

**WORKSHOP ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE UNECE STRATEGY FOR EDUCATION
FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT FOR THE SUB-REGION OF EASTERN EUROPE,
CAUCASUS AND CENTRAL ASIA**

8-9 November 2006

Lomonosov Moscow State University, Moscow (Russian Federation)

Presentation by representative of Kyrgyzstan

Progress review on education for sustainable development in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan

1.2. Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD:

1.2.1. Is ESD reflected in any national policy document(s)?

At the present time, the ESD issues are reflected in some national strategic documents of Kyrgyzstan insufficiently. There are some concept documents where they are presented partially.

In particular, the issues of Education for Sustainable Development are reflected in the Concept of Continuous Environmental Education of Kyrgyzstan, adopted by decision of board of the Ministry of Education and Culture of KR on September 17th, 2003.

The need to promote ideas of environmental and safety and achieving of sustainability is reflected also in State doctrine of education of Kyrgyz Republic (adopted in August, 2002 by the Order of the President of Kyrgyz Republic), which establishes strategy and tactic of education up to 2025, being a basis for creation and normative and legal documents, program documents in this area and to be approved according to legislative order.

Certain level of priority of achieving sustainability issues is also reflected in the Concept of Education Development of Kyrgyz Republic up to 2010 (adopted in 2002). It contains the part on requirement of creation "...self-developing, effective education system, which would assist to the economic growth of Kyrgyzstan and sustainable development of the country in conditions of rapidly changing world¹".

In addition to that, different aspects of sustainability achieving and implementation of principles of Education for Sustainable Development are reflected in the National Action Plan on education for the Kyrgyz Republic, developed in the frameworks of Dakar Agreement, 2000 (adopted by the Government of Kyrgyz Republic on July 30th, 2002).

Issues of gender equality have particular place in national strategic documents of Kyrgyzstan. Kyrgyzstan has ratified five main conventions preventing discrimination of women and 2 facultative protocols:

1. Convention of International Labor Organization (#100) related to the equal conditions of labor remuneration of men and women;
2. Convention on liquidation of all forms of discrimination towards women;
3. Convention on political rights of women;

¹ Concept of education development of Kyrgyz Republic, 2002.

4. Convention on citizenship of married woman;
5. Convention of International Labor Organization (#103) on protection of maternity.

These international agreements serve as a base for implementation of gender problems as one of the most important components of ESD into educational programs. The law “On bases of state guarantees of gender equality provision” is adopted; that aspect is also reflected in "Complex Basis of Development" of the National strategy on poverty reduction, as well as National Action Plan on Achieving of Gender Equality for 2002-2006 is developed.

Following priorities, related to the education area are included into the frameworks of the action plan:

- To foresee gender component, special programs and classes in state standards of education
- To widen sphere of formal and informal services on gender problems, to make it closer to the schools in rural areas
- To develop system of gender education for state officials
- To increase functional competence of men and women through access to Internet and informational centers
- To prevent influent of religious and extremist ideas on youth through Mass Media
- To change traditional models of girls and boys' upbringing in order to form gender sensitivity
- To provide special seminars for mass media on gender issues and other.

Issues of preventive measures of drug usage and HIV/AIDS sickness rate play an important role in educational area of the republic. In this connection, these issues are reflected in the “National program “Kyrgyzstan zhashtary” on development of youth of Kyrgyzstan up to 2010 (the Order to the President of Kyrgyz Republic “On concept of development of state youth policy of Kyrgyz Republic up to 2010 and National program “Kyrgyzstan zhashtary” for 2006-2008 as of April 14th, 2006 OP #173). In addition to that, national program “Manas”, devoted to reform of health care sector in Kyrgyzstan has served as a basis for strengthening of the work in this direction.

In relation to the issues of environmental education, it is important to notice that they are partially reflected in the following national political documents:

- The law of KR “On education” on April 30th, 2003, # 92.
- The laws “On environmental protection” and “On environmental expertise” (1999).
- President education program “Staff of XXI century” (the Order of the President of KR on September 11th, 1995, # OP-218).
- Concept of transfer of KR to the sustainable development up to 2010 (August 2nd, 2002) - “the priority of education is recognized and the reform of education system is implemented in order to receive adequate knowledge in achieving harmony with nature”.
- “Evaluation of results achieved by Kyrgyz Republic towards sustainable development” – National Review to RIO+10 (Decree of the KR Government #74-r on August 2nd, 2002)
- Agenda 21 of Kyrgyz Republic – Program activity up to 2010 (approved by Government Decree on August 2nd, 2002).

