

ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

104th meeting
Geneva, 11 March 2019

Item 4

Informal Document No.
2019/9/Rev.1

Annual report on evaluation 2018

Note by the Secretariat

INTRODUCTION

1. The present report is submitted to the Executive Committee (EXCOM) for information. EXCOM requested the Secretariat to prepare an annual report on evaluation at the ninety-first Meeting on 24 March 2017¹, beginning with an annual report for 2017. The purpose of the report is to inform the UNECE member States on evaluation efforts conducted during the past year, future evaluation plans, the status and information on completed, ongoing evaluations, and changes generated by the implementation of relevant recommendations.

2. As per the UNECE Evaluation Policy, the Secretariat undertakes evaluations for the purpose of learning, as well as to improve the future work of the organization. The present report consolidates and analyses the outcome of all evaluations conducted in 2018 in order to support this objective. The Executive Secretary, through the Programme Management Unit (PMU), ensures the consistent application of evaluation norms and standards across UNECE, and ensures the application of the key outcomes of evaluations into the future planning of the UNECE programme of work.

3. The analysis is based on the results of all evaluations conducted and/or commissioned by UNECE, relevant external and/or system-wide evaluations, and the UN System Wide Action Plan (UN-SWAP) to implement the Chief Executives Board for Coordination (CEB) Policy on gender equality and the empowerment of women.²

2. BACKGROUND ON EVALUATION IN THE UN SECRETARIAT

4. UNECE is governed by the Secretary-General's instructions for the UN Secretariat³, which outlines the requirements for evaluation for all departments. The purpose of evaluation is to determine as systematically and objectively as possible the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and impact of the Organization's activities in relation to their objectives, and to enable the Secretariat and Member States to engage in systematic reflection, and, if necessary, reviewing their objectives.⁴

5. To this end, all programmes shall be evaluated over a fixed time period, which shall include periodic self-evaluation of activities and the ad hoc in-depth evaluation of selected programme areas or topics.⁵ Evaluations may be conducted by external entities (OIOS, the Joint Inspection Unit, at the request of Member States), or by respective departments (so called "self-evaluation"). Self-evaluation shall be independent and present the effectiveness and impact of subprogrammes, outputs and activities. Heads of departments shall enforce the quality standards, methodology, transfer of evaluation information, and ad hoc studies.

¹ http://www.unecce.org/fileadmin/DAM/commission/EXCOM/Agenda/2017/92Excom-23_June_17/Item_2-Chair_s_conclusions-24.03.2017.pdf

² CEB/2006/2

³ ST/SGB/2018/3 Secretary-General's bulletin Regulations and Rules Governing Programme Planning, the Programme Aspects of the Budget, the Monitoring of Implementation and the Methods of Evaluation, 1 June 2018

⁴ ST/SGB/2018/3 Reg 7.1

⁵ ST/SGB/2018/3 Reg 7.2 And Rule 107.2

6 UNECE is also an active member of the UN Evaluation Group (UNEG), which establishes the norms and standards for evaluation for all UN agencies, funds and programmes. OIOS produces a biennial scorecard on the extent to which departments adhere to the UNEG norms and standards.

7. Resolution 72/303⁶, adopted by the General Assembly on 5 July 2018, welcomed the efforts of the Secretary-General towards a strong culture of accountability throughout the Secretariat, and stressed that an effective accountability system is central to successful management of the Organization. In particular, para.16 emphasizes that evaluation and self-evaluation are essential managerial tools and that senior managers have the responsibility to use evaluation and self-evaluation findings to improve performance and learning, and in this regard requests the Secretary-General to continue to take concrete measures to enhance in-house capacity for self-evaluation.

8. In addition, with reference to the General Assembly resolution 72/266 approving the proposed changes to the format and frequency of the budget report is to enable Member States to assess past performance, the lessons learned from improved evaluation and how they were applied to subsequent programme planning and resource requests in a timely manner⁷.

3. KEY ACHIEVEMENTS

9. A total of ten evaluations (subprogramme and end of project) were delivered in 2018: one contained in the Biennial Evaluation Plan (2018-2019) scheduled for 2018; four evaluations of UNDA projects, and five evaluations of extrabudgetary projects.

3.1 Implementation of outstanding evaluation recommendations from institutional-level evaluations

3.1.1 External evaluations

10. UNECE reports progress on closing recommendations to OIOS every six-months, and through the annual Compact of the Executive Secretary with the Secretary-General. The latest Progress Reports as of 31 December 2018, are available in Open UNECE website. As at 31 December 2018, 100% of the 7 recommendations due in 2018 were closed on time.

11. In 2018, UNECE was subject to outstanding recommendations from three institutional-level evaluations.

*OIOS Evaluation of UNECE (2016)*⁸

12. The OIOS made five recommendations for UNECE the programme evaluation published in 2016. In 2018, the last two outstanding recommendations were closed.

a) Recommendation (4) called for the UNECE secretariat to examine how its activities

⁶ <https://undocs.org/A/RES/72/303>

⁷ Reference is made to the Summary of SG Report A/72/492/Add.1, accessible at <https://undocs.org/A/72/492/Add.1>

⁸ IED-16-003, Evaluation of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (ECE)

under existing norms, standards, conventions, and related review mechanisms and statistical work can contribute to attainment of the SDGs.

In line with this recommendation, all UNECE subprogrammes have been fully aligned with the SDGs, in support of the 2030 Agenda. Biennial Programmes of Work of ECE subprogrammes have been approved by the respective Sectoral Committees, and methodologies for the country assessments have been adjusted. The alignment of all subprogrammes towards the nine SDGs that define the core specialization of UNECE (SDGs 3, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13 and 15, while SDGs 5 and 17 underpin all of them) is reflected in the 2020 Proposed Programme budget

- b) Recommendation (5) called for the UNECE secretariat to undertake a mapping of existing partnerships and cooperation with non-state actors and develop specific proposals for expanding and strengthening such cooperation in support of the SDGs.

In line with this recommendation, UNECE EXCOM approved (a) a Framework for the Engagement with the business sector, and (b) a due diligence procedure for agreement with private sector entities in October 2017. Further the Executive Secretary' strategy and vision, was presented to EXCOM in May 2018 (Informal Document 2018/12). In this document, the Executive Secretary defined the nexus approach for UNECE's work, articulating four Nexus areas, around which UNECE will partner with various entities to maximize the results on the ground in the region. Since the adoption of the 2030 Agenda, the Secretariat has continuously expanded its networks with non-state actors. Following the model of engagement developed for the Asia-pacific region, a Regional Civil Society Engagement Mechanism (RCEM) for the Agenda 2030 process of the UNECE region was established in June 2018.

***OIOS - Thematic evaluation of the United Nations Regional Commissions
(2017)⁹***

13. The Regional Commissions are due to report progress on implementing the recommendations at the time of the triennial review which will be due at the end of 2019. During 2018, UNECE closed 3 recommendations arising from this evaluation according to the established deadlines:

- a) Recommendation (5) called for Regional Commissions to develop and implement a strategy to enhance the capacity of all UN Member States for dissemination and use of statistics at the national level, including guidelines and recommendations.

The Conference of European Statisticians (CES) adopted a strategy for capacity development in the UNECE region in June 2018. The strategy emphasizes the importance of capacity development in countries not only in statistical subject-matter areas but also on so-called "soft skills", including statistical dissemination and communication.

- b) Recommendation (3) called for Regional Commissions to develop region-specific tools,

⁹ E/AC.51/2017/8, Thematic evaluation of the regional commissions, 17 March 2017

guidelines, frameworks and templates (taking into consideration the Guidelines by the Partnership in Statistics for the 21st Century - Paris 21), in order to strengthen their support to Member States with development and refinement of their National Statistical Plans and National Strategy for the Development of Statistics, to ensure that they take into account the goals, priorities and needs of the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda.

In line with this recommendation, UNECE has been carrying out global assessments for statistical systems of countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia (together with Eurostat and EFTA). The global assessments provide a good basis for the countries to develop national strategies and plans for development of statistics¹⁰.

UNECE also developed a Road Map on statistics for SDGs that gives guidance to countries on how to set up a system of providing statistics for SDGs. The Road Map includes recommendations and tools to support countries in this work¹¹.

Finally, UNECE has been undertaking statistical capacity activities as part of a 2017-2020 programme for the improvement of economic and social statistics in support of the implementation of the 2008 System of National Accounts (SNA) based on extrabudgetary resources. UNECE has developed a regional plan for the implementation of the 2008 SNA in countries of East Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia and South East Europe, which follows the global strategy adopted by the UN Statistical Commission.

- c) Recommendation (4) called for Regional Commissions to strengthen internal coordination within each Regional Commission with regard to the production and dissemination of sectoral data.

The UNECE Statistics Division maintains a central database and web interface for all statistical data produced by UNECE (<http://w3.unece.org/PXWeb/en>). This includes data on economic and social and demographic statistics (provided by the Statistical Division), transport (provided by Transport Division) and timber (provided by Forestry and Timber Section). The Statistical Division collects data through joint questionnaires with Eurostat, OECD and UNSD, or directly from the databases of other international organizations (such as Eurostat and OECD). On 11 December 2017, UNECE EXCOM approved the Mandates and Terms of Reference of the Teams of Specialists under the Conference of European Statisticians for the period 2018-2022 (ECE/EX/2017/L.14). As stated in para. 12: the work will build on existing national and international experience, including the results of related initiatives of UNSD, Eurostat, OECD, World Trade Organization (WTO) and IMF1. The Task Force will ensure coordination with and input to corresponding work undertaken by the Expert Group on International Trade and Economic Globalization Statistics (ITEGS), the G20 Data Gaps Initiative, Eurostat's Integrated Global Accounts (IGA) –projects, the CES Task Force on Common Elements of Statistical Legislation and the Data Integration Project under the UNECE High-level Group for the modernization of official statistics.

¹⁰ The results of latest global assessments are available at: <http://www.unece.org/statcoop/ga.html>.

¹¹ <https://statswiki.unece.org/display/SFSDG/Statistics+for+SDGs+Home>

3.1.2 Internal evaluation

Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work (2017)

14. The 7 recommendations from this evaluation were implemented and closed in 2018. As a result of this evaluation and since the adoption of the 2030 Agenda, UNECE has fully aligned its work to the SDGs, taking into account linkages between subprogrammes, and establishing a number of cross-divisional cooperation arrangements.

- a) Recommendation (1) called for UNECE to become a more integrated organization

The Executive Secretary strategy and vision for UNECE was presented to EXCOM in May 2018 (Informal Document 2018/12). In this document, the Executive Secretary articulated the four Nexus areas, to further align UNECE activities with the 2030 Agenda for sustainable development. Operationalization of the Nexuses is underway.

- b) Recommendation (2) called for the inclusion of the “nexus dialogues” in the UNECE strategic planning & budgeting process

The 2020 programme plan submitted to EXCOM in December 2018 includes the four Nexus areas and collaboration between the related thematic areas.

- c) Recommendation (3) encouraged UNECE to institutionalize information and knowledge sharing among subject-matter experts

While the implementation of the 2017 Knowledge Management action plan has been completed, in 2018, UNECE has focused its Knowledge Management activities around the alignment to SDGs and work on its priority areas.

- d) Recommendation (4) highlighted the need to capitalize on existing corporate coordination bodies.

All meetings of the Working Group on Technical Cooperation convened since the beginning of 2017 have included discussions on how to coordinate activities between Regional Advisers. Measures such as reprogramming residual RPTC Funds have included a criteria on joint activities, which has provided additional incentives for cross-collaboration.

- e) Recommendation (5) called for the establishment of a network of Secretaries to Sectoral Committees in support of Sectoral Committee bureau

In 2018, instead of establishing a virtual community of practice, OES, and in particular the Secretary of the Commission, has engaged in consultations with Secretaries of Committees to discuss governance issues, procedural matters and cross-cutting issues. One expression of these intensified consultations is the identification of a nexus issue as the overarching theme for the 2019 UNECE Commission Session, to which all subprogrammes, including all Secretaries of Sectoral Committees, contribute.

- f) Recommendation (6) called for the introduction of human resource measures that facilitate cross-sectoral cooperation

The Segment I of the 2020 Proposed Programme Budget for Section 20 and Section 23 include four nexuses and elaborate on appropriate collaboration between related thematic areas. As part of the Nexus approach, the Secretariat is presently operationalizing the Nexus teams.

- g) Recommendation (7) called for UNECE to address structural inefficiencies linked to cross-sectoral cooperation.

As a result of this recommendation, the Executive Secretary launched a review of UNECE administrative processes, which was completed in March 2018. EXCOM also took note “of the efforts led by the Executive Secretary to align UNECE work to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and looks forward to further updates on the issue” (EXCOM/CONCLU/98).

3.2 Implementation of outstanding evaluation recommendations from internal evaluations

15. With the recruitment of the full complement of staff resources in PMU in August 2018, a backlog of 118 outstanding recommendations from internal evaluations conducted since 2014 was reviewed during the last quarter of 2018. As a result, 97 recommendations (82%) have been fully implemented and closed. Details of the actions taken can be found in progress reports as of 31 December 2018, available in Open UNECE¹².

3.3 Limitations

16. During 2018, the PMU was limited by a shortage in staff resources until the recruitment of the new P-4 Programme Officer in August. With this recruitment, the Secretariat has returned to monitoring and reporting on outstanding recommendations and improvements to the programme of work as a result of evaluation activities as a continuous priority for 2019.

4. KEY CONCLUSIONS

Analysis of the results of the five internal evaluations highlighted the following five key areas:

17. **Strengthening stakeholder support for UNECE activities and interventions.** As noted previously in the 2017 Evaluation report¹³, a challenge identified to the successful implementation of projects remains insufficient support from partners, stakeholders and decision-makers. Recommendations from the reports indicate the need for UNECE increasing dialogue with governments, research institutions, and development partners to ensure long term impact of the projects. Some recommendations pointed out that activities could become institutionalized if formally integrated into official state or interstate structure.

18. **Continuation of UNECE activities/projects to obtain greater impact.** As noted in 2017, 2018 evaluation reports identified value in the extension or building upon previous projects to further continue or expand the impact of UNECE interventions. The reports indicate

¹² <http://www.unece.org/info/open-unece/evaluation-and-audit.html>

¹³ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/commission/EXCOM/Agenda/2018/97EXCOM-19-March-18/Item_4-ECE_EX_2018_5_Annual_Evaluation_Report_2018.pdf

that such continuation would increase the long-term impact of the projects. Some recommendations also highlighted that greater impact can also be obtained by replicating successful projects and building on the lessons learnt in another region, by UNECE, or by sharing of experiences between countries.

19. **Strengthening the gender dimension.** Two recommendations formulated in 2018 recommend practical approaches to strengthen the gender approach in environment projects, for example by giving a special notice on equal participation of women to respective ministries when organizing workshops. Amendments in December 2017 to internal directives requiring mandatory gender aspects in project documents are expected to yield results at the end of this first cycle of new projects.

