), 1–3 July and Geneva (hybrid), 28 and 29 October 2020). Statements delivered by Parties and stakeholders demonstrated general support for the document. The Working Group considered the draft at its twenty-fourth meeting and requested the Bureau to revise it in the light of the new comments received c. The Bureau revised the draft document in the light of the new comments received and submitted it to the Working Group at its twenty-fifth meeting for consideration, approval and subsequent submission to the Meeting of the Parties.  a Available at [www.unece.org/index.php?id=50755](http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=50755).  b Available at [www.unece.org/index.php?id=53323](http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=53323).  c Comments received are available at www.unece.org/index.php?id=52673. |
|  |

*The Meeting of the Parties,*

*Recalling* its decision VI/5[[2]](#footnote-3) on the work programme for 2018–2021, through which it requested the Bureau, with the assistance of the secretariat, to develop a strategic plan for the Convention for 2022–2030, based on the experiences and results of the implementation of the Strategic Plan 2015–2020, for consideration and adoption at the seventh Meeting of the Parties,

*Welcoming* the work undertaken by the Working Group of the Parties and the Bureau to develop a draft plan,

1. *Adopts* the Strategic Plan for 2022–2030 as set out in the annex to the present decision;

2. *Agrees* that the Strategic Plan will guide the implementation and further development of the Convention until 2030;

3. *Also agrees* that a midterm review of the Strategic Plan for 2022–2030 should be considered at the eighth session of the Meeting of the Parties, focusing in particular on the progress indicators, which could facilitate the preparation of a possible next strategic plan.

Annex

Strategic Plan for 2022–2030

Introduction

1. Environmental rights and democracy are essential elements of good governance and informed decision-making and a prerequisite for achieving the objective of sustainable development. Since the adoption of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development in 1992, and continuing through the 2002 World Summit on Sustainable Development, the 2012 United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development (Rio+20 Conference) and the 2015 United Nations Sustainable Development Summit, there has been a continued reinforcement of environmental democracy worldwide and progress in recognizing the economic benefits of sustainability, as well as the potential opportunities it presents for society as a whole. The Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (Aarhus Convention) strongly contributed to putting Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration into practice and has proved an effective tool for promoting effective governance, green economy and the Sustainable Development Goals.

2. Through their ratification of the Convention, 46[[3]](#footnote-4) countries from throughout Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia as well as the European Union have committed themselves to ensure that they have in place adequate laws and practices relating to access to information, public participation and access to justice in the environmental field. Furthermore, initiatives have been taken by Parties to promote the Convention and its principles globally and to encourage interested non-Parties to participate in its activities.

3. Nonetheless, significant problems remain. The national implementation reports, coupled with the experience gathered through the work of the Convention’s compliance mechanism and task forces, indicate that implementation of the access to justice provisions of the Convention appears to be the most difficult area for Parties. Although Parties report that they have elaborated legislation on most aspects relating to access to information and public participation, effective implementation of these provisions in practice has also proven challenging for some Parties.

4. The advancement and increased use of information and communication technologies bring both new opportunities and challenges regarding effective means to promote environmental democracy.

5. The Strategic Plan for 2022–2030 set out in the present document gives priority to securing effective implementation by Parties, while recognizing the need to promote the lessons learned and the experience of Parties in all countries that wish to accede to the Convention or to replicate its achievements. Furthermore, it acknowledges the necessity of addressing new thematic challenges within its scope. The Strategic Plan also recognizes the cornerstone role of civil society in protecting the environment and promoting sustainable development and the green economy. The document outlines the overall aspiration of Parties for2030, while priorities for specific periods will be defined in greater detail in the respective work programmes and will take into account the financial resources available.

I. Vision and mission

6. Worldwide, social, economic and environmental challenges are becoming increasingly complex and interrelated. This fact should not, however, discourage the public from involvement in decision-making and Governments must provide the necessary stimulus, tools, information and assistance to enable transparent decision-making processes in order to ensure informed, balanced and effective public participation. Making decisions and decision-making processes fully accountable to the public whom they should serve should become an essential, and not only procedural, matter. Furthermore, Governments should recognize that the Convention establishes the grounds for future developments and should endeavour to raise the accepted international standards in the future, based upon experience with higher standards on the domestic level.

7. The economic and social value of the environment and the environmental impacts of today’s actions should be fully reflected in all decisions at the policy, strategic and project levels, particularly in the light of the increasing pressures put on resources by rapid global economic and technological development and population growth. The social dimension of sustainable development is also closely linked to public participation in decision-making.