The component of the document “Strategy E: Environmental education and public participation” is defined in the action plan and in the strategy on biodiversity conservation, where the following vectors of activity are specified:

- Development and support of permanent program on environmental education;
- To develop and to conduct public awareness campaign;
- To inform the community on lows related to BD;
- To stir the activity on revival of national traditions and culture related to biodiversity conservation;
- To provide support to national and international days of environment.

In 1991, the decree on general environmental education was included into the “Concept of environmental safety of Kyrgyz Republic”.

EE is not included into the program of Complex Basis of Development (COD) as a priority goal. (COD of Kyrgyz Republic up to 2010 is the long-term strategy, whose implementation will allow providing with systematic overcoming of present problems, dynamic development of the state and society in political, social and economic spheres.)

EE is included into the National Action Plan on Environmental Protection as one of the components, but not as the priority goal.

1.2.2 Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements; at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?

There is no special law on ESD in Kyrgyzstan, but the law “On environmental protection” on May 13th, 1999 has an article, devoted to one of the ESD components, i.e. article #48 “Environmental education and upbringing”.

The Concept of Continuous Environmental Education, developed by the group of experts of different educational levels and NGOs, was adopted on September 17th, 2003 by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Culture, decision of board of the MEC and the Order of Ministry of Environment and Emergency.

The Ministry of Education and Culture of KR has developed and approved the Program of top-priority measures on implementation of the Concept of continuous environmental education in Kyrgyz Republic (order # 961/1 on September 29th, 2003).

The Concept defines constructive principles and establishes new directions of environmental education development and it has to serve as a basis for definition of content of normative documents, i.e. core lines of state standard, educational programs and mandatory minimum of environmental education content, creation on its basis of educational and methodical complex, training of teachers and experts.

At the present time, the ESD is not included into national curricula and national standards. Consideration of ESD issues by the national system of education in accordance with ISQE has not been conducted yet.

1.2.3 Is non-formal and informal ESD address in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks? Are the issues of formal and informal ESD reflected in current national policy and/or legal documents (document) and operational activity?

No, ESD issues are not included in the focus of current national policy and operational activity of the government at the moment.

1.2.4 Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)

No, there is no special program on public awareness on ESD issues developed at the moment. Partially, the goal of public awareness on different aspects of ESD is implemented in the frameworks of the activity of international projects being implemented in Kyrgyzstan.

For instance, in the frameworks of the GEF/WB project “Biodiversity conservation of Western Tyan Shan” there was a significant amount of work conducted with community of buffer zones in reserved territories on issues of biodiversity conservation. In the frameworks of joint initiative of ecological organization “BIOM”, British NGO “Field Study Council” under support of “Darwin Initiative” foundation during 2002-2005 there was wide awareness campaign conducted for school teachers on new approaches in the sphere of environmental education for biodiversity conservation as well as capacity building in ESD sphere. As the result of this initiative was the creation of network of “Schools of Kyrgyzstan for biodiversity conservation and sustainable development”, consisting from representatives of different regions of Kyrgyzstan, promoting ideas and principles of ESD locally. NGO “NABU” conducts activity on information campaign for the society on problem of decreasing amounts of animals being listed in the “Red Book”; they conduct annual action named “Bird of the year”.

Awareness campaign component is implemented in the frameworks of GEF/UNDP project on climate, i.e. brochures are published, and there is an electronic network. The Ozone center and NGO “Bigl” play an important role in awareness campaign on ozone depletion problem.

UNESCO network of schools works on such ESD component as “Cultural diversity and world heritage”. Number of UNDP and Soros Foundation-Kyrgyzstan projects includes awareness campaigns on such ESD components, as gender, human rights, HIV/AIDS, conflict resolution, etc. International Foundation for Electoral Support (“IFES”) systematically organizes democracy summer camps for young people. Democracy topic and human rights is the focus of activity of the “PEAKS” program, which is actively working in schools of Kyrgyzstan.

