

External evaluation of the project “**Strengthening the implementation of the UNECE Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia**” (July 2019)

**Progress report as at 30 June 2020**

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
1	<p><b>Given UNECE’s convening power and mandate, UNECE can facilitate involving and engaging with a broader range of key stakeholders/decision makers that could advance the Air Convention priorities more effectively by:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>organizing regional or national seminars to include decision-makers, such as representatives of the ministries of environment and natural resource management;</b></li> <li>- <b>including officials from statistical agencies in trainings would also facilitate their understanding of the type of data required to apply international methodologies.</b></li> </ul>	<p>UNECE partially accepts the recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE will continue to organize regional and national seminars to include decision-makers under the complementary projects under the workplan for the Convention (e.g. project co-funded by the European Union (Support to the implementation of the Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution in the EECCA region” (2014–2018) and “Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II” (2019-2021)).</p> <p>As regards the inclusion of officials from statistical agencies in trainings, UNECE has limited influence on the nominations of national experts for trainings but will recommend participation of officials from statistical agencies.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will ensure that complementary actions, such as seminars including decision-makers, will be organized, e.g. in the</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>	<p>December 2021</p>	<p><b>In Progress</b></p> <p>A sub-regional workshop on promoting the ratification of protocols and the application of best available techniques (BATs) in the EECCA region was organized by the Convention’s Task Force on Techno-Economic Issues (TFTEI) in close collaboration with the secretariat on 14 -16 May 2019 in Berlin, Germany. The workshop improved understanding of EECCA experts (19 experts (11 of them female) from Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Ukraine and Uzbekistan) on the concept of BATs and enhanced exchange of experiences among countries. Participants identified further steps and needs to facilitate the application of BAT, e.g., the need to provide assistance and advice to EECCA experts in estimating and measuring VOC emissions. <i>(Funded by EU project “Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II” (2019-2021))</i></p> <p>Therefore, follow up workshop on assessment and measurement of emissions of volatile organic compounds (VOC) from installations (requirements, emission monitoring, BATs) was organised on 11-12 November 2019 in Minsk, Belarus. The workshop provided clear examples of methods and applications to correctly approach the issue of VOC, in line with the Gothenburg Protocol provisions. The workshop was attended by technical experts from Belarus, Georgia,</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
		<p>framework of the EU co-funded project, to be implemented by the end of 2021.</p>			<p>the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine, involved in VOC management. <i>(Funded by EU project “Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II” (2019-2021))</i></p> <p>A five-day workshop was organized for national experts in Azerbaijan (23-27 September 2019) and Armenia (21-25 October 2019) to improve and maintain the completeness and accuracy of national air pollutant emission inventories under the Air Convention. The workshop, held in Baku, brought together six national experts (including five female experts) from the Ministry of Environment of Azerbaijan, responsible for developing a national inventory of air pollutant emissions. The Armenian Inventory Group was represented by seven national experts (all female) from the Environmental Monitoring and Information Center of the Ministry of Environment. The workshops resulted in improved skills of national experts in the preparation of national reporting (Annex I – Emissions reporting, Annex V - Gridded Emissions and, and the Information Inventory Report (IIR) – Annex II).</p> <p>In May 2020, UNECE organized an online meeting of the EECCA Coordinating Group to engage representatives of Ministries and share progress on ratification and implementation of the Convention.</p> <p>As regards the inclusion of officials from statistical agencies in trainings, UNECE has limited impact on the nomination of national experts to participate in the training sessions, but the secretariat nevertheless recommended the participation of statistical officials</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