8. Our long-term mission is to minimize the depletion of environmental resources that should remain for future generations, promote inclusive societies, address climate change, support disaster risk reduction and ensure sustainable and environmentally sound development through strengthening participatory environmental democracy in the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (ECE) region and beyond.

9. We recognize that, owing to its cross-cutting nature, the Convention plays an important role in the achievement of virtually all the Sustainable Development Goals, in particular Goal 16, by empowering the public with the right to participate effectively in decision-making on a wide range of issues addressed by the Goals, such as: health protection (Goal 3); water and sanitation management (Goal 6); clean energy (Goal 7); green economy (Goals 8, 9 and 12); the reduction of inequalities (Goal 10); climate action (Goal 13); tourism (Goals 8, 12, 14 and 15); urban planning (Goals 11 and 13) and disaster risk reduction (Goals 9 and 11).[[4]](#footnote-5)

10. Our immediate mission is:

(a) As a first priority, to work towards full implementation of the Convention by each Party where this has not already been achieved and to encourage and support its use by the public;

(b) To reaffirm the commitment to: (i) ensuring due protection of environmental defenders; (ii) having in place appropriate legislative and policy frameworks so that such defenders can exercise their rights in accordance with the Convention; and (iii) preventing the erosion of civic space;

(c) To strengthen promotion of the Convention in decision-making in different sectors that affect the environment;

(d) To increase the impact of the Convention by increasing the number of Parties within the ECE region and by encouraging States outside the region to accede to the Convention, replicate it or implement its principles, and by promoting Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development;

(e) To keep the provisions and principles of the Convention under constant review and consider forward-looking interpretations of the Convention and its further development so as to ensure that it continues responding to modern challenges and provides an adequate instrument to achieve its objectives.

11. This vision and mission are part of our broader aspiration to achieve a more equitable world and a better quality of life for all.

II. Roles and responsibilities

12. Parties should play a proactive role in promoting and facilitating the implementation of the Strategic Plan in their countries and in multilateral processes under the Convention. They should assess and regularly follow up its implementation at all levels of governance. In this context it should be understood that “Parties” includes all relevant public authorities at the national, subnational and local levels (responsible for, for example, environment, justice, water, agriculture, transport, industry, health, education and foreign issues). Focal points could contribute, as appropriate, to the implementation of the Strategic Plan.

13. Stakeholders, including the general public, civil society organizations, experts from the education and scientific sectors, the health sector, the private sector, industry, transport and agriculture, trade and labour unions, the mass media, various communities, indigenous peoples and international organizations, are encouraged. to support implementation of the Strategic Plan. Civil society organizations promoting environmental protection have an important role in implementation by alerting the public to its rights and by supporting Governments in understanding and acting upon their obligations.

14. The secretariat facilitates implementation of the Strategic Plan through servicing the Convention’s bodies, organizing regional and subregional capacity-building activities and undertaking advisory and promotion work.

III. Framework for implementation

A. Focal area I: Implementation

Strategic goal I  
Full implementation of the Convention by each Party

To achieve full implementation of the Convention by each Party, Parties will implement the objectives set out below as far as possible.

*Objective I.1*: Each Party has a clear, transparent and consistent framework for the implementation of all provisions of the Convention, comprising not only the necessary constitutional, legislative and regulatory provisions, but also the operational procedures and mechanisms required for their practical application both in a national context as well as in transboundary situations, without discrimination as to citizenship, nationality or domicile and without harassment, persecution or any kind of retaliation against members of the public exercising their rights in conformity with the Convention (mainly target 16.10 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Identify and remediate any deficiencies in the implementation framework to ensure that adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures, and institutional mechanisms are in place. All activities are to be implemented through a participatory process, such as a robust consultation in the preparation of the NIR. | Parties, partner organizations,*a* stakeholders | Adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures, and institutional mechanisms are in place.  A participatory mechanism, such as a robust consultation in the preparation of the NIR, to monitor progress in the implementation of the Aarhus Convention is operational.  Good quality and timely submitted NIRs.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International***b* |  |  |
| Strengthen Parties’ capacities to implement the Convention and address obstacles to its implementation through the compliance mechanism, sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies*c*  Parties and the secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed).  Effective implementation of decisions regarding Parties’ non-compliance. |

*Abbreviations:* Aarhus Clearinghouse, Aarhus Clearinghouse for Environmental Democracy; NIR, national implementation report.

*a* Wherever reference is made to partner organizations, it is understood that the organizations participating in the Convention’s capacity-building coordination framework and other relevant organizations will be involved.

