

National Implementation Report

(As submitted by: Germany)

Format for reporting on implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development Phase III: 2011–2015

The following report is submitted on behalf of the Government of Germany in accordance with the decision of the ECE Steering Committee on Education for Sustainable Development.

Name of officer (national focal point) responsible
for submitting the report:
Bianca Bilgram, German Commission for UNESCO,
Reiner Mathar, The Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural
Affairs of the Länder in the Federal Republic of Germany

Signature:

Date:

Full name of the institution: German Commission for UNESCO

Postal address: Langwartweg 72

Telephone: 0049-228-688444-0

E-mail: bilgram@unesco.de

Website: unesco.de

Contact officer for national report (if different from above):

A. Provide brief information (not more than half a page) on the process by which this report has been prepared, including information on which types of public authorities were consulted or contributed to its preparation, how the stakeholders were consulted and how the outcome of this consultation was taken into account and on the material used as a basis for the report.

Governmental institutions (please specify) _____Federal Ministry of Education and Research, Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs of the Länder in the Federal Republic of Germany_____

Stakeholder _____

NGOs (please specify) Mainly in the sector of Environmental and nature education and Global Education / Education on international development

Academia (please specify) Several Universities and institutions of teacher education on the regional level

Business (please specify) _____

Other (please specify) German Commission for UNESCO, coordinating body for the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development in Germany (Decade activities funded by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research), individual members of the National Committee for the Decade, which was instituted by the German Commission for UNESCO in consultation with the Federal Ministry of Education and Research

B. Report any particular circumstances that help clarify the context of the report — for example, whether the decision-making structure is federal and/or decentralized, and whether financial constraints are a significant obstacle to implementation. (This information should not exceed half a page.)

The draft report is based on the results of the national discussions leading to the final report to UNESCO on DESD and the closing conference of DESD in Germany in September 2014 and its accompanying stakeholder conferences across all sectors of education throughout the year 2014.

On the basis of a unanimous decision by the German Parliament and with funding from the Federal (National) Ministry of Education and Research, the German Commission for UNESCO coordinates the activities for the implementation of the DESD in German. It instituted a National Committee for the DESD, with representatives from Federal Ministries, the Federal States, civil society, and the business sector.

In 2013 the standing conference of the ministries of education of the German Länder (KMK) has published a national report on the development of ESD at school which is based on reports of the 16 Länder (States)

Various questions of the report below could only be addressed on the basis of estimates. Providing precise numbers would have required major research activities which would have taken up an amount of resources not acceptable for this exercise.

Issue¹ 1. Ensure that policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD	
<i>If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).</i>	
Indicator 1.1 Prerequisite measures are taken to support the promotion of ESD	
Sub-indicator 1.1.1	Is the UNECE Strategy for ESD available in your national ² language(s)?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>German</i>
Sub-indicator 1.1.2	Have you appointed a national focal point to deal with the UNECE Strategy for ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>(1) Federal Ministry of Education and Research; (2) Bianca Bilgram, German Commission for UNESCO; (3) Reiner Mathar, The Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs of the Länder in the Federal Republic of Germany</i>
Sub-indicator 1.1.3	Do you have a coordinating body for implementation of ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>The implementation of the DESD is coordinated by a National Committee convened by the German Commission for UNESCO. The National Committee is supported by a Secretariat at the German Commission for UNESCO set up with financial assistance of the Federal Ministry of Education and Research, the lead ministry for the DESD in Germany. Furthermore, a Round Table and Working Groups contribute to implementing the DESD in Germany.</i>
Sub-indicator 1.1.4	Do you have a national implementation plan for ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>The National Plan of Action for the DESD was adopted by the National Committee in 2004 and updated in 2008 and 2011</i>
Sub-indicator 1.1.5	Are there any synergies at the national level between the ECE ESD process, the UNESCO global process on the United Nations Decade of ESD, ³ and other policy processes relevant to ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>German activities regarding the UNECE ESD Strategy are carried out within the framework of the implementation of the DESD and are thus fully compatible with UNESCO activities on ESD. The DESD National Committee, the DESD Round Table, over 2000 DESD projects selected by the National Commission for UNESCO, and numerous other stakeholders working for the implementation of the DESD in Germany can thus be seen to be contributing also to the implementation of the UNECE Strategy.</i>

¹ Issues 1 to 6 herein are in accordance with the objectives (a)-(f) set out in the UNECE Strategy for ESD (CEP/AC.13/2005/3/Rev.1, para. 7).

² For countries with a federal government structure, all references to “national” apply to “State”, as appropriate. In this context, “data at the national level” means aggregated data received from sub-State entities.

³ The United Nations General Assembly in its resolution 57/254 of 20 December 2002 proclaimed the 10-year period beginning on 1 January 2005 the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development.

Indicator 1.2 Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD	
Sub-indicator 1.2.1	Is ESD reflected in any national policy ⁴ document(s)?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>There is an official report of the Federal Government on ESD to the federal parliament once every parliamentary term; ESD is also reflected in the National Sustainability Strategy adopted by the Federal Government in 2002 (regular updates, last 2012)</p> <p>The National Plan of Action for the DESD, adopted by the National Committee, is the central policy document for implementing the DESD in Germany. It was developed on the basis of a unanimous resolution on the DESD of the German Parliament in 2004. In addition 13 of the 16 German Federal States have formulated their own action plans for the DESD.</p> <p>The advisory board for school education of KMK produced an national report on ESD at schools in Germany with some hints to the further development including the area of teacher education, one main focus is on the integration of ESD in everyday lessons at all schools. Some of the states have already started to implement ESD in the next generation of curricula and educational standards.</p> <p>Furthermore, there are official recommendations and orientative documents regarding ESD in schools and in higher education, among others.</p>
Sub-indicator 1.2.2	Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ordinances/requirements at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED? ⁵

⁴ Policy documents may include national strategies, plans, programmes, guidelines and the like.

⁵ See <http://www.uis.unesco.org/Education/Pages/international-standard-classification-of-education.aspx>.

