

External evaluation of the project “Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence” (October 2018)

Progress report as at 30 June 2020

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
1	<b>In order to establish the People-First (PF)-PPPs as a main financing modality for sustainable development, UNECE should advocate the adoption of people-first principles at least across the UN System (in the first stage) through a “One-UN” approach. This might be achieved gradually either through a bottom-up approach (having the national governments requesting this in a formalized manner) or by proposing UN a general adoption of PF-PPP standards through internal (political or technical) mechanisms. As an organization with a high degree of credibility, the United Nations took take the lead role in regulating and creating standards for PPPs that would enable a wider acceptance and a more robust involvement of the private capital in financing sustainable development. An additional advantage of UNECE is the unique intergovernmental body – the Team of Specialists (later</b>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. UNECE member States strongly believe that the traditional PPP model needs to transition to people-first in order to have any impact vis-à-vis the SDGs and have asked us to promote this across the UN system. The Guiding Principles on people-first PPPs for the SDGs have been published as a UNECE contribution to paragraph 48 of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on Financing for Development. The UNECE works closely with other UN bodies within the interagency task force on Financing for Development and continues to explore options to promote this work collaboratives. However, it cannot assume a leadership role on this unless this role is recognised by other UN bodies.</p> <p>At its session in March 2018, the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and Public-Private Partnerships (Decision 2018 – 4b.6) “Encouraged the secretariat to continue working closely with the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, the other Regional</p>	Cooperation and Partnerships Section		The recommendation was <b>implemented in May 2019</b> when at the fourth International PPP Forum in Geneva on 7-9 May 2019, the five UN Regional Commissions agreed to work together to make PPP ‘fit for purpose’ for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (see UNECE press release at: <a href="https://www.unece.org/?id=51760">https://www.unece.org/?id=51760</a> ).

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	<p><b>upgraded to the Working Party on PPPs). This comparative advantage should be further capitalized by UNECE in being the leading entity on PF-PPP matter.</b></p>	<p>Commissions, UNCTAD, other United Nations agencies and the World Bank to make the guiding principles on people-first PPPs for the SDGs a joint contribution to the Inter-agency Task Force on Financing for Development in response to paragraph 48 of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda for adoption in the spirit of “Delivering as One”.</p> <p>UNECE will continue to promote its PPP work within the UN system, and in the context of the interagency task force.</p>			
2	<p><b>The private sector has a distinct performance advantage through its efficient and streamlined processes, maximizing the efficiency and thus bringing more ‘value for money’. The private sector is knowledgeable about PPPs, but less so about sustainable development and the SDGs. Especially the top management within the private companies started to become more aware of SDGs, not so the middle management. This niche can be considered by UNECE to become a broker between the public and the private sector.</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. UNECE works with the private sector (construction companies, consultants, lenders), especially through the PPP Business Advisory Board, which set up a special SDG task force with the aim of promoting the SDGs among the private sector. The PPP Business Advisory Board is a formal UNECE body set up by the Executive Committee (ECE/EX/2014/L.16) and is made up of 30 leading private sector PPP experts. This is an ongoing process, and UNECE will continue advocating with the private sector during its intergovernmental meetings and the PPP Forums to ensure that they are fully aware of the SDGs.</p>	<p>Cooperation and Partnerships Section</p>		<p>This recommendation was <b>implemented in May 2019</b> at the fourth International PPP Forum with awareness raising briefings for the private sector participants on the SDGs and how PPPs can contribute to their achievement.</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
3	<p><b>A central focus for ICoE should be on creating universal standards in PF-PPPs. Drafting guidelines and standards for PF-PPP should be done by the UN, not by the member States' governments nor by the private sector. For this, a mechanism of public consultations similar to public consultations for SDGs could be envisaged and should specifically involve non-state actors. After defining the guidelines and standards, a mechanism for legal adoption by member States' Parliaments should be created.</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. The PPP standards, guiding principles, declarations, best practices and recommendations developed by UNECE through its intergovernmental process have a very broad appeal beyond the UNECE region. One of the stages of the development of the standards is a very broad public consultation period of at least two months, where the secretariat proactively solicits comments and feedback from a variety of stakeholders – governments, private sector, NGOs, academia, IGOs. As per the mandate by the Commission, all these outputs are voluntary in nature and do not pose any obligations on the member States unless they decide to implement them in a variety of ways (e.g. through legislation, administrative instructions etc). A mechanism for legal adoption is presently outside the UNECE PPP mandate.</p>	<p>Cooperation and Partnerships Section</p>		<p>This recommendation was <b>implemented in March 2019</b>, with the adoption by the member States of three international PPP standards (roads, railway and renewable energy), the five People-first PPP outcomes and 10 guiding principles on People-first PPPs for the SDGs. These policy documents were the result of a collective effort by a variety of stakeholders (member States, private sector, NGOs, academia), and involved a robust public consultation process. As a result, the policy documents were endorsed by all stakeholders.</p>
		<p>As part of UNECE policy advisory services, the Working Party on PPPs engages on an ongoing basis with the member States who request the UNECE assistance to implement the PPP standards, guiding principles, declarations, best practices and recommendations. This includes giving them support in drafting legislation and administrative instructions for their effective implementation. In 2018 policy advisory missions were held in Belarus, Bulgaria, the Russian Federation and</p>			