*b* Refers to multilateral processes established under the Convention*.*

*c* Activities of the Meeting of the Parties and other bodies under the Convention also involve stakeholders.

*Objective I.2*: The Convention’s mechanism for compliance review fulfils the role of an effective instrument to address compliance problems that cannot be resolved at the national level. The findings and recommendations of the Compliance Committee are regarded by Parties as an authoritative source of advice on the implementation of the Convention and are used by them to improve their national practices in the best way possible (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 16).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Individual Parties promptly and fully implement the decisions concerning their compliance adopted by the Meeting of the Parties.  To ensure that compliance issues are addressed without delay,[[5]](#footnote-6) individual Parties shall do their utmost to promptly and fully implement the Committee’s findings and recommendations prior to the next session of the Meeting of the Parties, where the Party concerned has agreed that the Committee may make recommendations to them directly.  Having a system in place to monitor the implementation of decisions, involving all relevant authorities, communicants and other interested stakeholders. | Parties  Communicants and other interested stakeholders  Compliance Committee | Having a system in place for monitoring the implementation of decisions.  Decisions of the Meeting of the Parties are promptly and fully implemented.  In advance of the next session of the Meeting of the Parties, findings and recommendations of the Compliance Committee are promptly and fully implemented by individual Parties found to be in non-compliance.  Positive feedback from Parties and stakeholders |
| **International** |  |  |
| Review of submissions, communications, requests from the Meeting of the Parties and referrals and preparation and publication of findings and recommendations.  Regular review of the progress made by individual Parties in implementing the decision concerning their compliance adopted by the Meeting of the Parties.  Thematic review of systemic compliance problems. | Meeting of the Parties, Parties  Compliance Committee  Secretariat | Adoption of the findings and recommendations by the Compliance Committee, and adoption by the Meeting of the Parties of draft decisions on compliance endorsing those findings and recommendations in accordance with the long-standing and consistent practice to do so.  Positive feedback from Parties and stakeholders. |

*Objective I.3*: The reporting mechanism under the Convention fulfils the role of an effective instrument to monitor the Convention’s implementation.

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Preparing national implementation reports through wide multi-stakeholder consultations and making them available online. | Parties  Interested stakeholders | Good quality reports have been prepared through wide multi-stakeholder consultations.  Timely submission of good quality reports. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Review of the implementation. | Meeting of the Parties, Parties  Compliance Committee  Secretariat | Timely submission of good quality reports.  Good quality synthesis report is drawn up with the major conclusions drawn from the submitted NIRs.  Online access to the reports |

*Objective I.4*: In implementing the Convention, each Party not only complies with its mandatory provisions, but also endeavours to give effect to its provisions whose application is discretionary.

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Develop adequate legislation, regulations and implement required measures.  Pilot projects. | Parties  Stakeholders | Adequate legislation and regulations are developed and the required measures are taken.  Pilot projects are implemented.  Positive feedback from Parties and stakeholders.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities through sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties, relevant Convention bodies and the secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

*Objective I.5*: Environmental education is widely available and promotes active and responsible behaviour among the public as regards the environment, including the exercise of the rights guaranteed by the Convention (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 4).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Addressing provisions and principles of the Aarhus Convention through formal, informal and non-formal programmes on ESD.  Continue the integration, to the extent possible, of the issues of environmental law and access to justice in environmental matters into the curriculum. | Parties, Stakeholders, in particular educational institutions, local and subnational authorities  Media  Civil society organizations  Parties, stakeholders, in particular, law faculties, public administration and judicial training institutions and other relevant institutions supporting the implementation of the Convention | Adequate educational programmes and curriculum.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities through sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Secretariat, mostly through implementation of the ECE Strategy for ESD*a*  Relevant Convention bodies  Partner organizations | The objective is adequately addressed through the work on the ECE Strategy for ESD and Convention bodies, as appropriate (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

*Abbreviations:* ESD, education for sustainable development.