1.2.5 Does a formal structure for interdepartmental co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government?

Yes, it does.

The Coordination Council of Education for Sustainable Development was created by the Government Decree KR #74, on February 11, 2005; it is advisory and consultative body, aiming to integrate principles of sustainable development into educational system of Kyrgyz Republic in the frameworks of Transfer of Concept of Kyrgyzstan to sustainable development up to 2010, as well as creation of national platform on ESD in the frameworks of UN initiatives on ESD.

At the moment, its structure is under consideration, it will definitely consist of heads and experts of the Ministry of Education, science and youth policy of KR, State Agency of Environment Protection, NGOs.

Minister of Education of Kyrgyz Republic is the Chairman of the Coordination Council. Structure of Coordination Council will be approved by the Government of Kyrgyz Republic.

Coordination Council will implement coordination of activities of ministries, state committees and administrative departments, local state administrations and local self-governance bodies on interaction with international and public organization in the frameworks of UN initiatives on ESD.

The Coordination Council functions are in accordance with legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Statement and the Council implements its activity on voluntary bases.

1.2.6 Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your government?

At the moment, in the frameworks of the Coordination Council activity there are some ways being identified on creation of such mechanism of multi-stakeholder cooperation. The Council consists of experts representing state organizations, non-governmental sector, scientists, and specialists working at different levels of education, possessing strong partnership, which significantly assist to promotion of ESD issues.

The Strategy of civil initiative in the sphere of Environmental Education for Sustainable Development, developed by NGOs of Kyrgyzstan in 2006 in the frameworks of the project “Recreation of Environmental Movement in Kyrgyzstan”, conducted by Milieukontakt-Oost Europa” is one of the approaches to creation of multi-stakeholder cooperation mechanism in ESD sphere. Preparation of the Strategy included stage of discussing content of the document with broad group of stakeholders, such as representatives of state structures, international agencies, mass media, school and IHE teachers, etc. Implementation of the Strategy intends to accomplish initiatives in the frameworks of multi stakeholder cooperation.

1.2.7 Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?

At the present time, public budget is not available specifically to support financially ESD process in Kyrgyzstan. These types of projects are mainly implemented by non-governmental organizations under support of international donors.

1.3. National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD

Is ESD part of SD policy(s) if such exist in your country?

“Agenda 21 for Kyrgyzstan” does not include ESD; however, environmental education as a component of ESD is introduced.

According to the Agenda 21, it is required to achieve the following:

- ✓ To reorient 30% of study programs to sustainable development in 2007.
- ✓ To increase coverage volume of electronic mass media to 30% on sustainable development issues by encouragement through grants and tax credits up to 2006.

The National Strategy of sustainable human development in Kyrgyz Republic (May 28th, 1997) declares that “it is required to gain a complex approach, covering improvement of legislation, optimization of environmental protection, improvement of information access, environmental upbringing and increase of citizens’ activity.

2.1. ESD key themes are addressed in formal education

2.1.1. Are key themes of SD addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

No. Currently, there is only a starting point of work on addressing key themes of SD in the curriculum and programs of study at various levels of formal education.

There is a number of higher educational institutions and schools of Kyrgyzstan implementing initiatives in that sphere through development of author's study programs and education modules on ESD, and their integration into existing study programs.

Certain significant premises were created due to activity of different international projects on integration following themes of SD into study programs, such as "Biological and landscape diversity", "Citizenship, democracy and/or management", "HIV/AIDS, drug abuse", "Healthy life style", "Cultural diversity" and "Climate change".

2.1.2. Are learning targets that support ESD (including skills, attitudes and values) addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education?

No. It is required to implement broad work on integration of educational strategies supporting ESD into curricula, study programs and standards at various levels of formal education.

Number of achievements in the sphere of capacity building of schools and higher educational institutions' teaches on utilizing and introduction of these educational strategies such as development of system and critical thinking; future oriented thinking; participation in democratic decision-making process; overcoming of risk and crisis; conflict resolution and other are achieved in the frameworks of the projects of "Soros Kyrgyzstan" Foundation, "PEAKS" programs, Youth program of Adenauer foundation and other.