(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>If yes, please specify details for (a) and (b).</i>																																	
(b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Please also fill in the table by ticking (✓) as appropriate.</i>																																	
	<p><i>Please note:</i> Education legislation is largely within the responsibility of the Federal States in Germany. Therefore, each of them has formulated its individual education regulation/curricula for each education level. ESD has not been addressed in national legislation as such. However, at school level there exists a Cross-Curricular Framework on Global Development Education in the Context of ESD adopted by the Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs and the Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development, and a Recommendation for ESD in Schools adopted by the Standing Conference and the German Commission for UNESCO. For higher education, there only exists a statement of the Conference of University Rectors and the German Commission for UNESCO, which includes ESD but no legislation or curricula.</p> <p>The ticks above are to be understood in the sense that in some Federal States ESD is integrated into regulatory documents or curricula</p>																																	
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ISCED levels</th> <th>(a)</th> <th>(b)</th> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td><i>Yes</i></td> <td><i>Yes</i></td> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0. Early childhood education</td> <td>V</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Primary education</td> <td>V</td> <td>V*</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Lower secondary education</td> <td>V</td> <td>V*</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Upper secondary education</td> <td>V</td> <td>V*</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Post secondary non-tertiary education</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>8. Doctoral or equivalent level</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	ISCED levels	(a)	(b)		<i>Yes</i>	<i>Yes</i>	0. Early childhood education	V	V	1. Primary education	V	V*	2. Lower secondary education	V	V*	3. Upper secondary education	V	V*	4. Post secondary non-tertiary education			5. Short-cycle tertiary education			6. Bachelor's or equivalent level			7. Master's or equivalent level			8. Doctoral or equivalent level		
ISCED levels	(a)	(b)																																
	<i>Yes</i>	<i>Yes</i>																																
0. Early childhood education	V	V																																
1. Primary education	V	V*																																
2. Lower secondary education	V	V*																																
3. Upper secondary education	V	V*																																
4. Post secondary non-tertiary education																																		
5. Short-cycle tertiary education																																		
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level																																		
7. Master's or equivalent level																																		
8. Doctoral or equivalent level																																		
Sub-indicator 1.2.3	Are non-formal and informal ESD addressed in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks?																																	
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	The importance of non-formal and informal ESD is addressed in the report of the Federal Government on ESD and in the National Plan of Action and existing action plans of the Federal States.																																	
Sub-indicator 1.2.4	Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)?																																	
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	Raising of public awareness in relation to ESD is addressed in the National Plan of Action and in the action plans of the Federal States.																																	

Sub-indicator 1.2.5	Does a formal structure for interdepartmental ⁶ cooperation relevant to ESD exist in your Government?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>In May 2004, the German Commission for UNESCO instituted a National Committee in consultation with the Federal Ministry of Education and Research. This Committee represents Federal and State Ministries (eg Ministry of Environment and Economic Cooperation and Development), the Parliament, non-governmental organizations, media, the private sector and the scientific community. All 16 Federal States are represented at the Round Table for the DESD. The multi-stakeholder Round Table comprises some 130 members in total.</p> <p>Since 2007 a working group with representatives of the 16 Federal States and of the Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development is carrying out projects for the implementation of the Cross-Curricular Framework on Global Development Education in the Context of ESD. In 2011 a revised and enhanced version of the Cross-Curricular Framework as an official cooperation-project between the Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs and the Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development was published. At the end of 2014 the school advisory board of KMK decided on the next version of the Core Curriculum for Global development education which includes standards, competencies and concrete examples for nearly all subjects at school from Language Education to arts and sports. This document will be published as a basic curriculum framework for all schools in secondary education.</p>
Sub-indicator 1.2.6	Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your Government? ⁷
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Please see answer to sub-indicator 1.2.5.</i>
Sub-indicator 1.2.7	Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>On the national level, different German Federal ministries support ESD. In particular, the Federal Ministry of Education and Research, the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety, and the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development have allocated financial resources to ESD activities. Because ESD-related activities are under the domain of various sections, it is not possible to give precise total numbers.</p> <p>At the Federal State level, there exist different promotion funds as well. Moreover, several funding institutions, like the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, the Deutsche Bundesstiftung Umwelt (DBU), the VW Foundation, have been funding ESD projects in the last years. As one of Europe's largest foundations, the DBU is funding innovative ESD educational projects on a large scale.</p> <p>Some Länder (States) have linked ESD to their sustainability strategies, this includes funding for special educational activities and programmes.</p>
Indicator 1.3 National policies support synergies between processes related to sustainable development (SD) and ESD	

⁶ Between State bodies.

⁷ For an explanation, see paragraph 46 of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

Sub-indicator 1.3.1	Is ESD part of SD policy(ies) if these exist in your country?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>ESD is reflected in the National Sustainability Strategy adopted by the Federal Government in 2002 (regular updates, last 2012)</p> <p>A Peer Review Report, published in 2013, provides a firm foundation to consolidate what has been achieved so far and to integrate sustainability more securely throughout all parts of German government, business and society. Central recommendations include building sustainability more systematically into all levels of education. The German Council for Sustainable Development (RNE) has since scaled up considerably its efforts to strengthen ESD at local policy level and at institutes of higher education. In 2014 the chairman of the national committee for ESD was elected as a member of the RNE and education has become a core part.</p>
<i>Concluding remarks on issue 1</i>	<i>Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 1, which corresponds to objective (a) under the Strategy, namely, to ensure that policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD</i>
	<p><i>Please address in particular the following questions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>– Which actions/initiatives have been particularly successful and why?</i> <i>– What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?</i> <i>– Which other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?</i>

Issue 2. Promote SD through formal, non-formal and informal learning													
<i>If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).</i>													
Indicator 2.1 SD key themes are addressed in formal education													
Sub-indicator 2.1.1	Are key themes of SD ⁸ addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels ⁹ of formal education?												
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Please specify what SD issues are important in the country (i.e., biodiversity, gender, consumption/production, etc.) and how they are addressed in the curricula.</i></p> <p><i>Please update the table in appendix I (a) that was used for implementation phase II under this sub-indicator, as appropriate, and indicate the results in the box below in accordance with the rating scale set out in the appendix.</i></p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th>A</th> <th>B</th> <th>C</th> <th>D</th> <th>E</th> <th>F</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	A	B	C	D	E	F	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
A	B	C	D	E	F								
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>								
Sub-indicator 2.1.2	Are learning outcomes (skills, attitudes and values) that support ESD addressed explicitly in the curriculum ¹⁰ /programme of study at various levels of formal education?												
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Please specify what competences as learning outcomes are important in your country.</i></p> <p><i>Please update the table in appendix I (b) that was used for implementation phase II under this sub-indicator, as appropriate, and indicate the results in the box below in accordance with the rating scale set out in the appendix.</i></p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th>A</th> <th>B</th> <th>C</th> <th>D</th> <th>E</th> <th>F</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	A	B	C	D	E	F	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
A	B	C	D	E	F								
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>								

⁸ For details, see paragraph 15 of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

⁹ For the State or federal level, where relevant.

¹⁰ Idem.

Sub-indicator 2.1.3	Are teaching/learning methods that support ESD addressed explicitly in the curriculum ¹¹ /programme of study at various levels of formal education?																																																											
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Please specify what methods are of particular significance in your country. Please also specify for non-formal education, as appropriate.</p> <p>Please also update the table in appendix I (c) that was used to report on implementation phase II, as appropriate, and indicate the results in the box below in accordance with the rating scale set out in the appendix.</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td>A</td> <td>B</td> <td>C</td> <td>D</td> <td>E</td> <td>F</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> </table>	A	B	C	D	E	F	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>																																															
A	B	C	D	E	F																																																							
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>																																																							
Indicator 2.2 Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified																																																												
Sub-indicator 2.2.1	Is ESD addressed through: (a) existing subjects ¹² only?; (b) a cross-curriculum approach?; (c) the provision of specific subject programmes and courses?; (d) a stand-alone project ¹³ ; (e) other approaches?																																																											
<p>(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>(b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>(c) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>(d) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>(e) Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p>Please specify for different levels of education system in accordance with ISCED by ticking (✓) in the table as appropriate.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">ISCED levels 2011</th> <th>(a)</th> <th>(b)</th> <th>(c)</th> <th>(d)</th> <th>(e)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Yes</th> <th>Yes</th> <th>Yes</th> <th>Yes</th> <th>Yes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0. Early childhood education</td> <td></td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Primary education</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Lower secondary education</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Upper secondary education</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Please also provide information about the incentives on the national level for implementing (a), (b), (c), (d), and (e).</p>	ISCED levels 2011	(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)	(e)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	0. Early childhood education		✓		✓		1. Primary education	✓	✓		✓		2. Lower secondary education	✓	✓	✓	✓		3. Upper secondary education	✓	✓	✓	✓		4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	✓	✓	✓	✓		5. Short-cycle tertiary education	✓	✓	✓	✓		6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	✓	✓	✓	✓		7. Master's or equivalent level	✓	✓	✓	✓	
ISCED levels 2011	(a)		(b)	(c)	(d)	(e)																																																						
	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes																																																							
0. Early childhood education		✓		✓																																																								
1. Primary education	✓	✓		✓																																																								
2. Lower secondary education	✓	✓	✓	✓																																																								
3. Upper secondary education	✓	✓	✓	✓																																																								
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	✓	✓	✓	✓																																																								
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	✓	✓	✓	✓																																																								
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	✓	✓	✓	✓																																																								
7. Master's or equivalent level	✓	✓	✓	✓																																																								