20. **Use of social media.** Two recommendations highlighted that the use of social media could help strengthening interactions and building knowledge network between experts. One recommendation pointed that it would keep the exchanges ongoing between scheduled activities.

21. **Importance of knowledge management.** Two reports noted the importance of ensuring knowledge and expertise transfer at the end of the project. One recommendation was to establish an online archive system to ensure the knowledge generated by the project is not lost.

5. EVALUATIONS COMPLETED

22. The Biennial Evaluation Plan for 2018-2019 was approved by EXCOM in September 2016¹⁴. The Biennial Plans are developed based on an assessment of risk, as well as ensuring the widest possible coverage of the UNECE programme of work over successive biennia.

5.1 Internal evaluation

23. Six evaluations planned for 2018 were completed. In addition, a total of four end-of-project evaluations were conducted. Three projects amounted to a total of USD \$875,000 over their lifespan; while the expenditures of the UNECE Gas Centre are estimated at EUR 4 million for the period 2001-2014.

24. Three evaluations scheduled in 2018 were postponed to the second year of the biennium: one contained in the Biennial Evaluation Plan (2018-2019) and initially scheduled for 2018; and two evaluations of extrabudgetary projects:

- a) The planned Evaluation of the studies on *Regulatory and Procedural barriers to Trade in Kyrgyzstan* contained in the Biennial Evaluation Plan (2018-2019) was cancelled because of a similar evaluation being conducted for the extrabudgetary project *Removing regulatory and procedural barriers to trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan*, during the fourth quarter of 2018. Instead, the biennial evaluation of the Trade subprogramme will look at UNECE's support to the advancement of Regulatory Cooperation and Standardization Policies in Member States (Working Party 6). It will be conducted during the second quarter of 2019.

¹⁴ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/commission/EXCOM/Agenda/2016/87Excom-18Nov16/Item_2-Chair_conclusions_16.09.2016.pdf

b) The planned evaluations of the extrabudgetary projects *Competitiveness, innovative policies and PPPs: capacity building for civil servants and business associations in the CIS countries (2014-October 2017)* and *Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of the Sustainable Development Goals (2015 – September 2017)*, have been delayed to the first quarter of 2019 because some activities continued through end of December 2018.

The following evaluations were completed in 2018.

| | Category of Evaluation | Title of Evaluation | Sub-programme |
|----|-------------------------------|--|---|
| 1 | Subprogramme | Evaluation of the UNECE ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation: lessons from the use of ForFITS tool that links policy choices and CO2 emission scenarios for inland transport | Transport |
| 2 | UNDA Project | Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing in selected countries with economies in transition | Housing, Land Management and Population |
| 3 | UNDA Project | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Trade |
| 4 | UNDA Project | Strengthening Governments' and water operators' capacity to ensure equity of access to water and sanitation in CIT in the UNECE region with a particular focus on small-scale water supplies and sanitation in rural areas | Environment |
| 5 | UNDA Project | Strengthening national road safety management capacities of developing countries, countries with economies in transition as a means to achieve sustainable, equitable and inclusive development | Transport |
| 6 | XB Project | E236 Strengthening national capacities of CIS to implement UNECE agricultural quality standards | Trade |
| 7 | XB Project | E133 Strengthening cooperation on water quality management in Central Asia | Environment |
| 8 | XB Project | E133 Strengthening cooperation on hydrology and environment between Tajikistan and Afghanistan in the upper Amu Darya River basin | Environment |
| 9 | XB Project | UNECE Gas Centre | Sustainable Energy |
| 10 | XB Project | E182 PPP initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence | Economic Cooperation & Integration |

Table 1: Evaluations Completed in 2018

5.2 External evaluation

25. During the year, UNECE participated in and/or supported a number of external

evaluations of the UN Secretariat, or UN System-Wide as follows:

5.2.1 UN Office of Internal Oversight (OIOS)

Evaluation of United Nations entities' preparedness, policy coherence, and early results associated with their support to the Sustainable Development Goals¹⁵

26. OIOS-IED identified this topic in a risk assessment exercise in 2016 and undertook this evaluation in line with the Secretary-General's vision for a more integrated approach to SDG-related work within the UN system. The objective of this thematic evaluation was to assess, as systematically and objectively as possible, the extent to which UN entities have:

- a) prepared themselves in such a way as to maximize the relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of their individual and collective contributions in support of the implementation of, and monitoring and reporting on, the SDGs in the years ahead;
- b) achieved policy coherence within and among their respective organisations, wherever necessary, and the extent to which the overarching policy framework is fit-for-purpose in helping these entities fulfil their SDG-related responsibilities in the most relevant, efficient and effective ways possible; and,
- c) achieved early results in their support to governments in their efforts to implement, monitor and report on the SDGs.

27. When issued, the evaluation will provide an early, evidence-based assessment in these three areas, with a view to identifying achievements, outstanding gaps, good practices and lessons that might help inform the Organisation's way forward on the SDGs, management reform, and other areas.

5.2.2 Joint Inspection Unit (JIU)

Review of whistle-blower policies and practices in United Nations system organizations JIU/REP/2018/4¹⁶

28. The review involved an analysis of protection against retaliation policies, questionnaire responses and other documentation collected from the 28 JIU participating organizations; interviews with over 400 stakeholders, including 17 individuals who had reported misconduct/wrongdoing and retaliation; focus groups; and a global staff survey on whistle-blower policies, which was conducted across the United Nations system organizations in order to measure perceptions.

29. The review included 11 recommendations directed at legislative bodies and executive heads. Legislative Bodies of UN organizations are called on to ensure that policies and procedures are in place by 2020 to specifically address allegations against executive heads, that functions with a key role in misconduct/wrongdoing and retaliation cases are appropriately independent, and that they report regularly on their activities to the legislative body. The

¹⁵ To be published in 2019

¹⁶ https://www.unjiu.org/sites/www.unjiu.org/files/jiu_rep_2018_4_english_0.pdf

Secretary-General will decide how to translate these recommendations for UN Secretariat departments, including UNECE.

Review of the United Nations System-wide Action Plan on Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN-SWAP)

30. The review was undertaken in response to the request of the General Assembly to the Joint Inspection Unit in its resolution 67/226 “to undertake a system-wide evaluation of the effectiveness, value added and impact of the System-wide Action Plan on Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women as a tool for performance monitoring and accountability for submission to the General Assembly following its full implementation”.

31. Initiated in 2018, the review will determine the extent to which anticipated results were produced for all UN Secretariat departments. The review will draw lessons to improve the performance of the UN-SWAP in the future. The review covers the entire UN-SWAP first phase from 2012 to 2017, with a special emphasis on the last year of implementation in 2017, while also looking at the first half of the year 2018 when the UN-SWAP 2.0 final consultation and launch took place.

Progress report on the recommendations contained in the review of South-South and triangular cooperation in the United Nations system JIU/REP/2018/2¹⁷

32. The review followed up on a previous JIU report on South-South and triangular cooperation in the United Nations system (JIU/REP/2011/3) published in 2011, which presented 12 recommendations. As requested by the General Assembly, the objective of this 2018 review was to make an assessment of the progress made on these recommendations to the United Nations development system on implementing measures to further strengthen the United Nations Office for South-South Cooperation (UNOSSC).

33. The recommendation to the Regional Commissions in the previous review was to develop strategies and establish structures. JIU found that some Regional Commissions have implemented this recommendation by appointing focal points and/or setting up appropriate structures. As a conclusion, JIU recommended that the Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) request the Regional Commissions to set up strategies, structures/mechanisms, and mobilize or reallocate resources at the legislative, programmatic and operational levels dedicated to enhancing sub-regional, regional and interregional South-South cooperation (SSC), and to use the annual meetings of the regional coordination mechanisms (RCM) as a tool for advancing system-wide cooperation and coordination in support of SSC. UNECE will follow closely the forthcoming ECOSOC resolutions in this matter.

Strengthening the policy research uptake in the context of the 2030 Agenda JIU/REP/2018/X¹⁸

34. The overall objective of the review was to offer evidence on the uptake of policy research, identify gaps and overlaps, and outline ways for the United Nations system to produce and use research more effectively, in particular in support of the implementation of the 2030 Agenda

¹⁷ https://www.unjiu.org/sites/www.unjiu.org/files/jiu_rep_2018_2_english_0.pdf

¹⁸ To be published in 2019

for Sustainable Development.

35. The review found that research processes are not always integrated into the strategic vision of the organisations. The vision and actions for research uptake, developed to safeguard that findings are read and validated by a broader audience and have an impact, are not always envisaged in policy research planning. Most organizations have not successfully determined how to best utilize existing capacities in policy research uptake, although such capacities do exist. The insufficiency of internal skills' mapping for uptake allows organisations to seek resources externally, rather than incentivizing and training their own staff.

36. While the report has not yet been released, it is expected that recommendations will encourage long-term partnerships with academic communities at global, regional and national level, and establish basic guidelines for such partnerships. UNECE will carefully review the recommendations to ensure its policies are compliant.

6. EVALUATION PARTNERSHIPS

37. As a small Secretariat department, UNECE leverages partnerships with other relevant organisations to enhance its evaluative function and activities, and coordinates with the other Regional Commissions through the Chiefs of Programme Planning, and the Regional Commissions Monitoring and the Evaluation Focal Point Network. Moreover, UNECE collaborates with other UN entities on evaluation of joint activities. UNECE also engages with the JIU and OIOS on a regular basis.

6.1 UN Evaluation Group (UNEG)

38. UNECE has been an active member of UNEG since 2012. UNEG is an interagency professional network that brings together the evaluation units of the UN system, including UN departments, specialized agencies, funds and programmes, and affiliated organizations.

39. UNECE has actively contributed to discussions within UNEG for defining the future requirements for a centralized evaluation function in the UN Secretariat in HQ, in line with the negotiations regarding strengthening of the impact of the UN Development System. The results of these discussions, and the potential benefits for UN Secretariat departments, including UNECE, will be included in the 2019 Annual Report on Evaluation to EXCOM.

7. UN-SWAP EVALUATION SCORECARD (GENDER) 2018

40. In 2018, UN-WOMEN has rolled out UN-SWAP 2.0, which represents an update of the previous framework, building into it lessons learnt from the first 5 years of implementation.

41. As part of the annual reporting requirements on the UN-SWAP report, each department conducts an annual meta-evaluation of all evaluations completed in the prior year. The UN-SWAP Evaluation Scorecard is a reporting tool organized around four criteria that capture the overall elements related to mainstreaming gender equality and the empowerment of women as reflected in the evaluation reports conducted by the entities in a given year.

42. UNECE achieved a rating of Approaches Requirements for the inclusion of gender in evaluations in 2018 based on a review of 9 evaluation reports. Since December 2017 all new

projects include an extended integrated gender dimension, however improvements won't be witnessed before the completion of the first cycle of projects. The results of this new approach will be systematically reviewed in future Annual Reports on Evaluation, as well as in the next the UN-SWAP Evaluation Scorecard.

8. FUTURE EVALUATIONS

43. The Biennial Evaluation Plans for 2018-2019 and 2020-21 as approved by EXCOM, are contained in Annex I and III. In addition, the projects scheduled to close in 2018-19 and which will undergo an evaluation are attached in Annex II.

44. As the Programme Budget is now annual, the secretariat is not submitting a biennial plan for evaluation for 2022-2023. This plan will be submitted to EXCOM in March 2020, together with the Annual Report on Evaluations for 2019.

Annex I: Approved Biennial Evaluation Plan 2018-2019

| No. | Evaluation Title | Purpose | By Whom | Resources (Financial & Human) | Responsible Staff / & SP Focal Point | Schedule (Q/Y) | Type |
|-----------------------------|---|---|------------|--|--|----------------------------------|---------------------|
| Internal Evaluations | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Evaluation of the effectiveness and impact of gender mainstreaming in UNECE subprogrammes | The evaluation will review the effectiveness and impact of gender mainstreaming in all eight UNECE subprogrammes | Consultant | \$18,000 (external consultant) P5 – 3 months G6 – 0.5 month | <i>Programme Management Unit</i> | Q1 / 2019 | Programme – level |
| 2 | Evaluation of the Environment Performance Reviews (EPRs) | The evaluation will assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impact of the EPRs studies | Consultant | \$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1 month P4 – 1 month G6- 0.5 month | <i>Environment Division</i> | Q2 / 2019 | Subprogramme –level |
| 3 | Evaluation of the studies on Regulatory and Procedural barriers to Trade in Kyrgyzstan. | The evaluation will look at the relevance of the report(s) and its/their effectiveness/impact (i.e. how was it used). | Consultant | \$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1 month P3 – 1 month G6 – 0.5 month | <i>Economic Cooperation and Trade Division</i> | Q3 / 2018 | Subprogramme –level |
| 4 | Evaluation of the UNECE ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation: lessons from the use of ForFITS tool that links policy choices and CO2 emission scenarios for inland transport | The evaluation will review the UNECE ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation focusing on lessons from the use of ForFITS tool | Consultant | \$10,000 (external consultant) P5- 1 month P4- 1 month G6- 0.5 month | <i>Transport Division</i> | Q4 / 2018 | Subprogramme –level |
| | | | | | | Monthly Cost¹⁶ | Total |
| | | | | Consultancy | | | \$ 48,000 |
| | | | | P5 – 6 months | \$19.791 | | \$118.750 |
| | | | | P4 - 2 months | \$17.016 | | \$34.033 |
| | | | | P3 – 1 month | \$14.058 | | \$14.058 |
| | | | | G6 – 2 months | \$11.200 | | \$22.400 |
| | | | | | Total | | \$237.241 |

