



При финансовой поддержке  
Европейского Союза



UNECE



Полноправные люди.  
Устойчивые страны.

ОБСЕ

Организация по безопасности и  
сотрудничеству в Европе  
Офис программ в Астане

## **Final Round Table**

# **Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the UNECE Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment**

14 November 2018  
Astana, Kazakhstan



## **Final Round Table Report**

November 2018

## Table of Content

1. Background information.....	3
1.1. SEA and EIA in Kazakhstan .....	3
1.2. Review and revision of the existing SEA and EIA legislation and procedures.....	4
1.3. SEA of the Concept for development of fuel and energy complex of Kazakhstan until 2030.....	4
2. Final Round Table «Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the UNECE Espoo Convention its Protocol on SEA» .....	1
2.1 Objective of the round table meeting .....	1
2.2. Round table meeting design .....	1
2.3 Outcomes.....	2
2.4 Participants.....	2
2.5 Key international consultants and national experts .....	2
3. Round Table summary .....	3
4. Way forward.....	7
5. Evaluation.....	7
Annex 1 .....	9
Annex 2 .....	12
Annex 3 .....	22

# **1. Background information**

## **1.1. SEA and EIA in Kazakhstan**

The Republic of Kazakhstan, as a Party to the UNECE Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context (Espoo Convention) since 2001, targets to introduce internationally sound institutional and legislative frameworks on environmental impact assessment (EIA) and strategic environmental assessment (SEA). Efficient implementation of the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA in the country is seen as a valuable contribution to the on-going "green" economic reforms.

Under the on-going "green" economy reforms in Kazakhstan and, specifically, recently held international specialized exhibition "Expo-2017: Future energy" in Astana, the SEA concept in the country is currently considered as an instrument to identify the most sustainable and cost-effective strategic development alternatives for green economic growth on the way towards new foreign investments and improved environmental situation in the country and the human health. It is considered as a tool, which will help to strengthen the country's environmental governance through fostering transparency and consultation with relevant stakeholders and the public prior to the approval of policies, plans and programmes. In addition, the SEA in a transboundary context within the country is suggested to be employed to promote regional cooperation on environmental matters in the Central Asian region.

In this process the UNECE has been assisting Kazakhstan in the development of legislation and through support to practical steps towards the integration of SEA procedures in its planning and programming processes. Thus, the 2017-2020 workplan of the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA envisages technical advice to Kazakhstan on improving legislation to implement the Protocol and the Convention. It is built on official letter of request of the Ministry of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Ministry) as of 30 March and 12 December 2017 that addressed the UNECE Secretariat to help initiate a legislative drafting process to assist Kazakhstan in amending its national legislation for the establishment of the national SEA scheme in line with the Protocol on SEA and comprehensive revision of the national EIA scheme in accordance with the Espoo Convention.

In 2017 the Ministry took a decision to revise the Concept for development of fuel and energy complex of Kazakhstan until 2030 (Concept) that was developed back in 2014. To help the process the Ministry established the Working Group under its auspices, comprising from different Ministry's departments with an expertise in the energy field and private energy sector representatives. Following the country's strategic priority to shift to "green" economy path the Ministry in the official request as of 12 September 2017 addressed the UNECE to undertake the SEA of the Concept and, therefore, confirmed its readiness to promote "green" economy reform in the energy sector.

The assistance is carried out by the means of technical advice under the UNDP/UNECE/EC project on "Supporting Kazakhstan's Transition to a Green Economy Model" in several phases. During the inception phase the project allowed to assess the environmental impact assessment and strategic environmental assessment provisions in the existing national legislation vis-à-vis the Convention and the Protocol. The results of the assessment outlined that the national legislation and regulations contain elements of SEA and transboundary EIA procedures. However, to fully comply with the provisions of the Protocol on SEA and the Espoo Convention some changes and amendments to the current national legislation are needed.

## **1.2. Review and revision of the existing SEA and EIA legislation and procedures**

The SEA and EIA legal drafting activities are important elements of the project, aiming at national legislative enhancement with a focus on SEA and EIA in line with the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA. The activities envisage the preparation of amendments to the Environmental Code of Kazakhstan, relevant laws and as required develop draft secondary legislation with a focus on EIA and SEA. The revision of national regulatory and legislative frameworks with regard to transboundary EIA and SEA is also seen as an efficient tool for identifying the bottlenecks and bridging existing gaps. All in all, efficient introduction of the SEA and EIA elements in the legislative framework of Kazakhstan in full compliance with the legally binding instruments will help to secure the approach for effective protection of environment and human health and help prevent irreversible environmental consequences at the initial stage of strategic policy/program planning.

The Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan has a central role in conducting the development of amendments through its national SEA and EIA working group, which is responsible for providing required inputs and participating in the analysis. The working group was established in January 2018, comprising from the representatives of the Ministry and other state agencies to amend the Environmental Code of Kazakhstan.

The Ministry's drafting group under the above was invited to:

- (a) actively participate in the legal drafting process and all other SEA/EIA planned events;
- (b) guide the national and international experts in developing proposals for amending the legislation;
- (c) prepare necessary regulations; and provide written inputs and comments to the draft proposals.

## **1.3. SEA of the Concept for development of fuel and energy complex of Kazakhstan until 2030**

The second component of the UNECE component under the UNDP/UNECE/EC project on "Supporting Kazakhstan's Transition to a Green Economy Model" stands for introduction of a pilot application of the SEA procedure to Concept for development of fuel and energy complex until 2030 (SEA pilot). The Concept for development of fuel and energy complex until 2030 is recently being revised by the working group of the Ministry of Energy.

Subsequently, the SEA pilot project targets to test practical application of the SEA procedure in line with the Protocol on SEA and to demonstrate benefits and opportunities the SEA provides for environmental optimisation of the Concept for development of fuel and energy complex until 2030 (Concept). Main activities within the SEA pilot include:

- preparation of the scoping and SEA reports including all relevant analyses;
- organizing consultations with relevant stakeholders;
- communication with the Ministry and experts responsible for the amending the Concept.

The SEA pilot project was launched on 8 November 2017 in Astana at the two-day initial working meeting with participation of line ministries, team of international and national experts to demonstrate the application of international SEA principles. The national SEA team was established back in November 2017, which together with the UNECE international consultants carried out the SEA steps in line with the Protocol on SEA. Close co-ordination of the SEA process with the Ministry's Working Group on the Concept's amendment is a main prerequisite of success of pilot project activities.