¹¹ Idem.

¹² E.g., geography or biology. For higher education, “subject” means “course”.

¹³ A project is interpreted as a discrete activity with its own time allocation rather than a teaching/learning method.

	<p><i>Examples:</i></p> <p>(a) Within the education standards for the school subjects “Biology” and “Geography” ESD is integrated nationwide.</p> <p>(b) i) Within the national project Transfer 21 students explored various SD issues through workshops, student projects and expert talks. ii) The UNESCO Associated Project School are integrating DESD subjects through cross-circular projects.</p> <p>(c) Several subject programmes and courses concerned with sustainability issues are provided within the curricula of vocational schools, academies and higher education institutions, depending on the Federal State and the educational programme.</p> <p>(d) There are several stand-alone projects concerned with sustainability issues integrated into curricula at every education level, i.e. through workshops, project weeks and project periods, either taking place alongside regular teaching or in its place.</p> <p>Numerous specific examples can be found among the over 2,000 official German DESD projects selected by the German Commission for UNESCO.</p> <p>Some Federal States have introduced sustainable development in to the development of new curricula, ESD as a core principal; this is a dynamic process focused on the development at school level.</p>
Indicator 2.3	A whole-institution approach¹⁴ to SD/ESD is promoted
Sub-indicator 2.3.1	Do educational institutions ¹⁵ adopt a “whole-institution approach” to SD/ESD?

¹⁴ A “whole institution approach” means that all aspects of an institution’s internal operations and external relationships are reviewed and revised in the light of SD/ESD principles. Within such an approach each institution would decide on its own actions, addressing the three overlapping spheres of Campus (management operations); Curriculum; and Community (external relationships).

¹⁵ For higher education institutions: whole-university, whole-college or whole-faculty approach (including inter-faculty approaches).

Yes No

The Steering Committee has adopted as one priority action area that every school adopts an ESD school plan by 2015. ESD school plans are one means to implement a whole-institution approach. Please provide information on the implementation of this priority action area in your country.

Also, please provide information for all levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED by ticking (✓) in the table as appropriate and specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate.

ISCED levels 2011	Yes
0. Early childhood education	✓
1. Primary education	✓
2. Lower secondary education	✓
3. Upper secondary education	✓
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	✓
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	✓
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	✓
7. Master's or equivalent level	✓
8. Doctoral or equivalent level	✓

Please note: Numerous, yet not all, German education institutions are adopting ESD in a “whole-institution approach”. For example, more than 10% of German schools were part of the Transfer 21 project and, thus, are applying ESD; the majority of those schools have adopted an integrated approach. UNESCO Associated Project Schools have also to be mentioned in this context.

In addition, a growing number of German educational institutions within all educational levels are applying the principles of environmental management (EMAS and ISO 14001 or IWA 2:2007), which facilitates and supports a whole-institution approach. End of 2014 the extended version of the “Orientierungsrahmen Global Development” (Curriculum Framework for ESD with a main focus on global development) contains now a new chapter:” ESD as a task of the whole school” .This chapter provides examples on the different areas of school activities – lesson based and school live with a focus on ESD. This document will be published as an official guideline for all schools in Germany in 2015.

Sub-indicator 2.3.2	Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support a whole-institution approach to SD/ESD, including the implementation of ESD school plans?																				
Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>If yes, please specify what schemes are available for all levels of your education system.</i></p> <p><i>Please also provide information on all education levels in accordance with ISCED by ticking (✓) in the table as appropriate.</i></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ISCED levels 2011</th> <th>Yes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0. Early childhood education</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Primary education</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Lower secondary education</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Upper secondary education</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8. Doctoral or equivalent level</td> <td>✓</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><i>Please note: Institutions applying a whole-institution approach can apply for recognition as an Official DESD Project. Various additional support structures have been instituted in the context of the DESD at the Federal and the State levels</i></p> <p><i>Please also specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate. If relevant information is available please also specify (provide examples).</i></p>	ISCED levels 2011	Yes	0. Early childhood education	✓	1. Primary education	✓	2. Lower secondary education	✓	3. Upper secondary education	✓	4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	✓	5. Short-cycle tertiary education	✓	6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	✓	7. Master's or equivalent level	✓	8. Doctoral or equivalent level	✓
ISCED levels 2011	Yes																				
0. Early childhood education	✓																				
1. Primary education	✓																				
2. Lower secondary education	✓																				
3. Upper secondary education	✓																				
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	✓																				
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	✓																				
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	✓																				
7. Master's or equivalent level	✓																				
8. Doctoral or equivalent level	✓																				

Sub-indicator 2.3.3	Do institutions/learners develop their own SD/ESD indicators for their institution/organization?																																								
Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Please specify (i.e., provide examples of how this is done) for formal institutions as well as for non-formal institutions.</i></p> <p><i>Please also indicate for all levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED, by ticking (✓) in the table as appropriate:</i></p> <p><i>(a) For formal institutions:</i></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ISCED levels 2011</th> <th>Yes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>0. Early childhood education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>1. Primary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>2. Lower secondary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>3. Upper secondary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>8. Doctoral or equivalent level</td><td>V</td></tr> </tbody> </table> <p><i>(b) For non-formal institutions:</i></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ISCED levels 2011</th> <th>Yes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>0. Early childhood education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>1. Primary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>2. Lower secondary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>3. Upper secondary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td><td>V</td></tr> <tr><td>8. Doctoral or equivalent level</td><td>V</td></tr> </tbody> </table>	ISCED levels 2011	Yes	0. Early childhood education	V	1. Primary education	V	2. Lower secondary education	V	3. Upper secondary education	V	4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V	5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V	6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	V	7. Master's or equivalent level	V	8. Doctoral or equivalent level	V	ISCED levels 2011	Yes	0. Early childhood education	V	1. Primary education	V	2. Lower secondary education	V	3. Upper secondary education	V	4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V	5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V	6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	V	7. Master's or equivalent level	V	8. Doctoral or equivalent level	V
ISCED levels 2011	Yes																																								
0. Early childhood education	V																																								
1. Primary education	V																																								
2. Lower secondary education	V																																								
3. Upper secondary education	V																																								
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V																																								
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V																																								
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	V																																								
7. Master's or equivalent level	V																																								
8. Doctoral or equivalent level	V																																								
ISCED levels 2011	Yes																																								
0. Early childhood education	V																																								
1. Primary education	V																																								
2. Lower secondary education	V																																								
3. Upper secondary education	V																																								
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V																																								
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V																																								
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	V																																								
7. Master's or equivalent level	V																																								
8. Doctoral or equivalent level	V																																								

Indicator 2.4 ESD is addressed by quality assessment/enhancement systems	
Sub-indicator 2.4.1	(a) Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems?: ¹⁶ (b) Do they address ESD?; (c) Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that address ESD in national systems?