¹⁶Based on Standard Salary Costs Version 9 Year 2016

Annex II: Schedule of UNDA and XB Project Evaluations 2018-2019

| | Evaluation Title | Funding Source/ Total Project Budget | By Whom | Estimated Resources (USD) | Responsible Staff / & SP Focal Point | Schedule (Q/Y) |
|----|--|--------------------------------------|------------|---------------------------|---|----------------|
| 1. | 14/15AC Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing in selected countries with economies in transition (2014-2017) | UNDA \$533,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | G. Roll, Housing & Land Management | Q1/ 2018 |
| 2. | 14/15AE Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains (2014-2017) | UNDA \$440,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | L. Annovazzi-Jakab, Trade | Q1/ 2018 |
| 3. | 14/15AF Strengthening Governments' and water operators' capacity to ensure equity of access to water and sanitation in countries in transition in the UNECE region with a particular focus on small-scale water supplies and sanitation in rural areas (2014-2017) | UNDA \$578,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | C. Demilecamps, Environment | Q1/ 2018 |
| 4. | 14/15BC Strengthening national road safety management capacities of developing countries, countries with economies in transition as a means to achieve sustainable, equitable and inclusive development (2014 - March 2018) | UNDA \$498,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | N. Nikolic, Transport | Q2/ 2018 |
| 5. | E226 Competitiveness, innovative policies and PPPs: capacity building for civil servants and business associations in the CIS countries (2014-October 2017) | XB \$660,000 | Consultant | \$7,000 | R. Heinrich, Economic Cooperation & Integration | Q1/ 2019 |
| 6. | E249 Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of the Sustainable Development Goals (2015 – September 2017) | XB \$300,000 | Consultant | \$6,000 | T. Bonnici, Economic Cooperation & Integration | Q1/ 2019 |
| 7. | E236 Strengthening national capacities of CIS countries to implement UNECE agricultural quality standards (2014 – May 2018) | XB \$291,600 | Consultant | \$10,000 | M. Vepsalainen, Trade | Q4/ 2018 |
| 8. | 14/15AD Strengthening the capacity in the most vulnerable countries in the UNECE region for the sustainable development of statistics (2014 – November 2018) | UNDA \$535,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | S. Vale, Statistics | Q1/ 2019 |
| 9. | E239 Strengthening the implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia (2015 – December 2018) | XB \$435,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | A. Karadjova, Environment | Q1/ 2019 |

| | | | | | | |
|--------------|---|-----------------|------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|
| 10. | E253 Strengthening national capacity for monitoring and assessing the progress in the implementation of MIPAA / RIS and 2012 Vienna Ministerial Declaration goals: Active Ageing Index (2016-December 2018) | XB \$945,000 | Consultant | \$28,000 | V. Gaucaite Wittich, Population | Q1/ 2019 |
| 11. | E274 Strengthening capacity of the UNECE member States to achieve the energy-related SDGs (2016 – December 2018) | XB \$330,000 | Consultant | \$8,000 | S. Held, Sustainable Energy | Q1/ 2019 |
| 12. | E268 Removing regulatory and procedural barriers to trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan (2016 – March 2018) | XB \$290,000 | Consultant | \$8,500 | H. Daoudi, Trade | Q1/ 2019 |
| 13. | E259/E284 Road Safety (2015 – December 2018) | XB \$814,222 | Consultant | \$19,000 | W. Nissler, Transport | Q1/ 2019 |
| 14. | E282 Energy efficiency standards in buildings (July – December 2018) | XB \$286,000 | Consultant | \$6,000 | O. Dzioubinski, Sustainable Energy | Q1/ 2019 |
| 15. | E263 Strengthening the implementation of and accession to the UNECE Convention on the Transboundary effects of Industrial Accidents in Central Asia (April 2016-March 2019) | XB \$265,550 | Consultant | \$7,900 | F. Hirsch, Environment | Q2/ 2019 |
| 16. | E262 Strengthening the capacity of SPECA countries for the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) (2016 – December 2019) | XB \$547,000 | Consultant | \$10,000 | M. Apostolov, Trade | Q4/ 2019 |
| Total | | | | \$306,700 | | |

Annex III: Approved Biennial Evaluation Plan 2020-2021

| Evaluation Title | | Purpose | By Whom | Resources (Financial & Human) | Schedule (Q/Y) | Type |
|------------------|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------------|
| No. | Internal Evaluations | | | | | |
| 1 | <i>Review of UNECE engagement with the private sector</i> | The Evaluation will consider the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of UNECE engagement with the private sector from 2017-2021 | Consultant (PMU) | \$18,000 (external consultant) P4 – 2 months G6 – 0.5 month | Q2 / 2021 | Programme –level |
| 2 | <i>Review of UNECE collaboration with UN and other partners in delivering on energy for sustainable development</i> | The Evaluation will review the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of UNECE collaboration with UN and external partners from 2016-2020 | Consultant (Sustainable Energy Division) | \$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1.5 month G5 – 0.5 month | Q2 / 2020 | Subprogramme – level |
| 3 | <i>Review of the Innovation Performance Reviews & Regional Index</i> | The Evaluation will review the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of the methodology, selection process and follow up to the regional index from 2017-2020 | Consultant (Economic Cooperation & Integration) | \$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1.5 months G5 – 0.5 month | Q4 / 2020 | Subprogramme – level |
| 4 | <i>Review of the UNECE Active Ageing Index</i> | The evaluation will review the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of UNECE policy and statistical aspects of the Active Ageing Index | Consultant (Population) | \$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1 month GS – 0.5 month | Q3 / 2020 | Subprogramme – level |
| | | | | Unit Monthly Cost¹⁷ | Total | |
| | | | | Consultancy | | \$48,000 |
| | | | | P5 - 6 months | \$19,791 | \$118,750 |
| | | | | P4 - 2 months | \$17,016 | \$34,033 |
| | | | | G5/6 – 2 months | \$11,200 | \$22,400 |
| | | | | Total: | | \$ 223,183 |

¹⁷Based on Standard Salary Costs Version 7 Year 2015

Annex IV: List of recommendations from internal evaluations closed as of 31 December 2018