*Objective I.6*: Public authorities at all levels and in all relevant sectors of government are aware of the obligations under the Convention and allocate as far as possible the resources needed to comply with them. (mainly target 16.6 of the Sustainable Development Goals and Sustainable Development Goals 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14 and 15).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Information, training, organizational and budgetary measures. Translate text of the Convention and guidance material (for example, the *Maastricht Recommendations*[[6]](#footnote-7) or *The Aarhus Convention: An**Implementation Guide*),[[7]](#footnote-8) as far as appropriate, into national and subnational languages and distribute it widely; provide adequate training to all relevant staff of the authorities.  Strengthening of national focal points.  National capacity-building*a*activities. | Parties  All public authorities concerned within Parties  Stakeholders  Partner organizations | The required information, training, organizational and budgetary measures are taken.  National focal points have capacity to carry out the required work.  Resources are allocated as far as possible.  Convention and guidance material, as far as appropriate, are translated into national and subnational languages and distributed widely.  Adequate training is provided regularly to relevant staff in the authorities.  Programmes for capacity-building activities, including through face-to-face, e-learning and other courses, for different levels and sectors are being implemented.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities.  Strengthening Parties’ capacities through peer-learning, sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Relevant Convention bodies  Partner organizations and the secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material and e-learning course have been developed) |

*a* Wherever reference is made to capacity-building activities, it is understood that the organizations participating in the Convention’s capacity-building coordination framework will be involved.

*Objective I.7*: The implementation of the Convention leads to the development of an open administrative culture which supports public participation and transparency in environmental matters and values them as positive contributions to democratic, effective and good governance, ensures the participation of the public and strengthens a more effective participation of the vulnerable and marginalised groups. Public officials concerned have and apply the knowledge and skills to provide assistance and guidance to the public to facilitate the exercise of its rights (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 16).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Political support at the highest level.  Encourage proactive officials.  Exchange of best practices and national capacity-building for officials at all levels.  Regular awareness-raising.  Establishing and implementing the operational procedures and mechanisms promoting an open administrative culture.  Implement relevant e-government, open government and open government data initiatives | Parties  All public authorities concerned within Parties  Partner organizations | Programmes for capacity-building activities are being developed and implemented.  Relevant e-government, open government and open government data initiatives are being implemented.  The operational procedures and mechanisms are established and implemented.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities.  Sharing good practices. | Partner organizations and the secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared). |

*Objective I.8*: Each Party provides for appropriate recognition of and support to civil society and prevention of any kind of retaliation against members of the public promoting environmental protection as important actors in advancing democratic debate on environmental policies, raising public awareness and mobilizing and assisting citizens in exercising their rights under the Convention and contributing to its implementation (mainly target 16.10 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Identifying and remediating any deficiencies in the framework to ensure that adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures, and institutional mechanisms are in place.  National capacity-building and awareness-raising activities.  Preparing and disseminating adequate resource material in national and subnational languages to assist civil society organizations in exercising their rights under the Convention.  Provision of financial and expert assistance.  Effective implementation of measures for the enactment of article 3 (8), such as protection of whistle-blowersand environmental defenders. | Parties  Donor institutions  Partner organizations  Civil society  organizations | Measures are implemented.  Programmes for capacity-building and awareness-raising activities are implemented.  Civil society organizations participate effectively in the related activities.  Support for public interest environmental civil society organizations is being provided.  Members of the public can exercise their rights without any fear of repercussions as a result of their involvement.  Cases of penalization, persecution, harassment or any kind of retaliation are properly recorded, investigated and remediated.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities through sharing good practices. | Parties  Donor institutions  Partner organizations  Civil society  organizations  Secretariat | Civil society organizations participate effectively in the activities at the international level.  Good practices have been shared through regional and subregional capacity-building activities and the work of the Convention’s bodies.  Relevant bodies under the Convention address the reported cases effectively. |

*Objective I.9*: Civil society organizations and the general public are aware of their rights under the Convention and assert them to effectively engage in addressing environmental and sustainable development issues and to advance both environmental protection and good governance, thus contributing to sustainable development (mainly Sustainable Development Goals 4 and 16).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Public awareness campaigns.  Support for public interest environmental civil society organizations, including environmental law organizations. | Parties  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations  Academic Institutions  Donors | Measures for raising public awareness are being implemented.  Support for public interest environmental civil society organizations is being provided.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional activities. | Parties  Partner organizations  Donors  Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Secretariat | Civil society organizations and the general public have the opportunity to participate effectively in the activities under the Convention. |