¹⁶ For higher education institutions: either national centres for quality assessment in higher education or cooperation with general quality assessment agencies, such as the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM).

(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Please elaborate.</i>																																												
(b) Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Also, please specify for various levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED, by ticking (✓) in the table as appropriate.</i>																																												
(c) Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>																																													
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ISCED levels 2011</th> <th>(a)</th> <th>(b)</th> <th>(c)</th> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td><i>Yes</i></td> <td><i>Yes</i></td> <td><i>Yes</i></td> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0. Early childhood education</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Primary education</td> <td>V</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Lower secondary education</td> <td>V</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Upper secondary education</td> <td>V</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education</td> <td>V</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td> <td>V</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>8. Doctoral or equivalent level</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p> <i>Please note:</i> Education quality assessment is in the responsibility of the Federal States. Considering the ESD aspects of Appendix I (a), in the assessment documents of the Federal States ESD is primarily addressed in the context of the aspect “cultural diversity”. A national education quality assessment system was initiated in 2009 for secondary education first stage (ISCED level 2) for the subjects “German”, “English” and “French” and will continue in 2011 with primary education (ISCED level 1). Some federal states are working on integrating ESD in the final school examinations on upper secondary level, this is part of the process of integrating ESD in the core curriculum and is a dynamic, but complicated process in the long time run. </p> <p> <i>Please also specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate. If relevant data are available, please also specify this data (i.e., provide examples on how the data was compiled).</i> </p>	ISCED levels 2011	(a)	(b)	(c)		<i>Yes</i>	<i>Yes</i>	<i>Yes</i>	0. Early childhood education				1. Primary education	V			2. Lower secondary education	V			3. Upper secondary education	V			4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V			5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V			6. Bachelor's or equivalent level				7. Master's or equivalent level				8. Doctoral or equivalent level			
ISCED levels 2011	(a)	(b)	(c)																																										
	<i>Yes</i>	<i>Yes</i>	<i>Yes</i>																																										
0. Early childhood education																																													
1. Primary education	V																																												
2. Lower secondary education	V																																												
3. Upper secondary education	V																																												
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V																																												
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V																																												
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level																																													
7. Master's or equivalent level																																													
8. Doctoral or equivalent level																																													
Indicator 2.5	ESD methods and instruments for non-formal and informal learning are in place to assess changes in knowledge, attitude and practice																																												
Sub-indicator 2.5.1	Are SD issues addressed in informal and public awareness-raising activities?																																												

Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Please specify and provide information on new developments and good practice examples.</i></p> <p>Numerous activities in informal and awareness raising for SD are taking place throughout Germany. Governmental institutions, NGOs, and other initiatives organize workshops, conferences, public seminars, public lectures and festivals on SD. TV and radio programmes disseminate the idea of SD. Individual newspaper articles and article series deal with SD aspects, such as sustainable energy supply and consumption, water supply, and organic farming.</p> <p>Awareness raising specifically for ESD is taking place, among other things, through the publicly announced award scheme for German DESD Projects, annual action days for ESD, and a major ESD internet portal. Several Federal Länder address awareness raising through individual online platforms and award schemes.</p> <p>One of the working group of the national Round Table concerned itself exclusively on the topic of ESD and the media.</p> <p>One of the various private sector initiatives that can be mentioned is the partnership project of the major drugstore chain dm-drogerie markt with the German Commission for UNESCO. On the basis of a broad public call for projects, dm funds over 1,200 individual ESD projects with 1,000 Euros each; they are selected from over 4,400 applications. In the second year of the initiative those projects were supported again with 1.000 Euros each and additionally with capacity building seminars on fundraising, public relations and project management. All projects were introduced to the wider public through a presentation in the store magazine with a print run of 1,5 million copies.</p>
---	--

Sub-indicator 2.5.2	Is there any support for work-based learning (e.g., for small companies, farmers, trade unions, associations) which addresses SD issues?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	In Germany, there are numerous training programmes that qualify employees in diverse work contexts. This may include further training for investment consultants in “sustainable investment”, environmental management for company managers, as well as sustainability pedagogy for educators, or organic farming for farmers. Work-based conferences on SD issues addressed to company managers and educators also regularly take place.
Sub-indicator 2.5.3	Are there any instruments (e.g. research, surveys, etc.) in place to assess the outcomes of ESD as a result of non-formal and informal learning?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>The results of the initiatives mentioned under 2.5.1. are regularly internally monitored and evaluated.</i>
Indicator 2.6 ESD implementation is a multi-stakeholder process¹⁷	
Sub-indicator 2.6.1	Is ESD implementation a multi-stakeholder process?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Please specify the main stakeholders and the main impacts that those stakeholders had/have on implementation. Please update the information provided in the previous table for appendix II as appropriate.</i></p> <p>For examples of good practice of ESD as a multi-stakeholder process, see the explanation of DESD implementation in Germany in other parts of this document.</p> <p>The National Plan of Action of 2011 (translated into English) lists all major stakeholders on pages 80-84.</p> <p>http://www.bne-portal.de/fileadmin/unesco/de/Downloads/Dekade_Publikationen_national/Nationaler_Aktionsplan_2011_engl.pdf</p>
Concluding remarks on issue 2	<i>Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 2, which corresponds to objective (b) under the Strategy, namely to promote sustainable development through formal, non-formal and informal learning</i>
	<p><i>Please address in particular the following questions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – <i>Which actions/initiatives have been particularly successful and why?</i> – <i>What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?</i> – <i>Which other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?</i>
Issue 3. Equip educators with the competence to include SD in their teaching	
<i>If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).</i>	

¹⁷ For higher education institutions: this covers the issue of university “outreach” (meaning a wide spectrum from regional integration, business cooperation and transdisciplinarity to eco-procurement and research-education-cooperation).

Indicator 3.1		ESD is included in the training¹⁸ of educators
Sub-indicator 3.1.1	Is ESD a part of educators' initial training? ¹⁹	
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>In particular specify what ESD competences²⁰ are explicitly included in the study programmes.</i>	

¹⁸ ESD is addressed by content and/or by methodology.

¹⁹ For higher education institutions: the focus is here on existing teacher training at universities/colleges regarding SD and ESD for university/college teachers.

²⁰ For a set of core competences in ESD please see the report by the ECE Expert Group on Competences, *Learning for the future: Competences in Education for Sustainable Development* (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2011/6), available online from <http://www.unece.org/education-for-sustainable-development-esd/publications.html.html>.