During the period of November 2017 till November 2018 the national SEA team under the guidance of the UNECE consultants and in close collaboration with the Ministry underwent necessary stages of SEA procedure for the Concept revision and as result came up with the scoping and the SEA reports that contain valuable recommendations for the environmental optimization of the Concept.

## **2. Final Round Table «Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the UNECE Espoo Convention its Protocol on SEA»**

The final Round Table «Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the UNECE Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment» (Round table) took place on 14 November 2018 in Astana. The event was organized by the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan in close cooperation and consultation with the UNECE to present the substantial results and conclusions of the SEA and EIA legal drafting and the SEA pilot activities.

The round table was designed to present SEA and EIA international best practices and facilitate wider discussions under the recently developed SEA and EIA amendments to the Environmental Code of Kazakhstan, relevant sectoral legislation and the SEA by-laws. The agenda also accommodated the presentation of the SEA report with specific recommendations for the revision of the Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan for development of fuel and energy complex until 2030.

Theory was combined with the best practice presentations, specific suggestions for the improved environmental assessment framework in Kazakhstan and recommendations for environmental optimization of the fuel and energy complex. International consultants led the discussions and contributed significantly to the elaboration of specific recommendations and follow up steps for Kazakhstan.

The round table addressed some 80 members of the Ministries' working groups on the development of the national environmental legislation and Concept revision, responsible for the strategic planning and the EIA procedures, other line Ministries, namely, the Ministries of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Health Protection, Agriculture and Justice, international consultants and national experts, academia, private and non-governmental organizations. Participation of counterparts from Uzbekistan was ensured to secure the consideration of transboundary aspects and opportunities the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA offer.

**For more information, please visit:**

<http://www.unece.org/environmental-policy/conventions/water/areas-of-work-of-the-convention/envwatercentralasia/supporting-kazakhstans-transition-towards-green-economy-model.html>

<https://www.unece.org/info/media/presscurrent-press-h/environment/2018/kazakhstan-presents-draft-legislation-aligned-with-unece-environmental-impact-assessment-and-strategic-environmental-assessment-legal-instruments/doc.html>

### **2.1 Objective of the round table meeting**

The rationale of the round table was to support the SEA and EIA reforms in Kazakhstan based on available best practices in line with international standards and by employing the UNECE expert advice.

### **2.2. Round table meeting design**

The activity was designed to:

- present challenges and opportunities associated with the UNECE Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA implementation in the countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia;

- share the information on the SEA and EIA legislative reforms in Central and Eastern Europe countries with specific focus to Georgia and Ukraine;
- provide the overview of the legislative reform of SEA and EIA in Kazakhstan in light of the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA;
- present main findings, recommendations and conclusion of the SEA pilot: the key issues and significant environmental, including health, effects which are likely to occur further to the Concept implementation;
- identify possible follow ups in support to the on-going environmental assessment reforms.

## **2.3 Outcomes**

The round table resulted in three major outcomes:

- a) clear understanding of all participants about the scope and the content of the proposed SEA and EIA draft amendments to the Environmental Code, sectoral and secondary legislation of Kazakhstan;
- b) recommendations aiming at finalization of the SEA report key conclusions under the SEA pilot;
- c) suggestions for the SEA and EIA follow ups.

## **2.4 Participants**

Out of 80 participants 32 (40%) were represented by men and 48 (60%) – by women. 14 (17.5%) were from the national authorities, 21 (26.3%) – from associations and enterprises, 8 (10%) – from international organizations, 25 (31.2%) – from non-governmental organizations and 12 (15%) were represented by the pilot project international consultants and national experts (please, refer to Annex 2).

## **2.5 Key international consultants and national experts**

Mr. Jerzy Jendroska, key international expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting, Ms. Elena Laevskaya, international expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting and Ms. Leial Makhmetova, national expert on SEA and EIA legal drafting were the main source of expertise in the field of environmental assessment legal drafting.

Ms. Maryna Shimkus, Head of the EIA Unit Department of State Ecological Expertise and Auditing, Monitoring and Technical Regulations, Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine and Mr. Giga Gigashvili, Head of the Municipal service for Environment Protection, Tbilisi City Hall were invited on this special occasion to share the experience and lessons learnt with the Kazakhstani audiotoria.

The SEA pilot application was facilitated by Mr. Martin Smutny and Ms. Marina Khotuleva, international SEA consultants in close partnership with the SEA national team, comprising from six national experts in fields of strategic planning, energy, EIA, biodiversity, climate change, waste management and health protection.

The enlisted experts were the main source of expertise and, thus, acted as key speakers at the round table.

### 3. Round Table summary

The final round table was opened by Mr. Sabit Nurlybai, Vice Minister of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan by stressing the importance of the modern environmental assessment tools for sustainable economic development with environmental concerns. The Vice-Minister expressed appreciation for the expert and donor assistance provided and called on for further reform in this sector to sustain the achieved results and ensure efficient transboundary co-operation in line with the provisions of the Espoo Convention and the Protocol on SEA. The experience of Kazakhstan in this regard was named as pioneering best practice in the Central Asian region that and crucial for the success of other Central Asian countries on their ways towards “green” economy.

Mr. Victor Badaker, Economic Affairs Officer, Sustainable Energy Division, UNECE Secretariat underlined in his speech the role and benefits of the UNECE Espoo Convention and the Protocol on SEA for Kazakhstan that is a Party to the Espoo Convention and is currently considering to join the Protocol on SEA. Mr. Badaker expressed thanks to the co-organizers of the SEA and EIA pilot activities and to experts for their contribution in delivery of tailor-made outcomes.

Ambassador György Szabó, Head of the OSCE Programme Office in Astana welcomed the initiative of the Government of Kazakhstan, targeting to align its environmental assessment procedure and framework with international standards and expressed the readiness of the OSCE Office to support further reform in this sector if the need would be. Ambassador also stressed the valuable role of the modern SEA and EIA procedures for better strategic planning, good environmental governance, transparent and efficient decision-making.

While Ms. Snejana Popova, Project Officer, EU Delegation to Kazakhstan praised the work done and, *inter alia*, stressed the need of efficient environmental governance in the EC and partner-countries, in which modern SEA and EIA procedures have important role to play in the sustainable economic development.