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------|---|--------|-----|--|--|--|
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 1 | Maintain focus on value chain from forests to forest products/timber and markets. | Maintain and further strengthen the focus on the value chain until the end of the current IPoW period, in particular in working on the next cycle of the outlook studies, which is of essential importance for the forest- forest products- markets chain. The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, and proposals will be included for their consideration in planning the work for the next period. | October 2017/ the Integrated Programme of Work (IPoW) for 2018-2021 provides a comprehensive plan for work on the whole value chain (forest sector) and contains plans for the next cycle of outlook studies that will focus on value chains and how they are affected by climate change, structural changes and the green economy; December 2016/ Workshop on streamlining the next round of Forest Sector Outlook studies was organized to improve coordination and communication between experts involved in the forest sector outlook studies across the UNECE region |
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 2 | Continue using meetings for knowledge brokering and experience exchange | Continue to make efforts to organize more events in cooperation with relevant partners including Forest Europe process and FAO Regional Office in Budapest until the end of the current period of the IPoW. The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, and proposals will be included for their consideration in planning the work for the next period. | September 2016/ at the “Transition to a Green Economy” conference, UNECE/FAO Forestry and Timber Section organized an information stand with Forest Europe, and issued a joint statement on the role of forests in achieving the green economy; December 2016/ Capacity workshop organized jointly with the International Renewable Energy Agency for countries in the UNECE region to improve completeness and availability of wood energy data; October 2017/ The IPoW 2018-2021 specifically mentions the strong focus on working in partnerships with international and regional actors as the most effective way of optimizing benefits and avoiding potential duplication of activities. The Committee and the Commission will seek and welcome cooperation for any of the relevant outputs under the four Work Areas. |
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 3 | Use joint meetings to convene with stakeholders from the entire northern forest belt | Particular attention to organizing events in cooperation with other, relevant regional organizations and processes active in northern forest belt, including Montreal Process, Forest Europe, and Circumboreal Initiative until the end of the current IPoW period. The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, for their consideration in planning the work and cooperation for the next period. | October 2017/ The IPoW 2018-2021 specifically states that cooperation with other intergovernmental organizations and processes, including the European Union, the Intergovernmental Council on Forestry and the Forest Industry of the Commonwealth of Independent States, Forest Europe, the United Nations Forum on Forests, the International Tropical Timber Organization, the International Union of Forest Research Organizations and the European Forest Institute, amongst others, should be fostered; May 2017/ Joint side event organized by Forest Europe and UNECE/FAO Forestry and Timber Section on Forests and Green Jobs; June 2017/ joint workshop organized by Forest Europe and UNECE/FAO Forestry and Timber Section on promoting Green Jobs in the Forest Sector; September 2017/ initiation of the cooperation Circumboreal Cooperation Initiative on joint work related to boreal forests, in particular outlook studies. |
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 4 | Foster sectoral themes that do not receive sufficient attention in other fora | Implementation of this recommendation to a large extent depends on the content of the IPoW developed for the next quadrennium. The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, and proposals will be included for their consideration in planning the work for the next period. | March 2017/ International Day on Forests dedicated to forest and energy links, focused on sharing related information to the broad public; October 2017/ The IPoW 2018-2021 includes specific work area related to communication, with strong direction to sharing information beyond traditional forest constituencies; October 2017/ Team of Specialist on Wood Energy approved – this is one example of raising attention to sectoral themes that do not receive sufficient attention in other fora |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------|---|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 5 | Use the Rovaniemi Action Plan as basis for institutional development in Eastern Europe and Central Asia | Support to institutional development in the Eastern Europe Central Asian region will be also provided through other activities/projects (in cooperation with FAO and other relevant partners) aiming at supporting countries in implementing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, for their consideration in planning the work and cooperation for the next period. | June 2016/ start of the UNDA capacity building project "Accountability systems for sustainable forest management in Caucasus and Central Asian countries". It supports countries in implementing the 2030 Agenda; October 2017/ The IPoW 2018-2021 includes specific work area related to capacity building, including the work on institutional development. |
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 6 | Coordinate actions with work for other international agreements | The Section will support the activities of the other organizations and processes that are convergent with those of the IPoW. The Section will monitor developments in the other international agreements (for updating the member States and stakeholders) and provide information about the contribution of the IPoW to these processes. The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, and proposals will be included for their consideration in planning the work and cooperation for the next period. | October 2017/ The IPoW 2018-2021 specifically states that cooperation with other intergovernmental organizations and processes, including the European Union, the Intergovernmental Council on Forestry and the Forest Industry of the Commonwealth of Independent States, Forest Europe, the United Nations Forum on Forests, the International Tropical Timber Organization, the International Union of Forest Research Organizations and the European Forest Institute, amongst others, should be fostered; The IPoW 2018-2021 will contribute to the implementation of: (i) the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the achievement of the SDGs, (ii) the United Nations strategic plan for forests 2017-2030, (iii) the United Nations Forum on Forests Quadrennial Programme of Work 2017-2020, (iv) the Aichi Biodiversity Targets, (v) the Paris Agreement adopted under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and (vi) other international objectives and processes relevant to forests, including the Bonn Challenge and the Rovaniemi Action Plan for the Forest Sector in a Green Economy. |
| Forestry and Timber | Assessment of the relevance of the 2014-2017 UNECE/FAO Integrated Programme of Work to the needs of member States and challenges in the forest sector | Aug-16 | 7 | Reflect on private sector integration into the work of UNECE/FAO | The recommendation will be transmitted to the EFC and COFFI in their work on the IPoW for the 2018-2021, and proposals will be included for their consideration in planning the work for the next period. | October 2016/ October 2017 sessions of COFFI and COFFI/EFC include thematic panels with the strong participation of the private sector and ownership; October 2017/ The IPoW 2018-2021 specifically states that the private sector is a key actor for developing sustainable forest management, sustainable forest products and services and the transition towards a green economy. The participation of the private sector in the work of the Committee and the Commission including in the market discussions will be actively sought, in line with the ECE and FAO organizational policies. Increased participation from various relevant stakeholders should be encouraged. |
| Environment | Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 2 | May-17 | 2 | The UNECE should continue addressing concerns of the Central Asia countries on dam safety issues. Some of the countries may wish to avoid changing representatives attending the Project events and work on the developments at a national level. Should this be impossible, it may be reasonable to establish a strong succession of equally qualified representatives up-to-date with the most recent developments of the | The new project "Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia (phase 3)" to be implemented 2017-2020 will continue the cooperation with nominated institutions and focal points as during the previous project. A message has already been sent to the established national focal points informing about the new phase of the project. Invitations to the first regional meeting planned for the first part of 2018 were to the same institutions as during previous project phases | Implemented. The project established a network of dam safety national coordinators in each of the countries thereby ensuring effective implementation of the project activities, greater ownership and continuity. In addition, previously involved national experts and institutions are also involved in the new project to the extent possible |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|---|--------|-------|--|--|--|
| | | | | Project. This may allow faster progressing towards the expected accomplishments. | and previous participants will be informed about the planned meeting. | |
| Environment | Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 2 | May-17 | 3 | Since qualified and dedicated staff is one of the key success factors for any project, continue with the people who manage and execute the Project at the UNECE, if possible. | The new project manager in charge of the project will work with the previous consultant for coordination in Central Asia that contributes to the planning and implementation of the project. There will also be efforts to involve the previous project manager as a consultant to make sure the experiences from previous phases are transferred to the new management set-up. | Implemented. Qualified regional and international consultants are involved in supporting project implementation |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | 2 | The provisions are widely applied through international, regional and national legislation. There remains further scope to ensure even wider application and, importantly, regular updates of legislation to apply the latest versions of the UN instruments. (124, 128) | a - The current UNECE activities related to international and regional legislation should be actively pursued and, if possible, strengthened.b- The implementation of the United Nations Recommendations on the Transport of Dangerous Goods through national legislation and regular updating of such national legislation remains the responsibility of member States.c- The current resources of the secretariat are not sufficient to deploy an awareness and capacity building exercise on the national implementation of the Recommendations on the Transport of Dangerous Goods, although the secretariat believes that this would be of great benefit for countries outside the UNECE region (see also Conclusion/Recommendation No. 5). | a - The secretariat continues to monitor the implementation of the recommendations and legal instruments under its purview as time and resources allow. No extra resources have been provided to the secretariat for monitoring more precisely the status of implementation of the Recommendations on the Transport of Dangerous Goods worldwide. As usual at the end of the biennium of work of the ECOSOC bodies serviced by the section, the secretariat will draft the report to the Secretary General to ECOSOC on the implementation of the Model Regulations and on the GHS that contains, among other information, two sections on progress on implementation of these two instruments of global applicability. The secretariat will be providing information received from governments, IGOs, NGOs, UN agencies and programs or other trusted sources. b) and c) not applicable |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jul-16 | 4 | Considerable effort has been made both by the Secretariat and participating bodies to promote better cooperation and understanding between the SCETDG and SCEGHS. The establishment by the Main Committee in 2014 of an experimental standing joint working group is a significant step forward to ensuring the transport is seen as an integral part of the SCEGHS.(61) | In order to avoid duplication of work and enhance cooperation between the TDG and GHS sub-committees, it is worth noting that both subcommittees addressed this issue in December 2014 and agreed to sharing meeting time (starting on July 2015) to discuss issues of common concern. Both subcommittees remain flexible and willing to adapt the programme of meetings. | Since 2015, the TDG and the GHS Sub-Committees held 3 joint sessions: First session: 9 December 2015 (see ST/SG/AC.10C.4/60, Annex II) Second session: 5 July 2016 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.4/62, Annex II) Third session: 3 July 2018 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.3/106, paras 162 to 177). It is expected that this practice would continue in the future. |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of | Jan-16 | II/ 1 | Some attention needs to be given to goods in the mail whether for international or domestic post. It is sensible that UPU and ICAO take a lead on this as a good starting point for such items are the passenger allowances in the ICAO TIs. The | Draw the attention of the ECOSOC Sub-Committee of Experts on the TDG to this recommendation. | The outcome of the evaluation was brought to the Sub-Committee's attention at its 50th session in December 2016 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.3/100, paras 93 and 94). As noted in paragraph 94 of the report on that session, the Sub-Committee "considered that such items could be included in the programme of work only upon a proposal by volunteering delegations committed to lead such work". To date, no delegation volunteered to lead work at the Sub-Committee level, on the issues raised by the consultant ("cooperation with customs, dangerous goods in mail, the development of |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|---|--------|-------|--|--|---|
| | dangerous goods (2005-2014) | | | SCETDG should be kept informed because most mail will travel not only in vehicles but also railways and ships. Once a scheme has been identified it should be included as appropriate in the Model Regulations and the various modal documents (151) | | guidance for implementation and the development of guiding principles for modal regulations"). |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | II/ 2 | Guiding principles documents (153) for the modal regulations should be produced to ensure stakeholders understand the reasons for variations and additions in modal requirements (151) | Draw the attention of the ECOSOC Sub-Committee of Experts on the TDG to this recommendation. For secretariat involvement, see preliminary note 1 | The outcome of the evaluation was brought to the Sub-Committee's attention at its 50th session in December 2016 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.3/100, paras 93 and 94). As noted in paragraph 94 of the report on that session, the Sub-Committee "considered that such items could be included in the programme of work only upon a proposal by volunteering delegations committed to lead such work". To date, no delegation volunteered to lead work at the Sub-Committee level, on the issues raised by the consultant ("cooperation with customs, dangerous goods in mail, the development of guidance for implementation and the development of guiding principles for modal regulations"). |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | III-1 | Improve quality of interpretation services during meetings (paragraphs 108-109) | Bring to the attention of UNOG Division of Conference Management. See also management response to Finding 17. | The secretariat did not receive complaints from delegations on the quality of interpretation during the sessions. We remind delegates regularly to speak slowly when making interventions and particularly when reading a statement, as this may have an impact on the quality of the interpretation services provided. |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | III-2 | Develop a worldwide list of competent authorities (paragraph 136) | Already in process | The secretariat has developed a list compiling information about competent authorities for all modes, that is available on the website and is continuously updated based on information received from competent authorities: http://www.unece.org/trans/main/danger/competent_authorities.html In addition, the secretariat continues to keep a list of competent authorities for road (ADR) and inland transport of dangerous goods (ADN) in accordance with the requirements of these two legal instruments. This list is regularly updated based on the information provided by national competent authorities. ADR: http://www.unece.org/trans/danger/publi/adr/country-info_e.html ADN: http://www.unece.org/trans/danger/publi/adn/country-info_e.html |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of | Jan-16 | III-3 | Develop a simple guide to the basic regulations and how they work to help governments with implementation (similar to the ADR road map for implementation) (paragraph 137) | Draw attention of the ECOSOC Sub-Committee of Experts on the TDG to this recommendation | The outcome of the evaluation was brought to the Sub-Committee's attention at its 50th session in December 2016 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.3/100, paras 93 and 94). As noted in paragraph 94 of the report on that session, the Sub-Committee "considered that such items could be included in the programme of work only upon a proposal by volunteering delegations committed to lead such work". To date, no delegation volunteered to lead work at the Sub-Committee level, on the issues raised by the consultant ("cooperation with customs, dangerous goods in mail, the development of |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|---|--------|-------|--|---|---|
| | dangerous goods (2005-2014) | | | | | guidance for implementation and the development of guiding principles for modal regulations"). |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | III-4 | Explore increased cooperation with WCO and customs as well as documenting the correlation between UN provisions for transport of dangerous goods and customs tariffs nomenclature (paragraph 146) | Draw attention of the ECOSOC Sub-Committee of Experts on the TDG to this recommendation | The outcome of the evaluation was brought to the Sub-Committee's attention at its 50th session in December 2016 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.3/100, paras 93 and 94). As noted in paragraph 94 of the report on that session, the Sub-Committee "considered that such items could be included in the programme of work only upon a proposal by volunteering delegations committed to lead such work". To date, no delegation volunteered to lead work at the Sub-Committee level, on the issues raised by the consultant ("cooperation with customs, dangerous goods in mail, the development of guidance for implementation and the development of guiding principles for modal regulations"). |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | III-5 | Achieve better alignment of UN provisions with current consumer trends in online ordering, in particular, need for exemptions of minimal quantities of dangerous goods (paragraph 152) | Draw attention of the ECOSOC Sub-Committee of Experts on the TDG to this recommendation | The outcome of the evaluation was brought to the Sub-Committee's attention at its 50th session in December 2016 (see ST/SG/AC.10/C.3/100, paras 93 and 94). As noted in paragraph 94 of the report on that session, the Sub-Committee "considered that such items could be included in the programme of work only upon a proposal by volunteering delegations committed to lead such work". To date, no delegation volunteered to lead work at the Sub-Committee level, on the issues raised by the consultant ("cooperation with customs, dangerous goods in mail, the development of guidance for implementation and the development of guiding principles for modal regulations"). |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | III-6 | Develop guiding principles for those parts of ADR and ADN which are not addressed in the Model Regulations (paragraph 151,153, 154) | Draw attention of the RID/ADR/ADN Joint Meeting, WP.15 and ADN Safety Committee | The Joint Meeting was informed about the availability of the results of the analysis of the questionnaire, the evaluation report and the secretariat's response, at its Autumn 2016 session (see ECE/TRANS/WP.15/AC.1/144, para 63)The Working Party on the Transport of Dangerous Goods (WP.15) was also informed about the availability of these documents at its 103rd session (November 2017) (see ECE/TRANS/WP.15/239, para. 77) |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | 1 | From the evidence of the questionnaire, and from the evidence provided by earlier UN studies and studies from other bodies that the UN Model Regulations on the Safe Transport of Dangerous Goods and the international modal transport Conventions are widely known throughout the globe and do form the basis of most transport legislation in this field. (124) | The conclusion does not call for follow-up action. However, it would be useful to monitor more precisely the status of implementation of the Recommendations on the Transport of Dangerous Goods worldwide (paras 17-26 of report) and comments on finding in management response, but no resources are available for this. | The secretariat continues to monitor the implementation of the recommendations and legal instruments under its purview as time and resources allow. No extra resources have been provided to the secretariat for monitoring more precisely the status of implementation of the Recommendations on the Transport of Dangerous Goods worldwide. As usual at the end of the biennium of work of the ECOSOC bodies serviced by the section, the secretariat will draft the report to the Secretary General to ECOSOC on the implementation of the Model Regulations and on the GHS that contains, among other information, two sections on progress on implementation of these two instruments of global applicability. The secretariat will be providing information received from governments, IGOs, NGOs, UN agencies and programs or other trusted sources. |
| Transport | Evaluation of the global and regional impact of UN regulations and United Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | Jan-16 | 5 | The UNECE Secretariat, together with the other relevant UN Secretariats, provides a universally well respected and highly professional | According to the answers to the questionnaire: - No UNECE country expressed a need for support. The three countries expressing this need are non-UNECE developing countries. | The secretariat did not receive any official request for support that would justify establishing a trust fund. Requests for technical assistance were received from countries that did not reply to the questionnaire, on an ad-hoc basis. Since 2015, the secretariat participated in workshops/seminars in Albania and Morocco in 2018; |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|--|---|
| | Nations Recommendations on the transport of dangerous goods (2005-2014) | | | performance in servicing the instruments for which they have the remit to support. However, there is little available facility to do much more than service meetings and prepare regulatory text revisions for publication. Outreach to governments and NGOs is on an ad-hoc and unstructured basis dependent on the availability and willingness of individuals within the Secretariat. This is despite the written intent to provide such support in a number of UN seminars and reports. This should be reviewed in particular the resource and budgetary issues need to reflect a world that relies on the UN Recommendations (97-107, 142-143) | The secretariat has participated in several workshops and events about transport of dangerous goods and several countries from Africa, Asia and Latin America have expressed the need for support for the development and implementation of national regulations for the inland transport of dangerous goods. Unfortunately, these countries did not reply to the questionnaire. - No government has indicated willingness for contribution to a trust fund, but 5 NGOs have done so. When the secretariat receives official requests for support, the possibility of establishing a trust fund will be explored. | Croatia, China, Spain, Russian Federation, Belarus, Lebanon, Mongolia in 2017; Costa Rica, the Netherlands, Ecuador, Georgia and Egypt in 2016; and France, Spain, China, Kazakhstan and Ethiopia in 2015. These events were organized by Governments, NGOs or EU-funded programs and participation of the secretariat in many of them was conditioned to the availability of funds from organizers to cover the per-diem and travel expenses of the staff of the section participating in the event. For comments on staff resources refer to the comment under section 1. |
| Economic Cooperation & Integration | Evaluation of the UNECE project "Capacity Development to support the implementation of Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in Belarus | Nov-16 | 1 | Identify at an early stage a senior idea-champion, to advocate for the new intervention or approach | N/A | Already implemented. The identification of a senior PPP champion in countries is a key ingredient to successful PPP implementation, and this is a key requirement for UNECE capacity building activities in countries. |
| Economic Cooperation & Integration | Evaluation of the UNECE project "Capacity Development to support the implementation of Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in Belarus | Nov-16 | 2 | Develop a thorough needs assessment (Readiness Assessment), with facts-based clear recommendations and alternative proposals; | N/A | Already implemented. A Readiness Assessment tool is available for countries as part of the UNECE PPP capacity building activities to assess their PPP readiness. |
| Economic Cooperation & Integration | Evaluation of the UNECE project "Capacity Development to support the implementation of Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in Belarus | Nov-16 | 3 | Continue the involvement of the PPP BAB, as it greatly complements, at the technical level, the policy-making role of the UNECE; | N/A | Already implemented. The PPP Business Advisory Board is at the core of all PPP capacity building activities and policy advisory services in countries. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| Economic Cooperation & Integration | Evaluation of the UNECE project "Capacity Development to support the implementation of Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in Belarus | Nov-16 | 4 | Assist governments to create better employing environments for people benefitting from highly skilled training and knowledge transfers, or to create mechanisms to retain them for a set period of time, in order to avoid similar cases like the PPP Unit which lost most of its staff to other employment opportunities (a situation foreseen in the PPP Readiness Assessment); | N/A | Already implemented. This remains a major challenge, especially for countries getting started in PPPs, to retain trained staff working at PPP units. As part of its PPP capacity building activities, the UNECE advises governments on the best ways to keep staff employed in PPP units (these advisory services are adapted to the specific needs of countries). |