Sub-indicator 3.1.2	Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training? ²¹
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>In particular specify what ESD competences are explicitly included in training programmes. Please also specify to what extent the training programmes are mandatory or optional.</i> <i>Please also update the information provided under the phase II national implementation reporting in appendix III.</i>
Sub-indicator 3.1.3	Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	Through the organizational structure of DESD implementation in Germany, ESD is regularly communicated to leaders and administrators. Various Official DESD Projects and activities by other stakeholders focus on the training of leaders in ESD. Some states have already integrated the concept of SD in the basic training of new and established school principals and it's part of publications in the field of school development. ²²
Indicator 3.2 Opportunities exist for educators to cooperate on ESD	
Sub-indicator 3.2.1	Are there any networks/platforms of educators and/or leaders/administrators who are involved in ESD in your country?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	One central feature of German DESD implementation – with its National Committee, its Round Table, its working groups, and the award scheme for DESD projects – is that it provides a platform for the cooperation of education administrators and practitioners. The ESD internet portal run by the German Commission for UNESCO with funding from the Federal Ministry of Education and Research lists many hundreds of initiatives that can be contacted regarding cooperation on ESD, including at Federal State level. In 2013 a national network for teacher educators has been established, as a German speaking branch of the worldwide network established by Prof. Charles Hopkins. Networks at higher education level or teacher trainers are also being established at Federal State level.
Sub-indicator 3.2.2	Are ESD networks/platforms supported by the government in any way? ²³

²¹ For higher education institutions: the focus is here on existing in-service training programmes regarding SD and ESD for university/college teachers in their own universities/colleges.

²² For Example: Journal for educational leadership: ESD – Quality development at school, challenges for the future, Link Luchterhand 2008 and: Health, equity and sustainability at school, Link Luchterhand 2010

²³ Including assistance through direct funding, in-kind help, political and institutional support.

Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The Federal Ministry of Education and Research funds the organizational structure of DESD implementation in Germany. State Ministries fund networking initiatives at the State level.</p> <p>In 2012 the Federal Ministry of Education and Research launched jointly with the German Council for Sustainable Development a funding programme for local education and competence networks on ESD (32 local networks were supported with € 35.000 each to initiate and strengthen networks). The programme will be repeated in 2015.</p>
<i>Concluding remarks issue 3</i>	<i>Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 3, which corresponds to objective (c) under the Strategy, namely to equip educators with the competence to include sustainable development in their teaching</i>
	<p><i>Please address in particular the following questions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>– Which actions/initiatives have been particularly successful and why?</i> <i>– What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?</i> <i>– Which other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?</i>
Issue 4. Ensure that adequate tools and materials for ESD are accessible	
<i>If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).</i>	
tsIndicator 4.1 Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	
Sub-indicator 4.1.1	Does a national strategy/mechanism for encouragement of the development and production of ESD tools and materials exist?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The Cross-Curricular Framework on Global Development Education in the Context of ESD by the Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs and the Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development provides an orientation for the development of teaching materials and has been substantially updated and extended in 2014/2015. Within the award scheme for DESD projects, the development of teaching materials is also encouraged.</p> <p>The federal ministry of international cooperation funds the development and publishing good practice on the basis of Cross-curricular framework in all states (Umsetzungsprojekte zum OR), this funding will be available for the extended version of the framework in 2015.</p>

Sub-indicator 4.1.2	Is public (national, subnational, local) authority money invested in this activity?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	Funding at Federal and State level for ESD teaching materials exists, e.g. in the Federal State of Baden-Wuerttemberg as part of a substantial initiative of integrating ESD as general guideline in the context of an ongoing curricula reform for primary and secondary schools, or e.g. the Federal State of Hessen funds the development of material in the programme “School year for sustainability “ for primary education, and after 2015 the programme will be extended to pre school and secondary education. Additionally a special set of teaching materials on climate change for upper secondary education, provided with a teacher training module is available for schools. The Federal State of Hamburg developed a set of material – based on the curriculum framework for global development education of nearly all topic areas, Berlin has done a similar funding.
Indicator 4.2 Quality control mechanisms for teaching tools and materials for ESD exist	
Sub-indicator 4.2.1	Do you have quality criteria and/or quality guidelines for ESD-related teaching tools and materials that are: (a) supported by public authorities?; (b) approved by public authorities?; (c) tested and recommended for selection by educational institutions?
(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Please specify.</i>
(b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	Teaching materials that relate entirely or fully to ESD and that are used in publicly recognized education institutions are subject to the same comprehensive quality criteria as all other education materials used in public education.
(c) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	

Sub-indicator 4.2.2	Are ESD teaching tools/materials available: (a) in national languages?; (b) for all levels of education according to ISCED?																				
(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Please specify. If the answer is yes for (b), please specify by ticking (✓) in the table as appropriate.</i>																				
(b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>ISCED levels 2011²⁴</th> <th>Yes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0. Early childhood education</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1. Primary education</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2. Lower secondary education</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3. Upper secondary education</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5. Short-cycle tertiary education</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6. Bachelor's or equivalent level</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7. Master's or equivalent level</td> <td>V</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8. Doctoral or equivalent level</td> <td>V</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	ISCED levels 2011 ²⁴	Yes	0. Early childhood education	V	1. Primary education	V	2. Lower secondary education	V	3. Upper secondary education	V	4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V	5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V	6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	V	7. Master's or equivalent level	V	8. Doctoral or equivalent level	V
ISCED levels 2011 ²⁴	Yes																				
0. Early childhood education	V																				
1. Primary education	V																				
2. Lower secondary education	V																				
3. Upper secondary education	V																				
4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education	V																				
5. Short-cycle tertiary education	V																				
6. Bachelor's or equivalent level	V																				
7. Master's or equivalent level	V																				
8. Doctoral or equivalent level	V																				
Indicator 4.3 Teaching tools and materials for ESD are accessible																					
Sub-indicator 4.3.1	Does a national strategy/mechanism for dissemination of ESD tools and materials exist?																				
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	One key avenue for the dissemination of ESD materials is the major internet portal on ESD funded by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research. Other ministries at Federal and State level run additional activities.																				

²⁴ Education level in accordance with ISCED.

Sub-indicator 4.3.2	Is public authority money invested in this activity?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	See above. No precise figures are available.
Sub-indicator 4.3.3	Are approved ESD teaching materials available through the Internet?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>See above.</i>
Sub-indicator 4.3.4	Is a register or database of ESD teaching tools and materials in the national language(s): (a) accessible through the Internet?; (b) provided through other channels?
(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> (b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>For (a) and (b) please specify and mention by whom it was established and by whom it is managed.</i> (a) See above: www.bne-portal.de, and others such as www.lehrer-online.de and www.BMU.de (Bildungsservice) (b) Information on ESD teaching materials is commonly provided at workshops, seminars and conferences, at higher education institutions, or at public libraries.
<i>Concluding remarks issue 4</i>	<i>Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 4, which corresponds to objective (d) under the Strategy, namely, to ensure that adequate tools and materials for ESD are accessible</i>
	<i>Please address in particular the following questions:</i> – <i>Which actions/initiatives have been particularly successful and why?</i> – <i>What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?</i> – <i>Which other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?</i>
Issue 5. Promote research on and development of ESD	
<i>If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).</i>	
Indicator 5.1 Research²⁵ on ESD is promoted	
Sub-indicator 5.1.1	Is research that addresses content and methods for ESD ²⁶ supported?