*Picture 1. Mr. Sabit Nurlybai, Vice Minister of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan greets the participants of the final round table*

The workshop was moderated by Ms. Madina Ibrasheva, SEA and EIA pilot project Team Leader, who presented an agenda and introduced the SEA/EIA legal drafting international consultants and national expert.

Mr. Jerzy Jendrośka, key international consultant on EIA and SEA legal drafting opened the first session by presenting an overview of international standards of environmental assessment and implementation challenges in the countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia. In this

regard Mr. Jendroška spoke about the role of environmental assessment procedural steps with a reference to the international law, presented the SEA and EIA procedures as guided by and stipulated in the Concept of EIA Directive, the UNECE Espoo Convention and the Protocol on SEA. The key international consultant also paid attention to the deficiencies of the State Ecological Expertiza systems in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia, associated gaps, needs and challenges related to aligning the national legislations with international standards.

Ms. Maryna Shimkus, Head of the EIA Unit Department of State Ecological Expertise and Auditing, Monitoring and Technical Regulations, Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine was invited to present the experience of Ukraine in reforming the national environmental assessment system in line with the provisions of the Espoo Convention. Ms. Shimkus touched upon technical practicalities of the EIA stages in Ukraine by stressing the fact that the new EIA system functions within a moderate one-year time-frame. Nevertheless, the reform is seen as a success, mainly due to several innovations that were introduced to help enhance public participation in the decision-making and, thus, minimize corruption risks and promote transparent and accountable national authorities. In this regard, the establishment of Single EIA Register was mentioned as crucial to simplify the EIA procedure and increase the access to the EIA documentation. At the end Ms. Shimkus - based on Ukrainian lessons learnt - stressed the need to pay utmost attention to the institutional capacity building on the way to the modern EIA system, that, *inter alia*, should envisage the availability of enlarged skilled staff for effectively handling the EIA procedures.



Picture 2. Ms. Maryna Shimkus speaks about the SEA and EIA reform in Ukraine

In the next session Mr. Giga Gigashvilli, Head of the Municipal service for Environment Protection, Tbilisi City Hall took the floor to present the step forward from deficient old environmental assessment regulations to modern SEA and EIA systems in Georgia. The presentation mainly focused on procedural SEA and EIA elements, benefits, challenges and solutions. Mr. Gigashvilli drew auditoria's attention to the fact of increased demand in additional human recourses; further capacity building of local authorities responsible for strategic planning and EIA implementation after the new Environmental Code of Georgia with the new elements of SEA and EIA procedures was enacted. Moreover, elaboration of sector specific guidelines for efficient EIA/SEA practice and introduction of mandatory certification system for consulting companies were enlisted as priority areas of involvement in Georgia at present.

International standards for national EIA systems and transboundary procedure as set out in the Espoo Convention, the EIA legislative reforms in Central and Eastern Europe countries were the topic of the next session, led by Mr. Jerzy Jendroška. The presentation mainly covered the key mandatory requirements for the EIA national scheme in which the details of public participation are clearly regulated in line with the Aarhus Convention while the details of transboundary procedure are clearly stipulated by the provisions of with Espoo Convention. The speaker among

other issues stressed the fact that developer is responsible for the preparation of reports, but not for public participation to avoid the conflict of interest. Key practical features of the EIA system in the EU countries were enlisted and specific details were provided for the environmental assessment system in Poland. Furthermore, the scoping in some EU countries was named as non-mandatory and is done upon the request. The differences between the State Ecological Expertiza and modern EIA procedure were indicated to participants' attention to highlight the gaps and needs for Kazakhstan.

Ms. Leila Makhmetova, national expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting in continuation to international legal standards presentation shared the information on the proposals for the new Environmental Code of Kazakhstan (EnvCode), titled as Chapter on EIA procedure and the Chapter on EIA in transboundary context that were designed in full compliance with the provisions of the Espoo Convention. The proposals, among other topics covered the explanations related to activities of the 1<sup>st</sup> and the 2<sup>nd</sup> categories and requirements for screening. Ms. Makhmetova also touched upon the procedural elements of the EIA in transboundary context for Kazakhstan as a Party of origin and affected Party.

The session was finalized with the request for clarification by the representatives of the Ministry and civil society organization with respect to the EIA procedure for the final decision-making by the competent authorities and with the focus to the difference between the old-style categories of projects and the new ones that are proposed by the experts in line with the Espoo Convention.

Another topic for discussion related to the provisions and requirements of the UNECE Protocol on SEA and the SEA legislative reforms in Central and Eastern Europe countries by Ms. Elena Laevskaya, international expert on SEA and EIA legal drafting. Ms. Laevskaya addressed the audience with detailed explanations on the SEA concept, its role in decision-making in mitigating the impact on environment and human health, the planning documents that are subject to SEA according to the Protocol on SEA, stages of SEA, the rationale of screening, the role of environmental and health authorities, public participation in the SEA decision-making, involved parties of the SEA procedure and etc. The topics of due monitoring and transboundary procedures under the SEA were stipulated as important elements of SEA procedure to ensure environmental and health protection in the long-run at the strategic level including in transboundary context.

During the presentations Ms. Laevskaya also underlined the political and procedural differences between the SEA and the EIA and stressed that SEA is an efficient instrument of "green" economy and, thus, will contribute to efficient decision-making if implemented correctly.

Ms. Leila Makhmetova continued the presentation by presenting proposals for the national legislation of Kazakhstan in light of the Protocol on SEA. Speaking precisely, Ms. Makhmetova presented the new Chapter on SEA of the EnvCode and, therefore, talked about the strategic programmes that as subject to screening and SEA, as well as about the scoping stage and the elements of the SEA report preparation. Additionally, Ms. Makhmetova presented five sub-laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan that were aligned accordingly with the requirements of the Protocol on SEA.

The presentations were well received by the participants, while the issue of public participation attracted greater attention with a request to introduce specific mechanisms of enforced public participation at the legislative level. In this regard Ms. Laura Malikova, Association of Practicing Ecologists referred to the fact that at present there is insufficient public involvement and participation in the EIA consultations, thus, Mr. Malikova suggested to introduce appropriate relevant changes in the Labour Code of Kazakhstan.

