

External evaluation of the project “**Strengthening the implementation of the UNECE Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia**” (July 2019)

**Final Progress Report as at 31 December 2020**

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
1	<p><b>Given UNECE’s convening power and mandate, UNECE can facilitate involving and engaging with a broader range of key stakeholders/decision makers that could advance the Air Convention priorities more effectively by:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>organizing regional or national seminars to include decision-makers, such as representatives of the ministries of environment and natural resource management;</b></li> <li>- <b>including officials from statistical agencies in trainings would also facilitate their understanding of the type of data required to apply international methodologies.</b></li> </ul>	<p>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE will continue to organize regional and national seminars to include decision-makers under the complementary projects under the workplan for the Convention (e.g. project co-funded by the European Union (Support to the implementation of the Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution in the EECCA region” (2014–2018) and “Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II” (2019-2021)).</p> <p>As regards the inclusion of officials from statistical agencies in trainings, UNECE has limited influence on the nominations of national experts for trainings but will recommend participation of officials from statistical agencies.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will ensure that complementary actions, such as seminars including decision-makers, will be organized, e.g. in the</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>	<p><b>Implemented as of December 2020:</b></p> <p>In May and October 2020, UNECE organized online meetings of the EECCA Coordinating Group to engage representatives of Ministries and share progress on ratification and implementation of the Air Convention.</p> <p>UNECE organized online workshops on methodologies and guidelines used to develop national emissions inventories for national experts from ministries and relevant institutions in Moldova (6 November), Kyrgyzstan (4 December) and Kazakhstan (21 December). The workshops helped countries improve the quality and completeness of reporting under the Air Convention.</p> <p>As regards the inclusion of officials from statistical agencies in workshops, UNECE has limited impact on the nomination of national experts to participate in the training sessions, but the secretariat nevertheless recommended the participation of statistical officials.</p>	

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
		framework of the EU co-funded project, to be implemented by the end of 2021.			
2	<p><b>UNECE in collaboration with committed and experienced national partners should further work on the adaptability of the tools and methodologies to the regional and national contexts. Furthermore, UNECE may consider diversifying the portfolio of products covered in subsequent workshops and seminars, to include Greenhouse Gas - Air Pollution Interactions and Synergies (GAINS), COPERT and the like.</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>To complement activities under the capacity-building programme under the Convention, UNECE organized a workshop on GAINS in 2018. As there was a lot of interest, UNECE will try to organize further workshops on models such as GAINS and COPERT used under the Convention, depending on availability of resources. The workshop in 2018 has also helped in adapting the GAINS model further to suit national and regional contexts. In addition, UNECE has already engaged in translating information, analysis, and legislative texts into Russian and national languages.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will try to continue complementary activities on the tools and models (GAINS, COPERT) under the Convention, depending on availability of resources, by the end of 2021.</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat		<p><b>Implemented as of December 2020</b></p> <p>As some EECCA countries, in their official letters to the secretariat, stressed the need for a better understanding of the COPERT model for calculating emissions from road transport, the Convention's secretariat prepared a concept note on a future possible project and has attempted to raise funds and held negotiations with potential donors in this regard.</p> <p>A project proposal to be funded by the EU has been submitted, which includes a subregional workshop on the GAINS model and the development of scenarios with support of the GAINS model. The outcome of the project proposal is not yet known.</p>
3	<p><b>There is a continued need for awareness raising about the Convention and its protocols on the environmental and health effects of air pollution as well as modalities of</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>The Convention will continue organizing high-level awareness raising meetings in the framework of the capacity-building</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat		<p><b>Implemented as of December 2020</b></p> <p>Preparatory work has started for a high-level awareness-raising event and national roundtable to be held in Nur-Sultan in July 2021. Similar to the high-level meetings and roundtables organized in Armenia and Azerbaijan in 2019, this event also aims to raise the political profile of</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	<p><b>engagement and benefits. Potential tools may include a basic tool kit that could be applied for fast familiarization of new public officials with the problem, and/or a framework document that would visibly demonstrate the benefits of acceding to the Air Convention and the protocols. Using well-substantiated and clear-cut messages about adaptability of the tools to national contexts could help better sensitize politicians about the advantages of the Convention and encourage them to internalize this knowledge for further actions.</b></p>	<p>project under the Convention (e.g. EU co-funded project). In addition, an awareness-raising brochure for EECCA countries was developed in 2016 and translated into Russian. Further information (e.g. website) has been translated into Russian.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) could develop further awareness-raising materials, such as brochures and translation of existing documents into Russian, depending on availability of resources, by the end of 2021.</p>			<p>the Convention and awareness of the benefits of accession to the Protocols. The final draft of a National Action Plan for ratification will be presented and discussed with the national authorities of Kazakhstan at a roundtable.</p> <p>(The project is financed by Switzerland as co-funding to the EU project “Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II” (2019-2021)).</p> <p>A mid-term online stakeholder workshop was organized to fill information gaps and to produce different scenarios for ratification and implementation of the Convention in Kazakhstan.</p> <p>The secretariat co-organized a subregional online workshop for Central Asian countries convened by the US EPA to inform about the Convention, its lessons learned and the capacity building programme. About 50 participants joined the meeting.</p> <p>In addition, the secretariat organized an awareness raising webinar on the occasion of the First International Day of Clean Air for Blue Skies, which was attended by 150 participants from around the world, including many stakeholders from the EECCA countries.</p> <p>Further improvements and translations of sections on the website into Russian have been implemented and migrated to the new Drupal website.</p>
4	<p><b>UNECE should consider opportunities to enhance and strengthen accountability mechanisms to expedite ratification of protocols under the Convention in the countries where protocols have not been ratified. In the</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>The organization has limited influence on the functioning of and turnover of officials in national ministries. In addition, UNECE is already developing national action plans for ratification under the capacity-building</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>	<p><b>Implemented as of June 2020:</b></p> <p>A project to support development a National Action Plan for the ratification and implementation of key protocols to the Air Convention has been launched in June 2020. The project aims to strengthen Kazakhstan's capacity to ratify and implement the protocols to the Convention by developing a national action plan on ratification.</p>	