²⁵ These include support from various sources, such as State, local authorities, business and non-governmental organizations or institutions.

²⁶ E.g. concepts; formation of attitudes and values; development of competencies, teaching and learning; school development; implementation of information communications technology ;and means of evaluation, including socioeconomic impacts.

Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The Federal Ministry of Research and Technology (BMBF) is allocating financial resources to research and development in ESD.</p> <p>In 2012 a comprehensive overview of “ESD – contributions of education research” looking at the deficits and potentials of ESD research in Germany has been funded and published by the BMBF.</p> <p>Other funding institutions, such as foundations, provide support for ESD research as well. Precise figures cannot be given.</p>
Sub-indicator 5.1.2	Does any research evaluate the outcome of the implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>In Germany, evaluation research refers to ESD implementation in general. In that sense, it also evaluates the implementation of the UNECE Strategy. The UNECE Strategy, however, does not play a major role in guiding research, the key international activity in this regard is the DESD.</p> <p>Three research initiatives that can be mentioned by way of example: In 2007, a project started examining the effects of the Federal Government/State Commission of Educational Planning (BLK) project “Transfer 21” at teacher, school and system level as well as on teaching methods and cognitive attributes of pupils through transfer research. Another project was dedicated to evaluating the measures of the National Action Plan and the Official DESD Projects. Furthermore, in an international project together with Switzerland and Austria, German universities have been working on an interdisciplinary project to develop indicators for ESD.</p>
Sub-indicator 5.1.3	<p>Are post-graduate programmes available:</p> <p>(1) on ESD:²⁷ (a) for the master’s level?; (b) for the doctorate level?;</p> <p>(2) addressing ESD: (a) for the master’s level?; (b) for the doctorate level?</p>

²⁷ ESD is addressed by substance and/or by approach.

<p>(1) (a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> (b) Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> (2) (a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> (b) Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Please specify what programmes are available and list the most important academic dissertations that address ESD.</i></p> <p>(1) (a) i) A Master of Arts programme called “Education for Sustainable Development/Geography“ is offered by the University of Eichstätt-Ingolstadt. ii) The University of Applied Science in Erfurt is planning a Master programme in “Network Management with the major field of study in ESD”. iii) The University of Rostock is offering an in-service master programme in “Environment and Education” which equals a Master in ESD. The same university offers further training programmes in ESD that are mainly aimed at post-graduates.</p> <p>(2) (a) The following post-graduate programmes which include ESD in their curricula: - Master of Education for German primary and secondary schools; subject: social and general studies (Osnabrück University) - Master of Educational Science for German primary, secondary and secondary modern schools; subject: Geography (University of Vechta) - Master of Educational Science for German primary, secondary and secondary modern schools; subject: Biology (major: sustainable development) (University of Freiburg)</p> <p>Also, the following post-graduate programmes include environmental education (with an orientation towards ESD) into their curricula: - Master of Arts in Sustainable Tourism Management (University for Sustainable Development Eberswalde) - Master of Science in Regional Development and Conservation (University for Sustainable Development Eberswalde) - Master in Environmental Sciences: Human and environment in history, present and future (University of Hildesheim)</p> <p>In addition, there are five study programmes for educators dealing with ESD that lead to a “state examination” certification, which is equivalent to a Masters degree.</p> <p>(1) (b) + (2) (b) Obtaining a doctorate in Germany does usually not include lectures or seminars. Thus, it depends solely on the PhD student, and consultations with the supervisor, to decide to include ESD into her/his doctoral work.</p> <p>For an overview on Study and Research on Sustainability in general: http://www.leitfaden-nachhaltigkeit.de/index_en.html</p>
<p>Sub-indicator 5.1.4</p>	<p>Are there any scholarships supported by public authorities for post-graduate research in ESD: (a) for the master’s level; (b) for the doctorate level?</p>
<p>(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> (b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Please provide information on (a) and (b).</i></p> <p>There are no specific scholarships merely dedicated to ESD research at master or doctoral level. However, various funding institutions, such as the DBU, support ESD research, including at master and doctoral level.</p>

Indicator 5.2 Development of ESD is promoted	
Sub-indicator 5.2.1	Is there any support for innovation and capacity-building in ESD practice? ²⁸
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Numerous activities carried out in the context of DESD implementation support innovation and capacity-building in ESD practice. The title of Official German DESD Project is awarded for, among other things, innovative approaches. Capacity-building is carried out through workshops, seminars, publications and multi-stakeholder teams such as the Working Groups set up in the context of the DESD organizational structure.</p> <p>DESD implementation by the German Commission for UNESCO is supported with around 450,000 Euros per year by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research. Further funding for ESD, mostly from the Federal Ministry of Education and Research but also from other institutions, is available. Precise figures cannot be given.</p>
Indicator 5.3 Dissemination of research results on ESD is promoted	
Sub-indicator 5.3.1	Is there any public authority support for mechanisms ²⁹ to share the results of research and examples of good practices in ESD ³⁰ among authorities and stakeholders?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	An important objective of the German DESD implementation outlined above is the dissemination of good-practice and research results through workshops, seminars, the internet portal, committee meetings, publications. Addressees are decision makers, education authorities, other education stakeholders, as well as the interested general public. For total numbers, see above.

²⁸ Activities may include projects, action research, social learning and multi-stakeholder teams.

²⁹ E.g., conferences, summer schools, journals, periodicals, networks.

³⁰ E.g., the “participatory approach”; links to local, regional and global problems; an integrative approach to environmental, economic and social issues; an orientation to understanding, preventing and solving problems.

Sub-indicator 5.3.2	Are there any scientific publications: (a) specifically on ESD?;(b) addressing ESD?
(a) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Please name the major publications for (a) and (b).</i>
(b) Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	(a) A considerable number of scientific publications on ESD and addressing ESD is being published every year. No precise numbers can be given. (b) see above
<i>Concluding remarks on issue 5</i>	<i>Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 5, which corresponds to objective (e) under the Strategy, namely, to promote research on and development of ESD.</i>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> — <i>Which actions/initiatives have been particularly successful and why?</i> — <i>What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?</i> — <i>Which other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?</i>
Issue 6. Strengthen cooperation on ESD at all levels within the ECE region	
<i>If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).</i>	
Indicator 6.1 International cooperation on ESD is strengthened within the ECE region and beyond	
Sub-indicator 6.1.1	Do your public authorities cooperate in/support international ³¹ networks on ESD?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	German public authorities have a wealth of experience in international networks, working groups, associations on ESD at all educational levels. Examples for international exchange include the global network of UNESCO National Commissions. Numerous organizations active in the DESD work internationally, such as GIZ, which has established a major programme to bring together and train future ESD leaders in ESD from Germany, developing countries and emerging economies to form an international network of ESD experts. At the end of 2014 this ESD-Expertnet is established as an international operational body which has already developed a special contribution the Global Action Programme. For more information see www.esd-expert.net
Sub-indicator 6.1.2	Do educational institutions/organizations (formal and non-formal) in your country participate in international networks related to ESD?