In response Ms. Makhmetova informed the auditoria about the proposed mechanism on wider notification and consultations of affected population and interested stakeholders as described in the proposed SEA Chapter of the new EnvCode. Ms. Laevskaya added that the proposed

amendments are draft and subject to change until the new version of the EnvCode is approved. Ms. Laevskaya stressed that so far there is none of countries, which amended the national Labour Code in order to enforce public involvement in the EIA procedure. In that sense according to expert it might be redundant, instead the instrument of enhanced awareness raising instrument was proposed to bridge the gap.

Another question was raised by Ms. Shynar Izteleova, Zhayik-Caspian Aarhus Centre, who inquired additional information on transboundary EIA procedure and the national plan/strategy on the SEA introduction in Kazakhstan. In the absence of any specific plan for the latter the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan abstained from the intervention.



*Picture 3. Participants from various sectors at the final round table*

The next session covered the introduction to the SEA pilot of the Concept for Development of Fuel and Energy Complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030. Mr. Martin Smutny consultant to UNECE underlined in this regard the objectives, approach and procedure of the SEA pilot project. Mr. Smutny informed that the SEA was delivered for the Concept that is currently under revision by the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan through 2019 and is done based on the current version of the Concept. The consultant highlighted that due to soon pilot project completion the SEA of the Concept, unfortunately, can't be delivered in full compliance with the Protocol on SEA.

In the next session Mr. Rashid Korzhaspayev, Green Economy Department of the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan briefly presented the role, planning process and further steps of the Concept for Development of Fuel and Energy Complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030.

In the course of discussions Ms. Madina Ibrasheva presented the GIS maps, produced under the pilot project with respect to fuel and energy sector implications for biodiversity, water and air resources and health. Ms. Ibrasheva informed that the maps were exhibited at the conference hall and are available electronically in open access at the Ministry's web-site.

The next session was held by SEA national team, namely by the national consultants in the areas of strategic planning, EIA, biodiversity, energy security and health protection through a joint presentation on the SEA pilot findings and results. The experts presented key issues and significant environmental, including health, effects which are likely to occur in the course of Concept implementation, namely the implications of electricity, gas and coal mining industries, uranium mining, renewable energy and waste for air, water and land resources, biodiversity and human health that can also lead to aggravated climate change threats.

Key SEA recommendations were presented by Ms. Marina Khotuleva, consultant to UNECE and Mr. Nurzhan Begalin, key policy analysis expert, which ranged the elaborated recommendations into several groups: a) preliminary recommendations (identified under the scoping stage); b) recommendations to the attention of the Ministry's working group on Concept revision; c) recommendations for further strategic planning; d) recommendations for project-level activities and mitigation measures.

Ms. Khotuleva underlined the importance of policy analysis of the Concept and identification of trends and possible consequences that may result in the course of Concept implementation to help formulate mitigation measures. This analysis was done by the group of SEA experts in the SEA report along with the proposals for monitoring procedure and indicators. On the other hand, the speaker noted the absence of specific goal of the Concept and the monitoring element. That said, Ms. Khotulova expressed a hope that elaborated recommendations will be taken in due account by the planning agency to secure efficient and environmentally balanced fuel and energy complex development.

Mr. Begalin drew participants' attention to the fuel and energy complex development scenarios, which seem to be attractive from the point of environment and health protection, namely "Combined" and "Optimistic" scenarios out of identified four. Both scenarios according to expert target to actively introduce renewable and alternative energy sources, increase the role of gas in domestic energy consumption, etc. Mr. Begalin briefly summarized key SEA recommendations for the attention of auditoria that are presented in the SEA report.

The moderator addressed the participants with the request to submit any further comments regarding the environmental optimization of the Concept in written form to the attention of the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan.

The final round table was finalized with a wrap-up session, during which the co-organizers of the SEA and EIA pilot project in Kazakhstan positively assessed the results of the project and emphasized the importance of continuing the finalization of the SEA of the Concept and further SEA and EIA institutional and legal capacity building in Kazakhstan. The Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan called upon the donor organizations to support further dialogue and co-operation under the discussed agenda.

## **4. Way forward**

The SEA and EIA pilot project activities in Kazakhstan will be completed on 30 November 2018. Despite the soon project closure the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan expressed a readiness to continue the reform once the donor assistance is provided.

To support the initiative the OSCE Programme Office in Astana expressed a readiness to sponsor the amendment of secondary legislation of Kazakhstan in line with the provisions of the Espoo Convention. The work will be launched in December 2018 and continued through 2019 with a series of training workshops and public hearings in the Parliament of Kazakhstan.

Other donor organizations are currently in process of considering the sponsorship of the SEA and EIA follow up activities.

## **5. Evaluation**

The evaluation analysis was carried out based on evaluation form (See Annex 3 to this report) completed by participants at the end of the round table. In total, 26 forms have been filled out.

The summary of evaluation analysis:

***Evaluation question 1: Please indicate how important and relevant the topics of the round table are for you.***

Average scoring: 4

12 (46,2%) participants replied that presented topics and undertaken discussions are of high importance, 13 (50,0%) – important and 1 (3.8 %) – not important.

***Evaluation question 2: Please indicate how clear and understandable the information was for you.***

Average scoring: 4

6 (23,1%) participants replied that presented topics and undertaken discussions are of high importance, 20 (76,9%) – important and none – not important.

***Evaluation question 3: What speeches and topic(s) of the were most useful in your opinion?***

Average scoring: 5

Most of respondents indicated that delivered speeches and presented topics were useful. The following themes were highlighted of greater interest:

- Experience of Georgia and Ukraine in reforming the national environmental assessment systems;
- Proposals with respect to amendment of the legislation of Kazakhstan in line with the Espoo Convention and Protocol on SEA;
- Presentations on the likely main impacts related to the Concept and elaborated recommendations.

***Evaluation question 4: Do you see practical application of the knowledge obtained useful for yourself? If yes, in which area?***

Average scoring: 4

7 (26,9%) respondents indicated that the obtained knowledge is very useful, 19 (73,1%) – useful, none- not useful.

***Evaluation question 5: Please rate the organizational aspects of round table?***

Average scoring: 4.5

12 (46,2%) - excellent, 8 (30 %) – good, none- bad.

Thus, the following conclusions are drawn based on the scoring and provided written feedback:

1. The final Round table was organized and implemented well enough;
2. The program was developed in a way that the most relevant and necessary information was included and covered the topics of auditoria's interest. Nevertheless, the topics raised might be still new and, thus, require additional awareness raising activities in the future;
3. Targeted auditory was represented by wide range stakeholders;
4. Presented information by international and national consultants was very specific and probably not 100% clear enough due to new terminology and fuel and energy complex related technical aspects.