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	<p>situation of frequent change of relevant public officials, the establishment of such mechanisms, including international standards and procedures, could ensure sustainability and the continuity of efforts and facilitate the development of the national road map.</p>	<p>project for the Convention (e.g. the EU co-funded project).</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) could develop further awareness-raising materials, such as brochures and translation of documents, and will ensure that complementary actions, such as development of national action plans, will be organized, e.g. in the framework of the EU co-funded project, by the end of 2021.</p>			<p>The project is financed by Switzerland as co-funding to the EU project "Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II" (2019-2021))</p>
5	<p>Both UNECE and national partners should continue and encourage regular interaction between experts to share experiences, facilitate cross-learning and identify solutions, by using innovative communication mechanisms and platforms. In their interaction with the beneficiaries and subsequent projects, UNECE could encourage use of various communication channels and platforms (teleconferences, Skype, social media groups, etc.) for sharing experiences and problems and seeking answers, to complement traditional channels as sub-</p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE is adapting to the needs to beneficiaries and is open to use other communication channels (some of which are already being used) to foster exchange of information.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will inquire with beneficiaries about their preferred modes of communication and exchange of experiences, by December 2019.</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>	<p><b>Implemented as of June 2020</b></p> <p>UNECE is using teleconferences and various online communications channels with beneficiaries.</p> <p>UNECE recently also organized a webinar as part of its outreach activities, which could be replicated also in the context of the capacity-building programme.</p> <p>In May 2020, UNECE organized an online meeting of the EECCA Coordinating Group to engage representatives of Ministries and share progress on ratification and implementation of the Convention. Online meetings will be used for further meetings with the group in the future.</p>	

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	regional and regional meetings, and some email communication. These mechanisms could be envisaged and integrated into new projects.				
6	<b>Discussion of strategies to acquire funding and political support for advancing the Convention through other partners should be an integral part of UNECE support in EECCA region in addition to the focus on capacity building and skills upgrade.</b>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE will continue inviting representatives from international financial institutions (IFIs) to Convention meetings and can try to further engage with IFIs in future project activities.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will try to invite representatives from IFIs to capacity building activities, whenever appropriate, by December 2020.</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat	<b>Implemented as of December 2020</b>	UNECE invited representatives from the World Bank and the European Investment Bank to the 39 <sup>th</sup> session of the Executive Body for the Convention to discuss possible strategies to finance work related to the Convention in beneficiary countries. Follow-up discussions have been held with the World Bank.
7	<b>Consistent with UNECE prioritization of gender-responsive standards, affirming gender balance in invitations to participate would further ensure equal representation and equal project benefits for women and men. Existing gender representation in beneficiaries, which implicitly facilitated attention to gender equality, could be complemented by exploring</b>	<p>UNECE accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>The Environment Division will continue to promote gender equality by ensuring gender balance in its project activities.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will encourage gender balance in project activities by sending targeted invitations and explore opportunities to cooperate with other</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat	<b>Implemented as of December 2020</b>	<p>UNECE is encouraging gender balance in meetings and has highlighted the importance of gender balance in preparatory conversations for events with national focal points.</p> <p>In all seminars, national roundtables and organised awareness raising meetings, equal representation and equal benefits for women and men in project implementation are envisaged. An example is the recently organised online meeting of the EECCA Coordination Group, where 9 of the 15 participants were female. In the recent online workshop on the development of emission inventories in the Republic of Moldova, 9 of 20 participants were female.</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	opportunities to cooperate with other development partners with explicit mandate and knowledge on how to ensure gender equality, for example the UN Women and national gender machineries.	development partners with explicit mandate and knowledge on how to ensure gender equality, for example UN Women, by end of 2021.			
8	At the stage of the project proposal preparation extra analysis is recommended to better anticipate related costs, based on comparable projects and industry standards. Sufficient attention and resources should be put to cover expenditures for staff needed to manage and implement the project throughout its cycle.	<p>UNECE accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>As resources for staff often do not suffice to implement the full project and therefore need to be complemented by other funding sources, UNECE will assess and scrutinize the needs for expenditures for staff more thoroughly and establish thresholds, below which a project manager cannot be hired.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will more clearly communicate to donors the need for staff resources for future projects.</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat		<p><b>Implemented as of June 2020</b></p> <p>For a short-term project funded by Sweden to support the organization of the 40th anniversary session for the Convention, the majority of the project funding is earmarked for staff resources as a result of a thorough analysis of secretariat needs.</p> <p>In recent draft project proposals discussed with the main donors, secretariat staff made it clear what the true costs of projects staff are.</p>