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
		Ukraine.			
4	<p><b>In the context of the unstable humanitarian circumstances in parts of the world, refugee camps for regional or international displaced people have to be created rapidly, exerting increased pressure on local population and resources. In delivering public infrastructure and services in the camps, the private sector can be effective by delivering technical expertise and efficient cost management, thus making PPPs a potentially preferred approach. The knowledge transfer to relevant organizations could be realized within the overall inter-agency cooperation of the UN system. In this context, ICoE could generate and share knowledge on involving private sector in managing humanitarian situations.</b></p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. The UNECE does not have a mandate to prepare standards, recommendations and guiding principles for humanitarian situations. However, whenever standards or guidelines are designed on specific sectors, the UNECE gives careful considerations on how these could also have a positive impact on humanitarian situations. The private sector has provided many solutions in humanitarian situations, including in refugee camps, and as part of the UNECE campaign for 500 people-first PPP case studies, an energy project in a refugee camp in Ethiopia was showcased. One of the main infrastructure challenges in refugee camps is waste management and UNECE is working with a team of experts to develop guidelines on waste to energy projects, with a section dedicated to small waste to energy projects for refugee camps/rural communities.</p> <p>As explained above, the UNECE PPP secretariat is involved in the infrastructure work stream within the interagency task force on Financing for Development. It is however not involved at all in any interagency work related to humanitarian situations.</p> <p>The guidelines on PPPs in waste to</p>	Cooperation and Partnerships Section	December 2020	<p><b>In Progress</b></p> <p>The part of the recommendation related to humanitarian situations/refugee camps will be implemented in 2020 with the publication of the UNECE guide on PPPs in waste to energy, with a proposed solution for waste generated in refugee camps.</p>

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
		energy projects are under preparation and are expected to be finalised in 2019.			
6	In order to maximize the efficiency, the project management cost should be estimated and adjusted depending on the total project budget. In this case, the cost amounted to approximately 36 percent of the total project budget, a considerable level. However, for project management, staff personnel should be considered, as external consultants can cause fragmentation and diminish the institutional memory. In case staff would be too expensive compared to project size and budget, one person could manage several projects.	UNECE accepts this recommendation.  In the future, the Cooperation and Partnerships Section will ensure that temporary staff members provide management support to several XB projects.	Cooperation and Partnerships Section		<b>This recommendation was implemented in December 2019</b>  In September 2019, the section did a proper assessment for all future XB projects on the inclusion of a provision for temporary staff members to provide management support.
7	The project created and maintains a very well-designed web-site populated with reach content. A similar future project should consider hosting a more interactive information and knowledge exchange between the SCoEs (video conferences or scheduled meetings, either among the Centres or coordinated by the Secretariat through the WebEx platform). This interactive tool could also be used in public consultation stages. An	The first report to the Bureau of the Working Party on PPPs covering the period December 2017 to November 2018 will be published by March 2019.  The first meeting of the Specialist Centres of Excellence will take place in Beijing on 3-4 December 2018.	Cooperation and Partnerships Section		The recommendation was <b>implemented in March 2019</b> with the publication of the report of the meeting of the UNECE-affiliated International PPP Specialist Centres of Excellence ( <a href="#">ECE/CECI/2019/INF.9</a> ).

#	Recommendation	Management response	Responsibility	Target date/deadline	Date of implementation/comments
	Annual Report on PPPs (similar to Human Development Report) could be another effective tool to make PPPs better accepted and raise the visibility of UNECE.				