Access to information

*Objective I.10*: Public authorities at all levels and in all relevant sectors of government have well-established information policies and mechanisms, under which the scope ofenvironmental information is interpreted broadly in line with the requirements of the Convention, environmental information of a high quality – including national reports on the state-of-the-environment – is timely and routinely provided and proactively disseminated to the public in a user-friendly manner, making full use of electronic tools (mainly target 16.10 of the Sustainable Development Goals and Sustainable Development Goal 17).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Further development of systems to collect environmental information, including environment-related health,geospatial, hydrometeorological, statistical, Earth Observation and other relevant information in electronic form.  Further development of public registers, national nodes and information centres.  Increasing compatibility and interoperability of electronic databases containing environmental information.  Developing or updating single web access points, conceived to be user-friendly, that aggregate data and information resulting from different reliable sources.  Implementation of relevant e-government and open data initiatives.  Promoting “citizen science” and other relevant initiatives.  Application of the updated recommendations on electronic information tools developed under the Convention and other decisions of the Meeting of the Parties related to access to environmentalinformation. | Parties  All stakeholders, including health professionals’ organizations  Partner organizations | Environmental information of a high quality is timely and routinely provided and proactively disseminated to the public in a user-friendly manner.  National reports on the state-of-the-environment aligned with Sustainable Development Goals, their targets and indicators, and are regularly published online.  Number of Parties having established single web access portal for environmental information.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes.  Review mechanism on access to information |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities.  Strengthening Parties’ capacities through sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

Public participation

*Objective I.11*: Public participation procedures are regarded by public authorities and all other actors concerned as an integral part of the preparation of policies, plans, programmes, projects, legal instruments and executive regulations that may have a significant effect on the environment, and are implemented in their full scope with the support of electronic information tools, as appropriate. Prospective applicants are, where appropriate, encouraged to undertake proactive efforts to identify and inform the public concerned and enter into discussions with them at an early stage of planning, allowing for the effective participation of all interested members of the public (mainly Sustainable Development Goals 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14 and 15 and target 16.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Informational and organizational measures to facilitate public participation procedures.  Training and other capacity-building activities of officials and executives in communication with the general public.  Application of recommendations developed under the Convention and other decisions of the Meeting of the Parties related to public participation. Decisions broadly reflect the public input. | All authorities within Parties responsible for carrying out public participation procedures  Private sector  Partner organizations | Measures have been taken to ensure that effective public participation procedures are in place.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes.  Number of Parties having established online tools to support other mechanisms for public participation in the preparation of policies, plans, programmes, projects, legal instruments and executive regulations.  Public authorities demonstrably take account of public input. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities through regional and subregional capacity-building activities, sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Partner organizations  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

Access to justice

*Objective I.12*:

(a) Each Party ensures access to administrative or judicial review procedures that can provide timely and effective remedies for members of the public who consider that their rights under the Convention have not been respected;

(b) Each Party empowers members of the public, where they meet the criteria, if any, laid down in national law, to challenge acts and omissions that contravene provisions of national environmental law. Any such criteria should be established taking fully into account the Convention’s objective of guaranteeing access to justice;

(c) Each Party undertakes genuine efforts to reduce and eliminate financial and other barriers that may prevent access to such review procedures and establishes, where appropriate, assistance mechanisms to that end, including to vulnerable and marginalised groups (mainly target 16.3 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Identifying and remediating any deficiencies through a multi-stakeholder dialogue to ensure that adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures and institutional frameworks are in place with regard to: (a) remedies; (b) standing; and (c) financial barriers.  Capacity-building activities.  Implementing decisions of the Meeting of the Parties related to access to justice. | Parties  All authorities within Parties responsible for the functioning of administrative or judicial review procedures, in particular ministries of justice  Civil society  organizations  Public interest lawyers  Partner organizations | Effective access to administrative or judicial review procedures is ensured through: (a) providing timely and effective remedies to members of the public; (b) empowering members of the public to obtain access to justice; and (c) reducing and eliminating financial and other barriers that may prevent access to review procedures and through establishing assistance mechanisms.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes.  Number of Parties reporting quantitative data on public access to administrative and review procedures. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities through regional and subregional capacity-building activities, sharing good practices, maintaining jurisprudence database and developing guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties and relevant Convention bodies  Partner organizations  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies**,** through regional and subregional capacity-building activities and the Aarhus Clearinghouse (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

*Objective I.13*: Judges, public prosecutors and other legal professionals are familiar with the provisions of the Convention and are ready to exercise their respective responsibilities to uphold them (mainly target 16.3 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Information, education/training and capacity-building measures for legal professionals in accordance with decisions on access to justice adopted by the Meeting of the Parties.  Taking measures to make decisions of courts, and whenever possible of other judicial bodies, publicly accessible. | Parties, in particular, ministries of justice**,** or similar national bodies**,** courts and other independent review bodies  Judicial training centres  Law schools  Professional organizations  Civil society  organizations | Adequate curricula/training programmes.  Measures are being implemented.  Number of Parties making decisions of courts, and, whenever possible, of other judicial bodies, publicly accessible.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities through regional and subregional capacity-building activities, maintaining jurisprudence database, sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Partner organizations  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