При финансовой поддержке  
Европейского Союза



Организация по безопасности и  
сотрудничеству в Европе  
Офис программ в Астане



UNECE



Empowered lives.  
Resilient nations.

## Agenda

### Final Round Table

#### **Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the UNECE Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment**

**9:00-09:30** Registration of participants

**Video on the UNECE Protocol on SEA**

**9:30-09:50** Opening remarks

*Mr. Sabit Nurlybai*, Vice Minister of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan

*Mr. Victor Badaker*, Economic Affairs Officer, Sustainable Energy Division, UNECE Secretariat

*Ambassador György Szabó*, Head of the OSCE Programme Office in Astana

*Ms. Snejana Popova*, Project Officer, EU Delegation to Kazakhstan

**Moderator:** *Ms. Madina Ibrasheva*, UNECE Team Leader, SEA and EIA pilot project in Kazakhstan

**09:50–11:20** **Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment and other international standards of environmental assessment. Challenges of their implementation in the countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia**

*Mr. Jerzy Jendroška*, key international expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting

**Experience of Ukraine in reforming the national environmental assessment system**

*Ms. Maryna Shimkus*, Head of the EIA Unit Department of State Ecological Expertise and Auditing, Monitoring and Technical Regulations, Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine

## **Experience of Georgia in reforming the national environmental assessment system**

*Mr. Giga Gigashvili*, Head of the Municipal service for Environment Protection, Tbilisi City Hall

### **11:20-11:30 Overview of the project „Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA”: Project implementation stages and lessons learnt**

*Ms. Madina Ibrasheva*, UNECE Team Leader, SEA and EIA pilot project in Kazakhstan

### **11:30 -12:40 International standards for national EIA systems and transboundary procedure as set out in the Espoo Convention, the EIA legislative reforms in Central and Eastern Europe countries**

*Mr. Jerzy Jendrośka*, key international expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting

#### **Overview of the legislative reform of EIA in Kazakhstan in light of the Espoo Convention:**

- Chapter of the Environmental Code on "Environmental Impact Assessment";
- Chapter of the Environmental Code on "Environmental impact Assessment in a transboundary context".

*Ms. Leila Makhmetova*, national expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting

#### **Questions and answers**

### **12:40–13:00 Provisions and requirements of the UNECE Protocol on SEA, the SEA legislative reforms in Central and Eastern Europe countries**

*Ms. Elena Laevskaya*, international expert on SEA and EIA legal drafting

### **13.00-14.00 Lunch**

### **14:00–14:30 Overview of the legislative reform related to development of SEA system in Kazakhstan in light of the Protocol on SEA:**

- Chapter of Environmental Code on "Strategic Environmental Assessment"
- The law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Strategic Environmental Assessment"
- Proposals for secondary legislation

*Ms. Leila Makhmetova*, national expert on EIA and SEA legal drafting

#### **Questions and discussion**

### **14:30-14:50 Introduction to SEA pilot of the Concept for Development of Fuel and Energy Complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030: objectives, approach and procedure.**

*Mr. Martin Smutny*, consultant to UNECE  
*Ms. Marina Khotuleva*, consultant to UNECE

#### **Questions and answers**

**14.50-14.55 Introduction to the Concept for Development of Fuel and Energy Complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030: content, planning process, and further steps.**

*Ms. Olga Melnik*, Department of „green” economy, Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan, member of the Working Group of the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan on revision of the Concept for Development of Fuel and Energy Complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030

#### **Questions and answers**

**14.55-16.00 Main findings and results of the SEA pilot: the key issues and significant environmental, including health, effects which are likely to occur further to the Concept implementation**

*Mr. Vitaliy Kuzin*, EIA national expert  
*Mr. Rustem Vagapov*, biodiversity national expert  
*Mr. Mikhail Kim*, health protection national expert  
*Mr. Adletbek Bekeev*, policy analysis national expert  
*Mr. Nurzhan Begalin*, key policy analysis national expert  
*Mr. Sergey Katyshev*, energy key international expert

**16:00-16:30 Coffee-break**

**16.30-17.00 Main SEA recommendations**

*Mr. Nurzhan Begalin*, key policy analysis national expert  
*Ms. Marina Khotuleva*, consultant to UNECE

#### **Questions and discussion**

**17:00-17:30 Conclusions. Way forward and proposals for follow up**  
Concluding remarks by the Ministry of Energy of Kazakhstan

## List of participants

Start Date: Wednesday, November 14, 2018

End Date: November 14, 2018

**Participants: 80**

**Mr. Sabit NURLYBAI**  
Vice-minister, Ministry of Energy of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan

**Mr. Azamat ALIMBAEV**  
Deputy Chairman of the Committee for  
Environmental Regulation and Control,  
Ministry of Energy of the Republic of  
Kazakhstan

**Ms. Gulshira ATEMOVA**  
Acting Director of the Waste  
Management Department, Ministry of  
Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan

**Ms. Maral NUGUMANOVA**  
Deputy Director of Legal Services  
Department, Ministry of Energy of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan

**Ms. Gulmira MURSALOVA**  
Head of Atomic Projects Development  
Department, Department of Atomic  
Energy and Industry, Ministry of Energy  
of the Republic of Kazakhstan

**Mr. Elkhan KOZHAKAEV**  
Expert, Department of Environmental  
Conventions and International  
Organizations, Department of  
International Cooperation and Economic  
Integration Processes, Ministry of Energy  
of the Republic of Kazakhstan

**Mr. Daniyar MOLKENOV**  
Chief Expert of the Committee on  
Construction and Housing and Public  
Utilities, Ministry of Investment and

**Female participants: 48**

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)786981**

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)740061**  
**Email: [a.alimbaev@energo.gov.kz](mailto:a.alimbaev@energo.gov.kz)**

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)743863**  
**Email: [g.atemova@energo.gov.kz](mailto:g.atemova@energo.gov.kz)**

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)740297**

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)74098**  
**Email: [g.mursalova@energo.gov.kz](mailto:g.mursalova@energo.gov.kz)**

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)741307**  
**Email: [e.kozhakaev@energo.gov.kz](mailto:e.kozhakaev@energo.gov.kz)**

