## The measures taken to incorporate comments of the Decision VI/8g «About Kazakhstan's compliance with its obligations under the Convention in the draft law "On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of Kazakhstan on environmental issues"

In order to fulfill the recommendations of the Decision VI/8g of the Sixth Meeting of the Parties to the Aarhus Convention the following work to improve the legislation is carried out:

1. On April 8, 2016 changes in Environmental and Tax codes were made by the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of Kazakhstan on environmental issues", in particular:

1) The conclusions of the state ecological expertise shall be published on the website of the local executive authorities within five days of their receipt by natural resource users;

2) A list of procedures for public participation in decision-making on issues of environmental protection (Article 57-1 of the Environmental Code) is identified:

- Conducting public hearings;

- Conducting public environmental expertise;

- Carrying out public ecological control;

- Submission of comments and suggestions to the state authorities at carrying out the state ecological expertise;

- Participation in public councils under government bodies.

3) Reports on emissions of large natural resources of 1 category (over two thousand) into environment are publicly available as well as data on their payments to the budget, checks of the state environmental control, environmental action plan and its implementation.

4) An National report on the state of environment and use of natural resources is annually developed and published.

5) Natural and legal persons are exempt from tax when filing lawsuits in court on environmental issues.

2. On July 21, 2016 the "Regulations for conducting public hearings" are amended by the Order of the Minister of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan  $N_{2}$  260.

3. On June 10, 2016 "The list of economic activities, which projects to be submitted to a public hearing" is approved by the Order of the Acting Minister of Energy №240.

4. On April 6, 2016 the Law of Kazakhstan "On Legal Acts" regulating public participation in the development of instruments of state planning system is signed.

5. On June 30, 2016 "Rules of placement and public discussion of the draft concepts of the bills and draft regulations on the website of public normative legal

acts" are authorized by the Order of the Minister of Information and Communications  $N_{22}$ .

6. On November 2, 2015 the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan  $N_{2383}$  "On public councils" is signed.

7. On February 26, 2016 the list of members of "Public Council of the Ministry of Energy" is approved by the Order of the Minister of Energy №29.

8. On September 8, 2017 the changes to the "Rules of conducting public hearings" were made.

## Measures taken to incorporate comments on the Decision VI/8g

N⁰	Observations of the Compliance Committee	Measures taken
1.	a) To ensure that the mandatory requirements of the content of the public notice, as prescribed by article 6, paragraph 2, of the Convention, are detailed in law;	<ul> <li>Article 57-2 of the Environmental Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan established that the local executive bodies <u>twenty days prior</u> to the public hearings <u>provide the public access</u> to environmental information relating <u>process</u> for this activity through the online resource, as well as using <u>other means of informing</u>. Rules of public hearings provide for: <ul> <li>On an Internet resource of a local executive body, a special heading "Public Hearings" to be created on the form, according to appendix 1 to this Regulation;</li> <li>Local executive bodies <u>twenty days prior</u> to the public hearings shall provide the public access to environmental information relating to the procedure of environmental impact assessment of planned economic and other activity and to decision-making process for this activity through the local executive body the time and place of public hearing, a <u>preliminary list of the public concerned and justifies the most effective wavs of informing (ads in the media, newsletters, stands, written requests).</u></li> <li>Local executive body shall approve <u>the list of the public concerned, the way of informing, time and venue of the public hearings</u>.</li> <li>The Customer shall inform the public concerned in the state and Russian languages <u>no later than twenty days prior</u> to the public hearings.</li> <li>Customer shall send <u>announcement of the public hearing, draft documents</u> to place on an Internet resource of the local executive body.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
2.	(b) To establish a clear and consistent requirement for all information relevant to the decision-making to be made accessible to the public, in accordance with	Legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan provides for clear procedures for promptly informing on discussion of the EIA projects and regulations. 1. Rules of public hearings regulate procedures for documents publication at the discussion of the EIA of projects, in particular on the website of the local executive bodies shall be published: - The text of announcement of the public hearing, the name of the local executive body and the contact details of the person responsible for organizing the public hearing and receipt of comments and suggestions; - The name of a public authority on conducting state ecological expertise;