| Economic Cooperation & Integration | Evaluation of the UNECE project "Capacity Development to support the implementation of Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in Belarus | Nov-16 | 5 | On the gender dimension, future project documents should foresee provisions on collecting gender disaggregated data for the relevant indicators. | N/A | Already implemented. |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | External evaluation of the UNECE-European Union project Active Ageing Index II - Further Development and Dissemination | Mar-17 | 1 | The current contributors should continue to support the project to expand its geographical coverage and to deepen its substantive scope. | The recommendation 1 is accepted by the Population Unit and is partially implemented by the time of the evaluation. | Completed in 2018 1. The third phase of the AAI project (AAI-III), continuing the work undertaken under the first two phases, started in May 2016 and will end in August 2019. 2. By December 2018, three studies looking into AAI results for different population groups have been implemented; 3. The methodology fine-tuning as appropriate for the current stage of the project was carried out; 4. Continuous consultations to some countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus, Western Balkans and Central Asia were provided upon request, as well as to the EU members at national and subnational levels. |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | External evaluation of the UNECE-European Union project Active Ageing Index II - Further Development and Dissemination | Mar-17 | 2 | The project team should continue to improve the technical and management aspects of the project (in support of Recommendation 1) | The recommendation 2 is accepted by the Population Unit and is partially implemented by the time of the evaluation. | Completed in 2018) Under the third phase of the project, the Expert group on the Active Ageing Index, established under the first phase of the project in 2012, has been maintained.2) In 2016–2017, UNECE worked with the University of Southampton – UK as institutional contractor for implementation of a number of research tasks foreseen under the project. Four other institutional consultants were engaged throughout the period 2016–2018: Technical University of Dortmund, Warsaw School of Economics, Italian National Institute of Health and Science on Ageing, and University of the Basque Country for the implementation of country-specific studies (first three institutes) and more general scope of research tasks (the fourth institute).3) The structure of the project team has not changed since the evaluation. |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | External evaluation of the UNECE-European Union project Active Ageing Index II - | Mar-17 | 3 | The project should continue and improve the knowledge management function | The recommendation 3 is accepted by the population unite which will continue to implement the outlined activities. | Completed in 2018) Several events aimed at improving AAI visibility and recognition, sharing actual experiences of its application etc. were held during the AAI-III phase. These include a national seminar "Active Ageing Index in Italy: use and policy implications" in Ancona, Italy, on 11 May 2017; a side-event "Active Ageing Index: ways to realize the potential of living longer" in Lisbon, Portugal, on 21 September |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|--|
| | Further Development and Dissemination | | | | | 2017 during the fourth UNECE Ministerial Conference on Ageing; a National Seminar on AAI in Warsaw, Poland, on 18 June 2018; and the Second international seminar on AAI in Bilbao, Spain, on 27–28 September 2018. The wiki-space on AAI has been continually maintained and updated with new publications, papers, information about meetings etc. |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | External evaluation of the UNECE-European Union project Active Ageing Index II - Further Development and Dissemination | Mar-17 | 4 | The project should pursue a more visible dissemination and communication strategy for publicizing the AAI concept and methodological tool. | The recommendation 4 is accepted by the population unit which will make efforts to increase the visibility of AAI among policymakers and will engage a contractor to develop professional visualization tools for the index. | Completed in 2018 Presentations on AAI have been regularly given at relevant events involving policymakers throughout the third phase of the project. For example, UNECE regularly presents the developments under the project to the UNECE Working Group on Ageing and its Bureau (twice a year); a side-event at the UNECE Ministerial Conference on Ageing was held on 21 September 2017, national seminars are organized every year (see above). UNECE has been publishing information on AAI using the wiki-space developed for the purpose and its Twitter account. The visualization web-tool will be launched in 2019. |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | External evaluation of the UNECE-European Union project Active Ageing Index II - Further Development and Dissemination | Mar-17 | 5 | The project should intensify resource mobilization efforts to enable the expansion of the work on the AAI in the UNECE region and to maintain an adequately sized project management unit | The recommendation 5 is accepted partially by the population unit. There are no fund-raising activities foreseen by the Agreement with the donor, who is contributing | Partially accepted and completed in 2018 The project budget is set by the Agreement with the donor (European Commission) and is sufficient for the activities foreseen without additional fund-raising. Extension of AAI to more countries is included in the project activities. At the same time, a number of countries work on application of AAI at national and/or subnational levels outside of the project activities (Poland, Switzerland, Biscay province of Spain etc.), thus contributing to the AAI extension, its greater visibility and recognition — project activities foreseen by the Agreement. Cooperation with relevant stakeholders and provision of consultations to those interested in AAI application are parts of the project activities. The project team size is as set in the Agreement with the donor and is not subject to modification. |
| Sustainable Energy | Gas Center | May-18 | 1 | The UNECE secretariat should define and communicate the envisaged role for a successor to the Gas Centre to gas companies, member States and other relevant stakeholders. | This activity is underway. The Secretariat has shared the interest of the gas industry to institute a successor to the Gas Centre, but to date member States have indicated no appetite for such a body. A concept note was prepared and presented | This activity is completed. The Secretariat shared the interest of the gas industry to institute a successor to the Gas Centre, but member States declined. The secretariat proposed to reprogramme the remaining Gas Centre funds to the project “Strengthening capacity of the ECE member States to achieve the energy-related Sustainable Development Goals”. This proposal was approved by all the remaining Gas Centre members with the exception of one who requested its monies be returned. The project was approved by EXCOM on 14 December 2018. Approval to reprogramme the funds in this way is still awaited from the UN Controller’s Office in New York |
| Sustainable Energy | Gas Center | May-18 | 2 | If a successor to the Gas Centre is established, the UNECE secretariat should consider the following for its operational model: A focus on facilitating a dialogue between gas companies, member States and UN organizations through regular fora, e.g. quarterly or biannual; A research agenda coordinated with the Group of Experts of Gas; A knowledge hub of | If a successor is established, ensure that the recommendations are included in the terms of reference. | This recommendation is no longer applicable as there currently is no proposal for a successor to the Gas Centre. There will be no successor to the Gas Centre. As per recommendation 1 above the Gas Centre funds are being reprogrammed to the project “Strengthening capacity of the ECE member States to achieve the energy-related Sustainable Development Goals” subject to the approval of the UN Controller’s Office in New York. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|--|---|--|
| | | | | its outputs that is accessible and promoted | | |
| Statistics | Project on the preparation for the 2020 round of population censuses and the production of better migration data in CIS countries, Implemented from 2013 to 2015 | Feb-17 | 1 | UNECE to remain in close contact with national statistical offices and to follow up by organizing expert meetings and workshops on censuses and migration statistics where it will monitor the progress in census preparations according to the Recommendations and the implementation of guidance provided in the Handbook on migration statistics. | annual workshops on censuses and migration statistics for countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia; UNECE statistical division is mandated to organize annual capacity-building workshops on censuses and migration statistics. Those workshops will address the implementation of the corresponding recommendations. A workshop on censuses and migration statistics will be organized in 2018 and 2019. | UNECE organized the Expert meeting on population and housing censuses (Geneva, 26-28 September 2018) for all its member countries and the Workshop on population and housing censuses for countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia (Geneva, 24-25 September 2018), which monitored progress in census preparations according to the UNECE Recommendation. UNECE organized the Expert meeting on migration statistics (Geneva, 24-26 October 2018) for all its member countries and the Workshop on migration statistics for countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia (Geneva, 23-24 October 2018), which monitored the implementation of guidance provided in the Handbook on migration statistics. Similar meetings are planned for 2019. |
| Statistics | Project on the preparation for the 2020 round of population censuses and the production of better migration data in CIS countries, Implemented from 2013 to 2015 | Feb-17 | 2 | UNECE in cooperation with the Project partners and beneficiaries' countries to make efforts for more involvement of national migration agencies and other related (to migration) government agencies in international meetings on migration statistics in order to increase their commitment for and involvement in activities for improving the migration statistics in their respective countries. | improving collaboration with national providers of administrative data on migration, by inviting representatives of national migration agencies to workshops and by organizing national workshops; these efforts include additional fundraising | In the 2018 UNECE expert meeting on migration statistics, five countries were represented by their national migration agencies in addition to the national statistical office. |
| Statistics | Project on the preparation for the 2020 round of population censuses and the production of better migration data in CIS countries, Implemented from 2013 to 2015 | Feb-17 | 3 | UNECE in cooperation with the Project partners and beneficiaries' countries for purpose of follow up (mentioned in above two paragraphs and building on the results of the concluded Project), to consider the possibilities for planning and implementing a similar project within the UNECE statistical programme that includes further capacity-building on censuses and migration statistics. | annual workshops on censuses and migration statistics for countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia; UNECE statistical division is working closely with census and migration statistics experts to understand needs and support progress in implementing internationally agreed recommendations. Capacity-building activities will be carried out on that basis | UNECE is implementing a UN Development Account (10th tranche) project "Data and statistics", which provided financial support to the 2018 census workshop (Geneva, 24-25 September). Further support was received from the European Free Trade Association (Efta) and the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA). UNECE is implementing the project "Enhancing coherence and integration of economic and social statistics in support of the implementation of 2008 SNA" funded by the World Bank, which provided financial support for the 2018 migration statistics workshop (Geneva, 23-24 October). For the 2019 workshops, funding is available through the World Bank project (for migration statistics) and Efta (for part of the required cost of the census workshop). A funding proposal to UNFPA is under review. |
| Statistics | Project on the preparation for the 2020 round of population censuses and the production of better migration data in CIS countries, Implemented from 2013 to 2015 | Feb-17 | 4 | In addition to the monitoring objective, the new UNECE project can include strengthening household surveys for measuring migration. Also, can be considered the possibility of including production of Handbook on labour migration for CIS countries which would include conditions needed to measure labour migration via sample surveys. | implementation of a project "enhancing coherence and integration of economic and social statistics in support of the implementation of 2008 SNA" and a Task Force on Measuring Labour | In the project "Enhancing coherence and integration of economic and social statistics in support of the implementation of 2008 SNA" funded by the World Bank, UNECE developed in 2018 a harmonized module for measuring migration and remittances in household surveys, tested it in Kyrgyzstan, and prepared for further tests in Azerbaijan, Belarus, and Kazakhstan. In 2018, UNECE published a report "Measuring international labour mobility", to guide national statistical offices and other producers of migration statistics. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|--------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| | | | | Development of such Handbook was announced as a plan activity by CIS-stat in the migration workshop in Minsk 2015. | | |
| Statistics | Project on the preparation for the 2020 round of population censuses and the production of better migration data in CIS countries, Implemented from 2013 to 2015 | Feb-17 | 5 | In order to avoid significant restriction on the timing of events due to a long administrative procedure for grants at UNECE, it is preferable to organize meetings in countries with resident United Nations offices where simpler administrative procedures can be applied. | recommendation goes beyond project scope; UNECE is trying to identify ways to simplify and streamline administrative procedures under existing rules and regulations | In 2018, the meetings and workshops on censuses and migration statistics took place in Geneva. The financial support from UNFPA and Efta was administered by those agencies directly, without transferring funds to UNECE, which is the simplest way for UNECE to receive extra-budgetary financial support to its activities. |
| Statistics | Project on the preparation for the 2020 round of population censuses and the production of better migration data in CIS countries, Implemented from 2013 to 2015 | Feb-17 | 6 | To ensure donor funding that stretches over several years, which allows better planning, achieving stronger results and lower (per event) administrative burden in managing the funds, compared to projects based on just annual programmes. | capacity-building in migration statistics, among others, from 2017 to 2020, are planned and under way | The World Bank project “Enhancing coherence and integration of economic and social statistics in support of the implementation of 2008 SNA” is for 2017-2020, and the UN Development Account project “Data and statistics” for 2016-2019, which allows multi-year planning and lower administrative burden per year than short-term projects would. |
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best practice guidance for coal mine methane management | Dec-17 | 1 | Strategically, the Sustainable Energy Division should continue using the mixed technical-political approach: the technical level brings together state-of-the-art knowledge, while the political dialogue can stimulate the politics in the UNECE member States to intensify the adoption of the best practices in coal mine industry. For the Division, the GoE on CMM brings tangible results and an added value, strengthening the position of the Secretariat. This recommendation will play an even stronger role in the context of SDGs. It is also likely to gain importance as the biggest coal extracting countries become increasingly open and interested in adopting the best standards in safety and environmental protection; | UNECE accepts the recommendation. GoE on CMM that operates within the framework of the Sustainable Energy Division (SED) and under the supervision of the Committee on Sustainable Energy (CSE) is a platform that facilitates a dialogue among all stakeholders on both, technical, as well as political/decision-making level. The inclusive and multidimensional character of GoE on CMM is a foundation of its success and therefore it is to be preserved. | In 2018 the GoE on CMM continued to engage with a broad range of stakeholders from both the public and private sector. It organized various seminars, workshops etc. GoE on CMM and SED continued its outreach to all stakeholders, engaging with Governments, relevant international organizations, private sector, civil society actors, and representatives of academia. |
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best | Dec-17 | 2 | The GoE should generate more knowledge applicable to broader extraction industry, in order to sustain | UNECE accepts the recommendation. In order to do so, GoE on CMM needs to either request CSE to expand its mandate and/or engage with | • A new grant for development of the Project on Modernization of the Energy Sector led by GoE on CMM to be provided by Kazakhstan was announced. • An exchange of information and cooperation with the European Commission (EC) in general, and its |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|--------------------|--|--------|-----|---|--|--|
| | practice guidance for coal mine methane management | | | the results, given the excellent relevancy and sustainability. This recommendation applies provided that a draft Work Plan of the Group of Experts for 2018-2019, and the GoE's request for extension of its mandate is approved during the twenty-sixth session of the Committee on Sustainable Energy. The mandate extension should encompass work on the transition of traditional mining companies to become integrated service companies. It should also explore the impact this transition might have on the contributions of the energy sector on sustainable development and possible formal adoption and Independent Evaluation of the Effectiveness and Impact of UNECE Case Studies on the application of Best Practice Guidance for Coal Mine Methane management 25 implementation of the standards. Recommendation 8 lists several stakeholders to be consulted in this process. | other Groups of Experts operating the umbrella of CSE in cross-cutting activities serving a broader extractive industries' community. Regarding the former, it is noted that such a decision is at the CSE's full discretion and needs to be in line with the will of member States. Regarding the latter, the Group's proactive approach has to be matched by the interest of other Groups that are to be partnered with for the purpose of delivering more comprehensive projects, the scope of which extends beyond the current mandate of GoE on CMM. | Coal Regions in Transition Platform, in particular, continues. • IEA Clean Coal Centre, Boston University, Climate-Kic, Kopernikus ENavi Project, and Geschäftsführer Innovationsregion Lausitz GmbH, as well as various industrial sites' operators (In Russia, Kazakhstan, and Italy) were approached. They expressed interest in participating in the project on Modernization of the Energy Sector. The details of their potential engagement are being discussed. GoE on CMM together with the GoE on CEP prepared a joint session on the role of fossil fuels in electricity production that was delivered at the Global Methane Forum, Toronto, April 2018. GoE on CMM remains engaged in cooperation with the Expert Group on Resource Management (EGRM) for the purpose of developing UNFC guidelines for the assessment and management of CMM, abandoned mine methane (AMM) and ventilation air methane (VAM) projects. |
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best practice guidance for coal mine methane management | Dec-17 | 3 | It is recommended to employ a network of "champions" to lead the work on implementing the recommendations created by GoE, a practice frequently observed in policy making. The "champions" would be key political figures in governments of UNECE member States, advocating for legislative changes, eventually involving the mining companies in setting national industry standards. | UNECE accepts the recommendation. Since its creation, GoE on CMM has been working on developing a network of "champions". Currently, the Bureau of GoE on CMM includes nine Government representatives from Bosnia and Herzegovina, Poland, Republic of Serbia, Russian Federation, Turkey, Ukraine and the United States of America. Representatives of the Governments of Bosnia and Herzegovina, and Turkey are new additions to the Bureau. They were elected at the last annual meeting of GoE on CMM in October 2017 and influence, act towards promotion and implementation of practices and measures recommended by the Group. The secretariat encourages the members of the Group to do so. | • GoE on CMM continues to oversee and support activities of the existing ICE-CMMs in their dissemination activities, using them as vehicles to influence regulatory authorities to adopt industrial standards consistent with best practices developed by GoE on CMM. • A one-day seminar (in cooperation with the Polish International Centre of Excellence (ICE-CMM)) titled Coal Mine Methane as a Valuable Energy Source (28 February 2018, Cracow, Poland). The event was held within the framework of the School of Underground Mining hosted by the Polish Academy of Science and gathered together Polish and international practitioners, private enterprises operating in the sector, regulators, and academicians, allowing the Group to promote the Best Practices, to encourage the local regulators to align the applicable measures, standards, and procedures with the Best Practices, and to urge mine operators to apply the Best Practices in their mines. • A technical session (in cooperation with ICE-CMM in Poland) titled Pre-mining methane capture from coal deposits in the context of environmental protection and diversification of gas sources for Poland that was delivered within the framework of the Gazterm Conference, 6-9 May 2018., Międzyzdroje, Poland. The event provided a platform for an exchange and dialogue between the regulators and the private sector from Poland and various other UNECE member States, such as USA, Russia, and Ukraine, allowing the Group to promote the Best Practices, to encourage the local regulators to align the applicable measures, standards, and procedures with the Best Practices, and to urge mine operators and/or project developers to apply the Best Practices in their existing and/or |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|--------------------|--|--------|-----|--|--|---|