B. Focal area II: Expansion

Strategic goal II  
Increase the impact of the Convention in the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe region and beyond

To increase the impact of the Convention in the ECE region and beyond, Parties will implement the following objectives as far as possible:

*Objective II.1*: The number of Parties to the Convention within the ECE region continues to increase steadily throughout the plan period (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 17).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Build public and political support for ratification in non-Parties.  Bilateral consultations to discuss and overcome obstacles to ratification. | Parties  Partner organizations  Civil society organizations  Interested non-Party within the ECE region | Completed ratification procedures. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthen Parties’ capacities through capacity-building activities, sharing good practices, developing guidance material and providing assistance upon request. | Secretariat  Civil society organizations  Parties  Interested non-Party  Partner organizations | Increased number of Parties. |

*Objective II.2*: The amendment to the Convention on public participation in decisions on the deliberate release into the environment and the placing on the market of genetically modified organisms (GMOs) is approved by a sufficient number of Parties to enter into force by 20xxand is progressively implemented in the vast majority of Parties (mainly Sustainable Development Goals 15 and 16).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Build public and political support for ratification in Parties.  Parties seek bilateral consultations with other Parties that have ratified the amendment, to discuss and overcome obstacles to ratification and receive/ provide capacity-building assistance and share good practices. | Interested Parties  Partner organizations  Civil society  organizations | Completed ratification procedures.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening the capacities of the Parties concerned through capacity-building activities, sharing good practices and provision of advisory assistance upon request.  Use of regional and international cooperation arrangements to raise interest in the GMO amendment. | Secretariat  Civil society  organizations  Parties concerned  Partner organizations, in particular the secretariat of the Cartagena Protocol to the Convention on Biological Diversity. | Increased number of ratifications. |

*Objective II.3*: States in other regions of the world effectively exercise their right to accede to the Convention. Parties actively encourage accession to the Convention by States of other regions of the world (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 17).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Build public and political support for ratification in non-Parties.  Bilateral consultations between Parties and non-Parties to discuss and overcome obstacles to ratification, provide capacity-building assistance and share good practices with interested non-Parties. | Parties  Partner organizations  Civil society  organizations  Interested non-Party outside the ECE region | Completed ratification procedures.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening the capacities of interested non-Parties through capacity-building activities, sharing good practices, translating guidance material into national and subnational languages and providing advisory and technical assistance upon request. | Secretariat  Civil society  organizations  Parties  Interested non-Party outside the ECE region | Increased number of Parties. |
| Use of regional and international cooperation arrangements to raise interest in the Convention. |  |  |

*Objective II.4*: The Convention sets an internationally recognized standard for access to information, public participation in decision-making and access to justice in environmental matters, and inspires the development of similar instruments in other regions of the world thereby putting Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration into practice.

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Promoting the Convention: (a) at national level to national focal points dealing with other international forums; and (b) through bilateral cooperation with countries in other regions through providing capacity-building assistance and sharing good practices. | Parties  Partner organizations  Civil society  organizations | Convention promoted effectively within interministerial processes and through Parties’ positions in major international forums, as well as among countries in other regions.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Participation in key regional and international events to publicize the Convention.  Encouraging references to the Convention in other forums (political and academic).  Cooperating with other regional bodies interested in the implementation of Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration.  Providing capacity-building and advisory assistance. | Parties  Meeting of the Parties  and its Bureau and the Working Group  Secretariat  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations | Convention promoted effectively in major international forums and among countries in other regions. |

*Objective II.5*: The Parties to the Convention actively promote the application of its principles in international environmental decision-making processes and within the framework of international organizations relating to the environment, and endeavour to influence the practices of international forums in matters relating to the environment, in particular the development and implementation of multilateral environmental agreements (mainly target 17.14 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Consideration of possible measures to give effect to the Almaty Guidelines on Promoting the Application of the Principles of the Aarhus Convention in International Forums at the national level.  Implementation of the decisions of the Meeting of the Parties related to application of the Convention’s principles in international environmental decision-making. | Parties  Partner organizations  Civil society  organizations | Increased number of international forums that apply the Almaty Guidelines in their procedures.  National coordination mechanisms are in place and are working effectively.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities to apply the Almaty Guidelines.  Promotion of the application  of the Almaty Guidelines in international forums.  Adoption of appropriate practices and procedures in international forums; review of existing practices.  Consultations with other forums. | Parties  Secretariat  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations  Meeting of the Parties  and its Working Group | Application of the Convention’s principles is promoted effectively in major international forums.  The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies.  Parties coordinate collectively in other forums on matters relevant to the application of the Convention’s principles. |