32/1 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone: +7(7172)741954**  
**Email: [mid@mid.gov.kz](mailto:mid@mid.gov.kz)**

Development of the Republic of  
Kazakhstan

**Ms. Zukhra KHASENOVA**

Chief Expert of the Department for the  
Development of Economic Sectors,  
Ministry of National Economy of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan

8 Mangilik el street

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(7172)743798

**Email:** [info@economy.gov.kz](mailto:info@economy.gov.kz)

**Ms. Assel SHAUKENOVA**

Head of the Department of Production  
and Environment Statistics of the  
Committee on Statistics, Ministry of  
National Economy of the Republic of  
Kazakhstan

8 Mangilik el street

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(7172)743798

**Email:** [info@economy.gov.kz](mailto:info@economy.gov.kz)

**Mr. Almat KOSALIYEV**

Chief Expert of the Department of  
Forestry and Specially Protected Natural  
Territories of the Committee for Forestry  
and Wildlife, Ministry of Agriculture of  
the Republic of Kazakhstan

36 Kenesary street

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(7172)749838

**Email:** [a.kosaliev@msh.gov.kz](mailto:a.kosaliev@msh.gov.kz)

**Ms. Gulvira BAKYTKYZY**

Leading Specialist of the Corporate  
Governance Department of Occupational  
Safety, Safety and Environmental  
Protection of JSC, KazMunayGas NC

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(7172)789332

**Email:** [g.bakytqvzv@kmg.kz](mailto:g.bakytqvzv@kmg.kz)

**Mr. Arman BAIMURATOV**

Expert of the Department of  
Environmental Monitoring, RSE  
"Kazhydromet"

11/1 Mangilik el street

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(7172)798398

**Email:** [kazmeteo@gmail.com](mailto:kazmeteo@gmail.com)

**Ms. Aizhan BASHEYEVA**

Expert of the first category of the  
Department of Ecology, National  
Chamber of Entrepreneurs of RK  
"Atameken"

18 Dostik street

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(7172)270451

**Email:** [a.basheveva@atameken.kz](mailto:a.basheveva@atameken.kz)

**Mr. Serik KADRALIEV**

Adviser on technical issues in the field of  
environmental protection, Karachaganak  
Petroleum Operating BV

12 Samal m-t

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone:** +7(777)2204450

**Email:** [kadras@kpo.kz](mailto:kadras@kpo.kz)

**Ms. Galina ARTYUKHINA**  
Executive Director, Kazakhstan  
Association of Nature Users for  
Sustainable Development

23 A, Shevchenko street – 90  
050000 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(707)3137810  
**Email:** [kbcsd@kap.kz](mailto:kbcsd@kap.kz)

**Mr. Arman BIGAZIN**  
Project Manager, Kazakhstan Association  
of Nature Users for Sustainable  
Development

23 A, Shevchenko street – 90  
050000 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(701)5553821  
**Email:** [kbcsd@kap.kz](mailto:kbcsd@kap.kz)

**Ms. Olga POLYAKOVA**  
Chief Specialist of the Department of  
Legal Support of Environmental  
Management, Kazakhmys Corporation  
LLP

12 Lenin street  
1000012 Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7212)952707  
**Email:** [office@kazakhmys.kz](mailto:office@kazakhmys.kz)

**Ms. Malika ALDANOVA**  
Senior Lawyer of the Rulemaking  
Department, Kazakhmys Corporation  
LLP

12 Lenin street  
1000012 Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7212)952707  
**Email:** [office@kazakhmys.kz](mailto:office@kazakhmys.kz)

**Talgat TOREBEKOV**  
Director of Environmental Protection,  
Eurasian Group LLP

30A Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)592133  
**Email:** [Talgat.Torebekov@erg.kz](mailto:Talgat.Torebekov@erg.kz)

**Mr. Dmitriy SUKHANOV**  
Compliance Manager, Eurasian Group  
LLP

30A Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)592133  
**Email:** [dmitriy.sukhanov@erg.kz](mailto:dmitriy.sukhanov@erg.kz)

**Kuandyk KAHKENOV**  
Deputy General Director for Information  
Technology, RSE on REU "State  
extradepartmental examination of  
projects"

7 Kultobe street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)574244  
**Email:** [kenzhekenov@gosexpertiza.kz](mailto:kenzhekenov@gosexpertiza.kz)

**Mr. Salamat SERIKKHALIEV**  
Head of the Department of regulatory  
support expertise and work with the  
branches of the Department of  
Methodology, RSE on REU "State  
extradepartmental examination of

7 Kultobe street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)574244  
**Email:** [serikkhaliev@gosexpertiza.kz](mailto:serikkhaliev@gosexpertiza.kz)

projects"

**Ms. Gulzhan ASANOVA**  
Head of the Department of  
Environmental and Sanitary-  
Epidemiological Examination of Projects,  
RSE on REU "State Extradepartmental  
Examination of Projects"

7 Kultobe street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)574244  
**Email:** [asanova@gosexpertiza.kz](mailto:asanova@gosexpertiza.kz)

**Ms. Aigul CHUKPAROVA**  
Head of the Department of  
Environmental and Sanitary-  
Epidemiological Examination of Projects,  
RSE on REU "State Extradepartmental  
Examination of Projects"

7 Kultobe street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)574244  
**Email:** [chukparova@gosexpertiza.kz](mailto:chukparova@gosexpertiza.kz)

**Ms. Olga SITDIKOVA**  
Lead Engineer for Environmental  
Protection, Kazakhmys Energy LLP

100116 Topar, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +(72153)32598  
**Email:** [olga.sitdikova@kazakhmys.kz](mailto:olga.sitdikova@kazakhmys.kz)

**Ms. Madina RAKHIMOVA**  
Lead engineer for environmental  
protection, LLP "Main distribution power  
station Topar"

100116 Topar, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(72153)32598  
**Email:** -

**Ms. Sholpan SULEIMENOVA**  
National expert on EIA legal drafting

9/1 Bigeldinov st.-2  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(701)5432166  
**Email:** [sholpan\\_2006@mail.ru](mailto:sholpan_2006@mail.ru)

**Ms. Leila SEITOVA**  
Chief Expert of the Department for the  
Development of Oil and Gas and Energy  
Industries, KAZENERGY Association

19 Kabanbay batyr ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)790182  
**Email:** [kense@kazenergy.com](mailto:kense@kazenergy.com)