article 6, paragraph 6, of the	- Name of customer;
Convention;	- The address of Internet resource of local executive body, where the documentation on the project shall b
	placed;
	-Name of developer of documentation;
	- Date, time and venue of public hearings;
	- Notes and (or) proposals of public concerned on the project documentation;
	- Answers of customer to comments and (or) offers of public concerned;
	- The protocol of public hearings.
	2. In accordance with paragraph 62 of the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on Jur
	18, 2009 № 827 "On the System of state planning in the Republic of Kazakhstan", the participants in the process
	of state planning systems are public authorities, legal entities with state participation, <b>representatives of publi</b> academic and private organizations, <b>individuals</b> .
	All documents of state planning system (with the exception of Kazakhstan Development Strategy up to 205
	are normative legal acts.
	Public participation in the development of instruments of state planning system is regulated by the Law of the
	Republic of Kazakhstan on April 6, 2016 "On Legal Acts" (before 6 April 2016 - "On normative legal acts" Law the Republic of Kazakhstan).
	The order of placement and public discussion of draft laws and regulations is regulated by the Rules
	placement and public discussion of draft concept of the bills and draft regulations on the website of publicly op
	regulations, approved by order of the Minister of Information and Communications of the Republic of Kazakhst
	dated June 30, 2016 № 22 (hereinafter - Rules).
	In accordance with the Rules, draft regulations (hereinafter - NLA) are posted on the Portal of "Electron
	government" together with explanatory notes and comparative tables in the Kazakh and Russian languages.
	The period of public discussion of draft NLAs may not be less than ten working days from the date of the
	placement on the Portal. All comments and suggestions received on the draft NLAs are published in the op
	access.
	State authorities-developers of draft NLAs within three business days after the completion of public
	discussion shall consider the observations and (or) the public suggestions and decide on their acceptance
	rejection indicating justification. After that, state bodies shall form and publish a preliminary version of the repo
	on the completion of the public discussion on the draft.
	Within one working day after publication of the draft report on completion of public discussion on-li
	public vote shall be held on draft NLA presented by public authority and comments and suggestions of the public

After the voting state authority-developers of draft shall form and publish the final version of the report on
the completion of public discussion.
This report shall contain the following information:
commented structural part of the PPA;
text of notes, and (or) a proposal from the public;
text of response of state authority;
number of votes "for" and "against" the draft NPA proposed by state authority-developer;
number of votes "for" and "against" on the comments and suggestions from the public on the draft NLA.
Additionally, in the annex, we represent links, confirming plans, programs to discuss with the public on
environment issues.
Thus, public participation in decision-making at development of plans, programs and policies on
environmental protection issues is not governed by Article 57-2 of the Environmental Code "Public Hearings". At a
public hearing the documentation on environmental impact assessment shall be submitted, that has been made on
the construction of the ski resort "Kok Zhaylau".
Public participation in decision-making at development of plans, programs and policies on environmental
issues is regulated by:
- The seventh paragraph of Article 57-1 of the Environmental Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- Paragraph 62 of the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 18, 2009 № 827
"On the System of state planning in the Republic of Kazakhstan";
- Article 18 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Legal Acts";
- Rules of placement and public discussion of the draft concepts of the bills and draft regulations on the
website of public regulations, approved by order of the Minister of Information and Communications of the
Republic of Kazakhstan.
3. Another tool of public participation in decision-making is the public councils under government bodies.
Any citizen of Kazakhstan can become a member of public council. To do this, citizen shall submit an application
to the address of the state body.
As part of the Public Council of the Ministry of Energy there is Commission on ecology consisting of 14
representatives of environmental NGOs.
Since its inception in February 2016 the Commission on ecology has considered following issues:
- Problems of ecological state of the Kazakhstan sector of the Caspian Sea and adjacent coastal areas,
including areas where there is a conflict of interest on conservation of biological resources, environment and
subsurface use, in accordance with international requirements;
- The problem of creating an unified information system on the results of environmental monitoring;