³¹ In this context, international associations, working groups, programmes, partnerships, etc., means those at the global, regional and subregional levels.

Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>While activities in this area could be expanded, international cooperation by educational institutions and organizations is well established. Important networks on ESD or with a focus on ESD include the UNESCO Associated Schools Project Network, the Copernicus Alliance in the field of higher education, and Eco Schools of the Foundation for Environmental Education. Hessen is part of the international network “ENSI”</p> <p>Funded by NGOs and the federal ministry of international cooperation, international partnerships between schools and other educational institutions are promoted and organized. In 2013 a new non-profit organisation “Engagement Global” was established by the ministry of international cooperation to provide assistance for students and the civil society in the field of ESD cooperation</p>
Sub-indicator 6.1.3	Are there any state, bilateral and/or multilateral cooperation mechanisms/agreements that include an explicit ESD component?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	ESD plays an increasing role in German development cooperation activities, see the GIZ project listed above.
Sub-indicator 6.1.4	Does your Government take any steps to promote ESD in international forums outside the ECE region?
Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Germany has been actively and strongly supporting DESD implementation by UNESCO, the lead organization for the DESD within the UN. This includes co-organizing and funding the UNESCO World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development in 2009 in Bonn, and a follow-up workshop with international experts on the future of ESD beyond the Decade in 2012.</p> <p>This includes high ranking participation at ministerial level at international conferences such as the Nagoya conference marking the end of DESD.</p> <p>Germany supported the inclusion of ESD in the proposal of the SDGs in the Post-2015 process during 2014.</p>
<i>Concluding remarks on issue 6</i>	<i>Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 6, which corresponds to objective (f) under the Strategy, namely, to strengthen cooperation on ESD at all levels within the ECE region</i>
	<p><i>Please address in particular the following questions:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>Which actions/ initiatives have been particularly successful and for which reason?</i> - <i>What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?</i> - <i>Which other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?</i>
Issue 7.	Foster conservation, use and promotion of knowledge of indigenous peoples, as well as local and traditional knowledge, in ESD

Provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific issue (up to 2,000 characters with spaces). Please be as specific as possible.

Not applicable to any major extent. Local and traditional knowledge regarding ESD is fostered by some Official DESD Projects.

What the role does this issue play in ESD implementation in your country? Please provide updated information to indicate changes over time.

Issue 8. Describe any challenges and obstacles encountered in the implementation of the Strategy

Provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific issue (up to 2,000 characters with spaces). Please be as specific as possible.

Implementation of the DESD in Germany has been considerably successful since 2005 compared to similar initiatives. The German Parliament supported the DESD in a unanimous resolution in 2005. DESD implementation is carried out under the patronage of the German Federal President. Hundreds of stakeholders participate in the organizational structure set up by the German Commission for UNESCO with funding from the Federal Ministry of Education and Research. Over 2,000 good-practice projects have been awarded the title of Official German DESD Project on the basis of a competitive application process.

Challenges and obstacles include:

- Some major stakeholders from the education and sustainable-development fields are not part of DESD implementation yet.
 - ESD is still being perceived as an add-on to the curriculum and not as a cross-cutting principle.
 - Integration of ESD into curricula and other normative documents needs to be further increased.
 - ESD stakeholders need to undertake increased efforts to communicate ESD to other education stakeholders and reach out beyond their own community.
- It needs to be clarified how ESD can contribute to the increase of overall educational quality.
- ESD research needs to link up better with existing education and sustainable-development research.
 - A systematic evaluation of learning outcomes regarding ESD should be considered

Issue 9. Future implementation of Education for Sustainable Development

Is there a political commitment/an indication that ESD implementation will continue to be supported after the end of phase III of the UNECE Strategy for ESD and after the United Nations Decade of ESD in your country? If yes, is there already an indication of implementation priorities?

- *DESD activities have been concluded with a major two day stakeholder conference in September 2014 at which over 500 ESD experts, practitioners and administrator took part. A report of the conference and the outcome document, the Bonn Declaration 2014, is available in English: <http://www.bnekonferenz2014.de/national-conference/>*
- *Currently the transition to an implementation of the Global Action Programme for ESD is taking place. A national platform, an annual congress as a multi-stakeholder platform on ESD and a reward system similar as under the DESD are in preparation. The process is led by the National Ministry of Education and Research. In the most recent coalition agreement by the current government the goal of “strengthening ESD at all education levels” has been included.*
- *Also at the level of Federal States similar processes are taking shape to continue working on ESD at federal level.*

Appendix I (a)

Indicator 2.1, sub-indicator 2.1.1

Please specify which key themes of SD are addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education by filling in the table below. *(Please tick (✓) relevant themes for each level. Use the blank rows to insert additional themes that are considered to be key themes in addressing learning for SD.)*

Also, could you specify which specific themes are of critical importance in your country and why?

Some key themes covered by sustainable development	ISCED Levels 2011								
	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Peace studies (e.g., international relations, security and conflict resolution, partnerships)			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Ethics and philosophy	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Citizenship, democracy and governance			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Human rights (e.g., gender and racial and intergenerational equity)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Poverty alleviation	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Cultural diversity	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Biological and landscape diversity			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Environmental protection (waste management, etc.)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Ecological principles/ecosystem approach				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Natural resource management (e.g., water, soil, mineral, fossil fuels)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Climate change	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Personal and family health (e.g., HIV/AIDS, drug abuse)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Environmental health (e.g., food and drinking; water quality; pollution)		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Corporate social responsibility				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Production and/or consumption patterns			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Economics			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Rural/urban development		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Total									
Other <i>(countries to add as many as needed)</i>									

Note: Your response will reflect the variety of ESD themes distributed across the ISCED levels. The distribution is more important than the raw number of ticks. The number of ticks may be used for your own monitoring purposes.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 153 ticks; “other” categories not counted) is:

No. of ticks	0–9	10–16	17–39	40–75	76–112	113–153
Scale	A	B	C	D	E	F

Appendix I (b)

Indicator 2.1, sub-indicator 2.1.2

Please specify the extent to which the following broad areas of competence that support ESD are addressed explicitly in the curriculum³²/programme of study at various levels of formal education, by filling in the table below. (Please tick (✓) relevant expected learning outcomes for each level. Use the blank rows to insert additional learning outcomes (skills, attitudes and values) that are considered to be key outcomes in your country in learning for SD.)

Table of learning outcomes

Competence	Expected outcomes	ISCED Levels								
		0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Learning to learn Does education at each level enhance learners' capacity for:	- posing analytical questions/critical thinking?			✓	✓		✓			
	- understanding complexity/systemic thinking?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- overcoming obstacles/problem-solving?			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- managing change/problem-setting?						✓	✓	✓	✓
	- creative thinking/future-oriented thinking?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- understanding interrelationships across disciplines/holistic approach?			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	Total									
- other (countries to add as many as needed)?										
-										
Learning to do Does education at each level enhance learners' capacity for:	- applying learning in a variety of life-wide contexts?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- decision-making, including in situations of uncertainty?			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- dealing with crises and risks?				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- acting responsibly?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- acting with self-respect?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	- acting with determination?			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
	Total									
- other (countries to add as many as needed)?										

³² At the state level, where relevant.