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best practice guidance for coal mine methane management | Dec-17 | 4 | Given the raising importance of the private sector for sustainable development (also enshrined in the SDGs), the Division and GoE should frame ways to involve the private sector in enhancing the results of their activities. The partnerships with the private sector could pave the way to adopt (voluntary) industry standards, could further facilitate the knowledge transfer, and could augment extra-budgetary resources. | UNECE accepts the recommendation. The private sector has been a critical part of the GoE on CMM since its formation in 2004. Currently there are several Bureau members representing the private sector. However, it has always been difficult to assure presence of mining companies or mining associations at the annual meetings of GoE on CMM. As the industry faces severe financial challenges and other constraints, it is problematic to convince senior staff representatives to come to Geneva. At the same time, thanks to extrabudgetary resources that allow for organization of fact-finding missions, workshops and seminars in (or in proximity of) various coal mining regions of the world, GoE on CMM has been successful in attracting staff as well as management of mining entities to its events, and hence has been successful in conveying its message to this targeted audience. Following its well-established practice GoE on CMM will preserve its inclusive character and will continue its engagement with all stakeholders, including those from the private sector. | <p>future mines as well as at the drilling sites. • A side event at COP24 (10 December, in Katowice Poland) titled Conventional and Unconventional Gas as a Destination Fuel for the Green Economy. The event organized jointly with ICE-CMM Poland and the Polish Oil and Gas Company (PGNiG) featured a panel discussion on the future of natural gas, as seen from the perspectives of various stakeholders (public and private sector) from around the world (UNECE member States, Australia, and China). The event allowed the Group to raise its visibility and to reach out with its messages to the high-level political figures present at or observing COP24. • Three technical sessions (August, June and September) designed to train future trainers in Best Practices in CMM Capture and Use organized by ICE-CMM in China. The sessions were targeted at Chinese miners, mine operators, and local regulators. They provided a platform for exchange of experiences and knowledge-sharing between experts from UNECE member States and local stakeholders, and allowed the Group to promote the Best Practices, to encourage the local regulators to align the applicable measures, standards, and procedures with the Best Practices, and to urge mine operators to apply the Best Practices in their mines. • The Governments of Russian Federation, Ukraine and Colombia were approached and they all expressed their interest in setting up a local ICE-CMM. MoUs with Russian Federation and Ukraine are being discussed. • Local authorities as well as the local mining university in Colorado (USA) were approached and they expressed their interest in setting up a local ICE-CMM.</p> <p>• GoE on CMM continues to oversee and support activities of the existing ICE-CMMs in their dissemination activities, using them as vehicles to reach out to, engage with, and encourage the private sector to adopt industrial standards consistent with best practices developed by GoE on CMM. • A one-day seminar (in cooperation with the Polish International Centre of Excellence (ICE-CMM)) titled Coal Mine Methane as a Valuable Energy Source (28 February, Cracow, Poland). The event was held within the framework of the School of Underground Mining hosted by the Polish Academy of Science and gathered together Polish and international practitioners, private enterprises operating in the sector, regulators, and academicians, allowing the Group to promote the Best Practices, to encourage the local private sector to align the applicable measures, standards, and procedures with the Best Practices, and to urge mine operators to apply the Best Practices in their mines. • A technical session (in cooperation with ICE-CMM in Poland) titled Pre-mining methane capture from coal deposits in the context of environmental protection and diversification of gas sources for Poland that was delivered within the framework of the Gazterm Conference, held from 6 to 9 May in Międzyzdroje, Poland. The event provided a platform for an exchange and dialogue between the regulators and the private sector from Poland and various other UNECE member States, such as USA, Russia, and Ukraine, allowing the Group to promote the Best Practices, to encourage the local private sector to align the applicable measures, standards, and procedures with the Best Practices, and to urge mine operators and/or project developers to apply the Best Practices in their existing and/or future mines as well as at the drilling sites. • A side event at COP24 (10 December, in Katowice Poland) titled Conventional and Unconventional Gas as a Destination Fuel for the Green Economy. The event organized jointly with ICE-CMM Poland and the Polish Oil and Gas Company (PGNiG) featured a panel discussion on the future of natural gas, as seen from the perspectives of various stakeholders (public and private sector) from around the world (UNECE member States, Australia, and</p> |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|--------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best practice guidance for coal mine methane management | Dec-17 | 6 | (Optional:) The GoE should initiate a process to establish agreed measuring standards related to its work: incidents / explosions statistics and reporting, measure capture and commercial use of methane, measure the GHG emission reductions; and common evaluation methodologies for all fossil sources of energy. This task has two constraints: a) this type of information is under direct control of safety and environmental bureaus and agencies resident in the member States, and their reliability and comparability would be a challenge; and b) it would be difficult to establish a direct | The Bureau of GoE on CMM and the secretariat will develop indicators allowing for measuring in quantifiable way the results and effects of its work. The issue was discussed at the GoE on CMM's Bureau call on 14 December 2017. For each of the activities stipulated in the 2018-2019 Work Plan, the Bureau of the Group and the secretariat will establish a set of specific (where possible quantifiable) indicators, allowing for measuring effectiveness of the Group's actions. The Bureau of GoE on CMM and the secretariat will undertake efforts, within the scope of their capacities and mindful of time constraints, to obtain from intended beneficiaries (i.e. member States and/or other | <p>China). The event allowed the Group to raise its visibility and to reach out with its messages to the private sector representatives present at or observing COP24. • Three technical sessions (August, June and September) designed to train future trainers in Best Practices in CMM Capture and Use organized by ICE-CMM in China. The sessions were targeted at Chinese miners, mine operators, and local regulators. They provided a platform for exchange of experiences and knowledge-sharing between experts from the UNECE member States and local stakeholders, and allowed the Group to promote the Best Practices, to encourage the local private sector to align the applicable measures, standards, and procedures with the Best Practices, and to urge mine operators to apply the Best Practices in their mines. • The Governments of the Russian Federation, Ukraine and Colombia were approached and they all expressed their interest in setting up a local ICE-CMM. MoUs with Russian Federation and Ukraine are being discussed. • Local authorities as well as the local mining university in Colorado (USA) were approached and they expressed their interest in setting up a local ICE-CMM. • A one-day technical session on CMM (organized jointly with GMI) titled Turning Coal Mine Methane into an Asset: Implementing Best Practices and Policies. The event was held within the framework of the 25th World Mining Congress, 20 June 2018, Astana, Kazakhstan. It gathered public and private sector stakeholders from Central Asia, ex-Soviet Union States, China, India, Western and Eastern Europe, as well as North America, allowing them to discuss various aspects of the application of the Best Practices developed and promoted by the GoE on CMM. • A new grant from Kazakhstan for development of the Project on Modernization of the Energy Sector engaging both, public and private actors was announced in December. • An exchange of information and cooperation with the European Commission (EC) in general, and its Coal Regions in Transition Platform, in particular, continues. • Various public and private actors, such as: IEA Clean Coal Centre, Boston University, Climate-Kic, Kopernikus ENavi Project, and Geschäftsführer Innovationsregion Lausitz GmbH, as well as various industrial sites' operators (In Russia, Kazakhstan, and Italy) were approached. They expressed their interest in participating in the project on Modernisation of the Energy Sector. The details of their potential engagement are being discussed.</p> <p>• General direct and indirect objectives and indicators of success have been proposed by GoE on CMM and the secretariat. • Greater awareness of good practices identified and advocated by the Group is expected to be evidenced by the adoption of regulations and standards, either at the national level, or on a mine-by-mine basis, reflecting the principles contained in the Best Practices Guidance for Effective Methane Drainage and Use in Coal Mines (BPG) developed by the Group and recommended for worldwide application by ECOSOC (Decision 2011/222). Adoption of the relevant regulations will lead to a reduced number of methane-related accidents in coal mines, as well as to more efficient capture and use of CMM. • Since the Group's main objective, as mandated by the Committee on Sustainable Energy, is to disseminate the above-mentioned best practices, the work of the Group is focused primarily on delivering on this task. Consequently, the direct effect of the Group's work can be measured by the number of people benefitting from the dissemination activities that it organizes. • At the same time, proxy indicators can also be established, however, they should not be directly utilized to evaluate the success of the</p> |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|--|---|
| | | | | attribution of the GoE's activities to the final results – number of accidents or quantity of emissions; rather it would be a contribution to achieving set targets. The shift from output-oriented measuring to outcomes indicators will support the Division and the Group of Experts in presenting more convincingly the results of their work, especially given the international rhetoric related to results-based management and the raising importance of the private sector in sustainable development. | entities) data indicating direct and indirect impact of the Group's activities. | Group's work since they are dependent on multiple factors, many of which are of a political nature, and thus beyond the measurable influence of the Group. |
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best practice guidance for coal mine methane management | Dec-17 | 8 | (Optional:) To maximize sustainability, consider a more focused engagement with technical community, policy makers in UNECE member States, other UN System organizations, financial markets, private sector, NGOs. It is important to bring all stakeholders to dialogue, to establish common action plan and to create the legal frameworks within the UNECE member States. For the European Union Member States, it would make sense to create a strategic partnership / technical involvement of the EU bodies responsible with energy resources, to include best practices in the national legislation. | The Bureau and the secretariat touched upon issue at the GoE on CMM's Bureau call on 14 December 2017 and decided to discuss it further at the upcoming Bureau call in January 2018. By then Members of the Bureau will undertake efforts to evaluate the position of their respective Governments on this issue. Should the Bureau of the Group so request, the secretariat will engage with member States to gauge their interest in developing a legal instrument (e.g. a convention) regulating matters encompassed by the mandate of GoE on CMM. In case there is interest from member States to proceed with development of a legal instrument in the field of CMM, GoE and the secretariat will engage with the EU in order to explore a possibility of issuing a unified joint regulation. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Neither the Bureau, nor a member States requested any hard-law regulation in the field of CMM. • So far, the principle-based approach has been found appropriate and satisfactory. • At this time there is no political will in member States to commit to any binding legal framework regulating the issues related to CMM management. |
| Sustainable Energy | Review of the case studies of the application of best practice guidance for coal mine methane management | Dec-17 | 9 | (Optional:) It is advisable for the Division to include a stronger Results Based Management approach when creating project documentation and reports. This would make the results easily understandable to stakeholders, thus increasing credibility and evaluability. In turn, the future evaluations will have a stronger internal and external validity. | While developing project documentations and reports, the secretariat, where possible, will give more focus to detailed description, in a measurable and quantifiable manner, of the expected or achieved results. In this context, please also see Follow up actions and responsibilities in response to Recommendation 6. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All project documentation and reports produced by the Group comply with general UNECE standards. • For measurable and quantifiable indicators of success please see comments to point 6 above. |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the | Feb-15 | 1 | Strengthen the Information Unit with additional resources and clarify the responsibilities of the unit vis-à-vis the subprogrammes | 3. Progress and results of this approach to be reviewed | Implemented: Directors Meeting assessed progress on 7.10. 2016 |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|--|--|---|
| | Visibility of the Work of the ECE | | | | | |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 1 | Strengthen the Information Unit with additional resources and clarify the responsibilities of the unit vis-à-vis the subprogrammes | 4. Project proposal for fundraise to strengthen UNECE communications | Implemented: Informal presentation at EXCOM on 16.09.16 in framework of 70th anniversary preparations. |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 2 | Capitalize on Taskforce gains and formalize Communications Focal Points across the subprogrammes in order to strengthen corporate UNECE communications | UNECE accepts the recommendation to formalize the work of communications focal points in the subprogrammes, in line with the response to Recommendation 1. | Monthly meetings with Communication Focal Points since March 2015 chaired by Info Unit to share and disseminate communications best practices and enhance mobilization of subprogrammes for communication |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 5 | Review communications strategy disseminate it across the organization and implement it | 2. Disseminate the Communications Strategy to all staff | Implemented: approved by ES |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 6 | Standardize the UNECE brand | 2. Implementation of new branding strategy throughout UNECE | Implemented: Adopted on 19 May 2015 |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 7 | Review political communications | Review progress & impact of measures implemented by the Executive Secretary in October 2014 | Implemented: updated communication with EXCOM; regular briefings with MS in Geneva and New York; informal dialogue with MS: ES and Director's interaction with MS. |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 8 | Devise realistic annual programme of events and resource appropriately | 2. Develop an annual programme of events for 2016 | Prepared for 2017 and 2018 through Communication Focal points |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the | Feb-15 | 11 | Strengthen media engagement more broadly and target specialist media in particular more actively | As per Recommendations 1, 4, 5, 8 & 10 | Implemented |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| | Visibility of the Work of the ECE | | | | | |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 12 | Maintain primacy of UNECE website and continue with robust digital engagement. | 2. Ensure accuracy and quality of content on technical areas of website | Implemented |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of the Role of Information and Communication in Promoting the Visibility of the Work of the ECE | Feb-15 | 13 | Improve the quality of written products and streamline publications | 2. Quality assurance of publications in line with UN Policy Manual for Publications | Implemented 2015 onwards. |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 1 | To the extent possible, increase financing of and in-kind contributions to the UNECE activities under the treaties. e.g. via encouraging stronger financial commitment of the Parties and further contributions to the Trust Fund; attracting new partnerships and funding opportunities via extending the treaties beyond the UNECE region, establishing joint activities with international financial institutions. | To present the evaluation's recommendations for the Bureau and the Working Group on EIA and SEA to address within the draft decision on budget and financial issues 2017-2020 (to be adopted by the Meetings of the Parties in June 2017) | Recommendations disseminated by e-mail on 26 August and posted on the web; They will be presented for discussion at the Working Group's meeting (Geneva, 7-10 November 2016). |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 1 | To the extent possible, increase financing of and in-kind contributions to the UNECE activities under the treaties. e.g. via encouraging stronger financial commitment of the Parties and further contributions to the Trust Fund; attracting new partnerships and funding opportunities via extending the treaties beyond the UNECE region, establishing joint activities with international financial institutions. | To send out letters to encourage further pledges and timely financial contributions from Parties and signatory States, and encourage Parties to tap into development funding opportunities for financing capacity building activities | Letters to encourage further pledges were sent to the foreign ministers and environment ministers of Parties and Signatories in early 2017 and again in late 2018. The draft financial report until June 2016 was prepared. As of June 2017, the Meetings of the Parties decided to request the secretariat to prepare annual reports |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic | Jul-16 | 1 | To the extent possible, increase financing of and in-kind contributions to the UNECE activities under the treaties. e.g. via encouraging stronger financial commitment of the Parties and further contributions to the Trust | To present financial reports to Parties on income and expenditure based on the data from the Executive Office. | The most recent report include that prepared for the June 2017 meeting, and the subsequent one covers the period 1 July 2017- to 30 June 2018. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|--|--|--|
| | Environmental Assessment (SEA) | | | Fund; attracting new partnerships and funding opportunities via extending the treaties beyond the UNECE region, establishing joint activities with international financial institutions. | | |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 1 | To the extent possible, increase financing of and in-kind contributions to the UNECE activities under the treaties. e.g. via encouraging stronger financial commitment of the Parties and further contributions to the Trust Fund; attracting new partnerships and funding opportunities via extending the treaties beyond the UNECE region, establishing joint activities with international financial institutions. | To explore Parties' possibilities for sponsoring a junior professional officer to reinforce the secretariat staffing | Informal consultations with Governments were undertaken, the invitation to sponsor a JPO was raised and continues to be regularly raised at the meetings of the treaty bodies. |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 2 | Continuing and enhancing awareness raising activities regarding the Convention and the Protocol and improving implementation within and beyond the UNECE region, specifically through promotional videos, brief overviews (fact sheets, pamphlets), and thematic round tables and study tours for relevant stakeholders to acquire and share best practices in EIA and SEA implementation. Implementation of pilot projects is also recommended as a cost-effective tool for capacity building, awareness raising, information sharing, training and practical experience. | To organize thematic seminars/round tables focusing on climate change; and on the contribution of the treaties to the achievement of sustainable development goals | A panel discussion on climate change was organized in June 2017 |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 2 | Continuing and enhancing awareness raising activities regarding the Convention and the Protocol and improving implementation within and beyond the UNECE region, specifically through promotional videos, brief overviews (fact sheets, pamphlets), and thematic round tables and study tours for relevant stakeholders to acquire and share best | To ensure the preparation of fact sheets and pamphlets, and finalization of pilot projects in Armenia, Azerbaijan and the Republic of Moldova; as well as national guidance documents for the implementation of the treaties in Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine; a sub-regional experience sharing event in Ukraine; and legislative assistance to Belarus and Kazakhstan | Work was completed |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|--|--|---|
| | | | | practices in EIA and SEA implementation. Implementation of pilot projects is also recommended as a cost-effective tool for capacity building, awareness raising, information sharing, training and practical experience. | | |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 2 | Continuing and enhancing awareness raising activities regarding the Convention and the Protocol and improving implementation within and beyond the UNECE region, specifically through promotional videos, brief overviews (fact sheets, pamphlets), and thematic round tables and study tours for relevant stakeholders to acquire and share best practices in EIA and SEA implementation. Implementation of pilot projects is also recommended as a cost-effective tool for capacity building, awareness raising, information sharing, training and practical experience. | To inform the Bureau and the Working Group about the recommendations, and facilitate the finalization of a draft workplan for 2017–2020 (based on Parties’ priorities and the corresponding budget) to be adopted by Parties in June 2017 | The Bureau and the Working Group were informed on 26 August 2016 about the recommendations; The draft workplan 2017-2020 was prepared for the Working Group to discuss and finalize in November 2017; and the workplan was adopted in June 2017 |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 3 | Improving the relevance of the Convention and the Protocol via enhanced cooperation with other Conventions, such as CBD and UNCLOS, (and not only the UNECE ones), awareness raising events, legislative support, preparation of national guidelines taking into account national legal and institutional circumstances, national trainings (training of trainers), exchange of information and joint public events. | To complete further legislative support to Azerbaijan, Belarus and the Republic of Moldova; initiate legislative assistance to Kazakhstan; to ensure development of national guidance documents for Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine; and organize” training of trainers” workshops on SEA in Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine | Legislative assistance and capacity building activities were completed in April 2018. Further assistance will be provided under the new EU funded project in 2019-2022 in accordance with the workplan 2017-2020, and the subsequent workplan to build on and to enhance the achievements this far. |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 5 | Improving the communication and interactions between the Parties via the organization of further regional workshops, training, experience and information sharing events. The focal points should enhance, to the extent possible, their role in promoting the treaties at the national level. As focal | UNECE will continue to ensure that the database of nominated focal points is up to date (including by circulating the list to the delegates at the upcoming meetings in 2016 and 2017 for their review) | Ongoing, Continuous activity |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| | | | | points they serve as “the face of the treaties” in their countries, closer contact and coordination with them, and ensuring their active participation in each event of Espoo Convention is therefore very important. | | |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 6 | The maintenance and the further improvement of gender equality in the work on implementation of the Convention and the Protocol could be done via regular monitoring and inclusion of gender issues in the surveys undertaken by the Secretariat. Currently the gender equality is well performed, but a more systematic approach to maintaining gender equality and prevention of any discrimination according to the UN rules would be desirable. | To inform the Bureau and the Working Group about the recommendation and seek their views about how to best promote gender equality in a more systematic way under the treaties, e.g. when electing officers for the next intersessional period, or when carrying out questionnaire surveys. | The Bureau and the Working Group received the recommendations on 26 August 2016, feedback provided at their meeting in 7-10 November. |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 1 | To the extent possible, increase financing of and in-kind contributions to the UNECE activities under the treaties. e.g. via encouraging stronger financial commitment of the Parties and further contributions to the Trust Fund; attracting new partnerships and funding opportunities via extending the treaties beyond the UNECE region, establishing joint activities with international financial institutions. | To negotiate with the European Commission for further funding opportunities for capacity building activities (further to the 2 million Euro project funding obtained for 2013-2016) | A follow-up EU funded EU4Environment project will start in early 2018 for the next 4 years (it will fund capacity building activities with a budget of some \$2,7 Mio (2,4 Mio Euros). (The project was approved by EXCOM in July 2018) |
| Environment | Review of UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) | Jul-16 | 2 | Continuing and enhancing awareness raising activities regarding the Convention and the Protocol and improving implementation within and beyond the UNECE region, specifically through promotional videos, brief overviews (fact sheets, pamphlets), and thematic round tables and study tours for relevant stakeholders to acquire and share best practices in EIA and SEA implementation. Implementation of pilot projects is also recommended as a cost-effective tool for capacity | To prepare a guidance for Central Asian countries for the implementation of the Espoo Convention | Guidance was prepared. See document ECE/MP.EIA/2019/12 available at http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=50226 |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| | | | | building, awareness raising, information sharing, training and practical experience. | | |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 1 | Become a more integrated organization | UNECE will implement decisions resulting from the deliberation of Member States on the management reform initiatives proposed by the Secretary-General. | The Executive Secretary strategy and vision for UNECE was presented to EXCOM in May 2018 (Informal Document 2018/12). In this document, the Executive Secretary defines the nexus approach for UNECE's work, articulating 4 Nexus areas, to further align UNECE activities with the 2030 Agenda for sustainable development. EXCOM has "taken note, with appreciation, of the efforts led by the Executive Secretary to align UNECE work to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and looks forward to further updates on the issue." (EXCOM/CONCLU/98) The Executive Secretary continues to implement elements of her vision that are under her purview and maintains an active dialogue with MS on this issue. As necessary, she will continue to seek decisions on related issues that require MS approval. |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 2 | Include "nexus dialogues" in the UNECE strategic planning & budgeting process | The Executive Secretary will ensure that the development of the new Strategic Framework for 2020-21 includes appropriate cooperation between related thematic areas. | In its resolution 72/266, the UNGA decided to replace the biennial strategic framework by an annual Proposed Programme Budget starting with 2020. The 2020 programme plan submitted to EXCOM in December 2018 includes 4 nexuses and elaborate on appropriate collaboration between related thematic areas. The Executive Secretary has launched a strategy to assist its member States with SDG implementation by strengthening the impact of UNECE activities through a sharpened focus and enhanced cross-sectoral collaboration. This strategy envisages the creation of cross-divisional teams for each of the four identified nexus areas (sustainable use of natural resources; sustainable and smart cities for all ages; sustainable mobility and smart connectivity; measuring and monitoring SDGs (methodology)). These teams are designed as flexible arrangements to strengthen established synergies/complementarities among UNECE sub-programmes and identify opportunities for possible new joint or coordinated activities in the nexus area. Composition of the teams engages staff most relevant to the tasks at hand. The main goal of the cross-sectoral teams is the delivery of integrated solutions to identified needs within each nexus area. |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 3 | Encourage and institutionalize information and knowledge sharing among subject-matter experts | The Office of the Executive Secretary will lead organization-wide discussions on priorities for the 2018 Knowledge Management Action Plan by end February 2018. Action items will be demand-driven and aligned to the UNECE Knowledge Management Strategy. Related activities will be undertaken as needed and within existing resources. The Chef de Cabinet will ensure that these discussions are implemented. | Implementation of the 2017 KM action plan has been completed. In 2018, UNECE has focused its KM activities around the alignment to SDGs and work on its priority areas. Related KM activities included - Staff survey: UNECE and the SDGs (complete)- Focus groups on SDG alignment/mission/vision (complete)- Identification of priorities: 9+2 SDGs (complete)- Compilation of success stories at SDG target level (complete)- Formulation of Nexus Approach (complete)- Development of Nexus ppts (ongoing)- Presentations to MS briefings at UNHQ- Formulation of budget stories to illustrate impact/SDG linkage- 2019 Commission will focus on Nexus "Smart Sustainable Cities" and be preceded by a Day of Cities (8-10 April 2019) Additionally, an organization-wide project is underway to migrate the UNECE website to a new software platform. This process includes a broad content review that also includes focus on SDG alignment and Nexus work (ISU lead/completion expected May 2019). Additionally, more guidance materials on procedural and administrative matters was added to the UNECE intranet. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------------------------|---|--------|-----|---|--|---|