		Also on a permanent basis discussion of all draft environmental NLAs is conducted. Members of the Commission shall take a decision on the need to submit draft NLA to public hearings for a broader discussion among the population. On the website of the Ministry of Energy all information on the activities of the Public Council is published http://energo.gov.kz/index.php?id=8107 Also Public councils operate in all central local executive bodies.
3.	(c) To ensure that, in accordance with article 6, paragraph 7, of the Convention, the submission of comments by the public is not limited to only "reasonable" comments;	<ol> <li>Article 57-1 "Public participation in decision-making on issues of environmental protection" is introduced in the Environmental Code:         <ul> <li>Public participation in decision-making on issues of environmental protection is carried out through: conducting public hearings; conducting public environmental expertise; carrying out public ecological control; submission of comments and suggestions to the state authorities at conducting state ecological expertise; participation in public councils under government bodies; comments and suggestions on the draft normative legal acts on environmental issues, including the draft documents of state planning system.</li> <li>2. Environmental Code specifies requirements for the projects required to conduct public hearings (new Article 57-2 "Conducting public hearings").</li> <li>Public hearings shall be held on the projects:             <ol> <li>in the areas of agriculture and forestry, mining and manufacturing industries, construction, transport, electricity, heating, water supply, sewerage, waste management and other sectors of economy according to the list determined by the authorized body in the field of environmental protection;</li></ol></li></ul></li></ol>

		<ul> <li>materials of environmental impact assessment in accordance with the stages set out in Article 37 of this Code;</li> <li>6) projects of natural science and feasibility studies for the establishment and expansion of protected areas, the elimination of state nature reserves and state protected areas of the republican values and a decrease in their territory;</li> <li>8) projects of general development plans (development) of cities and territories, including the territories of special economic zones and territories with special regime of economic activity;</li> <li>9) materials of areas of inspection justifying the assignment of these areas to zones of ecological disaster or environmental</li> <li>10) projects of economic activities which may have an impact on the environment of neighboring states or for which carrying out is necessary to use natural objects common with the neighboring states, or which affect the interests of neighboring countries, including the complex "Baikonur" as defined by international treaties of the Republic of Kazakhstan;</li> </ul>
4.	(d) To establish appropriate procedures, which are not limited to publishing decisions only on websites, to promptly notify the public of the environmental expertiza conclusions, and to facilitate public access to these decisions, in accordance with article 6, paragraph 9, of the Convention;	<ol> <li>At the legislative level (Article 57) the obligation of publication of the state environmental expertise on the Internet site of the local executive authorities within five working days of receipt by the nature user is introduced.</li> <li>The Rules of conducting public hearings (approved by the Order of the Minister of Environmental Protection of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 7, 2007 № 135-p) provides that:         <ul> <li>the results of public hearings are designed in the protocol, which is hosted on an Internet resource of local executive body not later than seven working days after the public hearing.</li> </ul> </li> </ol>
5.	(e) To maintain and make accessible to the public, through publicly available lists or registers, copies of the decisions taken and other information relevant to the decision- making, including evidence	In accordance with paragraph 27 of the Rules of conducting public hearings, the responsible person of the local executive body together with the customer shall compile a Protocol on the conducting public hearings in the form of interview, in the form specified in Appendix 4 of these Rules. The Protocol reflects the comments and (or) proposals from the public concerned and the position of the customer regarding the recording of each comment and (or) proposal, as well as information about the possibility of appealing the decision.

of having fulfilled the
obligation to inform the
public and provide it with
opportunities to submit
comments;