**Ms. Inna ZUBKOVA**  
Head of the Methodology and Reporting  
Department, Kazakhmys Corporation  
LLP

12 Lenin street  
1000012 Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7212)952707  
**Email:** [office@kazakhmys.kz](mailto:office@kazakhmys.kz)

**Ms. Zarina UALIYEVA**  
Manager, Environment Group, KAZ  
Minerals Group

8 Omarova street  
050020 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7272)440353  
**Email:** [zarina.ualiyeva@kazminerals.com](mailto:zarina.ualiyeva@kazminerals.com)

**Mr. Sayan KASYMOV**  
Head of the Department of  
Environmental Safety of Vostoktsvetmet  
LLP, KAZ Minerals Group

8 Omarova street  
050020 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7272)440353  
**Email:** [sayan.kasymov@kazminerals.com](mailto:sayan.kasymov@kazminerals.com)

**Saule BUKHARBAYEVA**  
Senior lawyer, of Vostoktsvetmet LLP,  
KAZ Minerals Group

8 Omarova street  
050020 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7272)440353  
**Email:** [saule.bukharbayeva@kazminerals.com](mailto:saule.bukharbayeva@kazminerals.com)

**Ms. Altinkul BALABAEVA**  
Director of the Department of the State  
Fund for Environmental Information,  
Republican State Fund on the right of  
economic management "Information and  
Analytical Center for Environmental  
Protection"

11/1 Mangilik el street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)954795  
**Email:** [altyn\\_aisa@mail.ru](mailto:altyn_aisa@mail.ru)

**Mr. György SZABÓ**  
Ambassador, Head of the OSCE  
Programme Office in Astana

10 Beibitshilik st.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)580070  
**Email:** [astana-kz@osce.org](mailto:astana-kz@osce.org)

**Mr. Rati JAPARIDZE**  
Economic and Environmental Officer  
OSCE Programme Office in Astana

10 Beibitshilik st.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)580070  
**Email:** [rati.japaridze@osce.org](mailto:rati.japaridze@osce.org)

**Mr. Yerlen BADYKHAN**  
National Coordinator for Economic and  
Environmental Affairs, OSCE Office in  
Astana

10 Beibitshilik street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)580070  
**Email:** [yerlen.badykhan@osce.org](mailto:yerlen.badykhan@osce.org)

**Ms. Snejana POPOVA**  
Project Manager, Cooperation,  
Delegation of the European Union to the  
Republic of Kazakhstan

62 Kosmonavtov street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)974591  
**Email:** [Snejana.POPOVA@eeas.europa.eu](mailto:Snejana.POPOVA@eeas.europa.eu)

**Mr. Viktor BADAHER**  
Economic Affairs Officer, Sustainable  
Energy Division, UNECE Secretariat

Palais des Nations  
8-14 avenue de la Paix  
CH - 1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland  
**Phone:** +41 (0) 22 917 3071  
**Email:** [viktor.badaker@unece.org](mailto:viktor.badaker@unece.org)

<b>Ms. Gulzhamal ISAYEVA</b> UNDP Project Manager «Kazakhstan Support for the Transition to the Green Economy Model»	14 Mambetov st. 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7172)696544 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:gulzhamal.issaveva@undp.org">gulzhamal.issaveva@undp.org</a>
<b>Ms. Alina MAKSATOVA</b> Representative of the CAREC Country Office in Kazakhstan	1 Orbita microdistrict-40 050000 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7172)552016, +77026189436 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:amaxatova@carececo.org">amaxatova@carececo.org</a>
<b>Ms. Svetlana MOGILYUK</b> Head of NGO «ECOM»	Astana street 103-304 140000 Pavlodar, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(705)2074501 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:msvgeo@gmail.com">msvgeo@gmail.com</a>
<b>Ms. Mariya TYURYUSHEVA</b> Specialist, NGO "EcoObraz"	5-414 Alikhanov street 100000 Karaganda, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7212)911079 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:bilinskaya_sv@bk.ru">bilinskaya_sv@bk.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Lyudmila PETROVA</b> Head, NGO "Angel"	1-53 Muzeynayua street 020401 Atbasar, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(71643)25945 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:ngoangel@mail.ru">ngoangel@mail.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Alma KOMAROVA</b> Member of the EcoForum of Kazakhstan	010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7172) - <b>Email:</b> -
<b>Ms. Larissa KATELNIKOVA</b> Head, NGO "DOS"	15-1 Zhukov street 090002 Uralsk, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(71131)21603 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:vera21603@mail.ru">vera21603@mail.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Aida ALIYEVA</b> Manager, NGO Eco Mangistau	m-t 4, building 4-15 130000 Aktau, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7292)503880 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:info@ecomangystau.kz">info@ecomangystau.kz</a>
<b>Ms. Mariam ABISHEVA</b> Specialist, PF "Kazakhstan Innovation"	127 Auelbekov street 010000 Kokshetau, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7162)442488 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:mariam_ab@mail.ru">mariam_ab@mail.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Oksana VOLKOVA</b>	m-t 2, building 40A-4

Head, NGO "Female Ray"	021500 Stepnogorsk, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(71645)61468 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:4-9-49@mail.ru">4-9-49@mail.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Elena VARGANOVA</b> Head, NGO "Reflection"	m-t 9, building 5A-10 101400 Temirtau, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7213)950994 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:varganova_elen@mail.ru">varganova_elen@mail.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Shynar IZTLEUOVA</b> Head of NGO «Zhaik-Caspian Aarhus Centre»	060000 Atyray, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +77017812968 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:istshynar@mail.ru">istshynar@mail.ru</a>
<b>Ms. Dina NI</b> EcoForum of Kazakhstan	050000 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7272) - <b>Email:</b> -
<b>Ms. Dinara TLEBALDINA</b> Executive Director, Public Union "Birlik"	137-8 Lomov street 140000 Pavlodar, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7182)455237 <b>Email:</b> -
<b>Ms. Kaniya TURSIMBAYEVA</b> Head, NGO "Damu-Ulytau"	m-t 5, building 4-17 010000 Zhezkazgan, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7102)762800 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto:kaniya_t@mail.ru">kaniya_t@mail.ru</a>
<b>Mr. Maksut ZHAKSIBAYEV</b> Chairman of the Board, Kyzylorda Regional Aarhus Center	30 A Kazibek bi street 120200 Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(72431)32428 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto: aarhusorda@gmail.com"> aarhusorda@gmail.com</a>
<b>Ms. Aigul ZHUMADILOVA</b> Deputy Chairman of the Board, Regional Kyzylorda Aarhus Center	30 A Kazibek bi street 120200 Kyzylorda, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(72431)32428 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto: aarhusorda@gmail.com"> aarhusorda@gmail.com</a>
<b>Mr. Aydar KAPASSOV</b> Head of Human Health Institute	Zheltoksan street 33/1-102 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7172)779748 <b>Email:</b> <a href="mailto: aidar.kapassov@gmail.com"> aidar.kapassov@gmail.com</a>
<b>Ms. Sabina KUSAIKHANOVA</b> Specialist for environmental issues, Human Health Institute	Zheltoksan street 33/1-102 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan <b>Phone:</b> +7(7172)779748