2	<p>UNECE in collaboration with committed and experienced national partners should further work on the adaptability of the tools and methodologies to the regional and national contexts. Furthermore, UNECE may consider diversifying the portfolio of products covered in subsequent workshops and seminars, to include Greenhouse Gas - Air Pollution Interactions and Synergies (GAINS), COPERT and the like.</p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>To complement activities under the capacity-building programme under the Convention, UNECE organized a workshop on GAINS in 2018. As there was a lot of interest, UNECE will try to organize further workshops on models such as GAINS and COPERT used under the Convention, depending on availability of resources. The workshop in 2018 has also helped in adapting the GAINS model further to suit national and regional contexts. In addition, UNECE has already engaged in translating information, analysis, and legislative texts into Russian and national languages.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will try to continue complementary activities on the tools and models (GAINS, COPERT) under the Convention, depending on availability of resources, by the end of 2021.</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>	<p>December 2021</p>	<p><b>In progress</b></p> <p>As some EECCA countries, in their official letters to the secretariat, stressed the need for a better understanding of the COPERT model for calculating emissions from road transport, the Convention's secretariat prepared a concept note on a future possible project and has attempted to raise funds and held negotiations with potential donors in this regard.</p>
3	<p>There is a continued need for awareness raising about the Convention and its protocols on the environmental and health effects of air pollution as well as modalities of engagement and benefits. Potential tools may include a</p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>The Convention will continue organizing high-level awareness raising meetings in the framework of the capacity-building project under the Convention (e.g. EU co-funded project). In addition, an awareness-</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>	<p>December 2021</p>	<p><b>In Progress</b></p> <p>A high-level awareness-raising meeting organized in <b>Armenia (25 September 2019)</b> and <b>Azerbaijan (8 October 2019)</b> raised the Convention's profile and increased awareness of the benefits of joining the protocols. The events brought together high-level representatives of ministries, UNECE and the EU</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	<p><b>basic tool kit that could be applied for fast familiarization of new public officials with the problem, and/or a framework document that would visibly demonstrate the benefits of acceding to the Air Convention and the protocols. Using well-substantiated and clear-cut messages about adaptability of the tools to national contexts could help better sensitize politicians about the advantages of the Convention and encourage them to internalize this knowledge for further actions.</b></p>	<p>raising brochure for EECCA countries was developed in 2016 and translated into Russian. Further information (e.g. website) has been translated into Russian.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) could develop further awareness-raising materials, such as brochures and translation of existing documents into Russian, depending on availability of resources, by the end of 2021.</p>			<p>delegation to the country.</p> <p>Implementation of the Air Convention was promoted through the production of numerous press releases and communication materials, such as a video and a brochure entitled "Protecting the Air We Breathe" (<a href="http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=52690">http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=52690</a>), to raise awareness of air pollution and the Convention to celebrate its 40th anniversary. A brochure entitled "On the way to clean air" was prepared to provide information on the capacity-building programme under the Convention (<a href="http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=52692">http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=52692</a>). All materials are available in English and Russian.</p> <p>Preparatory work has started for a high-level awareness-raising event in Nur-Sultan, tentatively in July 2021, along with a national round table to present and discuss with national authorities the final draft of the national action plan developed under the project launched in Kazakhstan in June 2020. <i>(The project is financed by Switzerland as co-funding to the EU project "Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II" (2019-2021))</i></p>
4	<p><b>UNECE should consider opportunities to enhance and strengthen accountability mechanisms to expedite ratification of protocols under the Convention in the countries where protocols have not been ratified. In the</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>The organization has limited influence on the functioning of and turnover of officials in national ministries. In addition, UNECE is already developing national action plans for ratification under the capacity-building</p>	<p>Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat</p>		<p><b>Implemented as June 2020</b></p> <p>In June 2020, a project for the development of a national action plan for ratification and implementation of the key protocols to the Convention has started. The project is to strengthen Kazakhstan's capacity to ratify and implement the protocols to the Convention by developing ratification</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	situation of frequent change of relevant public officials, the establishment of such mechanisms, including international standards and procedures, could ensure sustainability and the continuity of efforts and facilitate the development of the national road map.	<p>project for the Convention (e.g. the EU co-funded project).</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) could develop further awareness-raising materials, such as brochures and translation of documents, and will ensure that complementary actions, such as development of national action plans, will be organized, e.g. in the framework of the EU co-funded project, by the end of 2021.</p>			<p>scenarios, its economic assessment and drafting a National Action Plan for implementation of key protocols.</p> <p>The project is financed by Switzerland as co-funding to the EU project “Implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (CLRTAP) – Phase II” (2019-2021))</p>