*Objective II.6*: The Parties to the Convention, both in their participation in international policymaking and in their national implementation activities, achieve synergies between the Convention and other international environmental and human rights agreements (mainly target 17.14 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Coordinated implementation  of the Convention and the provisions on access to information and public participation of other MEAs and human rights agreements. | Parties | Synergies between the implementation of the Convention and other international environmental and human rights agreements are ensured.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes and OHCHR special procedures mechanisms. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Organization of joint activities with other MEAs, in particular those of ECE, and human rights bodies. | Parties  Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Secretariat  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations | Joint activities with other MEAs and human rights bodies are implemented effectively.  Parties coordinate collectively in other forums on matters relevant to the application of the Convention. |

*Abbreviations:* MEA, multilateral environmental agreement; OHCHR, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

C. Focal area III: Development

Strategic goal III  
Further development of the provisions and principles of the Convention where necessary to ensure that it continues to achieve its objectives

To achieve the further development of the provisions and principles of the Convention where necessary to ensure that it continues to achieve its objectives, Parties will endeavour to implement the following objectives:

*Objective III.1*: The provisions of the Convention are interpreted in a dynamic way, enabling practice to adapt to experience acquired in the course of implementation, new developments in society, technological innovation, new and emerging technologies and environmental challenges.

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Forward-looking interpretation of the Convention in view of new environmental and development challenges. | Parties  Civil society  organizations  Private sector | Number of Parties having adapted relevant legislative, regulatory and policy measures and institutional frameworks to recent developments.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Strengthening Parties’ capacities and addressing obstacles in implementing the Convention through the compliance mechanism, sharing good practices and developing guidance material. | Parties  Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

*Objective III.2*: The Parties continue to explore possibilities for implementing more effective measures under the Convention to ensure greater opportunities for public participation in policy formulation and implementation concerning each of the three pillars of the Convention, so as to contribute to sustainable development, recalling the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Furthermore, the Parties share their experiences in implementing the Convention with other forums interested in using them as a basis or a source of inspiration for further strengthening participatory democracy in their respective fields.

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Use of participatory procedures in the revision and/or development of national strategies for sustainable development and for the development of sustainable development goals. | Parties  Civil society  organizations  Private sector | Provisions for effective public participation are implemented.  Good practices are reported through NIRs,the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Exchange of experience and best practices on the impact of instruments of participatory democracy on decisions related to all dimensions of sustainable development, public participation in policy formulation and implementation contributing to sustainable development. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Parties  Secretariat  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

Access to information

*Objective III.3*: The use of modern information and communication technologies and the range of environmental information that is made available to the public are gradually widened, inter alia, by developing and implementing mechanisms enabling more informed consumer choices as regards products, thereby contributing to more sustainable patterns of production and consumption. Through exchange of information and good practice, consideration is given as to how to promote the increasing accessibility of environmental information held by the private sector, taking into account relevant issues of confidentiality of commercial and industrial information and protection of intellectual property rights, in line with the current approach under the Convention (mainly Sustainable Development Goals 3, 11, 12 and 17 and target 16.10 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Identify and remediate through a participatory intersectoral and multi-stakeholder process any deficiencies in the national framework to ensure that adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures and institutional frameworks are in place.  Application of the updated recommendations on electronic information tools developed under the Convention and decisions of the Meeting of the Parties with regard to relevant provisions on access to information, including environment-related product information.  Capacity-building activities. | Parties  Civil society  organizations  Private sector  Partner organizations | Number of Parties having implemented relevant “open data” initiatives.  Environmental information, including related to products is made available effectively.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities, exchange of information and best practice in promoting the accessibility of environmental information held by the private sector based on national experience, preparing studies and guidance material. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Civil society  organizations  Private sector  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant studies and guidance material has been developed). |

Public participation

*Objective III.4*: The provisions on public participation in decisions having a significant impact on the environment, encompassing, inter alia, product-related decision-making, are assessed, further reflected on and, where appropriate, elaborated upon (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 12 and target 16.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Identify and remediate through a participatory intersectoral and multi-stakeholder process any deficiencies in the national framework to ensure that adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures and institutional frameworks are in place.  Application of recommendations developed under the Convention with regard to relevant provisions on public participation.  Capacity-building activities. | Parties  Civil society  organizations  Private sector | Measures are taken.  Provisions for effective public participation are implemented.  Capacity-building activities are implemented.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities, exchange of information and promotion of good practice with regard to the implementation of the provisions on public participation in decisions having a significant impact on the environment. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Civil society  organizations  Partner sector  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