Competence	Expected outcomes	ISCED Levels									
		0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Learning to be Does education at each level enhance learners' capacity for:	- self-confidence?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- self-expression and communication?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- coping under stress?				V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- ability to identify and clarify values (<i>for phase III</i>)?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	Total										
	- other (<i>countries to add as many as needed</i>)?										
Learning to live and work together Does education at each level enhance learners' capacity for:	- acting with responsibility (locally and globally)?			V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- acting with respect for others?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- identifying stakeholders and their interests?				V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- collaboration/team working?			V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- participation in democratic decision-making?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- negotiation and consensus-building?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	- distributing responsibilities (subsidiarity)?	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
	Total	12	12	19	22	21	23	22	22	22	22
	- other (<i>countries to add as many as needed</i>)?										
-											

Note: Your response will reflect the variety of ESD themes distributed across the ISCED levels. The distribution is more important than the raw number of ticks. The number of ticks may be used for your own monitoring purposes.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 207 ticks; "other" not counted) is:

No. of ticks	0–11	12–21	22–53	54–105	106–156	157–207
Scale	A	B	C	D	E	F

Appendix I (c)

Indicator 2.1, sub-indicator 2.1.3

Please indicate the teaching/learning methods used for ESD at the different ISCED levels. (Please tick (✓) relevant teaching/learning methods for each level. Use the blank rows to insert additional teaching/learning methods that are considered to be key methods in your country in teaching-learning for sustainable development.)

Table of teaching-learning methods

Some key ESD teaching/learning methods proposed by the Strategy ^a	ISCED Levels								
	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Discussions		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Conceptual and perceptual mapping		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Philosophical inquiry	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Value clarification	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Simulations; role playing; games	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Scenarios; modelling			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Information and communication technology (ICT)		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Surveys				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Case studies				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Excursions and outdoor learning	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Learner-driven projects	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Good practice analyses				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Workplace experience				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Problem-solving				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Total	5	8	9	14	14	14	14	14	14
Other (countries to add as many as needed)									

Note: Your response will reflect the variety of ESD themes distributed across the ISCED levels. The distribution is more important than the raw number of ticks. The number of ticks may be used for your own monitoring purposes.

^a Please refer to paragraph 33(e) of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 126 ticks; “other” not counted) is:

No. of ticks	0–8	9–42	43–53	54–76	77–98	99–126
Scale	A	B	C	D	E	F

Appendix II

Indicator 2.6, sub-indicator 2.6.1

Please specify to what extent ESD implementation is a multi-stakeholder process by filling in the table below. Please provide examples of good practice. *(Please tick (✓) in both (a) and (b) template-tables to indicate what types of education stakeholders are involved.)*

Table (a)

According to the UNECE Strategy for ESD

Stakeholders	Classification by UNECE Strategy for ESD		
	<i>Formal</i>	<i>Non-formal</i>	<i>Informal</i>
NGOs	✓	✓	✓
Local government	✓	✓	✓
Organized labour		✓	✓
Private sector	✓	✓	✓
Community-based	✓	✓	✓
Faith-based		✓	✓
Media		✓	✓
Total			
Other (<i>countries to add as many as needed</i>)	4	7	7

The scoring key for this table (maximum 21 ticks; “other” not counted) is:

No. of ticks	0–1	2	3–5	6–10	11–15	16–21
Scale	A	B	C	D	E	F

Table (b)
According to United Nations Decade of ESD

Stakeholders	Classification by United Nations Decade of ESD				
	<i>Public awareness</i>	<i>Quality education</i>	<i>Reorienting education</i>	<i>Training</i>	<i>Social learning</i>
NGOs	V	V	V	V	V
Local government	V	V	V	V	V
Organized labour	V	V	V	V	V
Private sector	V	V	V	V	V
Community-based	V	V	V	V	V
Faith-based	V	V	V	V	V
Media	V	V	V	V	V
Total	7	7	7	7	7
Other (<i>countries to add as many as needed</i>)					

The scoring key for this table (maximum 35 ticks; “other” not counted) is:

No. of ticks	0-5	6-11	12-17	18-23	24-29	30-35
Scale	A	B	C	D	E	F

Appendix III

Indicator 3.1, sub-indicator 3.1.3

As the training of educational professionals is run by the independent universities in Germany there is no special information with concrete data available. But examples of practice show, that there are several activities already established from single courses (initial and In-service) up to comprehensive course for all students at some universities. End of 2014 a group of teacher educators established a platform “Teachers for ESD” to provide the further development.

Please specify to what extent ESD is a part of the initial and/or in-service educator’s training, by filling in the table below by ticking (✓) as appropriate.

ISCED levels	Percentage of education professionals who have received training ^a to integrate ESD into their practice																	
	<i>Educators</i>												<i>Leaders/administrators^b</i>					
	<i>Initial^c</i>						<i>In service^d</i>						<i>In service^e</i>					
	A	B	C	D	E	F	A	B	C	D	E	F	A	B	C	D	E	F
0.																		
1.																		
2.																		
3.																		
4.																		
5.																		
6.																		
7.																		
8.																		
Non-formal																		
Informal																		

^a Training is understood to include at least one day (a minimum of five contact hours).

^b See paras. 54 and 55 of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

^c Please indicate the number of educators who have received initial training on ESD as a percentage of the total number of educators by the reporting date.

^d Please indicate the number of educators who have received training on ESD as a percentage of the total number of educators who received in-service teacher training by the reporting date.

^e Please indicate the number of leaders/administrators who have received training on ESD as a percentage of total number of leaders/administrators who received in-service teacher training by the reporting date.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 100%) is:

Percentage of educated trainers	0-5	6-10	11-25	26-50	51-75	76-100
Scale	A	B	C	D	E	F

Appendix IV

Summary and self-assessment by countries

Please specify the status of efforts to implement the sub-indicators listed in the table below by ticking (✓) as appropriate.

On the basis of the answers to the sub-indicators, please self-assess the status of the implementation of the respective indicator in your country. If feasible, please specify the methodology used for the self-assessment.

Indicator 1.1	Prerequisite measures are taken to support the promotion of ESD	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 1.2	Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 1.3	National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 2.1	SD key themes are addressed in formal education	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 2.2	Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 2.3	A whole-institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 2.4	ESD is addressed by quality assessment/enhancement systems	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 2.5	ESD methods and instruments for non-formal and informal learning are in place to assess changes in knowledge, attitude and practice	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 2.6	ESD implementation is a multi-stakeholder process	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 3.1	ESD is included in the training of educators	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 3.2	Opportunities exist for educators to cooperate on ESD	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 4.1	Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 4.2	Quality control mechanisms for teaching tools and materials for ESD exist	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 4.3	Teaching tools and materials for ESD are accessible	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 5.1	Research on ESD is promoted	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed

		Completed
Indicator 5.2	Development of ESD is promoted	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress X <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 5.3	Dissemination of research results on ESD is promoted	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress X <input type="checkbox"/> Developing <input type="checkbox"/> Completed
Indicator 6.1	International cooperation on ESD is strengthened within the ECE region and beyond	<input type="checkbox"/> Not started <input type="checkbox"/> In progress <input type="checkbox"/> Developing X <input type="checkbox"/> Completed