5	Both UNECE and national partners should continue and encourage regular interaction between experts to share experiences, facilitate cross-learning and identify solutions, by using innovative communication mechanisms and platforms. In their interaction with the beneficiaries and subsequent projects, UNECE could encourage use of various communication channels and platforms (teleconferences, Skype, social media groups, etc.) for sharing experiences and problems and seeking answers, to complement traditional channels as sub-	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE is adapting to the needs to beneficiaries and is open to use other communication channels (some of which are already being used) to foster exchange of information.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will inquire with beneficiaries about their preferred modes of communication and exchange of experiences, by December 2019.</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat		<p><b>Implemented as of June 2020</b></p> <p>UNECE is using teleconferences and skype as communications channels with beneficiaries.</p> <p>UNECE recently also organized a webinar as part of its outreach activities, which could be replicated also in the context of the capacity-building programme.</p> <p>In May 2020, UNECE organized an online meeting of the EECCA Coordinating Group to engage representatives of Ministries and share progress on ratification and implementation of the Convention. Online meetings will be used for further meetings with the group in the future.</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	regional and regional meetings, and some email communication. These mechanisms could be envisaged and integrated into new projects.				
6	<b>Discussion of strategies to acquire funding and political support for advancing the Convention through other partners should be an integral part of UNECE support in EECCA region in addition to the focus on capacity building and skills upgrade.</b>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE will continue inviting representatives from international financial institutions (IFIs) to Convention meetings and can try to further engage with IFIs in future project activities.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will try to invite representatives from IFIs to capacity building activities, whenever appropriate, by December 2020.</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat	December 2020	<p><b>In progress</b></p> <p>UNECE is inviting representatives from the World Bank and the European Investment Bank to the 39<sup>th</sup> session of the Executive Body for the Convention to discuss possible strategies to finance work related to the Convention in beneficiary countries.</p>
7	<b>Consistent with UNECE prioritization of gender-responsive standards, affirming gender balance in invitations to participate would further ensure equal representation and equal project benefits for women and men. Existing gender representation in beneficiaries, which implicitly facilitated attention to gender equality, could be complemented by exploring</b>	<p>UNECE accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>The Environment Division will continue to promote gender equality by ensuring gender balance in its project activities.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will encourage gender balance in project activities by sending targeted invitations and explore opportunities to cooperate with other</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat	December 2021	<p><b>In progress</b></p> <p>UNECE is encouraging gender balance in meetings and has highlighted the importance of gender balance in preparatory conversations for the national roundtable and awareness raising meetings in Yerevan, Armenia (25 September 2019) and Baku, Azerbaijan (8 October 2019) with national focal points.</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	opportunities to cooperate with other development partners with explicit mandate and knowledge on how to ensure gender equality, for example the UN Women and national gender machineries.	development partners with explicit mandate and knowledge on how to ensure gender equality, for example UN Women, by end of 2021.			
8	At the stage of the project proposal preparation extra analysis is recommended to better anticipate related costs, based on comparable projects and industry standards. Sufficient attention and resources should be put to cover expenditures for staff needed to manage and implement the project throughout its cycle.	<p>UNECE accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>As resources for staff often do not suffice to implement the full project and therefore need to be complemented by other funding sources, UNECE will assess and scrutinize the needs for expenditures for staff more thoroughly and establish thresholds, below which a project manager cannot be hired.</p> <p>The Air Unit/Environment Division (Krzysztof Olendrzynski, Environmental Affairs Officer) will more clearly communicate to donors the need for staff resources for future projects.</p>	Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution Secretariat		<p><b>Implemented as of June 2020</b></p> <p>For a short-term project funded by Sweden to support the organization of the 40th anniversary session for the Convention, the majority of the project funding is earmarked for staff resources as a result of a thorough analysis of secretariat needs.</p> <p>In recent draft project proposals discussed with the main donors, secretariat staff made it clear what the true costs of projects staff are.</p>