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 4 | Capitalize on existing corporate coordination bodies | The Executive Secretary will ensure that senior management meetings include substantive content in line with her evolving vision for UNECE for the 2030 Agenda. The PMU will continue efforts to facilitate potential cooperation between Regional Advisers and focal points responsible for technical cooperation activities. Informal arrangements between various work teams will be encouraged. | All Directors Meeting convened since the end of the evaluation have included the cross-sectoral dimension in the discussions of substantive issues. As of 2018, a strong focus has been placed on the nexus approach that UNECE has presented to its membership in May 2018 and on SDG alignment and focus on 9+2 priority SDGs for which UNECE holds special expertise. All WGTC meetings convened since the end of the evaluation have included discussions on how to coordinate activities across subprogrammes. Measures such as opportunities to reprogramme residual RPTC Funds have included a criterion on joint activities, which has worked effectively as a driver for joining up the substantive efforts of the subprogrammes. These efforts will continue as part of the next phase, responding to a recent audit recommendation of the development of a new Technical Cooperation Strategy, to be launched in 2019. |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 5 | Establish a network of Secretaries to Sectoral Committees in support of Sectoral Committee bureau | The Office of the Executive Secretary, as Focal Point for Knowledge Management, will facilitate the establishment of an online forum (Community of Practice) of Committee Secretaries by February 2018. Working methods, agenda items and joint activities will be determined by the group based on actual demand. Related activities will be undertaken as needed and within existing resources. | completed and ongoing |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 6 | Introduce human resource measures that facilitate cross-sectoral cooperation | Following the approval by Member States of the Secretary-General's reform measures, the Executive Secretary will ensure that measures relating to UNECE are implemented. | As part of the Nexus approach, UNECE is fostering cross-sectoral collaboration and is currently exploring the establishment of Nexus teams to operationalize the strategy. Discussions on the larger UN reform streams is ongoing (as of Dec 2018). |
| Executive Direction and Management | Review of UNECE efforts to promote cross-sectoral collaboration and an integrated approach to sustainable development work | Nov-17 | 7 | Address structural inefficiencies linked to cross-sectoral cooperation | The Executive Secretary will finalize the review of UNECE administrative processes, and of items within the control of senior management, by 30 March 2018. As per the response to Rec 1, the Executive Secretary will ensure the implementation of her vision following endorsement by EXCOM by 31 December 2018. Respective Directors may consider related areas across subprogrammes that merit working together. | The review of UNECE administrative processes has been completed. Results are posted on the UNECE intranet under https://intranet.unece.org/display/EXECUTIVE DIRECTION AND MANAGEMENT/03-+FAQs+administrative+issues |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing | Aug-16 | 1 | Improve the funding and in-kind contributions by pursuing a stronger and more sustainable financial commitment by the MSs to the CP programme. Attract new funding opportunities by promoting a participatory approach among the UNECE MSs and extending networks | The Housing and Land Management Unit will update the guidelines for the preparation of Country Profiles by adding to the procedure of their preparation an option for the establishment, when appropriate, of an interagency partnership for the production of the Country Profiles and a requirement for fundraising for extrabudgetary | Continuous activity. Developing and strengthening partnerships is continuously pursued. For instance, the CP Kazakhstan is being prepared jointly with UNDP, UN-Habitat and OECD where UNDP, UN-Habitat as well as governments of UK and the Netherlands provide in-kind support; XB funds received from Russian Federation to this project. Establishing partnerships for the preparation of CPs will be formally reflected in the guidelines for CP preparation. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|--|--|---|
| | legislation and programmes | | | and partnerships with organizations that support development in the housing, urban development and land management sectors in the UNECE region and beyond. | funds and in-kind support. The guidelines will be presented at the 78th CHLM session. | |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 2 | Utilize internal UNECE resources and broaden existing partnerships with experts and interested parties. Promote more efficient online communications, and peer-review mechanisms, for the sustainable production of the CP analytical studies, broadening the networks and partnerships to attract additional experts, volunteers and pro-bono contributors. | The Forests, Land and Housing Division will send a communication to UNECE divisions with information on the Country Profile programme and an invitation to cooperate on the production of Country Profiles through provision of expertise to the Country Profiles planned for 2017-2018 (Kazakhstan and a second Country Profile for Belarus). | January 2018: Focal points on UNECE smart sustainable cities at divisions were informed. Cooperation with Trade Division was established who prepare a chapter for CP Belarus, regular cooperation established with EPR team who provide expertise; August 2018: HLM had its meetings in August and October 2018 with divisions focal points where further cooperation was discussed with Transport colleagues to involve on urban planning and transport chapter for CP Kyrgyzstan |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 2 | Utilize internal UNECE resources and broaden existing partnerships with experts and interested parties. Promote more efficient online communications, and peer-review mechanisms, for the sustainable production of the CP analytical studies, broadening the networks and partnerships to attract additional experts, volunteers and pro-bono contributors. | The Housing and Land Management Unit will send email invitations to its Committee and Working Party on Land Administration Bureau and CHLM focal points to attract additional experts, volunteers and pro-bono contributions. | Regular communication, latest 4 October 2017. Invites were sent, there is excellent involvement of the experts from member States |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 3 | Discuss the relevance and benefits of aligning the goals and objectives of the CP programme with SDGs, the UNECE Strategy for Sustainable Housing and Land Management, and other important international agreements and frameworks. By doing so (most importantly with SDG 11 and the New Urban Agenda), and supporting their implementation, the CP exercise will emphasize cross-sectoral linkages, including those related to the environment, climate change, natural and human-made disaster risks, urban transport, ageing, and other topics. Incorporating the Monitoring Framework to measure the progress towards the fulfilment of | The Housing and Land Management Unit will update the guidelines for the preparation of Country Profiles by June 2017 by revising the Country Profiles publication structure to ensure the publication addresses issues relevant to the implementation of the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda, especially the Urban SDG 11; the draft New Habitat Agenda; the Geneva UN Charter on Sustainable Housing; the Global Housing Strategy; the UNECE Strategy for Sustainable Housing and Land Management 2014- 2020; and other important international agreements and frameworks as listed in the evaluation report text. The revised guidelines will be presented at the 78th session of CHLM as an official document for the Committee's decision. | Implemented: January 2018. Guidelines were updated and published, are implemented as part of CP Belarus. The guidelines are available in English and Russian at http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=48549 |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|--|--|
| | | | | SDGs would increase the chances of the programme attracting | | |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 4 | Embed the CP programme with the necessary impact indicators, and follow-up and monitoring mechanisms. Upgrade project documentation in light of SDG 11 framework indicators. Develop closer partnerships with UN Habitat's City Prosperity Initiative, the OECD Territorial Reviews, and other similar programmes for the establishment of common benchmarks for local, national and global monitoring, which would be crucial for the creation of an integrated monitoring mechanism in the housing, urban planning and land management sectors. | The Housing and Land Management Unit will include the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda indicators for urban related SDGs for monitoring the progress towards achieving the SDGs in October 2019 into the guidance document for the preparation of the Country Profiles to ensure all efforts by all the UN agencies are taken into account. UNECE will establish closer partnerships with UN-Habitat's City Prosperity Initiative, the OECD Territorial Reviews, the UNECE/ITU Key Performance Indicators for Smart Sustainable Cities and other similar programmes by June 2017 through exchange of letters and will work on regular basis with the partners on the development of a common a framework for monitoring the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda at local, national and global levels. | Joint workplan for cooperation was established with UN-Habitat (January 2018); UN-Habitat, OECD reported on joint activities at the 79th Committee on Housing and Land Management session (October 2018) |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 5 | The CPs should guide individual MSs towards the fulfilment of "equal treatment and non-discrimination, especially for women", by the broader application and monitoring of gender issues in the CP analytical studies and subsequent recommendations in accordance with the programme objectives and broader UN rules and regulations. | The Housing and Land Management Unit will update by June 2017 the guidelines for the preparation of Country Profiles by including a separate chapter with a more detailed explanation on how the gender issues must be addressed in Country Profiles to reflect relevant UN rules and regulations. The revised guidelines will be presented at the 78th session of the Committee on Housing and Land Management as an official document for the Committee's decision. | Implemented: January 2018 |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 6 | Update the guidelines for producing the CP reports by: a) eliminating inefficient procedures regarding the formal approval of the draft CP report by the CHLM prior to its printing and publication; b) limiting the HLM Unit's involvement in preliminary and research missions, and limiting the number of international experts[1] taking part in CP research missions; c) formalizing the fundraising activities by setting up effective and sustainable measures for the funding of the CP programme; d) if relevant, | The Housing and Land Management Unit will update the guidelines for the preparation of Country Profiles by June 2017 by (a) eliminating inefficient procedures regarding the formal approval of the draft CP report by the CHLM prior to its printing and publication; (b) including a provision for fundraising activities; (c) including a recommendation for more detailed information on construction standards, energy efficiency, resilience to natural disasters, spatial and urban planning for housing, new and available technologies, and building-up and development of BIM. The revised guidelines will be presented at the 78th session of CHLM | Implemented: January 2018 |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------------------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|---|
| | | | | including more detailed information on construction standards, energy efficiency, resilience to natural disasters, spatial and urban planning for housing, new and available technologies. | as an official document for the Committee's decision. | |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Role of UNECE Country Profiles on housing and land management and related follow-up activities in development of national housing legislation and programmes | Aug-16 | 7 | Creation of a web-tool (portal, forum, cloud or database) for the exchange and sharing of information and best practice examples of legislation, policies, plans and strategies that were developed based on CP recommendations. | The Housing and Land Management Unit will present this proposal to the CHLM session in September 2016. Given the Committee approves this proposal, the webpage will be established by October 2017 at the HLM website. The webpage will contain information on best practice examples of legislation, policies, plans and strategies that were developed based on CP recommendations and the status of the implementation of Country Profiles' recommendations. | Implemented: January 2018. Within existing resources, the page was developed at http://www.unece.org/housing-and-land-management/training-materials.html Is being updated according to the concept note on Regional Observatory |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing in selected countries with economies in transition | Jan-18 | 2 | The project performance monitoring reporting through the Project Monitoring Tool (PMT) should be made more comprehensive and contemporaneous to its implementation. | The recommendation is not accepted. HLMU is a user which, like other project managers completes information according to the template and requirements established. The PMT was developed as an interim tool to provide updates to member States. Further enhancement of the PMT will not be made pending the deployment of new UMOJA modules in 2018. The HLMU will continue to update the PMT with the information required. | N/A |
| Housing, Land Management & Population | Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing in selected countries with economies in transition | Jan-18 | 1 | HLMU should follow the best practice of administering to the beneficiaries on-the spot online (or paper-based where unavoidable) surveys as the standard operational procedure for all workshops and seminars. Such surveys should always include requests for qualitative comments and proposals by participants. The summaries of returns and their analytics should be stored online and become part of the records of the project reimplementation's be used for lessons learning purpose. The staff of HLMU should be trained in using Google Forms and Survey Monkey. | One-day workshop is planned to be organized during July-August 2018 with a trainer. | Project staff was trained in the use of Survey Monkey which is now regularly used for conducting surveys and feedbacks. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|--|
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 1 | In designing future project proposals, envisage a broader integrated approach. Agricultural standards and trade facilitation are just two "links" in the supply chain "from field to the plate". As UNECE and UNESCAP have clear mandates, strategic partnerships should be envisaged to cover other areas of improvement- (e.g., multilateral development banks could address the issue of micro-financing of small producers and traders; FAO could support improving the productivity of producers; UNEP/GEF could contribute in decreasing the carbon footprint of the production). | UNECE will continue to closely cooperate in all its regular and project work with organizations covering those parts of the supply chain covered by UNECE mandates. These include the European Union, OECD, FAO, the Asian Development Bank, UNEP, or ITC in addition to UN countries offices and donor agencies. This will ensure the more coherent delivery of results and impact of the work at country level. This collaboration will include consultations, joint events, joint training and the delivery of joint training material. A first workshop addressing this recommendation was held with the European Union on access conditions to EU markets and the role of UNECE standards for developing countries (Dominican Republic, April 2018). The next event is planned for June 2018 with UNDP's country office Uzbekistan and Tajikistan as well as for September 2018 with the same partners as well as donor-agencies. Through the existing UNNExT Advisory Group on Agriculture Trade Facilitation (Ag-TF) UNESCAP has been able to forge partnerships with other UN bodies and international working in the areas of agricultural trade facilitation, such as FAO and the WTO's Standards and Trade Development Facility (STDF) as well as with the private sector and high-ranking government officials in the Asia Pacific region. ESCAP will continue to seek guidance and technical support from the members of the UNNExT Ag-TF group in the design and review of projects and activities. | November 2018 UNECE: implemented as outlined. UNECE has taken the Recommendation to envisage a broader approach into consideration in its drafting of new project proposals as well as in its implementation of new activities. UNECE continues to work in strategic partnerships to cover related areas and has organized activities and project implementation with UNCTAD, UNDP, FAO and the private sector. This will continue also in the future. |
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 3 | Partnerships with national and local stakeholders, as well the UN country teams, should continue for future projects (linked to recommendation 1). Besides broadening the thematic coverage, the partnerships raise the profile of the projects and help lowering the costs (maximizing the efficiency); | For UNECE, building partnerships with national and local stakeholders and UN country teams has been an integral part of this UNDA project as well as the UNDA project on "Increased policy coherence and sustainability of national production and consumption patterns in North-South and South-South agriculture trade". In the latter, the integration of national stakeholders and UN country teams are part of the project design. The first events organized with UN country teams are planned for June and September 2018. In June 2018, the UNCT's Uzbekistan and Tajikistan will contribute substantially and financially to an event focused | November 2018 UNECE: Implemented as scheduled and outlined in the management response. The very fruitful cooperation with national and regional stakeholders as well as the UN country teams has become integral part of the new UNDA project as well as UNECE's regular work. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|---|---|--|
| | | | | | on improving production patterns and sustainable nuts and dried fruit trade to be held in Geneva. In September 2018, the UNCT Uzbekistan will help organize and facilitate a capacity building event on UNECE standards and best practice to improve quality production and prevent food loss, to be held in Tashkent, Uzbekistan. The involvement and advisory role of national stakeholders will also continue to be an integral part of UNECE's regular and project work. Country delegations will be invited to contribute to regular intergovernmental work and submit their comments as well take part in projects. | |
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 4 | Continue the "open process" approach, making available online links to all events, training materials and case studies. They facilitate knowledge exchange and increase trust and interest from all stakeholders. | ESCAP will continue to share information on trade facilitation and agricultural trade facilitation measures on the ESCAP and UNNExT websites, to facilitate an exchange of knowledge and best practice amongst relevant stakeholders. UNECE is in the process of restructuring its web page including both structure and content to make it easier to disseminate available content and provide even more information on events, studies and training material for the Fall of 2018. | ESCAP: Implemented as outlined, in particular through https://unnnext.unescap.org/ and https://www.unescap.org/our-work/trade-investment-innovation |
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 5 | In order to avoid situations when finding appropriate consultants for technical work is difficult or ill-timed, UNECE and UNESCAP should implement a roster of vetted specialists. The roster could be shared by UNECE and ESCAP, eventually by other UN organizations. | The United Nations Network of Experts for Paperless Trade and Transport Facilitation in Asia and the Pacific (UNNExT) consists of a group of specialists and experts on trade facilitation, including agricultural trade facilitation. UNESCAP will continue to maintain an open "expert database" on the UNNExT website. https://unnnext.unescap.org/ . UNECE will continue to draw on its extensive expert date base comprising close to 1000 experts in these fields and who are actively participating in UNECE events in meetings, trainings and electronic working groups, Discussions on the possibility of establishing a vetted roster through existing mechanisms (e.g. Inspira) will take place by December 2018. The challenges faced include the difficulty of identifying and including the most competent right experts in the many areas of work covered by the mandates of both organizations; the difficulty maintaining the roster up to date and | December 2018 UNECE and ESCAP: Discussions on the possibility of establishing a vetted roster have taken place. Given the differences in mandates of the two organizations and their project work, it was decided to collaborate and exchange recommendations on the most competent experts for a given task on an ad-hoc basis. This has already been on several occasions since the project closure. UNECE and ESCAP will continue to consult and exchange views on the identification of experts whenever necessary. UNNExT database of experts continues to be maintained as an open access database. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------|--|--------|-----|--|---|--|
| | | | | | making sure that it is expanded on a regular basis. The rosters, if established, will be open and jointly managed. UNECE and UNESCAP will share their experts' rosters whenever necessary. | |
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 6 | Continue the Trade Facilitation Survey implemented by UNESCAP. The survey is a very cost-effective way to collect data and to adjust tools and projects to the actual needs of the actors in the region. | ESCAP will continue to collect data on trade facilitation implementation, including indicators on agricultural trade facilitation and paperless trade. The Trade Facilitation Survey is one of many tools that the ESCAP uses to collect and monitor trade facilitation implementation. ESCAP will lead work on the next Trade Facilitation Survey scheduled for 2019, in collaboration with UNECE, other regional commissions and other UN and international organizations. | ESCAP: Implemented as outlined. Preparations for the UN Global Survey on Trade Facilitation and Paperless Trade Implementation 2019 are on-going, with official support from Executive Secretaries of all Regional Commissions received in November 2018. Updated survey data will be made freely available at: https://unnnext.unescap.org/AP-TFSurvey2017 |
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 7 | Continue collecting case studies and create a Best Practice Guide. The Case Studies should focus both on best practices as well as on lessons learnt from failures and should cover diverse geographic areas as well as topics. The examples and lessons learnt should be compiled in a Best Practice Guide to contribute to better understanding and improvement of supply chains in agriculture. | The UNNExT website includes already a large number of case studies and policy briefs on trade facilitation measures and innovation in the Asia Pacific region. The case studies and policy briefs are available here: https://unnnext.unescap.org/ . Increasingly, case studies on agricultural trade facilitation have been added to the UNNExT policy briefs. The guides produced under the projects have also been envisaged as best practice guidelines for topics such as facilitating compliance for food safety and quality standards and electronic sanitary and phytosanitary certification. Subject to resource availability, additional case studies may be added to the UNNExT website, when relevant cases and projects are identified. | ESCAP: Implemented as outlined. New case studies have been made available on UNNExT website, including most recently a report on regional best practices in single window implementation (https://www.unescap.org/resources/single-window-trade-facilitation-regional-best-practices-and-future-development), as well as a report on good practices to balance trade compliance and facilitation for food safety (https://www.unescap.org/resources/facilitating-compliance-food-safety-and-quality-cross-border-trade) |
| Trade | Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains | Feb-18 | 9 | Strengthen the role of the concluding project event in order to increase ownership, sustainability and dissemination of the project results in beneficiary countries and beyond. In cases when a project or its components have any form of continuation, the concluding event is essential to get endorsement from the stakeholders for the new phases. | In future projects and whenever possible and can be integrated into the final project design, more emphasis will be placed on concluding events. In future projects and whenever possible, UNECE and UNESCAP will attempt to strengthen the role of concluding events as one way of fostering sustainability, the continuation of project achievements and the strong stakeholder engagement beyond the projects' life cycles. In addition, UNECE and UNESCAP will make every effort possible to strengthen stakeholders' engagement during the entire project implementation phase. | November 2018/UNECE: Implemented as outlined. A concluding event is included in the current projects. In addition, national ownership on ongoing projects is ensured through strong attention to sustainability mechanisms at national level and involvement of local and national stakeholders at all steps of the project implementation. ESCAP Implemented as outlined. A concluding event is included in current ESCAP projects (e.g., Russian funded project on pilot exchange of electronic data between Mongolia and three neighboring countries will end with a region-wide forum in March 2019), disseminating the work done in a few target countries to a wider group. |