*Objective III.5:* The provisions of the Convention relating to public participation in the preparation of plans, programmes and policies relating to the environment, as well as executive regulations and other generally applicable legally binding normative instruments that may have a significant effect on the environment, are applied, kept under review and, as appropriate, further developed to enhance public participation from an early stage in strategic decision-making processes. This should be done with appropriate public involvement and taking fully into account the specific nature and constraints of such processes and related obligations under other MEAs, in particular the Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (Protocol on SEA) to the Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context (Espoo Convention), and by involving its bodies in such processes (mainly Sustainable Development Goal 12 and target 16.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Identify and remediate through a participatory intersectoral and multi-stakeholder process any deficiencies in the national framework to ensure that adequate legislative, regulatory and policy measures and institutional frameworks are in place.  Application of the recommendations developed under the Convention with regard to relevant provisions on public participation.  Capacity-building activities. | Parties | Measures are taken.  Provisions for effective public participation are implemented.  Capacity-building activities are implemented.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities, exchange of information and promotion of good practice with regard to implementation of the provisions of articles 7 and 8 of Convention and in context of the implementation of the SEA Protocol. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Parties  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations  Espoo Convention/ Protocol on SEA bodies  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

*Objective III.6*: To enhance the effectiveness of public participation, the development and application of innovative forms and tools of public participation beyond traditional consultation procedures are encouraged, the development of the capacity of vulnerable and marginalised groups as well as civil society organizations is supported and civil society is strengthened (mainly Sustainable Development Goals 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14 and 15 and target 16.7 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Promote good practices regarding different modes of public participation. | Parties  Civil society  organizations  Partner organizations | Innovative and effective forms and tools of public participation are in place.  Capacity of civil society organizations and civil society is strengthened.  Good practices are reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities, exchange of information and promotion of good practice on innovative and effective forms of and tools for participation. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Parties  Civil society organizations  Partner organizations  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

Access to justice

*Objective III.7:* Work on promoting effective access to justice continues, in particular by way of further information exchange, capacity-building and exchange of good practice, inter alia, on the issue of adequate and effective remedies, taking fully into account the Convention’s objective of, inter alia, guaranteeing access to justice. The extension of the range of members of the public having access to administrative and judicial procedures is explored, with particular focus on access by environmental civil society organizations. Further steps are taken to remove or reduce financial and other barriers and to establish assistance mechanisms where appropriate (mainly target 16.3 of the Sustainable Development Goals).

| *Indicative types of activity/measure* | *Possible implementing partners* | *Indicators of progress/targets* |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| **National** |  |  |
| Review of implementation of article 9, paragraphs 2, 3 and 4, through a multi-stakeholder dialogue to identify gaps and obstacles to implementation.  Reducing or removing financial and other barriers and provision of assistance mechanisms where appropriate. | Parties  Civil society  organizations | Number of Parties having promoted a multi-stakeholder dialogue.  The quantitative data for monitoring the effectiveness of the review procedures is routinely collected and analysed.[[8]](#footnote-9)  Relevant information is reported through NIRs, the Aarhus Clearinghouse and/or national nodes.  Adequate measures are implemented. |
| **International** |  |  |
| Regional and subregional capacity-building activities, exchange of information and promotion of good practice with regard to implementation of the provisions of article 9. | Meeting of the Parties  and relevant Convention bodies  Parties  Civil society organizations  Partner organizations  Secretariat | The objective is adequately addressed through the work of the respective Convention bodies and through regional and subregional capacity-building activities (for example, good practices have been shared and relevant guidance material has been developed). |

1. \* This document was scheduled for publication after the standard publication date owing to circumstances beyond the submitter's control. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. See ECE/MP.PP/2017/2/Add.1. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. To be updated in the light of possible new ratifications. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. In accordance with the Budva Declaration on Environmental Democracy for Our Sustainable Future (ECE/MP.PP/2017/16/Add.1-ECE/MP.PRTR/2017/2/Add.1. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. See ECE/MP.PP/2/Add.8, decision I/7, annex, para. 36. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
6. *Maastricht Recommendations on Promoting Effective Public Participation in Decision-making in Environmental Matters: Prepared under the Aarhus Convention* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.15.II.E.7). [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
7. United Nations publication, Sales No. E.13.II.E.3. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
8. See ECE/MP.PP/WG.1/2019/4, para. 63; and informal document AC/TF.AJ-12/Inf.4, available at www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/env/pp/a.to.j/TF12-2019/12TFAJ\_Inf4\_2019\_Statistics.pdf. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)