Many teachers of higher educational institutions have had training of interactive methods of teaching and principles of student oriented learning during last recent years due to activities of different international projects, such as AIRECS, ACCELS, UNDP, USIA, USAID, TEMPUS/TASIS, UNESCO, UNICEF, CAREC, Peace Corp and other; however, the number of teachers have been trained is not that big in terms of country size. Many teaching disciplines are still taught in a form of traditional lecture resulting from that.

2.2. Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified

2.2.1. Is ESD addressed through:

- ***Existing subjects only? (Yes /No)***

At the moment, ESD issues are not integrated as components into existing subjects. There is clear need in modern time to analyze existing study programs of schools and education of higher institutions, as well as broad methodical work on manuals and methodical guides, exposing specific ways of including ESD key themes into existing subjects of natural and humanitarian cycle. It is also required to implement awareness campaigns for schools and institutions of higher education teachers on needs of including ESD issues into existing programs.

- *A cross-curriculum approach? (Yes /No)*

Cross-curriculum approach in ESD sphere is under stage of development at the moment in Kyrgyzstan. Indeed, that issue is perspective to introduce ESD issues in Kyrgyzstan. It is required to develop capacity of teachers on introduction of cross-curriculum approach in implementation of study programs on ecology and SD, as well as strengthening of methodical base of educational institutions in that sphere, i.e. publishing of author's programs, dissemination of best practices on introduction of cross-curriculum approach in ESD sphere.

- *The provision of specific subject programmes and courses? (Yes /No.)*

Kyrgyz Russian Slavonic University approbates following new disciplines, such as "Sustainable development and ecological and economical systems" for students majoring on economics, and "Basics and sustainable nature resources use" for students majoring in jurisprudence.

- *A stand-alone project? (Yes /No.)*

As it previously mentioned, the initiatives in that area are at the starting point right now. Following project could serve as role modules, i.e. joint project of environmental movement "BIOM" and British NGO "Field Study Council" under support of "Darwin Initiative" on development and introduction of education module in 3 institutions of higher education in Kyrgyzstan.

2.3. A whole institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted

2.3.1. *Do educational institutions adopt a "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD?*

At the present time, educational institutions do not adopt "whole institutional approach" to SD/ESD. The reason for that is the fact that representatives of administration of schools and institutions of higher education, as well as teachers and professors of main part of educational institutions are not informed on goals and aims of UNECE Strategy on ESD, and priorities of Kyrgyzstan on implementation of the Strategy.

Currently, there are some initiatives in that sphere have been made in the Republic. For instance, in 2005, resulting from participation of Kyrgyz delegation in the High-Level Meeting of UNECE Ministers of Environment and Education (Vilnius, Lithuania, March, 2005) the State Agency of Environment and Forestry under KR Government in cooperation with the Ministry of Education, Science and Youth policy of KR and NGO "BIOM" has conducted a broad awareness campaign on ESD issues for schools and institutions of higher education of Kyrgyzstan. Awareness campaign on promotion of ESD issues in regional institutions of higher education has been implemented since 2005.

2.3.2. *Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD"?*

There are no incentives that support "a whole institutional approach to SD/ESD" at the moment.

2.3.3. *Do institutions/learners develop their own SD indicators for their institution/organization?*

There is a number of initiatives existing now related to development of indicators of sustainable development for local communities. The "Green Agenda in Kyrgyzstan" project supported by international organization "Milieukontakt Oost-Europa" devoted to development of local action plans on environmental protection in local communities (Tuz village, Sverdlov district, Bishkek, etc.) is a great example of it. Till the

moment Concept of transfer of Kyrgyzstan's capital (Bishkek) to sustainable development in 2010 and local "Agenda 21 for Bishkek have been developed.

Approaches on creation of indicators of sustainable development and local agendas have been developed in the frameworks of "BIOM's" project named "School of Sustainable Development".