| Sub programme | Evaluation Title | Date | No. | Report Recommendation | Management Response | Progress Report |
|---------------------|--|--------|-----|---|--|---|
| Transport | Strengthening the national road safety management capacities of selected developing countries and countries with economies in transition | Jul-18 | 1 | UNDA: inclusion, in the proposal template, of the following sections: overall objective at the impact level with the requirement of insertion indicators of achievements; cross cutting issues and specifically gender-sensitive aspects. | Not applicable to UNECE. UNECE will inform DESA of the evaluator's recommendation for consideration. The Programme Management Unit will liaise with DESA accordingly. | The evaluation was shared with DESA. |
| Forestry and Timber | UNDA Project 12/13AW - Sustainable Forest Management for Greener Economies in the Caucasus and Central Asia | Jul-16 | 3 | Maintain and expand the project website by uploading more results-oriented documents (action plans, programmes or strategies). | To request the latest versions of the relevant documents from project countries and will upload them to the project website. | The secretariat has approached project countries for result-oriented documents. However, no additional documentation, relevant to the project, was available at that time. |
| Forestry and Timber | UNDA Project 12/13AW - Sustainable Forest Management for Greener Economies in the Caucasus and Central Asia | Jul-16 | 4 | C) Develop national awareness-raising campaigns with involvement of local youth, female groups and active local leadership groups. | C) To identify examples of successful communication or awareness raising campaigns in a study on forest sector workforce, including the review of forestry education in the region, green economy or bio economic strategies and action plans. Gender and youth aspects will also be considered in the study | Information about education in the forest sector, age, gender and development of green jobs in the forest sector has been included in the thematic study, which was presented at the ECE Committee on Forests and the Forest Industry in 2016. The section organized in 2017 an international expert workshop on "promoting green jobs in the forest sector", which aimed at raising awareness on new job opportunities in the context of green economy and bioeconomy. |
| Sustainable Energy | UNDA project 1213AB - Promoting Energy Efficiency Investments for Climate Change Mitigation and Sustainable Development | Nov-15 | 3 | Regional Commissions should continuously monitor and document progress and success of selected projects as 'best practice' examples in the area of energy efficiency financing. | Project manager will contact project participants to monitor and document progress and success of selected projects executed under the project. | A study: Best Policy Practices for Promoting Energy Efficiency - Second edition has been developed and posted on UNECE website in November 2017: http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=47415 . |
| Sustainable Energy | UNDA project 1213AB - Promoting Energy Efficiency Investments for Climate Change Mitigation and Sustainable Development | Nov-15 | 4 | The Regional Commissions may consider formulating follow-up project proposals for further extra-budgetary funding from bi- or multi-lateral sources. | The UNECE SED's Regional Advisor to formulate and submit project proposals for further extrabudgetary funding from bi- or multilateral sources by March 2016. | Two follow-up project proposals were formulated, submitted and approved: Promoting Renewable Energy Investments for Climate Change Mitigation and Sustainable Development (2014-2017, ESCWA-lead agency and UNECE, completed) and Sustainable Energy for All (SE4All) in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia (2016-2019, UNECE-lead agency and ESCAP, under implementation). |