**Ms. Simbat AMANTAYEVA**  
Health Specialist, Human Health Institute

**Email:** [sabina.kusajxanova@mail.ru](mailto:sabina.kusajxanova@mail.ru)

Zheltoksan street 33/1-102  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)779748  
**Email:** [simbat\\_kz96@mail.ru](mailto:simbat_kz96@mail.ru)

**Ms. Shynar TEZEKBAEVA**  
Specialist, Human Health Institute

Zheltoksan street 33/1-102  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)779748  
**Email:** [tezekbaeva.shynar@mail.ru](mailto:tezekbaeva.shynar@mail.ru)

**Ms. Gulnara ZHUMABAYEVA**  
Science Specialist, US Embassy

3 Koshkarbayev street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)702100  
**Email:** -

**Mr. Medgat OLZHAEV**  
Advisor to the Netherlands Ambassador  
for Economic Affairs

62 Kosmonavtov street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(7172)555455  
**Email:** [medgat.olzhaev@minbuza.nl](mailto:medgat.olzhaev@minbuza.nl)

**Anatoly Pepenin**  
Kazakhstan branch trade union

**Email:** [aspepenin@gmail.com](mailto:aspepenin@gmail.com)

**Nurlan ABELDINOV**  
Liter Newspaper

**Email:** [Utesh1955@mail.ru](mailto:Utesh1955@mail.ru)

**Oksana TARNETSKAYA**  
EcoForum Kazakhstan

**Email:** [omaprem@mail.ru](mailto:omaprem@mail.ru)

**Ms. Marina SHIMKUS**  
Head of the Department of  
Environmental Impact Assessment,  
Ministry of Ecology and Natural  
Resources of Ukraine

35 Lipovsky street  
03035 Kiev, Ukraine  
**Phone:** +380442063100  
**Email:** [shimkus\\_marina@ukr.net](mailto:shimkus_marina@ukr.net)

**Ms. Madina IBRASHEVA**  
UNECE Project Team Leader  
SEA and EIA pilot project in Kazakhstan

52 Kenesary street  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(701)7279762  
**Email:** [mibrasheva@mail.ru](mailto:mibrasheva@mail.ru)

**Mr. Jerzy JENDROSKA**  
Key international expert on EIA and SEA

**Phone:** +48713410234  
**Email:** [jerzy.jendroska@jib.com.pl](mailto:jerzy.jendroska@jib.com.pl)

legal drafting

**Ms. Elena LAEVSKAYA**  
International expert on SEA and EIA  
legal drafting

**Phone:** +375296250264  
**Email:** [evlaevskaya@gmail.com](mailto:evlaevskaya@gmail.com)

**Mr. Martin SMUTNY**  
UNECE SEA Consultant

Palais des Nations  
8-14 avenue de la Paix  
CH - 1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland  
**Phone:** +7(420)724110779  
**Email:** [martin.smutny@integracons.com](mailto:martin.smutny@integracons.com)

**Ms. Marina KHOTULEVA**  
UNECE SEA Consultant

21 Tatarskaya street 8  
115184 Moskow, Russian Federation  
**Phone:** +7(495)9516585  
**Email:** [info@ecoline-eac.com](mailto:info@ecoline-eac.com)

**Mr. Sergey KATYSHEV**  
UNECE Energy Consultant

59 Tauelsizdik ave.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(701)7449129  
**Email:** [katyshev@kegoc.kz](mailto:katyshev@kegoc.kz)

**Ms. Leila MAKHMETOVA**  
National expert on the development of  
legislation on EIA and SEA

m-t 1, building 28-25  
050062, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(701)2219016  
**Email:** [leila\\_lawyer@mail.ru](mailto:leila_lawyer@mail.ru)

**Mr. Nurzhan BEGALIN**  
Key Policy Analysis Consultant

8/2 Turkestan st.  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(777)3081339  
**Email:** [nbegalin14@gmail.com](mailto:nbegalin14@gmail.com)

**Mr. Rustem VAGAPOV**  
Biodiversity Expert

9 Zhubanov street  
050000 Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(705)3332163  
**Email:** [rustem.vagapov@mail.ru](mailto:rustem.vagapov@mail.ru)

**Mr. Vitaliy KUZIN**  
EIA Expert

12A Kazhimukan st. – 703  
010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(705)7010472  
**Email:** [kuzin@greenbridge.kz](mailto:kuzin@greenbridge.kz)

**Mr. Adletbek BEKEEV**  
Policy Analysis Expert

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
**Phone:** +7(705)7549747  
**Email:** [bekrimma@gmail.com](mailto:bekrimma@gmail.com)

**Ms. Olga SUVOROVA**  
Media and Communications Specialist

010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Phone: +7(701)5200266**

**Email: [suvorovaolga@mail.ru](mailto:suvorovaolga@mail.ru)**

Evaluation form

Round Table

Strengthening environmental assessment systems in Kazakhstan in line with the UNECE Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment

14 November 2018

1. Please indicate how important and relevant the topics of the Round Table is for you?

1 (not important)                      2 (important)                      3 (very important)

2. Please indicate how clear and understandable was the information provided to you (check):

1 (totally unclear)                      2 (clear)                      3 (totally clear)

3. What speeches and topic(s) of the Round Table were most useful in your opinion?

---

---

---

---

---

4. Do you see practical application of the knowledge obtained useful for yourself? If yes, in which area?

1 (not useful)                      2 (useful)                      3 (very useful)

---

---

---

---

5. Please rate the organizational aspects of the Round Table?

1 (excellent)                      2 (good)                      3 (satisfactory)                      4 (bad)