2.4 ESD is addressed by quality assessment / enhancement systems

2.4.1 Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that include criteria on ESD in:

(a) National systems

(b) Other

Currently education quality assessment systems/enhancement systems do not include criteria on ESD; and they are not represented in the state standards of education in KR. Nevertheless, frameworks of development of the National Strategy on ESD include introduction of ESD criteria in quality assessment/enhancement systems and submission of ESD aspects into state standards of education in KR.

3.1 ESD is included in the training of educators

3.1.1 Is ESD a part of the initial educators' training?

Initial educators' training include a number of ESD issues, consisting from its components, such as "Environmental principles", "Climate change", "Biodiversity", "Nature resources management", "Health of population and environment" and other.

In addition to that, it is required to strengthen activity of introduction complex of ESD issues into in-service training program for teachers, and providing training for them on new educational technologies on ESD.

3.1.2 Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training?

State system of educators' in-service training does not include ESD, however, different international and international agencies include components devoted to awareness campaign and education through trainings, round tables, conferences and other, when teachers are provided with in service training on ESD or its separate components.

3.2.3 Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?

Head and representatives of administration of educational institutions in Kyrgyzstan have an opportunity to raise qualification level in Kyrgyz Academy of Education, but in most of the cases, these programs do not include a complex of ESD issues, but some ESD components only. Since 2005, there were some projects initiated by NGO, enlightening ways and perspectives of introduction of institutional approach to ESD in educational institutions.

In addition to that, the State Agency on environment protection and forestry under Government of Kyrgyz Republic conducts annual in-service trainings for educators; in-service training program include

lectures on UNECE Strategy on ESD, Vilnius frameworks of implementation, assessment of potential of the country, etc.

4.1 Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced

4.1.1 Does a national strategy/ mechanism for encouragement of development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?

At the moment, the Expert Council of revision of textbooks, study programs and manuals under the Ministry of Education, Science and Youth Policy of KR, Academic Council of Kyrgyz Academy of Education periodically considers and recommends for publishing of different **learning methods and materials** on some ESD issues. There is no possibility to publish recommended materials due to strict limits of financial resources. Nevertheless, learning and methodical materials are published in the Republic on regular bases due to activity of international projects and non-governmental organizations. For instance, the following teaching and methodical materials on ecology for work with children (mainly, with the kids of pre-school age), such as: manual for teachers “School of sustainable development”, “In workshop “Ecology” subject”, “Domestic ecology” (EM “BIOM”), “Zhalpy Ecologia” (by Kulnazarov B.), textbook for 9th grade “Basics of ecological knowledge” (by Suynbaev M., Romanovskiy V., Mamytova A.), “Ecology in School”, “About ozone layer for teachers”, “About persistent organic pollutants for teachers” (by Fomina T.V.), “Sustainable development of ecological and economical systems” (by Fomina T.V.), “Climate and Environment” (edited by Rodina E.M.), “Theoretical, methodological and applied aspects of sustainable development (on examples of CA and Kyrgyzstan)” (by Rodina E.M.).

Published manuals recommended by the Kyrgyz Academy of Education:

1. Osmonov A. Basics of geo-ecology: text book for 11 grade of high school. – Bishkek, 1999.
2. Postnova E.A., Korotenko V.A., Domashov I.A. “In a workshop of “ecology” subject”, teachers’ manual. Edited by V.A. Korotenko. – B. 2003.

Multimedia resources on different ESD aspects, such as CD, DVD, video and etc. are being developed, and replicated in addition to the textbooks.

In most of the cases, there is lack of published materials on ESD issues to cover all of the educational institutions of the Republic.

4.1.2 Is public (national, sub-national, local) authority money invested in this activity?

There is a lack on amounts of allocated state funds for provision of educational institutions with required quantity of textbooks and manuals on different ESD aspects. Republican Environmental Foundation works under the State Agency of environment protection and forestry under Government of Kyrgyz Republic, possessing a budget item for environmental education for publishing of manuals on environmental education and some ESD aspects.

Duishenova Jyldyz, Chief Specialist,
National focal point of ESD in Kyrgyz Republic,
State Agency of Environmental Protection
and Forestry under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic

Postnova Ewgeniya
Coordinator of ESD Programmes
Ecological Movement “BIOM”